

Title	Fashioning Brazil: Globalization and the Representation of Brazilian Dress in National Geographic
Type	Thesis
URL	https://ualresearchonline.arts.ac.uk/id/eprint/12111/
Date	2016
Citation	Kutesko, Elizabeth (2016) Fashioning Brazil: Globalization and the Representation of Brazilian Dress in National Geographic. PhD thesis, Courtauld Institute of Art.
Creators	Kutesko, Elizabeth

Usage Guidelines

Please refer to usage guidelines at <http://ualresearchonline.arts.ac.uk/policies.html> or alternatively contact ualresearchonline@arts.ac.uk.

License: Creative Commons Attribution Non-commercial No Derivatives

Unless otherwise stated, copyright owned by the author

**Fashioning Brazil: Globalisation and the Representation of
Brazilian Dress in *National Geographic***

(Two Volumes)

Elizabeth Kutesko

Doctor of Philosophy in the History of Art

The Courtauld Institute of Art, University of London

Abstract

As a popular 'scientific' and educational journal, *National Geographic*, since its founding in 1888, has positioned itself as a voice of authority within mainstream American print media, offering what purports to be an unprejudiced 'window onto the world'. Previous scholarship has been quick to call attention to the magazine's participation in an imperialist representational regime. Catherine A. Lutz and Jane L. Collins, Tamar Rothenberg and Linda Steet have all argued that *National Geographic's* distinctive, quasi-anthropological outlook has established hierarchies of difference and rendered subjects into dehumanised objects, a spectacle of the unknown and exotic other. A more nuanced understanding can be reached by drawing upon Mary Louise Pratt's concept of the 'contact zone'. Pratt defined the contact zone as 'spaces where cultures meet, clash and grapple with each other, often in contexts of highly asymmetrical relations of power'. Photographs since *National Geographic's* centenary edition in September 1988 have traced the beginnings of a different view of encounters within the United States-Brazil contact zone, driven by the forces of globalisation, which have resisted the processes of objectification, appropriation and stereotyping frequently associated with the rectangular yellow border. This is because they have provided evidence of a fluid and various population, which has selected and experimented with preferred elements of American and European dress, and used it to fashion their own, distinctly Brazilian identities.

This thesis will examine both the visual and textual strategies that *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil* (the Portuguese-language version of the magazine, established in Sao Paulo in May 2000) have used to *fashion* Brazil, but also the extent to which Brazilian subjects can be seen to have *self-fashioned*, through the strategic appropriation of clothing and ideas derived from an existing and dominant global culture. It will approach dress not simply as cloth but as a system of communication, whose many meanings are not fixed but *continually informed* and to an extent, even *performed*, by its visual, material, and textual representation. This thesis employs a multidisciplinary mode of analysis that draws on five Brazilian scholars, each of whom have used dress and fashion metaphors in their writings, which have encompassed poetry, film studies, poststructuralist theory, literary criticism and anthropology.

Table of Contents

VOLUME I

Title Page	p. 1
Abstract	p. 2
Table of Contents	pp. 3-5
List of Figures	pp. 6-22
Acknowledgements	p. 23
Introduction. <i>National Geographic</i> as a Contact Zone.	pp. 25- 61
‘L’Origami du Monde’: Making Contact with <i>National Geographic</i>	pp. 30-35
<i>National Geographic</i> as a Contact Zone	pp. 35-37
Re-addressing Previous Academic Contact with <i>National Geographic</i>	pp. 37-40
A Phenomenology of Contact Through Dress and the Photographic Object	pp. 41-44
The Global Contact Zone since 1988	pp. 44-47
Snapshots of the Contact Zone	pp. 47-49
Brazilian Auto-Ethnography and Structure of Chapters	pp. 50-54
Entering the Contact Zone: A Comment on Methodology and My Auto-Ethnography	pp. 54-60
Research Questions	pp. 60-61
Part One.	
Chapter 1. Anthropophagy: the First Hundred Years of Brazilian Dress in <i>National Geographic</i>.	pp.
• Snapshot 1: The Maku Woman’s ‘Old Piece of Cloth’, April 1926.	
• Snapshot 2: <i>Paulista</i> Women’s White Sportswear, October 1942.	
• Snapshot 3: The Cinta Larga Women’s Black Body Paint and Beaded Necklaces, September 1971.	
The Representation of Brazil in <i>National Geographic</i> Over One Hundred Years	pp. 62-64
An Ethnographic Gaze on the Maku in an Age of Pan-Americanism	pp. 64-67
Snapshot 1: The Maku Woman’s ‘Old Piece of Cloth’	pp. 68-77
A Documentary Gaze on Sao Paulo during World War Two	pp. 77-83
Snapshot 2: <i>Paulista</i> Women’s White Sportswear	pp. 83-88
An Ethnographic Gaze on the Cinta Largas during the Military Regime	pp. 88-91
Snapshot 3: The Cinta Larga Women’s Black Body Paint and Beaded Necklaces	pp. 92-102

Chapter 2. Aesthetics of Garbage: Globalisation and the Representation of Brazilian Dress in *National Geographic* since 1988. pp. 103-143

- Snapshot 4: Djauí's Red T-shirt and Adidas Shorts, December 1988.
- Snapshot 5: The Afro-Brazilian Woman's Lycra Top and Denim Jeans, August 2002.

The Representation of Brazil in <i>National Geographic</i> since 1988	pp. 109-110
<i>Beyond the Yellow Border: A Heightened Phenomenology of Contact</i>	pp. 110-117
An Ethnographic Gaze on the Urueu-Wau-Wau in 1988	pp. 117-123
Snapshot 4: Djauí's Red T-shirt and Adidas Shorts	pp. 123-130
A Documentary Gaze on Afro-Brazilian Subjects in 2002	pp. 130-136
Snapshot 5: The Afro-Brazilian Woman's Lycra Top and Denim Jeans	pp. 136-143

Chapter 3. Space In-Between: Brazilian Fashion in *National Geographic* since 2001. pp. 144-186

- Snapshot 6: The Yanomami Boy's Gaze at the *National Geographic* Photographer's Clothing, September 2001.
- Snapshot 7: Bianca Marque's Bikinis and Victor Denzk's Dresses, September 2011.

<i>National Geographic Fashion: In-Between Exotic Spectacle and Critical Recognition</i>	pp. 144-163
Snapshot 6: The Yanomami Boy's Gaze at the <i>National Geographic</i> Photographer's Clothing	pp. 163-163
A Fashionable Gaze on Brazilian Women in 2011	pp. 166-172
Snapshot 7a: Bianca Marque's Bikinis in the Magazine	pp. 172-177
Snapshot 7b: Victor Denzk's Dresses on the Website	pp. 178-186

Part Two: Holding up a mirror to *National Geographic*. pp. 187-189

Chapter 4. Misplaced Ideas: Brazilian dress as reflected in the first ten years of *National Geographic Brasil*. pp. 190-226

- Snapshot 8: The Mayongong Man's Rawhide Bag and Cotton Loincloth, July 2000.
- Snapshot 9: Lourenço Loy's Red and White Bandana and Gold Medallion, February 2001.
- Snapshot 10: The Japanese-Brazilian Women's Cotton *Yucata* and Wooden *Geta*, June 2008.

The Representation of Brazil in <i>National Geographic Brasil</i> Over A Decade	pp. 198-200
---	-------------

A Brazilian Gaze on <i>National Geographic</i> in 2000	pp. 200-203
Snapshot 8: The Mayongong Man's Rawhide Bag and Cotton Loincloth	pp. 203-206
A Documentary Gaze on Angolan-Brazilians in 2003	pp. 206-209
Snapshot 9: Lourenço Loy's Red and White Bandana and Gold Medallion	pp. 210-216
A Portraiture Gaze on Japanese-Brazilians in 2007	pp. 216-218
Snapshot 10: The Japanese-Brazilian Women's Cotton <i>Yucata</i> and Wooden <i>Geta</i>	pp. 219-226

Chapter 5. Mundialization: Brazilian dress in <i>National Geographic Brasil</i>, August 2013.	pp. 227-258
--	-------------

- **Snapshot 11: The Guarani-Kaiowa's Western-style dress and Feathered Headdresses, August 2013.**

An Ethnographic Gaze on the Guarani-Kaiowa in 2013	pp. 233-236
Snapshot 11a: Magazine	pp. 236-245
Snapshot 11b: iPad	pp. 246-250
Snapshot 11c: Film	pp. 250-258

Conclusion	pp. 259-280
-------------------	-------------

VOLUME II

Figures	pp. 281-349
Archives and Museum Collections	pp. 350-370
Bibliography	pp. 371-393
List of Appendices	p. 394
Appendices	pp. 395-588

List of Figures

Introduction

Fig. 1.0 Author assembling Cyprien Gaillard, 'L'Origami du Monde', in the article 'Happy Birthday, *National Geographic*', 032c, Autumn/Winter 2013/14, front cover.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 1.1 Author assembling Cyprien Gaillard, 'L'Origami du Monde', in the article 'Happy Birthday, *National Geographic*', 032c, Autumn/Winter 2013/14, pp. 158-159.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 1.2 Author assembling Cyprien Gaillard, 'L'Origami du Monde', in the article 'Happy Birthday, *National Geographic*', 032c, Autumn/Winter 2013/14, pp. 160-161.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 1.3 Author assembling Cyprien Gaillard, 'L'Origami du Monde', in the article 'Happy Birthday, *National Geographic*', 032c, Autumn/Winter 2013/14, pp. 160-163.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 1.4 Author assembling Cyprien Gaillard, 'L'Origami du Monde', in the article 'Happy Birthday, *National Geographic*', 032c, Autumn/Winter 2013/14, pp. 160-165.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 1.5 Author assembling Cyprien Gaillard, 'L'Origami du Monde', in the article 'Happy Birthday, *National Geographic*', 032c, Autumn/Winter 2013/14, pp. 160-166.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 1.6 Author assembling Cyprien Gaillard, 'L'Origami du Monde', in the article 'Happy Birthday, *National Geographic*', 032c, Autumn/Winter 2013/14, pp. 160-167.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 1.7 Cyprien Gaillard, Pop-Up Artwork, 'L'Origami du Monde', 2013/4.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 1.8 Brent Stirton, *National Geographic*, October 2013, pp. 34-35.

(Image: photograph taken by author, London, March 2014)

Fig. 1.9 Steve McCurry, Ed Kashi, *National Geographic*, October 2013, pp. 36-37.

(Image: photograph taken by author, London, March 2014)

Fig. 1.10 Stephanie Sinclair, *National Geographic*, October 2013, pp. 76-77.

(Image: photograph taken by author, London, March 2014)

Fig. 1.11 Steve McCurry, William Albert Allard, *National Geographic*, October 2013, pp. 78-79.

(Image: photograph taken by author, London, March 2014)

Fig. 1.12 Lynsey Addario, *National Geographic*, October 2013, pp. 94-95.

(Image: photograph taken by author, London, March 2014)

Fig. 1.13 David Guttenfelder, *National Geographic*, October 2013, pp. 98-99.

(Image: photograph taken by author, London, March 2014)

Part One:

Chapter 1.

Fig. 2.0 Map of the route followed on the Alexander Hamilton Rice Expedition, 1924-5 published in Captain Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, p. 354.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.1 Captain Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, p. 370.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.2 Captain Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, p. 397.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.3 Captain Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, p. 396.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.4 Author viewing article written by Captain Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, pp. 396-397.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 2.5 Author viewing article written by Captain Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, pp. 396-397.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 2.6 A. H. Bruno, 'Airplanes aid explorers in Brazil', *Popular Mechanics*, November 1925, p. 788.

(Image: *Popular Mechanics* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.7 Alexander Hamilton Rice, 'The Rio Negro, the Casiquiare Canal and the upper Orinoco', Sept 1919-April 1920, typescript read at the Meeting of the Royal Geographic Society, 21 February 1921, from Papers, Hamilton Rice Expedition 1919-1920.

(Image: photograph taken by author at the Royal Geographical Society, London, September 2013)

Fig. 2.8 Advertisement, *National Geographic*, April 1926, p. 3.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.9 Anonymous, Rio de Janeiro, 1926, FOLDER 016 –Diversos Autores, Instituto Moreira Salles.

(Image: from the collection of the Instituto Moreira Salles, Rio de Janeiro)

Fig. 2.10 Henry Albert Phillips, 'Air Cruising through New Brazil: A National Geographic reporter spots vast resources which the Republic's war declaration adds to strength of United Nations', *National Geographic*, October 1942, p. 523.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.11 Henry Albert Phillips to J. R. Hildebrand, Letter, 18 June 1942, Microfiche File No. 510-1-999.116948.

(Image: scanned microfiche file obtained by author at National Geographic Society Archive, Washington D.C., June 2013)

Fig. 2.12 Henry Albert Phillips, 'Air Cruising through New Brazil: A National Geographic reporter spots vast resources which the Republic's war declaration adds to strength of United Nations', *National Geographic*, October 1942, p. 505.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.13 Author viewing article written by Henry Albert Phillips, 'Air Cruising through New Brazil: A National Geographic reporter spots vast resources which the Republic's war declaration adds to strength of United Nations', *National Geographic*, October 1942, pp. 504-505.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 2.14 Advertisement, *National Geographic*, May 1941, p. 16.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.15 Henry Albert Phillips, 'Air Cruising through New Brazil: A National Geographic reporter spots vast resources which the Republic's war declaration adds to strength of United Nations', *National Geographic*, October 1942, p. 519.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.16 Horst P. Horst., Portrait of Senhora Alzira Vargas do Amaral Peixote, in anon, 'South American Visitors: Five Beautiful Neighbors from Brazil, Peru and the Argentine... recent visitors to the U.S.', *Vogue*, July 1941, p. 22.

(Image: *Vogue* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.17 Advertisement, *Vogue*, February 1941, p. 3.

(Image: *Vogue* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.18 Anon., 'A Visita do Sr. Presidente Getulio Vargas a Sao Paulo', *Estado de Sao Paulo*, 28 April 1940, p. 7.

(Image: British Library Newspaper Collections)

Fig. 2.19 Detail, Anon., 'A Visita do Sr. Presidente Getulio Vargas a Sao Paulo', *Estado de Sao Paulo*, 28 April 1940, p. 7.

(Image: British Library Newspaper Collections)

Fig. 2.20 Author viewing article written by Henry Albert Phillips, 'Air Cruising through New Brazil: A National Geographic reporter spots vast resources which the Republic's war declaration adds to strength of United Nations', *National Geographic*, October 1942, pp. 518-519.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 2.21 Author viewing article written by Henry Albert Phillips, 'Air Cruising through New Brazil: A National Geographic reporter spots vast resources which the Republic's war declaration adds to strength of United Nations', *National Geographic*, October 1942, pp. 518-519.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 2.22 Henry Albert Phillips, 'Air Cruising through New Brazil: A National Geographic reporter spots vast resources which the Republic's war declaration adds to strength of United Nations', *National Geographic*, October 1942, p. 518.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.23 Map of Cinta Larga Territory published in W. Jesco von Puttkamer, 'Brazil protects her Cinta Largas', *National Geographic*, September 1971, p. 426.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.24 W. Jesco von Puttkamer, 'Brazil protects her Cinta Largas', *National Geographic*, September 1971, p. 442-443.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.25 Author viewing article written by W. Jesco von Puttkamer, 'Brazil protects her Cinta Largas', *National Geographic*, September 1971, p. 442-443.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 2.26 Jose Medeiros, 'Indio Xavante', 1949.

(Image: <http://www.ims.com.br/ims/artista/colecao/jose-medeiros/obra/2140>)

Fig. 2.27 Henri Ballot, 'Indios Txucarramaes', c. 1953.

(Image: <http://www.ims.com.br/ims/artista/colecao/henri-ballot/obra/9873>)

Fig. 2.28 W. Jesco von Puttkamer, 'Brazil protects her Cinta Largas', *National Geographic*, September 1971, p. 440-441.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 2.29 Author viewing article written by W. Jesco von Puttkamer, 'Brazil protects her Cinta Largas', *National Geographic*, September 1971, p. 440-441.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 2.30 John Dominis, 'Taming the Green Hell', *Life* magazine, 12 November 1971, p. 30.

(Image: photograph taken by author at Library of Congress, Washington D.C., June 2013)

Fig. 2.31 Author viewing the article written by John Dominis, 'Taming the Green Hell', *Life* magazine, 12 November 1971, p. 30.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 2.32 Joan G. Wallis to The Secretary NGS, Letter, 29 August 1971, Microfiche File No. 21.121397.

(Image: scanned microfiche file obtained by author at National Geographic Society Archive, Washington D.C., June 2013)

Fig. 2.33 John Scofield to Joan B. Wallis [sic], Letter, 20 September 1971, Microfiche File No. 21.121397.

(Image: scanned microfiche file obtained by author at National Geographic Society Archive, Washington D.C., June 2013)

Fig. 2.34 John T. Goss to Melville B. Grosvenor, Letter, 5 October 1971, Microfiche File No. 21.121397.

(Image: scanned microfiche file obtained by author at National Geographic Society Archive, Washington D.C., June 2013)

Fig. 2.35 Jon Schneeberger to John T. Goss, 2 November 1971, Microfiche File No. 21.121397.

(Image: scanned microfiche file obtained by author at National Geographic Society Archive, Washington D.C., June 2013)

Chapter 2.

Fig. 3.0 Author viewing the article written by Wilbur Garrett, 'Within the Yellow Border', *National Geographic*, 174:6, (December, 1988), pp. 270-286

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 3.1 Author viewing the article written by Wilbur Garrett, 'Within the Yellow Border', *National Geographic*, 174:6, (December, 1988), pp. 270-286

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 3.2 Author viewing the article written by Wilbur Garrett, 'Within the Yellow Border', *National Geographic*, 174:6, (December, 1988), pp. 270-286

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 3.3 Author viewing the article written by Wilbur Garrett, 'Within the Yellow Border', *National Geographic*, 174:6, (December, 1988), pp. 270-286

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 3.4 Author viewing the article written by Wilbur Garrett, 'Within the Yellow Border', *National Geographic*, 174:6, (December, 1988), pp. 270-286

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 3.5 Joseph R. Judge to John McPhee, Memorandum, 12 August 1988, Microfiche File No. 510-1-999.115517.

(Image: scanned microfiche file obtained by author at National Geographic Society Archive, Washington D.C., June 2013)

Fig. 3.6 Jon Schneeberger to Jeffrey Lawson, Memorandum, 22 June 1989, Microfiche File No. 510-1-999.115517.

(Image: scanned microfiche file obtained by author at National Geographic Society Archive, Washington D.C., June 2013)

Fig. 3.7 W. Jesco von Puttkamer, 'Last Days of Eden: Rondonia's Urueu-Wau-Wau Indians', *National Geographic*, December 1988, p. 804.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 3.8 Author viewing the article written by Loren McIntyre (with photographs by W. Jesco von Puttkamer), 'Last Days of Eden: Rondonia's Urueu-Wau-Wau Indians', *National Geographic*, December 1988, p. 804.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 3.9 W. Jesco von Puttkamer, 'Last Days of Eden: Rondonia's Urueu-Wau-Wau Indians', *National Geographic*, December 1988, pp. 812-813.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 3.10 Author viewing the article written by Loren McIntyre (with photographs by W. Jesco von Puttkamer), 'Last Days of Eden: Rondonia's Urueu-Wau-Wau Indians', *National Geographic*, December 1988, pp. 812-813.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 3.11 Author viewing the back cover of *National Geographic*, December 1988.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 3.12 Jean-Pierre Dutilleux, 'Primal Sting', *Vogue*, June 1988, p. 244.

(Image: *Vogue* Digital Archive)

Fig. 3.13 *Baiana* dress for sale at Mercado de Madureira, Rio de Janeiro.

(Image: photograph taken by author at Mercado de Madureira, Rio de Janeiro, May 2014)

Fig. 3.14 Detail, *Baiana* dress for sale at Mercado de Madureira, Rio de Janeiro.

(Image: photograph taken by author at Mercado de Madureira, Rio de Janeiro, May 2014)

Fig. 3.15 Detail, *Baiana* dress for sale at Mercado de Madureira, Rio de Janeiro.

(Image: photograph taken by author at Mercado de Madureira, Rio de Janeiro, May 2014)

Fig. 3.16 Detail, *Baiana* dress for sale at Mercado de Madureira, Rio de Janeiro.

(Image: photograph taken by author at Mercado de Madureira, Rio de Janeiro, May 2014)

Fig. 3.17 Detail, *Baiana* dress for sale at Mercado de Madureira, Rio de Janeiro.

(Image: photograph taken by author at Mercado de Madureira, Rio de Janeiro, May 2014)

Fig. 3.18 Anon, 'Guias e baianas recepcionam turistas que desembarcam no porto de Salvador para o Carnaval' ['Guides and *baianas* receive tourists who disembark at the port of Salvador for Carnaval'], *Turismobahia* on Instagram, February 2014.

(Image: <http://instagram.com/p/IH8dWEBD5g/>, accessed April 2014)

Fig. 3.19 David Alan Harvey, 'Where Brazil was Born: Bahia', *National Geographic*, August 2002, p. 79.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 3.20 Author viewing the article written by Charles E. Cobb, (with photographs by David Alan Harvey), 'Where Brazil was Born: Bahia', *National Geographic*, August 2002, pp. 78-79.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 3.21 Mari Stockler, image from *Meninas do Brasil* [Girls of Brasil], (Sao Paulo: Cosac & Naify, 2001), taken in Salvador de Bahia, 1996.

(Image: Mari Stockler)

Fig. 3.22 Arthur Elgort, image from 'White Heat', *Vogue*, March 2006, p. 521.

(Image: *Vogue* Digital Archive)

Chapter 3.

Fig. 4.0 Author viewing front cover of *National Geographic Fashion*, ed. by Cathy Newman (Washington D.C.: National Geographic Society, 2001).

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 4.1 Author viewing *National Geographic Fashion*, ed. by Cathy Newman (Washington D.C.: National Geographic Society, 2001), pp. 2-3.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 4.2 Author viewing *National Geographic Fashion*, ed. by Cathy Newman (Washington D.C.: National Geographic Society, 2001), pp. 58-59.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 4.3 Author viewing *National Geographic Fashion*, ed. by Cathy Newman (Washington D.C.: National Geographic Society, 2001), pp. 118-119.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 4.4 Author viewing *National Geographic Fashion*, ed. by Cathy Newman (Washington D.C.: National Geographic Society, 2001), pp. 178-179.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 4.5 Author viewing *National Geographic Fashion*, ed. by Cathy Newman (Washington D.C.: National Geographic Society, 2001), pp. 12-13.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 4.6 Author viewing back cover of *National Geographic Fashion*, Newman, Cathy ed., (Washington D.C.: National Geographic Society, 2001)

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 4.7 Anon., 'Global: Fashion's Second Circuit', *Women's Wear Daily*, 24 July 2001, pp. 16-17.

(Image: *Women's Wear Daily* Digital Archive)

Fig. 4.8 Loren McIntyre, *National Geographic Fashion*, ed. by Cathy Newman (Washington D.C.: National Geographic Society, 2001), p. 178.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 4.9 Loren McIntyre, 'Amazon – The River Sea', *National Geographic*, October 1972, pp. 494-495.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 4.10 Robert W. Madden, *National Geographic Fashion*, ed. by Cathy Newman (Washington D.C.: National Geographic Society, 2001), p. 12.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 4.11 Robert W. Madden, 'Yanomamo, the True People', *National Geographic*, August 1976, p. 211.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 4.12 Michael Nichols, *National Geographic Fashion*, ed. by Cathy Newman (Washington D.C.: National Geographic Society, 2001), p. 13.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 4.13 Michael Nichols, Photograph of Yanomami Father and Son, 1990.

(Image: <http://www.natgeocreative.com/ngs/photography/search/comp-view/index.jsf>)

Fig. 4.14 Advertisement, *National Geographic*, September 2011, back cover.

(Image: photograph taken by author, London, March 2014)

Fig. 4.15 John Stanmeyer, 'Machisma: How A Mix Of Female Empowerment And Steamy Soap Operas Helped Bring Down Brazil's Fertility Rate and Stoke Its Vibrant Economy', *National Geographic*, September 2011, pp. 98-99.

(Image: photograph scanned by author, London, March 2015)

Fig. 4.16 John Stanmeyer, 'Machisma: How A Mix Of Female Empowerment And Steamy Soap Operas Helped Bring Down Brazil's Fertility Rate and Stoke Its Vibrant Economy', *National Geographic*, September 2011, pp. 114-5.

(Image: photograph scanned by author, London, March 2015)

Fig. 4.17 John Stanmeyer, 'Machisma: How A Mix Of Female Empowerment And Steamy Soap Operas Helped Bring Down Brazil's Fertility Rate and Stoke Its Vibrant Economy', *National Geographic*, 220:3, (September, 2011), pp. 118-9

(Image: photograph scanned by author, London, March 2015)

Fig. 4.18 Author viewing the article written by Cynthia Gorney (with photographs by John Stanmeyer, 'Machisma: How A Mix Of Female Empowerment And Steamy Soap Operas Helped Bring Down Brazil's Fertility Rate and Stoke Its Vibrant Economy', *National Geographic*, September 2011, pp. 118-119.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 4.19 Angelo Pennetta, image from 'The Full Brazilian', *New York Times T Style Holiday Magazine*, December 2011, p. 169.

(Image: British Library Newspaper Collections)

Fig. 4.20 John Stanmeyer, 'Machisma: How A Mix Of Female Empowerment And Steamy Soap Operas Helped Bring Down Brazil's Fertility Rate and Stoke Its Vibrant Economy', *National Geographic*, 220:3, (September, 2011), n.p.

(Image: screen grab from <http://ngm.nationalgeographic.com/2011/09/girl-power/stanmeyer-photography#/08-fashion-boutique-670.jpg> taken by author, London, July 2014)

Fig. 4.21 Author viewing the online article by written by Cynthia Gorney (with photographs by John Stanmeyer, 'Machisma: How A Mix Of Female Empowerment And Steamy Soap Operas Helped Bring Down Brazil's Fertility Rate and Stoke Its Vibrant Economy', *National Geographic*, 220:3, (September, 2011), n.p.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Part Two:

Chapter 4.

Fig. 5.0 Deborah Reis, 'Feliz Natal' ['Happy Christmas'], Deborah Reis on Facebook, 12 December 2014.

(Image: <https://www.facebook.com/photo.php?fbid=10205506497210490&set=pb.1493261988.-2207520000.1432288715.&type=3&theater>, accessed December 2014)

Fig. 5.1 Advertisement, *National Geographic Brasil*, July 2000, pp. 2-3.

(Image: *National Geographic Brasil* Digital Archive)

Fig. 5.2 Advertisement, *National Geographic Brasil*, July 2000, p. 169.

(Image: *National Geographic Brasil* Digital Archive)

Fig. 5.3 Advertisement, *National Geographic Brasil*, July 2000, p. 13.

(Image: *National Geographic Brasil* Digital Archive)

Fig. 5.4 Captain Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, p. 398.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 5.5 Marina Moraes, (fotos de Capitão Albert W. Stevens), 'Grandes Reportagens: a terra é verde. Formigas gigantes, onças à espreita, piranhas, corredeiras, mosquitos, malária. As descobertas e os sustos de uma exoedição de hidroavião à Amazônica em 1924' ['Big Reports: the land is green. Giant ants, jaguars lurking, piranhas, rapids, mosquitoes, malaria. The findings and the scares of an expedition by hydroplane to the Amazon in 1924'], *National Geographic Brasil*, July 2000, pp. 156-157.

(Image: *National Geographic Brasil* Digital Archive)

Fig. 5.6 Author viewing article written by Captain Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, pp. 398-399.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 5.7 Author viewing article written by Captain Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, pp. 398-399.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, March 2014)

Fig. 5.8 Captain Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, p. 397.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 5.9 Ricardo Beliel, 'Mais Brasil: Angolanos no Rio. Fugitivos da Guerra em seu país, imigrantes de Angola vivem hoje em comunidade no centro velho do Rio de Janeiro – onde, há um século, influências africanas germinaram o samba carioca' ['Little Africa: Living in a community in Rio de Janeiro, people from Angola recreate the environment where samba and carnival were born.], *National Geographic Brasil*, February 2003, pp. 116-117.

(Image: *National Geographic Brasil* Digital Archive)

Fig. 5.10 Marcio Scavone, 'Oriente Próximo: No Bairro da Liberdade em São Paulo, reside o espírito dos 100 anos da imigração japonesa no Brasil ['Near East: In Liberdade in São Paulo, the spirit of 100 years of Japanese immigration to Brazil resides'], *National Geographic Brasil*, June 2008, pp. 42-43.

(Image: *National Geographic Brasil* Digital Archive)

Fig. 5.11 Marcio Scavone, 'Oriente Próximo: No Bairro da Liberdade em São Paulo, reside o espírito dos 100 anos da imigração japonesa no Brasil ['Near East: In Liberdade in São Paulo, the spirit of 100 years of Japanese immigration to Brazil resides'], *National Geographic Brasil*, June 2008, pp. 48-49.

(Image: *National Geographic Brasil* Digital Archive)

Fig. 5.12 Marcio Scavone, 'Oriente Próximo: No Bairro da Liberdade em São Paulo, reside o espírito dos 100 anos da imigração japonesa no Brasil ['Near East: In Liberdade in São Paulo, the spirit of 100 years of Japanese immigration to Brazil resides'], *National Geographic Brasil*, June 2008, pp. 54-55.

(Image: *National Geographic Brasil* Digital Archive)

Fig. 5.13 Yukata for sale in shop on Rua Galvão Bueno, in Liberdade, Sao Paulo.

(Image: photograph taken by author in Liberdade, Sao Paulo, May 2014)

Fig. 5.14 Geta for sale outside shop on Rua Galvão Bueno, in Liberdade, Sao Paulo.

(Image: photograph taken by author in Liberdade, Sao Paulo, May 2014)

Fig. 5.15 Marcio Scavone, 'Miss Tanabata', Print, 2007.

(Image: taken by author at Sandra Higgins Fine Art Gallery, London, December 2014)

Fig. 5.16 Marcio Scavone, 'O Calendario', Print, 2007.

(Image: taken by author at Sandra Higgins Fine Art Gallery, London, December 2014)

Chapter 5.

Fig. 6.0 Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, August 2013, pp. 126-127.

(Image: *National Geographic Brasil* Archive, Sao Paulo)

Fig. 6.1 Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, August 2013, pp. 126-127.

(Image: *National Geographic Brasil* Archive, Sao Paulo)

Fig. 6.2 Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, August 2013, pp. 120-121.

(Image: photograph taken by author at *National Geographic Brasil* Archive, Sao Paulo)

Fig. 6.3 Paulo Siqueira, Untitled, Photograph, 2013.

(Image: Paulo Siqueira)

Fig. 6.4 Paulo Siqueira, Untitled, Photograph, 2013.

(Image: Paulo Siqueira)

Fig. 6.5 Paulo Siqueira, Untitled, Photograph, 2013.

(Image: Paulo Siqueira)

Fig. 6.6 Paulo Siqueira, Untitled, Photograph, 2013.

(Image: Paulo Siqueira)

Fig. 6.7 Paul Patrick Borhaug, 'ONG associa alta taxa de suicídio entre índios jovens a problemas fundiários', *Estado de Sao Paulo*, 9 October 2013.

(Image: <http://politica.estadao.com.br/blogs/roldao-arruda/ong-associa-alta-taxa-de-suicidio-entre-indios-jovens-a-problemas-fundiarios/>, accessed 17 February 2015)

Fig. 6.8 Author viewing the article written by Nadia Shira Cohen, (with photographs by Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, digital edition, August 2013, n.p.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.9 Author viewing the article written by Nadia Shira Cohen, (with photographs by Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, digital edition, August 2013, n.p.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.10 Author viewing the article written by Nadia Shira Cohen, (with photographs by Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, digital edition, August 2013, n.p.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.11 Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, digital edition, August 2013, n.p.

(Image: screen grab taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.12 Author viewing the article written by Nadia Shira Cohen, (with photographs by Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, digital edition, August 2013, n.p.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.13 Author viewing the article written by Nadia Shira Cohen, (with photographs by Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, digital edition, August 2013, n.p.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.14 Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, digital edition, August 2013, n.p.

(Image: screen grab taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.15 Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, digital edition, August 2013, n.p.

(Image: screen grab taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.16 Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, digital edition, August 2013, n.p.

(Image: screen grab taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.17 Author viewing the film produced by Nadia Shira Cohen and Paulo Siqueira in association with Planeta Susteneval, entitled 'Hopeless: the government neither indemnifies the farmers nor regulates the indigenous lands', included in 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, digital edition, August 2013, n.p.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.18 Film Still, Nadia Shira Cohen and Paulo Siqueira in association with Planeta Susteneval, 'Hopeless: the government neither indemnifies the farmers nor regulates the indigenous lands', 0.03.

(Image: screen grab taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.19 Film Still, Nadia Shira Cohen and Paulo Siqueira in association with Planeta Susteneval, 'Hopeless: the government neither indemnifies the farmers nor regulates the indigenous lands', 0.09.

(Image: screen grab taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.20 Film Still, Nadia Shira Cohen and Paulo Siqueira in association with Planeta Susteneval, 'Hopeless: the government neither indemnifies the farmers nor regulates the indigenous lands', 0.18.

(Image: screen grab taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.21 Film Still, Nadia Shira Cohen and Paulo Siqueira in association with Planeta Susteneval, 'Hopeless: the government neither indemnifies the farmers nor regulates the indigenous lands', 0.22.

(Image: screen grab taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.22 Film Still, Marcho Bechis, *Birdwatchers* (Italy and Brazil: Artificial Eye, 2008), 01.26.

(Image: taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.23 Film Still, Marcho Bechis, *Birdwatchers* (Italy and Brazil: Artificial Eye, 2008), 01.32.

(Image: taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.24 Film Still, Marcho Bechis, *Birdwatchers* (Italy and Brazil: Artificial Eye, 2008), 01.34.

(Image: taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.25 Film Still, Marcho Bechis, *Birdwatchers* (Italy and Brazil: Artificial Eye, 2008), 01.40.

(Image: taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.26 Film Still, Marcho Bechis, *Birdwatchers* (Italy and Brazil: Artificial Eye, 2008), 02.04.

(Image: taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.27 Film Still, Marcho Bechis, *Birdwatchers* (Italy and Brazil: Artificial Eye, 2008), 03.11.

(Image: taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.28 Film Still, Marcho Bechis, *Birdwatchers* (Italy and Brazil: Artificial Eye, 2008), 03.36.

(Image: taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.29 Film Still, Marcho Bechis, *Birdwatchers* (Italy and Brazil: Artificial Eye, 2008), 104.45.

(Image: taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 6.30 Film Still, Marcho Bechis, *Birdwatchers* (Italy and Brazil: Artificial Eye, 2008), 105.48.

(Image: taken by author, London, May 2015)

Conclusion.

Fig. 7.0 Captain Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, p. 397.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 7.1 Henry Albert Phillips, 'Air Cruising through New Brazil: A National Geographic reporter spots vast resources which the Republic's war declaration adds to strength of United Nations', *National Geographic*, October 1942, p. 519.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 7.2 W. Jesco von Puttkamer, 'Brazil protects her Cinta Largas', *National Geographic*, September 1971, p. 440-441.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 7.3 W. Jesco von Puttkamer, 'Last Days of Eden: Rondonia's Urueu-Wau-Wau Indians', *National Geographic*, December 1988, pp. 812-813.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 7.4 David Alan Harvey, 'Where Brazil was Born: Bahia', *National Geographic*, August 2002, p. 79.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 7.5 Michael Nichols, *National Geographic Fashion*, ed. by Cathy Newman (Washington D.C.: National Geographic Society, 2001), p. 13.

(Image: photograph taken by Jonathan Vickers, London, February 2014)

Fig. 7.6 John Stanmeyer, 'Machisma: How A Mix Of Female Empowerment And Steamy Soap Operas Helped Bring Down Brazil's Fertility Rate and Stoke Its Vibrant Economy', *National Geographic*, 220:3, (September, 2011), pp. 118-9

(Image: photograph scanned by author, London, March 2015)

Fig. 7.7 John Stanmeyer, 'Machisma: How A Mix Of Female Empowerment And Steamy Soap Operas Helped Bring Down Brazil's Fertility Rate and Stoke Its Vibrant Economy', *National Geographic*, 220:3, (September, 2011), n.p.

(Image: screen grab from <http://ngm.nationalgeographic.com/2011/09/girl-power/stanmeyer-photography#/08-fashion-boutique-670.jpg> taken by author, London, July 2014)

Fig. 7.8 Marina Moraes, (fotos de Capitão Albert W. Stevens), 'Grandes Reportagens: a terra é verde. Formigas gigantes, onças à espreita, piranhas, corredeiras, mosquitos, malária. As descobertas e os sustos de uma exoedição de hidroavião à Amazônica em 1924' ['Big Reports: the land is green. Giant ants, jaguars lurking, piranhas, rapids, mosquitoes, malária. The findings and the scares of an expedition by hydroplane to the Amazon in 1924'], *National Geographic Brasil*, July 2000, pp. 156-157.

(Image: *National Geographic Brasil* Digital Archive)

Fig. 7.9 Ricardo Beliel, 'Mais Brasil: Angolanos no Rio. Fugitivos da Guerra em seu país, imigrantes de Angola vivem hoje em comunidade no centro velho do Rio de Janeiro – onde, há um século, influências africanas germinaram o samba carioca' ['Little Africa: Living in a community in Rio de Janeiro, people from Angola recreate the environment where samba and carnival were born.], *National Geographic Brasil*, February 2003, pp. 116-117.

(Image: *National Geographic Brasil* Digital Archive)

Fig. 7.10 Robert W. Madden, 'Yanomamo, the True People', *National Geographic*, August 1976, p. 211.

(Image: *National Geographic* Digital Archive)

Fig. 7.11 Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, August 2013, pp. 126-127.

(Image: *National Geographic Brasil* Archive, Sao Paulo)

Fig. 7.12 Paulo Siqueira, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, digital edition, August 2013, n.p.

(Image: screen grab taken by author, London, May 2015)

Fig. 7.13 Film Still, Nadia Shira Cohen and Paulo Siqueira in association with Planeta Susteneval, 'Hopeless: the government neither indemnifies the farmers nor regulates the indigenous lands', 0.09.

(Image: screen grab taken by author, London, May 2015)

Acknowledgements

I have come into contact with numerous people during the three year period spent researching and writing this thesis, which was generously funded by the AHRC. First and foremost, I would like to thank Dr Rebecca Arnold. I have benefited greatly from her critical advice, support, enthusiasm and friendship throughout.

In Washington D.C., I would like to record my thanks to the following at *National Geographic*: Renee Braden, Susan Welchman, Cathy Newman, Cynthia Gorney, John Stanmeyer, Annie Griffiths Belt, and Amy Kolczak (in addition to part-time contributors, Valerie Mendes and Professor Joanne Eicher), but particularly to Heidi Schultz, who was so interested in the project, and put me in touch with colleagues in Sao Paulo.

In Sao Paulo, I would like to thank the following at *National Geographic Brasil*: Ronaldo Ribeiro, Roberto Matsui, Matthew Shirts, Ricardo Beliel, Marcio Scavone, Nadia Shira Cohen and Paulo Siqueira, who were so relaxed, helpful and unremittingly enthusiastic. Thank you to Pedro Felipe at the Museu do Futebol, who showed me some fantastic photos from the inauguration of Pacaembu Stadium.

In Rio de Janeiro, I had useful and interesting conversations with Mari Stockler, Deborah Reis and Vincent Rosenblatt. Joanna at the Instituto Moreira Salles was also very helpful, as well as staff at the Biblioteca Nacional. Thank you to Amanda Calazans, who helped me with my translations, and saved me when my accommodation in Pavão Pavãozinho encountered difficulties.

In Goiana, I would like to thank Dr Rita Andrade for inviting me to give a paper to her students at PUC and for sharing ideas, in addition to Professor Paulo Cesar, at the Jesco von Puttkamer collection.

I am also very grateful to Virginia Rounding, for her thoughtful and critical comments, and continued support and advice. Thank you to Jonathan Vickers for encouraging me to look, and to think, in a more nuanced light, and for offering advice on previous drafts. I want to thank my parents, for allowing me to seek refuge out of London, and the Courtauld Slide Library, for providing a calm haven in London.

Finally, I would like to express my thanks to John Hemming who pointed me in a number of helpful directions, but also cast doubt on the merit of this study. He spurred me on to prove the opposite!

For Dziadek

(8th July 1925 – 26th October 2014)

Introduction. *National Geographic* as a Contact Zone.

As a popular 'scientific' and educational journal, *National Geographic* has self-consciously positioned itself as a voice of authority within mainstream U.S. print media, offering what purports to be an unprejudiced 'window onto the world'. In recent years, academic scholarship has critiqued the magazine's quasi-anthropological outlook, for organising hierarchies of race, gender, sexuality and identity and, under the guise of objective science, pursuing a form of U.S.-driven cultural imperialism.¹ *National Geographic* unquestionably constitutes a fascinating resource, yet to be seriously examined by scholarship, on the global use of dress and fashion to construct and perform individual, social, cultural, national and international identities. Despite a growing number of interdisciplinary and cross-cultural examinations of 'non-Western' dress and fashion since the early 1990s, that dress and fashion historians are yet to conduct an in-depth analysis of *National Geographic* can be understood as part of a

¹ The four key critical monographs on *National Geographic* to date that will be addressed in the introduction to this thesis are: Catherine A. Lutz and Jane L. Collins, *Reading National Geographic* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1993); Linda Steet, *Veils and Daggers: A Century of National Geographic's Representation of the Arab World* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2000); Tamar Y. Rothenberg, *Presenting America's World: Strategies of Innocence in National Geographic Magazine, 1888-1945* (Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing, 2007); Stephanie L. Hawkins, *American Iconographic: National Geographic, Global Culture, and the Visual Imagination* (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2010).

Other critical studies of *National Geographic* have included: Philip J. Pauly, 'The World and All That is In It: The National Geographic Society, 1888-1918', *American Quarterly*, 31.4 (1979), 517-32 (p. 523); Howard S. Abramson, *National Geographic: Behind America's Lens on the World* (New York: Crown Publishers, 1987); Joan Gero and Dolores Root, 'Public Presentations and Private Concerns: Archaeology in the Pages of National Geographic', in *The Politics of the Past*, ed. by Peter Gathercole and David Lowenthal (London: Unwin Hyman, 1990), pp. 19-37; Lisa Bloom, 'Constructing Whiteness: Popular Science and *National Geographic* in the Age of Multiculturalism', *Configurations*, 2.1 (1994), 15-32; Alison Devine Nordstrom, 'Wood Nymphs and Patriots: Depictions of Samoans in *The National Geographic Magazine*', *Visual Sociology*, 7. 2 (1992), 49-59; Julie A. Tuason, 'The Ideology of Empire in *National Geographic Magazine's* Coverage of the Philippines, 1898-1908', *Geographical Review*, 89.1 (1999), 34-53; Susan Schulten, *The Geographical Imagination in America, 1880-1950* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001); Radhika Parameswaran, 'Local Culture in Global Media: Excavating Colonial and Material Discourses in *National Geographic*', *Communication Theory*, 12.3 (2002), 287-315; David R. Jansen, 'American National Identity and the Progress of the New South in "National Geographic Magazine"', *Geographical Review*, 93.3 (2003), 350-69; Robert M. Poole, *Explorer's House. 'National Geographic' and the World it Made* (New York: Penguin, 2004).

larger scholarly tendency to privilege enquiries into ‘Western’ high fashion.² A revisionist examination of *National Geographic* needs to bridge this perceived gap between the West and the non-West.³ It needs to consider, firstly, what the magazine can tell us about the dress and fashion choices of the individual subjects represented and their interactions with global culture. Secondly, and of equal importance, it needs to scrutinise the magazine’s own representational agenda, and consider how the magazine may have used dress to fashion an *idea* of the different peoples and places represented.

This thesis contributes to widening academic research on *National Geographic*, conducted so far by sociologists, anthropologists, feminists and postcolonial theorists. These scholars have equated the gaze of *National Geographic* with masculine, imperialist power, but failed to acknowledge the fundamental social, cultural, economic and political role that dress has played within photographs and text published within the magazine, whether as a form of *submission*, or crucially, of *resistance*. This thesis uses an interdisciplinary framework, developed from my perspective as a dress historian trained in art history, to interrogate previous academic scholarship on *National Geographic*. Brazil has been chosen as a case study to focus

² Three notable examples of interdisciplinary and cross-cultural examinations on ‘non-Western’ dress and fashion that have been influential to this thesis are: Jennifer Craik, *The Face of Fashion: Cultural Studies in Fashion* (London: Routledge, 1993); Margaret Maynard, *Dress and Globalisation* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2004); Susan B. Kaiser, *Fashion and Cultural Studies* (London: Berg, 2012).

³ I am aware of the pitfalls of employing the generalised and ambiguous terms, Western and non-Western, which are centred upon a dichotomy that implies the West is the standard by which everything else is measured. These concepts are particularly unhelpful and reductive within the context of Latin America which, geographically, is certainly a Western landmass, but also given the multiple and interconnected dress and fashion systems that co-exist, interact and compete throughout the world. Nevertheless, in the absence of more appropriate terminology, for the purposes of this thesis I use the term ‘Western’ to refer broadly to cultural and sartorial systems that have emerged from the United States and Western Europe. I hope that readers will understand what is meant by this usage, rather than enter into an ideological and semantic debate that is beyond the confines of this thesis.

Sarah Cheang engages with similar issues in her examination of exotic location fashion shoots produced by Patrick Demarchelier, Mario Testino and Tim Walker, and published in British *Vogue* since the mid-2000s. Sarah Cheang, ‘To The Ends of the Earth’: Fashion and Ethnicity in the *Vogue* Fashion Shoot’ in *Fashion Media: Past and Present*, ed. by Djurdja Bartlett, Shaun Cole and Agnes Rocamora (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2013), pp. 35-45.

and sharpen a cross-cultural and dress-historical analysis of *National Geographic* and Brazilian subjects represented within it. Brazil is often portrayed in mainstream U.S. fashion media through recurring stereotypes that focus on Carnival, samba, and thong bikinis worn on *Copacabana* beach, but these exotic images of cultural difference fail to appreciate the internal subtleties of the country's racial, religious, social, cultural, geographical and sartorial diversity.⁴ The development of Brazilian dress and fashion reflects a long history of cross-cultural contact, slavery and immigration, in a complex and fluid process by which Brazil, now the fifth largest and fifth most populous country in the world, has since its colonisation by the Portuguese in 1500 absorbed but also re-interpreted multiple influences that stem from its indigenous populations, as well as from Europe, Africa, Asia and the United States.

The history of Brazil embodies the slipperiness of the tensions between the Western and the non-Western, and raises interesting questions about how *National Geographic* has articulated a recognisable image of the country within its pages.⁵ In geographical terms, Brazil is certainly a Western nation. Moreover, it is affiliated with the West in terms of its developing free-market economy, its large export supplies of raw materials and manufactured goods, its transition to a democratic constitution following the end of the authoritarian military regime in 1985, its high cultural institutions, and its adoption of Christianity and the Portuguese language. Brazil also enjoys a regional hegemonic influence in Latin America that raises doubt about

⁴ Rita Andrade and Regina Root, 'Dress, Body and Culture in Brazil', <<http://www.bergfashionlibrary.com/viewencyclopedia/bewdf/BEWDF-v2/EDch2064.xml>> [accessed 21 May 2015]

⁵ Although Brazil has many affinities with the United States, in terms of its vast territory in the Western hemisphere, and its racial, ethnic and cultural multiplicity as a result of European colonial conquest, slavery and immigration, making a sustained comparison between the two is not the concern of this thesis.

simplistic assertions of U.S. cultural imperialism.⁶ However, Brazil might still be considered a non-Western nation with regard to its incomplete infrastructure, socioeconomic disparities, unequal distribution of wealth and land, poor standards of public health, and its popular and material culture which constitutes, as David Hess and Roberto DaMatta have succinctly articulated, a unique site in which ‘Western culture has mixed and mingled with non-Western cultures for centuries’.⁷ Brazil can thus be understood as a microcosm of the world as a whole and as such, just as *National Geographic* has attempted to encapsulate within its pages, ‘The World and All That Is In It’, provides a revealing case study through which to examine how global identities have been asserted, negotiated and *re-negotiated* in the magazine through the representation of Brazilian dress and fashion.⁸ These fluid intersections and entanglements have particular relevance in the transitional post-1988 timeframe under examination, and offer the potential for the diversity that is evident *within* Brazilian borders, to cast a light upon *National Geographic’s* search for difference *across* national boundaries.⁹

⁶ In 1991 Joseph D. Straubhaar examined the effects of U.S. media expansion and used the term ‘asymmetrical interdependence’ to describe the multiple relationships that exist between Brazil and the United States, which have moved beyond media imperialism, and towards differentiated degrees of shared cultural, economic and political power. His argument was centred upon an understanding of media audiences as critical and active participants, rather than passive and dominated. Their interpretations were nonetheless conditioned by their gender, class, age, political views and interests.

Joseph D. Straubhaar, ‘Beyond Media Imperialism: Asymmetrical Interdependence and Cultural Proximity’, *Critical Studies in Mass Communication*, 8 (1991), 39-59.

⁷ David J. Hess and Robert A. DaMatta, ‘Introduction’ in *Brazilian Puzzle: Culture on the Borderlands of the Western World*, ed. by Hess and DaMatta (New York: Columbia University Press, 1995), p. 2.

⁸ Alexander Graham Bell quoted in Pauly, ‘The World and All That is In It’, p. 523.

⁹ This timeframe, and my use of Brazil as a case study, are both vastly underrepresented in *National Geographic* scholarship. The only comment made to date on the magazine’s representation of Brazil was provided by Catherine Lutz and Jane L. Collins in 1990, who argued that, as in much popular media, Brazil is represented as ‘a kind of sister state to the United States, complete with the same vast area, wealth of resources, frontier with Indians, and much immigration [...] Brazil’s experience is identified with that of the United States but then distinguished from it. As with many other countries in the popular imagination, their present is our past.’ The comparisons between the United States and Brazil in *National Geographic* have not been so systematic as Lutz and Collins imply but, rather, have been used at key moments to highlight the similarities between the two countries, in attitudes, interests, dress and

This introduction will outline the theoretical framework and research methodologies that will be used to knit the fabric of this thesis together. It begins with an examination of French artist Cyprien Gaillard's pop-up artwork, 'L'Origami du Monde', which was published in *O32c* in October 2013 to coincide with *National Geographic*'s 125th anniversary.¹⁰ Gaillard's artwork will be used to cast a contemporary light on *National Geographic* and provide a brief history of the development of the magazine since it was established in 1888. *National Geographic* will be conceptualised as a 'contact zone', a term coined by Mary Louise Pratt, an American scholar of Spanish and Portuguese Languages and Literature, to describe a space in which different cultures come into contact with one another and establish on-going interactions.¹¹ A critical assessment will be made of the important previous scholarship conducted on *National Geographic* which this thesis expands upon. My modus operandi, however, is to outline the original avenues of critique and discussion provided by a phenomenological approach towards dress and its visual, textual and material representation. I will unpick why the transitional post-1988 timeframe, which coincides with *National Geographic*'s centennial, has been selected as the focus for an examination of the magazine. I explain the 'snapshot' approach that will be used throughout to zoom in and focus on my central case studies, which re-enact eleven particularly charged and complex cross-cultural encounters in the fabric of *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil*'s representation of Brazilian dress. I will

deportment, as part of a specific representational agenda that has drawn parallels with contemporary government policy. Lutz and Collins, *Reading National Geographic*, p. 125.

The only comment made to date on the magazine's representation of global culture has been by Radhika Parameswaran, who made a case study of the August 1999 millennium issue. She used a semiotic, feminist framework to make a critique of 'the *Geographic*'s discursive strategies, which focuses attention on the intricate, hierarchical structures of gender, race, and class that became entangled with the magazine's neocolonial rendering of global culture'. Parameswaran, 'Local Culture in Global Media', p. 288.

¹⁰ Cyprien Gaillard, 'L'Origami du Monde', *O32c*, Autumn/Winter 2013, pp. 160-67.

¹¹ Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation*, 2nd edn (New York: Routledge, 2008), p. 8.

define 'auto-ethnographic expression', a broad term used to describe how ethnographic subjects use cultural expressions to construct a dialogue in response to their ethnographic representation by a dominant culture.¹² The multifarious and contradictory nature of dress demands an interdisciplinary methodological approach that can revise accepted and one-dimensional histories of *National Geographic*, provided by both the magazine and previous scholarship. In this vein, I outline the theories of the five multidisciplinary scholars whose concern with auto-ethnography and the construction of Brazilian identity informs the five chapters of this thesis. I move on to acknowledge my own auto-ethnography as the author of this thesis, and comment upon the self-reflexive methodology that is used throughout. I conclude by summarising the key research questions this thesis sets out to answer.

'L'Origami du Monde': Making Contact with *National Geographic*

To commemorate the 125th anniversary of *National Geographic*, a pop-up artwork by Cyprien Gaillard (1980-), entitled 'L'Origami du Monde' (Figs. 1.0 – 1.7), was published in the Autumn/Winter 2013 25th edition of *O32c*.¹³ It addressed the mixed readership of the Berlin-based bi-annual contemporary art, fashion and culture magazine, which is recognisable for its distinctive red glossy cover and thick binding, its innovative fashion imagery and thought-provoking content. Spread over seven full-bleed pages in *O32c*, 'L'Origami du Monde' reproduced five photographs selected from Gaillard's extensive collection of *National Geographic* magazines, which span the

¹² *National Geographic* is understood throughout this thesis to be a form of popular ethnography in the sense that it has systematically studied different peoples and cultures since 1888.

¹³ Cyprien Gaillard, 'L'Origami du Monde', *O32c*.

period 1888 to 1995.¹⁴ The richly coloured sequence comprised masked figures, abstract landscapes, undulating sea creatures, and expressive hands clutching U.S. dollar notes. There was no acknowledgement of *where* these photographs had been taken, nor *when* they had originally been published in *National Geographic*. However, in a 2012 interview with Sven Schumann for *Purple* magazine, Gaillard praised *National Geographic*'s outstanding photojournalism, particularly during the 1960s and 1970s: 'The quality of the reportage that they were doing at the time was so amazing. It's the kind of magazine your father had. It was this prism that you looked at the world through. There's something very colonial about it.'¹⁵ He equated *National Geographic* with a patriarchal, masculine gaze: one that was concerned not just with *seeing* the surrounding world, but that constituted a particular way of *looking* at it that, by extension, sought to acquire *control* over it.

Printed on bright yellow pages, a contextual accompaniment to Gaillard's artwork, written by Dieter Roelstraete, Senior Curator at the Museum of Contemporary Art, acknowledged the evolution of the 'paper empire' over one hundred and twenty-five years.¹⁶ *The National Geographic Magazine* was first published in 1888 as a slim terracotta-coloured technical journal produced by the National Geographic Society, which was based in Washington D.C. and comprised two hundred members, 'to increase and diffuse geographic knowledge'.¹⁷ Under its first full-time editor, Gilbert H. Grosvenor (1903–1954), it increased its outreach and developed into the popular glossy 'scientific' and educational magazine, with its

¹⁴ In an interview with Sven Schumann, Gaillard explained he has 'the entire National Geographic stock until around 1995, basically when it started to become a bit ugly'. He did not elaborate on the latter point. Sven Schumann, 'Cyprien Gaillard: Architectural Hangover', *Purple*, Autumn/Winter 2012, pp. 224-30.

¹⁵ Schumann, 'Cyprien Gaillard: Architectural Hangover'.

¹⁶ Dieter Roelstraete, 'L'Origami du Monde', *032c*, Autumn/Winter 2013, p. 162.

¹⁷ Anon., 'Announcement', *National Geographic*, October 1988, p.1.

distinctive yellow border and colour photography, which is familiar today.¹⁸ Within the contemporary global mediascape, *National Geographic* still casts a quasi-ethnographic gaze onto the purportedly exotic flora and fauna in the world each month to its 4,125,152 U.S. and 6,855,235 international readers.¹⁹ Although *National Geographic's* mainstream cultural production is addressed at a predominantly heterosexual male, middle-class and middle-aged audience, demonstrated by the advertisements published within it, the exact breakdown of readership statistics is difficult to ascertain, since a mixed, male *and* female readership, constituting a broad range of ages and social classes, has unquestionably come into contact with the magazine.

Renee Braden, Senior Archivist at the National Geographic Society, has explained:

It is hard to give exact figures because one person may subscribe, but the rest of the family reads. It's even harder to track viewers today. There's no need to subscribe even – you can now look online or buy it at a newsstand. Both men and women read it. Or a man subscribes, but his girlfriend, wife or kids borrow the magazine and read it. You can tell from the adverts though (for things like BMWs), the type of audience that we believe to read the magazine – mainly middle-class men, but also women. We believe that this audience is in the over 50s category. Our house style is 'readable and interesting' and so you can see that we are still trying to appeal to a mass audience.²⁰

This inability to pinpoint *National Geographic's* readership is largely due to its ubiquity, memorably dramatised in Elizabeth Bishop's 1971 poem, 'The Waiting Room', in which she recalled a crude memory of her six-year-old self, reading the February 1918 edition of the magazine whilst waiting for her aunt in a dentist's surgery in Worcester, Massachusetts.²¹ To date, *National Geographic* produces forty editions in local

¹⁸ C. D. Bryan, 'The Language of the Photograph', in *The National Geographic Society: 100 Years of Adventure and Discovery* (New York: Abrams, 1987), pp. 118-35.

¹⁹ Renee Braden, Personal Communication with Author, (National Geographic Headquarters, Washington DC, 17 July 2013). Refer to Appendix 5: Interviews.

²⁰ Braden, Personal Communication with Author.

²¹ Elizabeth Bishop, 'The Waiting Room', in *The Complete Poems: 1927-1979* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1983), n.p.

languages, in addition to its English-language version, and is a global brand that encompasses television, radio, films, music, books, DVDs, maps, exhibitions and merchandise.

Despite such developments at *National Geographic* to expand product lines and distribution outlets, Roelstraete captured the magazine from an observational perspective that rendered it a cast-off cultural artifact from a bygone, pre-Internet age:

Through the iconic yellow frame of a cover design that hasn't changed for over a century, we catch a glimpse of a steadily receding past – who needs *National Geographic* in the age of high-speed, hand-held image searching, memes, tumblrs, and various other types of 'viral' visuals? The coming of the Internet arguably ushered in the end of this particular chapter in the history of publishing culture, and this is precisely the moment – sometime in the nineties, when Gaillard was still a teenager – when *National Geographic* as a brand 'lost it'.²²

He stressed that *National Geographic's* authoritarian voice in mainstream American print media had been surrendered to digital reconfigurations of mass media, but also to 'the rise of political correctness ... emergence of postcolonial theory and assorted critiques of empire'.²³ Whereas Gaillard associated *National Geographic* with a patriarchal, colonial gaze, Roelstraete advanced one step further and removed any humanising aspect from this particular manner of looking at the world. Instead, *National Geographic's* 'all seeing eye', he asserted, has analysed, monitored and collected subjects, who have been exposed to an unmediated application of autonomous power that is 'not so very different, and geographically not so far removed, from that of the FBI or CIA – or, why not, the NSA'.²⁴

²² Roelstraete, 'L'Origami du Monde', p. 164.

²³ Ibid.

²⁴ Ibid., p. 166.

In 'L'Origami du Monde', Gaillard inverted that authoritarian gaze by placing it on the magazine, which he objectified and transformed, with the assistance of the *O32c* viewer, into a sculptural form that constituted a critical point of entry into *National Geographic's* complex history. The instructions that accompanied his artwork in *O32c* read:

Assembled from images that span more than 40 years of *National Geographic* magazine, Cyprien Gaillard's art edition for *O32c* can be assembled by making three simple folds from left to right into the inside hinge of the magazine. No glue is required. This anachronistic monument is held together by tension.²⁵

The meaning of 'L'Origami du Monde' was therefore dependent upon the *O32c* viewer, who had to assemble it with her hands, and thereby acquired an *active* as opposed to *passive* participatory role in its construction as image *and* object. The magazine had to be placed on a flat surface and its tactile, matte pages, distinct from the high-gloss sheen of *National Geographic*, manipulated as three folds were gently curled in towards its spine, and carefully balanced. The result was a subjective and sculpted reconstruction of *National Geographic*, which emphasised a level of artifice and mutability in the magazine's purportedly objective and linear historical account of the world. Time and space collapsed and merged into a singular, imaginative and *contingent* (in the sense that the artwork had to be disassembled in order for the viewer to read the remainder of the magazine) structure through a constructive process that was instigated by Gaillard, and fulfilled by the *O32c* viewer, who was directly implicated in the artistic practice. This collaborative act between performing individuals in response to a governing power, *National Geographic*, corresponded with Ariela Azoulay's use of the rhetorical device she has termed 'the civil contract of

²⁵ Matthew Evans, 'HAPPY BIRTHDAY NATIONAL GEOGRAPHIC', *O32c*, Autumn/Winter 2013, p. 159.

photography'.²⁶ Azoulay complicated the one-directionality of power that Susan Sontag attributed to mass-media images and asserted that, rather than fatigued and image-saturated, viewers are global citizens: active, aware and, by extension, politically informed and capable of alternative interpretation.²⁷ Gaillard's sculpture was not a mere aestheticisation of *National Geographic*, but a critical re-presentation of the magazine during the build-up to, and celebrations of, its 125th anniversary. He used *032c* as site and vehicle for a critical and tactile re-engagement with the ethnographic gaze now widely equated in academic scholarship with the yellow-bordered frame of *National Geographic*, and encouraged *032c* viewers to do the same. Rather than analyse the magazine at arm's length, as many of its harsher critics have, Gaillard intervened at close quarters, and in doing so blurred the boundary between two-dimensional, detached viewing and three-dimensional multisensory experience, highlighting how *National Geographic's* mode of documenting the world might be reclaimed through imaginative storytelling and narrative construction.

***National Geographic* as a Contact Zone**

'L'Origami du Monde' sculpted a critical perspective on *National Geographic* by creatively intervening in the ways that the magazine has synthesised and compressed diverse peoples and places, previously separated by geographical, temporal, cultural and ethnic disjuncture, into a single compact entity. In doing so, the artwork encapsulated what Mary Louise Pratt conceptualised as the 'contact zone'.²⁸ Pratt coined the term to describe real or imagined 'spaces where disparate cultures meet,

²⁶ Ariella Azoulay, *The Civil Contract of Photography* (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 2008).

²⁷ Susan Sontag, *On Photography* (London: Penguin, 1979); Susan Sontag, *Regarding the Pain of Others* (London: Penguin, 2004).

²⁸ Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, p. 7.

clash, and grapple with each other, often in highly asymmetrical relations of domination and subordination'.²⁹ Inherent within this space of encounter are notions of friction and conflict played out in a militant area, or amorphous zone, in which the spatial and temporal presence of disparate groups can be seen to intersect and establish ongoing interactions. Whereas Gaillard used the removed space of *032c* to put forward his critique, to slide open the glossy cover of *National Geographic* is to be confronted with an intrinsic critique that is mobilised through the magazine's own visual and textual eclecticism, which presents a recurrent repertoire of diverse expressions, gestures, poses, clothing and colours. A pertinent example can be seen in the 125th anniversary edition of *National Geographic*, published in October 2013, which documented encounters with the Democratic Republic of Congo, Kuwait, Nigeria, Afghanistan, India, Peru, Iraq, China and North Korea (Figs. 1.8 – 1.13).³⁰ Viewed in its entirety, it presented a complex portrait of the world that oscillated precariously between homogenous identification *of*, and heterogeneous identification *with*, the represented subjects. The interpretative emphasis shifted between two opposing poles: on the one hand, a distanced pleasure derived from the stereotypical exoticism manifest when privileged viewers observe geographically distant and often impoverished subjects, but simultaneously, a critical awareness of those diverse subjects as a site for potential, as knowing agents capable of constructing their own subjectivities through dress, pose and deportment.

The text catalysed this palpable tension and contrasted, to cite one example, 'witness', a noun suggestive of the distanced spectator, with 'relate', an empathetic verb indicative of identification. In a similar logic, conflicting statements posited

²⁹ Ibid.

³⁰ *National Geographic*, October 2013.

‘Photography is a weapon against what’s wrong out there. It’s bearing witness to the truth’ against ‘I fall in love with almost every person I photograph. I want to hear each story. I want to get close. This is personal for me.’³¹ This complex disjunction between the standardisation and differentiation of peoples and places that materialised from *within* the pages of *National Geographic* presented cross-cultural contact as an intricate and, crucially, *continually shifting* process of cultural exchange, as opposed to a static, deterministic state. Representation emerged as a complex cultural process, comprised of numerous spatial and temporal continuities and discontinuities, in which meaning was not inherent only in the clothing choices made by subjects, but has also been fashioned by *National Geographic* in response to modulations in the balance of global power. To recognise *National Geographic* as a contact zone enables the multiple subjects represented within it to be understood as *both* interacting agents who *self-fashioned*, and subordinate subjects who were *fashioned* by *National Geographic’s* quasi-anthropological gaze. This methodological framework thus enables the ambivalent and asymmetrical relations of power presented in *National Geographic* to serve as a point of departure, but not the straightforward conclusion, of the magazine’s representational agenda.

Re-addressing Previous Academic Contact with *National Geographic*

This thesis will revise accepted and standardised views, concerning *National Geographic’s* unchanging participation in an imperialist representational regime, which have emerged in a sustained critical commentary since the early 1990s. Catherine Lutz

³¹ Brent Stirton, *National Geographic*, October 2013, p. 37; Stephanie Sinclair, *National Geographic*, October 2013, p. 79.

and Jane L. Collins, Linda Steet, Tamar Rothenberg and Stephanie Hawkins have all condemned the primitivising and exoticising gaze that the magazine has routinely placed on non-Western subjects.³² It is important to acknowledge the potential reductiveness of such critiques, which assert that *National Geographic* has fixed *subjects* as dehumanised and essentialised *objects* within an imposed ethnographic present, a spectacle of the unknown and exotic Other.³³ This tantalising commentary has disregarded the possibility that dress, with all of its allied ambiguities, might operate in unexpected or strategic ways, sometimes even against the very representational contexts that have framed it.

Whilst none of these female North American scholars has explicitly focused on dress, its symbolic and semiotic function has been threaded throughout almost all of their arguments. Anthropologist Lutz and sociologist Collins conducted an ethnographic study of *National Geographic* from 1950 to 1986 and outlined its encyclopaedic and oppressive arrangements of race, gender, sexuality and identity. They compared the magazine to Edward Steichen's *Family of Man* exhibition at MOMA (1955), which featured five hundred and three photographs from sixty-eight countries and was extensively criticised for its promotion of an undifferentiated form of universal humanism embedded in U.S. Cold War propaganda. Lutz and Collins acknowledged that *National Geographic* has made a distinction between subjects wearing brightly coloured 'indigenous dress, tribal fashion, and/or ritual costume', indicative of 'an entire alien life-style, locale or mind-set', and those wearing 'Western dress', which implied a desire for 'social change, material progress, and ...a forward-

³² Lutz and Collins, *Reading National Geographic*; Steet, *Veils and Daggers*; Rothenberg, *Presenting America's World*; Hawkins, *American Iconographic*.

³³ I draw here on Edward Said's widely acknowledged discussion of the Western European ideological creation of an inferior Other. Edward Said, *Orientalism* (London: Penguin, 2003).

looking Western orientation'.³⁴ Similar conclusions about the Orientalist role of dress were drawn by Arab-American feminist scholar Steet in her examination of the magazine's systematic coverage of Arab peoples and cultures from 1888 to 1988. She argued that *National Geographic* has explicitly used non-Western dress to symbolise Arab women's alleged 'domination and backwardness', as opposed to Western-style dress, which has signified their 'emancipation and modernity'.³⁵ Rothenberg, meanwhile, used dress more implicitly in her examination of the magazine from 1888 to 1945. She criticised the 'strategies of innocence' used by *National Geographic* to present a utopian and altruistic vision of North American moral and technological supremacy abroad, and briefly outlined the exploitation of non-Western clothing to highlight distance and difference.³⁶ *National Geographic* photographer, Maynard Owen Williams, for example, posed individuals in 'full-costume' for the 'benefit of his camera'.³⁷ Rothenberg's own, limited use of the term 'full-costume' constructed a binary opposition between fashionable, modern dress and fixed, traditional costume, and demonstrated that her understanding of dress within the context of a transnational world was rather limited. Most recently, literary scholar Stephanie L. Hawkins' revisionist account of *National Geographic* from 1896 to 1954 has provided an important critique of previous scholarship, namely for its assumptions that 'readers are not *reading* the magazine so much as treating it as a picture book, mindlessly flipping through the photographs without pause for critical reflection'.³⁸ *National Geographic* viewers, she asserted, were not passive receptacles of cultural stereotypes, but active and critical participants who, rather than endorse the

³⁴ Lutz and Collins, *Reading National Geographic*, pp. 91-93.

³⁵ Steet, *Veils and Daggers*, p. 109.

³⁶ Rothenberg, *Presenting America's World*, p. 6.

³⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 112.

³⁸ Hawkins, *American Iconographic*, p. 10.

magazine's imperialist agenda, negotiated their own understanding of the multifarious identities in the world through the lens of this American 'icon'.³⁹ However, Hawkins failed to extend her analysis to understand active and critical *National Geographic* viewers as also embodied and clothed, who formed sensory and emotional connections with subjects represented in the magazine through the interconnected activities of looking, seeing, being, feeling and, crucially, *wearing*.

Although the important work contributed by these scholars cannot be discounted, they have neglected to consider the dressed body in the broader cultural sense as a tangible, three-dimensional site where complex forces meet. Rather than consider the subversive possibilities that are inherent in dress, and which demand a correspondingly multisensory response from viewers, Lutz and Collins, Steet and Rothenberg concentrated on the ways the magazine has used dress as a tool to oppress non-Western subjects and construct stereotypical narratives of exotic difference. They interpreted dress as a mere surface decoration, a secondary construction to the body, whereas this thesis is concerned with the dressed body as a unified whole: how it *feels* to be dressed, the *experience* of dress, how Brazilian subjects have *been* dressed by *National Geographic*, but also their own, embodied *practices* of dress.⁴⁰

³⁹ Ibid., p.13.

⁴⁰ Misty L. Bastian makes this distinction between understanding clothing as secondary to the body, and acknowledging the way that identity 'exist[s] in the very seams and folds of clothing: how clothing shapes bodies and even, in some cases, gives form to amorphous bodies'. Misty L. Bastian, 'Female "Alhajis" and Entrepreneurial Fashions: Flexible Identities in Southeastern Nigerian Clothing Practice' in *Clothing and Difference: Embodied Identities in Colonial and Post-Colonial Africa*, ed. by Hildi Hendrickson (Durham: Duke University Press, 1996), pp. 97-132 (p. 102).

A Phenomenology of Contact through Dress and the Photographic Object

This thesis extends previous scholarship by approaching dress not simply as cloth, but as a system of communication, whose many meanings are not fixed but *continually informed* and to an extent, even *performed*, by its visual, textual, and material representation. I draw here upon anthropologists Joanne B. Eicher and Mary Ellen Roach-Higgins' understanding of dress as 'an assemblage of body modifications and/or supplements', which takes into account both its material properties and expressive capabilities.⁴¹ This encompassing definition extends beyond clothing alone, but involves the numerous acts and products used to fashion the body, such as makeup, hairstyle, piercing, scarification, body paint and tattoos, which act as a non-verbal system of cross-cultural communication. It is useful to clarify here the distinction that I make between 'dress' and 'fashion'. I also define fashion within an expansive framework, as a concept that indicates change and permeates not solely dress, but many areas of life, including interior design, architecture, food, and even trends in academic thought. I examine fashion throughout this thesis as an ambiguous and additional value that is attached to dress, as well as its visual representation, which can be fast and throwaway street style, or rarefied and elite haute couture, but frequently capitalises upon its contradictory nature to negotiate the local and the global.⁴²

⁴¹ Joanne B. Eicher and Mary Ellen Roach-Higgins, 'Dress and Identity', in *Dress and Identity*, ed. by Mary Ellen Roach-Higgins, Joanne B. Eicher and Kim K.P. Johnson (New York: Fairchild Publications, 1995), p. 7.

⁴² Rebecca Arnold and Yuniya Kawamura have both expressed similar opinions and my understanding that fashion and dress, although closely related, cannot be used interchangeably, is informed by their thinking. Rebecca Arnold, *Fashion: A Very Short Introduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009); Yuniya Kawamura, *Doing Research in Fashion and Dress: An Introduction to Qualitative Methods* (Oxford: Berg, 2011).

If dress is the tactile layer that clothes the body, an exterior surface turned outward towards the gaze of the viewer, then it is simultaneously proximate to the wearer, who has an innate awareness of how clothing *feels* on her body, how it *touches* her body. This contradictory dynamic can be extended further to the viewer of a dressed body, since the viewer is also a *wearer*, who encounters the world through her own experience of dress, that double layer that both *has* a material surface but also *is* an exterior surface. Maurice Merleau-Ponty clearly indicated this entwining of body and clothing when he used a dress metaphor to foreground his phenomenological understanding of sensory perception: '*My body is the fabric into which all objects are woven*, and it is, at least in relation to the perceived world, the general instrument of my 'comprehension' [my italics].'⁴³ He asserted that an individual's experience of her body, and this is not just *a* body, but our *own, dressed* bodies, is the mediator for everything that she experiences in the outside world. Furthermore, every lived experience is a unity of our bodies and the world, the two of which are intertwined and cannot exist separately: 'Our own body is in the world as the heart is in the organism: it keeps the visible spectacle constantly alive, it breathes life into it and sustains it inwardly, and with it forms a system.'⁴⁴ Merleau-Ponty rejected a detached scientific and objective mode of viewing the world, and instead foregrounded the role of the dressed body in the act of making sense of our surroundings, accounting for the thoughts, emotions and memories evoked by touch. To make a phenomenological register of perception is to understand that contact between dressed *National Geographic* viewers and dressed Brazilian subjects was not *disembodied* and distanced, but a tactile and intimate encounter, whether

⁴³ Maurice Merleau-Ponty, *Phenomenology of Perception*, trans. by Colin Smith (London and New York: Routledge, 2002), p. 273.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 235.

acknowledged or unacknowledged by the viewer, which was woven into the sensory fabric of the magazine.⁴⁵

Not only has clothing provided a tactile surface through which the *National Geographic* viewer has perceived dressed Brazilian subjects, but the magazine itself is also a corporeal object that has clothed original photographs of dressed Brazilian subjects within a second, glossy skin.⁴⁶ To come into contact with *National Geographic*, whether it has been picked up, exchanged, sold, glanced through, read from cover to cover, collected, even thrown away, is to experience it as a sensory object, to *feel* its weight as it is held in the hands, to explore the texture of its pages. Contact is necessarily bodily, as Merleau-Ponty made palpably clear when he acknowledged that to touch is also to be touched.⁴⁷ It is through handling of itself that the magazine has communicated to viewers, not solely by means of linguistic signification of the two-dimensional image, but also via the sensations, memories, emotions, or *affect* evoked by the three-dimensional object. Laura U. Marks has insisted that the haptic and optic are not a dichotomy, but rather ‘slide into one another’; she uses haptic criticism as a means to “‘warm up” our cultural tendency to take a distance’.⁴⁸ This thesis argues that the direct physical contact *National Geographic* viewers have had with the magazine has demanded, however unwittingly, an instinctively visceral response, which has counteracted an overdeterministic awareness of geographical distance, in

⁴⁵ I use the term ‘dressed’ here, as opposed to ‘clothed’, in an attempt to acknowledge that, whereas a *National Geographic* viewer is likely to have experienced the world through Western-style clothes and accessories, the Brazilian subject represented in the magazine can be seen to have dressed in a variety of choices that range from Western-style dress to bodily adornment.

⁴⁶ Strictly speaking, *National Geographic* has not always constituted a ‘second, glossy skin’. Until the high-gloss centennial edition in December 1988, which had a hologram cover, the magazine tended to use thicker matte paper, which had a slightly rough texture. Occasionally this was interspersed with glossier pages; one example is the September 1971 edition of *National Geographic*. The 125th centennial edition in October 2013 was remarkably glossier even than the December 1988 edition, and the cover easily slid open so that the pages inside could be effortlessly flicked through.

⁴⁷ Merleau-Ponty, *Phenomenology of Perception*, pp. 368-69.

⁴⁸ Laura U. Marks, *Touch: Sensuous Theory and Multisensory Media*, (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2002), pp. xii-xiii.

favour of affective identification with multivalent Brazilian subjects. This approach marks a revisionist shift that departs from a reliance solely on distanced semiotic analyses of images of clothing in *National Geographic* as signified and textualised, and moves towards a more dynamic engagement with dress and fashion as image, object, text and idea intertwined.⁴⁹

The Global Contact Zone since 1988

The hypothesis of this thesis is that *National Geographic's* centennial, in September 1988, marked a paradigm shift at the magazine, from an understanding of itself as an exemplar of objective science, towards a more self-reflexive and performative subjectivity that has been driven by, and presumably has also driven, the forces of contemporary globalisation. Crucial to this shift is that the magazine consciously *encouraged* its readers to experience diversely dressed Brazilian subjects in a heightened, multisensory way, centred on the fact that the act of wearing dress, and the feel of it on our skin, is intimately linked to our tactile senses of interpretative looking. This thesis hypothesises that photographs since *National Geographic's* centenary edition in September 1988 have traced the beginnings of a different view of encounters within the United States-Brazil contact zone, which have resisted the processes of objectification, appropriation and stereotyping frequently associated with the rectangular yellow border. This is because they have provided evidence of a fluid and various population, which has selected and experimented with preferred elements of American and European dress, and used it to fashion their own, distinctly Brazilian identities. The period under examination has been selected because it coincided with

⁴⁹ Martin Lister, 'Introduction', in *The Photographic Image in Digital Culture*, ed. by Lister, 2nd edn, (New York: Routledge, 2013), pp. 1-21.

the end of the Cold War, and the unravelling of the fabric of a bipolar world, which gave rise to a fragmented but increasingly interconnected and fluid one. Globalisation is a complex and multidimensional process, which invites confusion unless it is given a recognisable and real-life form, and thereby invested with shape, colour, pattern and texture. It is in this respect that dress, as a multifaceted form of cultural expression, is well equipped as a basis to analyse the widespread economic and cultural exchanges that have transformed contemporary social life, and resulted in the interwoven processes of fragmentation and cross-fertilisation. The adoption of mass-produced Western-style clothing throughout the world might suggest that we are witness to a pervasive and homogenised global culture. This would equate globalisation, which unequivocally takes place on uneven and asymmetrical terms, with a one-directional force of cultural imperialism that has standardised, homogenised, Westernised and Americanised more vulnerable cultures.⁵⁰ Yet this oversimplified perspective does not account for the numerous cultural and stylistic particularities that have been mobilised when Western-style dress is worn in ambiguous ways, often reconfigured for local tastes, or adopted for different reasons, possibly even as a form of resistance to the West.⁵¹ Arjun Appadurai has pointed out that objects in cross-cultural networks have no intrinsic meaning but acquire new values through their exchange; in dress terms, the different contexts in which Western-style clothing has been worn reveal

⁵⁰ These critiques have been put forward by scholars such as: Benjamin Barber, *Jihad Versus McWorld* (New York: Ballantine Books, 1996); Samuel Huntington, *The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1996); Thomas Friedman, *The Lexus and the Olive Tree* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1998).

⁵¹ An example that springs to mind is the appropriation and re-presentation of Western designer labels by the Congolese *Sapeurs* in Kinshasa (Democratic Republic of Congo) and Brazzaville (Republic of Congo). See Elizabeth Kutesko, 'Problems and Tensions in the Representation of the *Sapeurs*, as Demonstrated in the Work of Two Twenty-first Century Italian Photographers', *Immediations: The Courtauld Institute of Art Journal of Postgraduate Research*, 3:2 (2013), 61-78.

articulations and re-articulations that are variable and dialectical, based upon their new uses and requirements.⁵²

Appadurai has theorised the complex interactions and exchanges of information and ideas since the late 1980s as a series of conceptual frameworks, comprised of constantly shifting and overlapping flows and interconnections between economic, political and cultural constructs. He coined the terms ideoscapes, technoscapes, mediascapes, ethnoscapes and finanscapes to describe these multiple realities, which shift in accordance with one another and establish tensions between the *warp* of cultural homogeneity and the *weft* of cultural heterogeneity.⁵³ It is within this hybrid space, where the *weft* is drawn through the *warp*, that new sartorial expressions are generated as two hitherto relatively distinct forms, types, patterns or styles of dress mix and match. Certainly, all cultures have been hybrid for a long time, as a result of trade, slavery, warfare, travel and migration, but the development of media and information technologies throughout the 1990s and beyond have substantially expanded the contact that different cultures have had with one another, and accelerated the speed at which these global interactions have occurred.⁵⁴ Jan Nederveen Pieterse has eloquently described hybridisation, and the heightened connectivity of contemporary global culture, as a process by which multifarious identities are 'braided and interlaced, layer upon layer'.⁵⁵ His use of a dress metaphor is a crucial reminder that globalisation, in its economic, political, cultural and technological dimensions, is intricately woven into everyday life; it shapes, encloses,

⁵² *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*, ed. by Arjun Appadurai (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1986).

⁵³ Arjun Appadurai, *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1996), p. 33.

⁵⁴ Marwin M. Kraidy, *Hybridity, or the Cultural Logic of Globalization* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2005), p. 21.

⁵⁵ Jan Nederveen Pieterse, *Globalization and Culture: Global Melange*, 2nd edn (New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2009).

exposes and interacts with different bodies, defining and expressing personal and collective identities, both of *National Geographic* viewers and of Brazilian subjects represented within its pages.

Snapshots of the Contact Zone

It is important to ground an analysis of hybridity in unique and individual examples, to ensure that the term does not denote an overgeneralised and undifferentiated form of fusion. In order to do so, I utilise a snapshot approach in my examination of the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic*. This is also in accordance with Pratt's acknowledgement that 'the complexities of life in the contact zone ... show up only in glimpses'.⁵⁶ I do not intend to provide an encyclopaedic account of the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic* but rather, in the words of Alexander Nemerov, to examine 'a patchwork of glimpses' that provide a means of coming into contact with the past through the 'photojournalistic precision of an instant in time'.⁵⁷ This thesis unpicks eleven snapshots from the fabric of *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil*, which are understood as a series of unique but interconnected case studies, threaded into the cultural and visual landscape of a particular time and place. As displaced fragments, snapshots should be addressed with precision and depth since they reflect a gaze that must be understood in anthropological terms as unequivocally conditioned by the social, cultural, political, economic and technological context that produced it. Hans Belting critically recognised this when he insisted that photography does not simply mirror the world but, rather, synchronises our shifting gaze with that world; it is

⁵⁶ Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, p. 52.

⁵⁷ Alexander Nemerov, *Wartime Kiss: Visions of the Moment in the 1940s* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2013), p. 2.

‘our changing gaze upon the world – and sometimes a gaze upon our own gaze’.⁵⁸ Not solely a record of something that existed in the world, a snapshot opens up interpretative possibilities for the viewer, who invests her own memories, imaginings, epistemological knowledge, experiences, emotions and preconceptions onto it, thereby forming interconnections with broader verbal, visual, textual and tangible systems of communication. A snapshot is a discernible marker embedded in the past, which embodies the flux and flow of the instant in which it was captured. Yet it also exists in the present, and is therefore mobile, with an emancipatory nature that invests it with the potential to distort the linearity of the historical past and, in doing so, destabilise the certainty of the contemporary present. To cite Nemerov, to view the snapshot is to bear witness to a complex interplay (of particular relevance to the discourse of dress, which continually interweaves past, present and future) as ‘what *was* and what *is* coalesce in eerie combination’.⁵⁹

My use of the term snapshot extends beyond its common usage in photography, where it is used to describe a spontaneous mode of amateur picture-making that often employs typical visual ‘mistakes’ such as off-kilter framing, double exposure and out-of-focus subjects, to refer to the complex combination of text and image within a *National Geographic* article.⁶⁰ Clearly, none of the photographs published in *National Geographic* were taken as snapshots: they do not share the technical inaccuracies of the genre, nor, for the most part, do they employ the ordinary subject matter of amateur photography, which has tended to focus on key moments or milestones achieved in life, such as birth, birthdays, weddings,

⁵⁸ Hans Belting, *An Anthropology of Images: Picture, Medium, Body*, trans. by Thomas Dunlap (Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2011), p. 146.

⁵⁹ Nemerov, *Wartime Kiss*, p. 2.

⁶⁰ Sarah Greenough, ‘Introduction’, in *The Art of the American Snapshot, 1888-1978*, ed. by Sarah Greenough and others (Washington: National Gallery of Art, 2007), pp. 1-6 (p. 1).

graduations and family holidays.⁶¹ Nevertheless, a crucial part of the interpretation of the snapshot lies in its selective editing and arrangement in the photograph album, and it is in this respect that an unmistakable parallel can be drawn with *National Geographic*. Although no glue, tears or ink scribbles are tangibly evident in *National Geographic*, the magazine has re-contextualised the family photograph album to serve as both a documentary record of the world and as a trigger for memory and recollection. It has constituted a space to order and control the interpretation of snapshots, as well as to alter or add to their meaning through the use of text, design, aesthetics, juxtapositions and layout, fabricating contradictory narratives that promote identification and familiarity with subjects, but also exoticism and Otherness. Patrizia di Bello, in her analysis of women's popular culture in the nineteenth century, points to the intersensoriality of photograph albums and magazines, which were part of a complex process through which 'vision was modernized ... into a fragmented, subjective experience by new technologies and visual entertainment machines which were operated by and operated on the body of the observer.'⁶² Di Bello acknowledges the subjective vision of the embodied observer, who becomes an active producer in the experience and perception of meaning in the magazine, a notion that is extendable to a contemporary analysis of *National Geographic* and its varied, individual viewers.

⁶¹ Richard Chalfen, *Snapshot Versions of Life* (Bowling Green, OH: Bowling Green State University Popular Press), p. 11.

⁶² Patrizia di Bello, 'Vision and Touch: Photography and Women's Popular Culture in the Nineteenth Century', in *Visual Delights: Exhibition and Reception*, ed. by Vanessa Tomalin and Simon Popple (Eastleigh: John Libbey Publishing, 2005), pp. 3-16 (p. 14).

Brazilian Auto-Ethnography and Structure of Chapters

As part of its analysis of individual snapshots, this thesis will identify instances of 'auto-ethnographic expression', which Pratt emphasised is a hybrid phenomenon of the contact zone. Auto-ethnographic expression is an autobiographical mode of writing, performing and reflecting upon the subjectivity of one's own culture; it is engaging and emotional, as opposed to putatively 'objective', and thereby differs from ethnographic accounts of a particular culture made by an ostensibly neutral and distanced observer, such as *National Geographic*. The process encompasses an appropriation of the idioms of the dominant culture, but also an infiltration by indigenous modes, which enable the auto-ethnographic subject to creatively and actively self-fashion and self-present. Pratt's formulation of auto-ethnographic expression is clearly informed by and expands upon the poststructuralist thinking of Brazilian scholar Silviano Santiago. Santiago coined the term 'writing back' in 1978 to refer to the palimpsestic process whereby Western literary practices are modified, re-presented or even resisted in part by Latin American writers, in order to provide space within Latin American literature for the reinscription of different and alternative modes of non-Western creative expression.⁶³ Brazilian dress is a form of auto-ethnographic expression, a sartorial manifestation of 'writing back', which has enabled Brazilian subjects to re-present themselves as *they* wished and to highlight some of the tensions, contradictions and nuances of their ethnographic representation by *National*

⁶³ Silviano Santiago, *The Space In-Between: Essays on Latin American Culture*, ed. by Anna Lucia Gazzola, trans. by Tom Burns, Ana Lucia Gazzola, and Gareth Williams (Durham: Duke University Press, 2001), p. 31.

More recently, Pratt has referred directly to Santiago's work and drawn upon his conceptualisation of the 'space in-between', defined by Pratt as 'a site from which she or he [the Latin American subject] can reflect back to the center images of itself that the center could never generate but from which it stands to learn'. See 'Modernity and Periphery: Towards a Global and Relational Analysis', in *Beyond Dichotomies: Histories, Identities, Cultures and the Challenge of Globalization*, ed. by Elizabeth Mudimbe-Boyi (New York: SUNI Press, 2012), pp. 21-48 (p. 32).

Geographic. Pratt acknowledged that 'whilst subjugated people cannot control what the dominant culture visits upon them, they do determine to varying extents what they absorb into their own, how they use it, and what they make it mean'.⁶⁴ Although auto-ethnographic expressions are predetermined to be understood differently by diverse readerships, this is not of primary concern, since they nevertheless 'constitute a group's point of entry into the dominant culture'.⁶⁵

To develop the analysis of dress as a multifaceted form of auto-ethnographic expression, this thesis utilises a multi-disciplinary analytical method. It has a hybrid structure whereby the first part, constituted by Chapters One, Two and Three, examines the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic*, while the second part, comprised of Chapters Four and Five, examines how the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic Brasil*, itself an exemplary auto-ethnographic expression, casts light upon these dominant representations of Brazil. Organised over these five interconnected chapters, the thesis mediates threads of thought from five theorists, each of whom have grappled with the auto-ethnographic construction of Brazilian identity in diverse and singular ways. It is not surprising that Oswald de Andrade, Robert Stam, Silviano Santiago, Roberto Schwarz and Renato Ortiz have all engaged with, and theorised, forms of auto-ethnography given their own mixed cultural identities and experiences of living and writing within different contact

⁶⁴ Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, p.7.

⁶⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 9.

In her investigation of the European reception of Japanese fashion designers in the 1980s, Dorinne Kondo has used the term 'auto-exotic gaze' to describe the Western gaze that non-Western cultures place upon their own cultures, which they translate into an exotic product that they then offer back to the West. Kondo's expression draws a parallel with Pratt's understanding of auto-ethnographic expression, since the process of auto-exoticism is, as Kondo pointed out, 'never *merely* a reinscription of the dominant' but rather contains 'a dis-ease that always contains an implicit threat to the colonizer's hegemony'. Dorinne Kondo, *About Face* (London: Routledge, 1997), p. 10.

zones.⁶⁶ Not only have these scholars woven dress metaphors into their writing, but their different disciplines have encompassed poetry, film studies, poststructuralist theory, literary criticism and anthropology.

The first chapter uses the work of Brazilian modernist author Oswald de Andrade (1890-1954) to examine the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic* in the first hundred years since the magazine was established.⁶⁷ It opens up a critical discourse with the magazine's representational politics and analyses to what extent it can be seen to have fulfilled a form of U.S.-driven cultural imperialism in its representation of Brazil. Through a close reading of three snapshots, which reflect three themes that are roughly chronological and reflective of three different gazes that *National Geographic* has placed on Brazil, my analysis brings to the fore the additional layers of complexity provided by a revisionist re-reading of *National Geographic* through dress. This paves the way for my second chapter, which uses the work of North American scholar of Brazilian film Robert Stam (1947-) to develop a complex and critical analysis of dress in the magazine's representation of Brazil in the period post-1988.⁶⁸ It examines the shift in *National Geographic's* representational policy, to a

⁶⁶ Andrade, for instance, was born in Sao Paulo in 1890 and lived there for the duration of his life, but was of mixed European and indigenous ancestry. Stam, also of mixed parentage, was born in the United States in 1941 and completed his PhD in Comparative Literature at the University of Berkeley in 1977. He has described his three-decade 'intense, palimpsestic cohabitation with all things Brazilian' as 'the fruit of a long personal connection to Latin America due to an important part of [his] family living there'. Santiago, on the other hand, was born in Brazil in 1936, received his PhD in comparative literature at the Sorbonne in 1961, and has taught in the United States and Brazil. His personal experience of living between different cultures has surely sparked his concern with Latin American hybridity. Roberto Schwarz was born in Vienna in 1938 but grew up in Sao Paulo, received his PhD at the Sorbonne in Latin American Studies in 1976, and currently lives and teaches in Brazil. His formulation of 'misplaced ideas' can be understood as a reflection of his personal experiences of feeling 'out of place' between these different cultures. Finally, Ortiz's conception of the neologism 'mundialization' is a reflection of his hybrid identity, as a Brazilian (b. 1947) who was educated in France and received his PhD at l'Université de Paris VIII in 1975, but now lives and works in Brazil.

Robert Stam, 'Acknowledgements' in *Tropical Multiculturalism: A Comparative History of Race in Brazilian Cinema and Culture* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1997), p. xi.

⁶⁷ Oswald de Andrade, 'Manifesto Antropofago', *Revista de Antropofagia*, 1.1 (1928), 6-7.

⁶⁸ Robert Stam, 'Hybridity and the Aesthetics of Garbage', *Cultura Visual en América Latina*, 9:11 (1998), <http://www.tau.ac.il/eial/IX_1/stam.html> [accessed 11 February 2015]

more performative and subjective approach, which was encapsulated by the September 1988 centennial edition. The magazine's increased concern with imagery over text is analysed, within which Brazilian dress can be seen to have insistently disturbed the spatial and temporal logic of representation. It contextualises the two snapshots examined, reflective of two themes that emerged within this timeframe, within a broader framework driven by the forces of contemporary globalisation. How fashioned subjects might break out of a particular gaze imposed upon them by the camera will be addressed in more detail in the third chapter, which uses the poststructuralist thinking of Brazilian theorist Silviano Santiago (1936-) to examine *National Geographic's* engagements with (Brazilian) fashion since 2001.⁶⁹ Over a timeframe of ten years, I present two snapshots that constitute the exception that proves (in the sense of tests) my hypothesis – that since 1988 *National Geographic* has moved from cool, distanced viewing, and towards an intimate and multisensory engagement with images as objects. Although the primary concern of this thesis is the printed magazine, the effects of enlarged and pervasive digital media networks cannot be ignored. *National Geographic* has metamorphosed since 1995 to incorporate these changes, constructing a website, and an iPad and iPhone edition of the magazine. In an effort to acknowledge these changes, this chapter extends the analysis to consider briefly the representation of Brazilian fashion on the *National Geographic* website. The fourth chapter uses the work of Brazilian literary scholar Roberto Schwarz (1938-) to extend the analyses made in the first three chapters to *National Geographic Brasil*, which was established in May 2000.⁷⁰ It examines three snapshots of Brazilian dress, which are organised chronologically. The analysis is attentive to the representational

⁶⁹ Santiago, *The Space In-Between*.

⁷⁰ Roberto Schwarz, *Misplaced Ideas: Essays on Brazilian Culture*, ed. by John Gledson, trans. by Peter Anti (London: Verso, 1992).

agenda of *National Geographic Brasil*: how it has confronted and re-presented earlier representational paradigms produced by *National Geographic*, but also how it has produced original modes of representation. The fifth chapter draws together the different strands examined in the previous four, using the work of Brazilian cultural critic and sociologist Renato Ortiz (1947-).⁷¹ It focuses on an article published in *National Geographic Brasil* in 2012, and briefly considers the representation of Brazilian dress in the digital iPad edition, making a link with the third chapter and its discussion of the *National Geographic* website. Each of these five chapters aims to be sensitive to the communicative possibilities and tactile intimations of dress, as well as, where necessary, its critical limitations.

Entering the Contact Zone: A Comment on Methodology and My Auto-Ethnography

It is important to comment upon my own auto-ethnography and where I situate my subjectivity as researcher in relation to the methodological framework of the contact zone that is used throughout this thesis. In conducting this examination of *National Geographic*, I necessarily enter the contact zone, and situate myself in dialogue, discussion and debate with a range of different subjects that I have come into contact with: predominantly those represented in the pages of *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil*, but also those inferred from the principally (but by no means exclusively) white or European-descended male readership, in addition to *National Geographic* staff in Washington DC and their Brazilian counterparts in Sao Paulo, as well as the numerous Brazilian, North American,

⁷¹ Renato Ortiz, 'Problematizing Global Knowledge – Genealogies of the Global/Globalizations', *Theory, Culture & Society*, 23 (2006), 401-03.

and European artists, photographers, fashion designers, writers and researchers that I have met throughout the process. My gender, age, sexuality, ethnicity, nationality, cultural background and religion has necessarily affected the subjective position that I have adopted, however subconsciously, throughout this project, and had a bearing on both my readings of race, and my understanding of the self-reflexive experience of the clothed body of the *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil* viewer in relation to the dressed Brazilian subject. It is useful to introduce myself at the outset: I am a twenty-seven year old heterosexual white British woman educated in the United Kingdom. My mother tongue is English, but I have learnt and practiced varying degrees of comprehension, written and oral proficiency in Italian and Brazilian Portuguese. As a dress historian trained in an art history tradition, with an understanding of the practical techniques of dressmaking and a keen interest in fashionable modes of clothing, I have an image-centred and material notion of what dress and fashion constitute, and how this is encapsulated through representation. I understand that not only is there a consciousness in the way that active subjects choose to dress and present themselves to the outside world, but that the images that surround us in print and digital media provide an additional layer of meaning that influences my own awareness, as a viewer *and* a wearer, of how identities are fashioned. I use art historical methods as a critical strategy to analyse images of dress heuristically; although focusing on eleven select case studies, I make a richer visual and material analysis, by allowing close examination of the photographic object to open out a broader discussion that draws on theory and context.

Whilst my use of Latin American scholars is intended to situate my own arguments derived from visual analysis in relation to contemporary writing on Brazilian

national identity, I am aware that my subjective position provides an additional, self-reflexive gaze onto *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil*.⁷² I understand this gaze to be a fundamental and integral part of the research process; it is a means of closely examining, with a revisionist imperative, images of Brazilian dress published in the magazine since 1888. I do not merely take into account the specific context of the time and place in which these images were first presented and perceived, but I also consider how my contemporary gaze might re-present them in the current day. A self-reflexive re-engagement with these images holds the potential for a contested history of *National Geographic* to be revealed whereby, as Elizabeth Edwards has articulated, the photograph itself acts 'both as a confrontation with the past and as an active and constituent part of the present'.⁷³ The images, or snapshots, that I discuss offer a site of potentiality, to identify points of fracture and distinction from the overdetermined arguments of previous scholarship. Whilst it cannot be denied that an asymmetrical dynamic of power has often been in operation between *National Geographic* photographers and their Brazilian subjects, in allowing the images themselves to perform on a broader stage across space and time, my method of analysis provides the opportunity for a counternarrative to be revealed, from *within* the representation of dress and fashion. In peeling back these layers of meaning, I hope that as I enter, and by extension, research, write and form evaluations from within the contact zone, new ideas, conversations, debates, and even histories will be produced. These discussions have the potential for the totalising and reductive view of *National Geographic*, as the ultimate archetype of the popular ethnographic gaze, to

⁷² My use of the pronoun 'her' for the reader, in addition to the photographs of myself holding *National Geographic* that are included throughout this thesis, is a means of foregrounding this autobiographical mode of writing and researching that situates myself self-reflexively in relation the primary material that I examine.

⁷³ Elizabeth Edwards, *Raw Histories: Photographs, Anthropology and Museums* (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2001), p. 7.

be re-engaged with in a way that might move beyond previous scholarship. This scholarship has undeniably constituted an important stage in the discussion of the magazine, but I suspect is by no means the definitive one.⁷⁴ This thesis can be understood in itself then as a moment of 'writing back', whereby I position myself self-reflexively as the auto-ethnographic writer, who undertakes the process of modifying, re-evaluating and re-presenting the historiography of *National Geographic*. My intent in doing this is to sculpt out a space within existing academic discourse for alternative histories of the magazine, which allow for the creative sartorial expressions of Brazilian subjects to be foregrounded, as opposed to silenced.

In taking into account my auto-ethnography, it is important to outline what was at stake in my selection of individual snapshots. Rather than impose any assumptions onto the primary material, I allowed the starting point to be the images themselves. In order to remain sensitive to the materiality of the magazine (and the digital screen of my iPad and computer screen), as well as to the reader/viewer's specific experience of interacting with it, this careful and close-up analysis could only have been conducted by me, since the experience was necessarily one of unequivocal subjectivity. During the numerous hours spent in London, Washington DC and Sao Paulo examining every single copy of *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil* to date, but also during the time spent thinking about and discussing the images with archivists, editors and contributors, I was concerned first and foremost with those particular images that

⁷⁴ It is certain that no-one can know exactly what *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil* viewers thought and felt at the exact moment in time and space that they engaged with the magazine. Such information on the magazines' readership is not the focus of the thesis but a different project that would constitute a cultural history of the *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil* reader to date. This project has already been initiated in part by Hawkins, who engaged with the National Geographic Society Archive's vast collection of letters in order to determine how readers directly responded to images published in *National Geographic*, through how they voiced their responses to the magazine in writing. Hawkins, *American Iconographic*.

revealed the nuances and complexities of Brazilian dress.⁷⁵ Whilst the complete archive of each issue of *National Geographic* produced to date is published and available to purchase inexpensively as a digital collection on DVD, the National Geographic Society Archive in Washington DC is far less willing to allow scholars and journalists access to its rich archival material, which includes correspondence sent between editors, contributors and readers, working drafts of articles, and unpublished photographs.⁷⁶ That my request for access was received favourably is likely due to the nature of my topic, which staff generally seemed more intrigued by than anxious of its potential to damage the reputation of the magazine. Nevertheless, once granted access to the archive, I was not allowed free reign, but could only access information within the Records Library by requesting microfiche and digital files related to particular articles. I was frequently informed that files were unavailable to view, and it was only through determination and insistence that I was able to examine all of the material related to the particular snapshots that I had selected previously, through close visual analysis of every edition of the magazine published to date in the British Library, London. The nature of my experience at *National Geographic Brasil* in Sao Paulo was markedly different to that in Washington DC, since access to archival material, although by no means as extensive, was fluid and open, and staff went out of their way to locate relevant files, which included unpublished photographs, readership statistics, and every edition of the magazine published to date. It was very easy to find out information verbally on the editorial processes of *National Geographic Brasil*,

⁷⁵ This close-up view, however, concerned as it was with the more subtle and performative qualities of dress as a material object, could not always adhere rigidly to its methodology, and occasionally, the term snapshot denotes not just one image, but a number of images. To try to level the data so that it could fit to a rigid methodology (of one snapshot constituting one photograph) would be to impose a false narrative onto the primary material, since the fluidity of the chosen snapshots also reflects how the meanings of the images themselves have shifted, and continue to shift.

⁷⁶ This reluctance is not surprising due to the highly critical nature of previous scholarship.

which had not previously been possible at *National Geographic*, but I was unable to view correspondence exchanged between contributors, editors and readers since this was largely conducted in conversation or via email. I was informed by staff at *National Geographic Brasil* that it was very interesting to respond to the questions that I asked as an outsider, since it prompted them to reflect upon their own identity and culture in a way that they had not previously considered. This was a good example of how entering the contact zone as a researcher can be a positive experience, since it enabled me to ask questions that might not have seemed important or interesting to a Brazilian researcher, and therefore highlights the importance of having an awareness of one's positionality as a researcher. Whilst at *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil*, I also conducted 15 semi-structured interviews in person, on Skype and via email that I recorded and later transcribed. Although I planned a series of questions in advance, these were reasonably open-ended to give the interviewees the opportunity to answer freely, and for the course of the interview to take a more natural direction in the form of an extended conversation.⁷⁷

I conducted all of these interviews in English, which leads me on to make a brief comment on my translation of Portuguese language materials throughout this thesis. I studied Brazilian Portuguese whilst researching my thesis, which enabled me to travel with ease around Brazil whilst on my study trip and to conduct translations of written materials for basic comprehension. I worked closely with Amanda Calazans to

⁷⁷ I found face-to-face interviews to be a more effective method of gathering information about the magazine, since they enabled me to clarify the interviewee's responses and to probe the information that they supplied a little more deeply. Although I still managed to collect very interesting results, I found email a less effective method of interviewing, since the interviewees tended simply to respond to my questions and I was unable, without sending another email, to adjust the interview accordingly, whether to make clarifications or to probe a response more deeply. Interviewees also differed in the length and depth of responses to my questions.

make a richer translation of the *National Geographic Brasil* articles that I had selected to focus on in greater detail. This cross-cultural and bilingual experience enabled me to grasp the meaning of Brazilian Portuguese words such as *saudade*, which has no direct English translation but is commonly used throughout Brazil to describe a feeling of nostalgia or longing. Collaborating with a native speaker was a good example of how productive it is to research and write from within the contact zone; this process prompted discussion and debate as the perspective of a twenty-five year old white Brazilian woman from the northeastern state of Pernambuco merged with my own interpretations. In my use of key texts written in Portuguese, such as Andrade's '*Manifesto Antropófago*', I relied upon the most comprehensive translation that I could find. I was not afraid to use my own knowledge of Brazilian Portuguese to question aspects of translations that I felt were ambiguous, and this is clearly highlighted in my footnotes. This was very important since I am well aware that the meaning of any text is often heterogeneous, both on its production and reception, and will read differently to subjects located in contrasting positions of power within the contact zone. Crucially, not being fluent in Brazilian Portuguese did not have a negative impact on my research, but was a productive dynamic that required collaboration with a native speaker, in a process that was fitting to the processes of reading, writing, researching and translating from within the contact zone. It means that this thesis, in its visual and written components, is truly the product of at least three contact zones, in existence between the United States and Brazil, the United Kingdom and Brazil, and Brazil and itself.

Research Questions

The structure of this thesis draws a parallel with Gaillard's creative construction of 'L'Origami du Monde' and can be understood as a contact zone through the way that it compresses space and time, and forms commonalities and conflicts, across the eleven snapshots examined. It seeks to unpick, investigate and analyse several key questions, and summarise the conclusions provided by an examination of these pulled threads in the fabric of *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil*. How has *National Geographic* fashioned and narrated an image of Brazil through its representation of Brazilian dress and fashion? How do these representational strategies relate to those of the broader global mediascape? How do the magazine's different gazes onto Brazilian dress and fashion reflect global, political, social, cultural and economic attitudes and agendas between the United States and Brazil? How might photographic snapshots of dress break out of these different gazes, whether ethnographic, documentary or fashionable, by enabling active Brazilian subjects to self-consciously fashion, through pose, performance, expression, gesture and the mobilisation of their own multiple gazes? How does the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic Brasil* cast a light upon *National Geographic's* representational strategies?

Part One.

Chapter 1.

Anthropophagy: the First Hundred Years of Brazilian Dress in *National Geographic*

- Snapshot 1: The Maku Woman's 'Old Piece of Cloth', April 1926
- Snapshot 2: *Paulista* Women's White Sportswear, October 1942
- Snapshot 3: The Cinta Larga Women's Black Body Paint, September 1971

Pratt emphasised that the contact zone delineated a charged site of entanglement between two unequal and separate cultural groups. She asked: 'What do people on the receiving end of empire do with metropolitan modes of representation? How do they appropriate them? How do they talk back?'⁷⁸ Brazilian modernist author Oswald de Andrade engaged with a similar set of questions when he published the '*Manifesto Antropófago*' (May 1928, hereafter referred to as the MA) in the first edition of Sao Paulo cultural review *Revista de Antropofagia*.⁷⁹ As one of the founders of the *Revista de Antropofagia*, Andrade created the metaphor of '*antropofagia*', translated from Portuguese into English as 'anthropophagy', at the height of modernisation in Brazil, when European modernist *avant-garde* movements were becoming increasingly influential to Brazilian artists and intellectuals.⁸⁰ He used

⁷⁸ Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, p. 7.

⁷⁹ Oswald de Andrade, 'Manifesto Antropófago', *Revista de Antropofagia*, 1.1 (1928), 6-7. Throughout this thesis I will use the annotated English translation of Andrade's work by Leslie Bary. Oswald de Andrade, 'Cannibalist Manifesto', trans. by Leslie Bary, *Latin American Literary Review*, 19.38 (1991), 38-47.

⁸⁰ It is important to note that Bary translated the 'Manifesto Antropófago' as the 'Cannibalist Manifesto'. Throughout this thesis, however, I prefer to use the translation 'Anthropophagic Manifesto'. This is because there is a difference in the etymology and history of the two nouns: 'cannibalism', defined as 'the practice of eating the flesh of one's own species', and 'anthropophagy', defined as 'the eating of human flesh by human beings'. *Oxford Dictionary* <<http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/>> [accessed 29 May 2015]

Mele Pesti discussed this distinction at length in Chapter 2 of her doctoral thesis. She pointed out that both terms, *antropofagia* and *cannibalismo*, existed in Brazilian Portuguese when Andrade was writing and, whilst they have similar connotations (as indeed they do in English), *cannibalismo* is a far more common word with 'a cargo of pejorative connotations'. Andrade's choice of the word *antropofagia* was therefore not accidental, but an intentional means of reversing the negative associations of *cannibalismo*, and placing the conceptual act of consuming human flesh in a novel and positive light. Mele Pesti, 'From an Intuitive Metaphor Towards a Working Cultural Model: "Anthropophagy" in Oswald de Andrade's "Anthropophagic Manifesto" and its Development in 20th Century Brazil' (unpublished doctoral thesis, Tallinn University, 2014), pp. 74-75.

the metaphor of digestion to conceptualise how the subordinate Brazilian subject consumed elements of a dominant European or North American culture, swallowed what was necessary, and defecated what was no longer of any use. This critical and creative process, which operated precisely in this uneven space of relationality between former coloniser and colonised, enabled the Brazilian subject to cannibalise the colonial cultural identity, in order to regurgitate an entirely new and distinctive one in postcolonial Brazil. Andrade deconstructed the negative connotations of cannibalism pervasive in popular Western discourses that condemned the barbaric and uncivilised flesh-eating Other.⁸¹ Instead, he offered a crucial antidote to such carnivalesque fictions of grotesquerie, and created a positive self-presentation of a Brazilian culture that creatively devoured dominant trends from abroad, addressing the specific themes of modernism, nationalism, primitivism and anti-colonialism in Brazil.

Andrade was a major representative of Brazilian *Modernismo*, an influential intellectual and artistic movement that emerged in Sao Paulo after the First World War and sought a critical response to European modernity which could re-position Brazil without neglecting national realities. This interdisciplinary movement included Brazilian artists Emiliano di Cavalcanti and Tarsila do Amaral, composer Heitor Villa-Lobos, sculptor Victor Brecheret and poet Mário de Andrade (no relation to Oswald). It was heralded by the Modern Art Week, held in Sao Paulo in February 1922, which celebrated the centennial of Brazilian independence from Portuguese colonial rule.⁸²

⁸¹ The collection of essays published in *Cannibalism and the Colonial World* addressed the Western fascination with the negative image of the savage and non-Western cannibal since Christopher Columbus' 'discovery' of the New World. *Cannibalism and the Colonial World*, ed. by Francis Barker, Peter Hulme, and Margaret Iverson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998).

⁸² Beatriz Resende, 'Brazilian Modernism: The Canonised Revolution' in *Through The Kaleidoscope: The Experience of Modernity in Latin America*, ed. by Vivian Schelling (London and New York: Verso, 2000), pp. 199-218.

Modernismo sought aesthetic independence from Europe and the United States, and conceptualised a distinctively modern Brazilian artistic and cultural identity that did not merely imitate vanguard art, literary and architectural movements, but *refashioned* them to address Brazilian concerns. It began with Oswald de Andrade's '*Manifesto da Poesia Pau-Brasil*' (March 1924) published in the *Correio da Manhã*, wherein he argued that Brazilian identity was situated in between the modern and the tropical.⁸³ This was followed by his tour de force, the MA, which resonated with *Modernismo*'s desire for a modern Brazilian cultural identity that could engage with the Primitivist art aesthetic currently in vogue in Europe. Andrade found inspiration in pre-colonial Brazilian culture and used the metaphor of anthropophagy to describe the process by which the Brazilian subject fashioned her modern national identity as autonomous and original, as opposed to dependent and derivative. This positive identification of giving a quality to something through the process of anthropophagy has been expanded upon by Beatriz Resende, who has pointed out that 'enemies deserve to be eaten only if they demonstrate special qualities [...] such as courage in battle and in defeat'.⁸⁴ Andrade celebrated anthropophagy as a critical strategy through which the Brazilian subject, rather than straightforwardly imitating or rejecting a foreign European or North American culture, swallowed its positive strengths, defecated what was of no use, and incorporated foreign thought into the native self.

The first seven non-linked short sections of the MA highlight its interrupted form, contradictory sentences, variety of allusions, fragmented visual spacing, and use of parody and puns:

⁸³ Oswald de Andrade, 'Manifesto of Pau-Brasil Poetry', trans. by Stella M. de Sá Rego, *Latin American Literary Review*, 14.27 (1986), 184-87.

⁸⁴ Resende, 'Brazilian Modernism: The Canonised Revolution', p. 207.

Cannibalism alone unites us. Socially. Economically. Philosophically [...]

* * *

Tupi or not tupi, that is the question [...]

* * *

I am concerned only with what is not mine. Law of Man. Law of the
cannibal [...]

* * *

What clashed with the truth was clothing, that raincoat placed between
the inner and outer worlds. The reaction against the dressed man. American
movies will inform us.⁸⁵

With no coherent narrative and numerous unfinished statements, the MA is difficult to interpret and must be understood, as Carlos Jauregui has emphasised, as 'a collection of surrealist phrases' as opposed to 'a systematic proposal'.⁸⁶ Ambiguity is abundant throughout Andrade's writing style, which intentionally interweaves numerous ambiguous meanings and interpretative possibilities in fragmented form. This critical strategy may have been intentionally deployed by Andrade to relieve the writer of complete and overdetermined control over his text, which is instead offered up to the reader to extrapolate further meaning. Dress, by its very ambiguity as a contradictory form of cultural expression subject to continuous repositioning, is a fitting medium through which to tease out and analyse a number of possible interpretative threads from the MA.⁸⁷

The MA presents an innovative form of Brazilian artistic expression, which rejects European styles of writing. This is explicit in the cannibalisation of the most well

⁸⁵ Andrade 'Cannibalist Manifesto', p. 38.

⁸⁶ Carlos Jauregui, 'Antropófagia', in *Dictionary of Latin American Cultural Studies* (Gainesville: The University Press of Florida, 2012), p. 25.

⁸⁷ Whether intended by the wearer or merely imputed by the viewer, dress, as Fred Davis has asserted, "merely suggests" more than it can (or intends to) state precisely'. Fred Davis, *Fashion, Culture and Identity* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992), p. 3.

known phrase from Hamlet, as the protagonist contemplated his own suicide and weighed up whether or not to exist: 'Tupi or not Tupi, that is the question'.⁸⁸ This line was written in English in the original Brazilian Portuguese version of the MA. *Tupi* is the common, generalised name for the various different indigenous groups living in Brazil. In the fifth section, Andrade used the metaphor of digestion to re-interpret the traditional understanding of cannibalism in Western discourse in a wider sense to relate to that which is not his. He thereby moved away from the negativity that the West has constructed around the oppressive figure of the savage cannibal Other who devoured his enemies, and towards an understanding of the process of anthropophagy as a creative act of appropriation: 'I am concerned only with what is not mine. Law of Man. Law of the cannibal.'⁸⁹

Andrade referred to dress directly only in the seventh section, when he expressed: 'What clashed with the truth was clothing, that raincoat placed between the inner and outer worlds. The reaction against the dressed man. American movies will inform us.'⁹⁰ He drew an important connection here with the broader historical trajectory of travel and written accounts of it, both often inextricably linked to Western colonialism, within which the unclothed 'primitive' non-Western body was frequently used to construct and articulate fundamental social, cultural, political and moral *differences* from the clothed and 'civilised' Western body. In this regard, Andrade may have equated colonialism with an oppressive attempt to dress and oppress the natural Brazilian 'body'. Yet his use of the term 'raincoat' is interesting, since this item of dress is both an impermeable *barrier* worn to protect the body from undesirable, outside elements, and a *mediator*, a second skin that enables the wearer

⁸⁸ Andrade, 'Cannibalist Manifesto', p. 38.

⁸⁹ Ibid.

⁹⁰ Ibid.

to come into contact with the outside world, regardless of weather conditions. In this respect, a raincoat can both create boundaries, separating and containing the 'inner' world of the private Self from the 'outer' world of the public Other, and de-construct them, constituting a vehicle through which the *other* (the unknown and outside world) is tangibly experienced and brought into contact with the *self* (our known, inside world). A parallel can be drawn here with Marks' assertion that we 'all live on the same surface, the same skin. If others are unfathomable, it is because it takes an infinite number of folds to really reach them.'⁹¹ To apply this statement with specific reference to this chapter would be to suggest that it is not that Brazilian subjects are ultimately unknowable to the *National Geographic* viewer because of their ostensible differences in dress, but that it requires the unfolding of infinite numbers of layers before the meaning of their sartorial practices can be understood, and therefore before Brazil can become knowable. From his disjointed phrases, one cannot be entirely sure of what Andrade was describing, except that there is a 'reaction against the dressed man'.⁹² He also asserted that 'American movies will inform us' and acknowledged the popularity of Hollywood films in Brazil throughout the 1920s, which reflected a deep fascination with U.S. culture.⁹³ If we reflect on *National Geographic's* gaze through the prism of anthropophagy, we may detect the now *active* and clothed anthropophagic Brazilian subject, who becomes a multivalent site of potential to break down the barrier between Self and Other, by presenting an important subjectivity through which to re-think the magazine's representational politics.

By highlighting the representational ambiguity of Brazilian dress that has been woven into the fabric of *National Geographic*, this chapter will examine the

⁹¹ Marks, *Touch: Sensuous Theory and Multisensory Media*, p. xii.

⁹² Andrade, 'Cannibalist Manifesto', p. 38.

⁹³ Ibid.

complexities of clothing as both barrier *and* mediator. The three snapshots or case studies that this chapter examines span a period of forty-five years and will be contextualised with contemporary examples from mainstream print media, to draw points of comparison and distinction.⁹⁴ The first snapshot was written and photographed by U.S. Army Air Corps officer Albert W. Stevens and published in the magazine in April 1926, two years prior to the publication of Andrade's MA.⁹⁵ The second was written by the American author Henry Albert Phillips and published in *National Geographic* in October 1942.⁹⁶ The third was written and photographed by the Brazilian photographer and documentary filmmaker of German descent, W. Jesco von Puttkamer, and published in *National Geographic* in September 1971.⁹⁷ This chapter uses anthropophagy as a critical lens through which to question, firstly, what visual and textual strategies *National Geographic* has used to *fashion* an idea of Brazil over the course of the twentieth century and, secondly, to what extent Brazilian subjects can be seen to have *self-fashioned*, through their ability to selectively appropriate ideas, styles and motifs derived from contemporary North American and European culture.⁹⁸ Does anthropophagy provide a potential means of resistance,

⁹⁴ Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the valley of the Amazon in a hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, pp. 353-420; Henry Albert Phillips, 'Air Cruising through New Brazil: A National Geographic reporter spots vast resources which the Republic's war declaration adds to strength of United Nations', *National Geographic*, October 1942, pp. 503-36; W. Jesco von Puttkamer, 'Brazil protects her Cinta Largas', *National Geographic*, September 1971, pp. 420-44.

⁹⁵ Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane'.

⁹⁶ Phillips, 'Air Cruising Through New Brazil'.

⁹⁷ Puttkamer, 'Brazil protects her Cinta Largas'.

⁹⁸ Although the MA was published in 1928, it is relevant to a discussion of all three snapshots because the ideas discussed within it were being articulated and negotiated in Brazil throughout the twentieth century. For example, Oswald de Andrade's 'Manifesto da Poesia Pau-Brasil' was published in March 1924, one month before the first snapshot examined was published in *National Geographic*. The second snapshot was published in October 1942, the same year (in February) that Mário de Andrade published an essay entitled 'O Movimento Modernista', in which he retrospectively acknowledged how Brazil was created anew through the metaphor of cannibalism, but also pointed out some of the limitations of Oswald de Andrade's argument. The third snapshot was published in September 1971 and coincided with the left-wing cultural and artistic movement in Brazil known as *Tropicália*, which recycled the theme of anthropophagy in the late 1960s as a reaction to the early years of the right-wing Brazilian military dictatorship. In order to maintain its focus, this thesis will use the Manifesto Antropófago as its starting point for an analysis of the representation of Brazilian dress in all three snapshots.

which has enabled Brazilian subjects to preserve their own cultural agency whilst sartorially 'talking back' to dominant representations of Brazil in *National Geographic*? Are there any problems inherent to the process of anthropophagy?

The Representation of Brazil in *National Geographic* Over One Hundred Years

It is important to include a brief comment on the representation of Brazil in *National Geographic* over the first hundred years after the establishment of the magazine in September 1888. *National Geographic* first made contact with Brazil in April 1906, the same year that the Pan-American Conference was held in Rio de Janeiro.⁹⁹ Pan-Americanism emerged at the close of the nineteenth century as America actively sought to expand its commercial, social, political, economic and military contact with the nations of Central and South America.¹⁰⁰ From this point on and continuing until March 1987, *National Geographic* published thirty-seven articles on Brazil.¹⁰¹ Although they appeared to follow no regular pattern, three key trends can be noted over the course of the twentieth century. The first trend emerged between 1909 and 1933, when *National Geographic* focused upon the vast and unexplored Amazon region and its indigenous populations. A narrative of American expansionism was mythologised by articles that stressed active, masculine pursuits in the Amazon region; see, for example: 'Fishing and Hunting Tales from Brazil' (October 1909), 'The Amazon, Father of Waters' (April 1926), 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane'

⁹⁹ Anon., 'What the Latin American Republics think of the Pan American Conferences', *National Geographic*, August 1906, pp. 474-79; Anon., 'Brazil and Peru', *National Geographic*, April 1906, pp. 203-04.

¹⁰⁰ Joseph Smith, *The United States and Brazil: Convergences and Divergences* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2010), p. 4.

¹⁰¹ Refer to Appendix 1 for a timeline tracing these 37 articles onto key events in the history of Brazil and Brazilian interactions with the United States from 1888 to 1988.

(April 1926), 'Through Brazil to the Summit of Mount Roraima' (November 1930), 'In Humboldt's Wake' (November 1931), which referenced the German naturalist Alexander von Humboldt, renowned for his late-eighteenth-century romantic descriptions of lush vegetation curving and swelling in the tropics, and 'A Journey by Jungle Rivers' (November 1933).¹⁰² The second trend appeared between 1939 and 1945, a period of worldwide fragmentation and anxiety as a result of the events leading up to, and following, the outbreak of war in Europe in September 1939. Four articles on Brazil were published in *National Geographic* during this period. Each focused on Rio de Janeiro and Sao Paulo, and outlined the similarities between Brazil and the United States in terms of magnitude, modernity and capitalism, emphasised through dynamic architecture and busy streets populated by workers and shoppers of predominantly European descent dressed in Western-style fashions. The articles emphasised the modernisation and industrialisation of Brazil, as is clear from their titles: 'As Sao Paulo Grows' (May 1939), 'Rio Panorama' (September 1939), 'Air Cruising Through New Brazil' (October 1942), and 'Brazil's Potent Weapons' (January 1944).¹⁰³ This narrative can be understood as a manifestation of President Theodore Roosevelt's Good Neighbor Policy, which was advanced during wartime and appeared to emphasise a less interventionist approach to interactions within the Western

¹⁰² Dewey Austin Cobb, 'Fishing and Hunting Tales from Brazil', *National Geographic*, October 1909, pp. 917-20; W. L. Schurtz, 'The Amazon, Father of Waters', *National Geographic*, April 1926, pp. 444-63; Stevens, 'Exploring the valley of the Amazon in a hydroplane'; G. H. H. Tate, 'Through Brazil to the Summit of Mount Roraima', *National Geographic*, November 1930, pp. 584-605; Ernest G. Holt, 'In Humboldt's Wake: Narrative of a National Geographic Society Expedition up the Orinoco and through the strange Casiquiare Canal to Amazonian Waters', *National Geographic*, November 1931, pp. 620-44; Ernest G. Holt, 'A Journey by Jungle Rivers to the Home of the Cock-of-the-Rock', *National Geographic*, November 1933, pp. 585-630.

¹⁰³ Robert W. Moore, 'As Sao Paulo Grows: Half the World's Coffee Beans Flavour the Life and Speed the Growth of an Inland Brazil City', *National Geographic*, May 1939, pp. 657-88; Moore, 'Rio Panorama: Breathtaking is this Fantastic city amid peaks, palms and sea, and in carnival time it moves to the Rhythm of Music', *National Geographic*, September 1939, pp. 283-324; Phillips, 'Air Cruising Through New Brazil'; Moore, 'Brazil's Potent Weapons: Brazil supplies the Allies with many valuable products, including iron, manganese, quartz, rubber, vegetable oils, and insecticides', *National Geographic*, January 1944, pp. 41-78.

Hemisphere.¹⁰⁴ The third trend appeared between 1964 and 1984, during the throes of the right-wing military dictatorship in Brazil, which was politically aligned to the United States. Articles published during this period focused on the indigenous peoples of Brazil; see, for example: 'Indians of the Amazon Darkness' (May 1964), 'The Waura: Brazilian Indians of the Hidden Xingu' (January 1966), 'Saving Brazil's Stone Age Tribes from Extinction' (September 1968), 'Brazil protects her Cinta Larga' (September 1971), 'Brazil's Kreen-Akores: Requiem for a Tribe?' (February 1975), 'Brazil's Txukahameis: Goodbye to the Stone Age' (February 1975), 'Man in the Amazon: Stone Age Present meets Stone Age Past' (January 1979) and 'Brazil's Kayapo Indians: Beset by a Golden Curse' (May 1984).¹⁰⁵ These titles stressed a sense of loss, which presumed that the interactions of indigenous peoples with 'civilisation' were leading to their eventual demise. It was therefore apparently left to *National Geographic* to represent them before they disappeared, and in doing so, ensure that they did not vanish irretrievably. The final observation to note is that from April 1906 to March 1987 there was no representation in *National Geographic* of Afro-Brazilians, nor of the northeastern state of Bahia which, after the abolition of slavery in Brazil in 1888, established its reputation, still applicable today, as the region most populated by Afro-Brazilians.¹⁰⁶

¹⁰⁴ Antônio Pedro Tota, *The Seduction of Brazil: the Americanization of Brazil during World War II* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2009).

¹⁰⁵ Harold Schultz, 'Indians of the Amazon Darkness', *National Geographic*, May 1964, pp. 736-58; Schultz, 'The Waura: Brazilian Indians of the Hidden Xingu', *National Geographic*, January 1966, pp. 130-52; Orlando and Claudio Villas Boas,, 'Saving Brazil's Stone Age Tribes from Extinction', *National Geographic*, September 1968, pp. 424-44; Puttkamer, 'Brazil protects her Cinta Largas'; Puttkamer, 'Brazil's Txukahameis: Goodbye to the Stone Age', *National Geographic*, February 1975, pp. 270-83; Puttkamer, 'Man in the Amazon: Stone Age Present meets Stone Age Past', *National Geographic*, January 1979, pp. 60-83; Vanessa Lea, 'Brazil's Kayapo Indians: Beset by a Golden Curse', *National Geographic*, May 1984, pp. 674-94.

¹⁰⁶ Refer to Appendix 1 for a map detailing the geographical location of the 37 articles on Brazil that were published in *National Geographic* during this period.

An Ethnographic Gaze on Brazil in an Age of Pan-Americanism

The first snapshot was published in *National Geographic* in April 1926, in an article entitled 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane: twelve thousand miles of flying over the world's greatest river and greatest forest to chart the unknown Parima river from the sky'.¹⁰⁷ The article was written and photographed by Stevens, 'observer and aerial photographer', and documented the Alexander Hamilton Rice Scientific Expedition (1924-25) to the upper Amazon River basin.¹⁰⁸ This was the seventh expedition to the Amazon that the American explorer Alexander Hamilton Rice had directed and it was supported by the latest surveying technology, which included a bespoke hydroplane specially equipped to undertake aerial photography.¹⁰⁹ The aim of the expedition was to 'survey and map the Rio Branco and its western tributary, the Rio Uraricoera, following the latter to its source in the Serra Parima and to ascertain whether any passage existed between the headwaters of this river and those of the Orinoco, thus tying this survey to the one carried out on the leader's 1919-1920 expedition'.¹¹⁰ It also sought 'to gather anthropological and ethnographical data' and 'to make a medical survey' of the indigenous peoples encountered.¹¹¹ A map of the expedition was published in *National Geographic* and can be seen in Fig. 2.0.¹¹² The route pursued by the party can be traced on this map along the 'Rio Negro to

¹⁰⁷ Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane'.

¹⁰⁸ Ibid., p. 393.

¹⁰⁹ Luciana Martins, 'Filming *Terra Incognita*: the Exploration of the Amazon', in *Photography and Documentary Film in the Making of Modern Brazil* (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2013), pp. 40-70.

The party consisted of Alexander Hamilton Rice (director), Albert W. Stevens (observer and aerial photographer), Weld Arnold (cartographer), Dr Koch-Grunberg (ethnologist), Dr George Shattuck (physician), Charles C. Bull (assistant), Walter Hinton (hydroplane pilot), John C. Couzens (engineer), John E. Wilshusen (airplane mechanic), John W. Swanson (radio telegraphist), Thomas S. MacCaleb (radio telegraphist), Hermann Dengler (draftsman), Silviano Santos (film operator) and Ramundo Camara (assistant).

¹¹⁰ Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', p. 353.

¹¹¹ Ibid., p. 357.

¹¹² Ibid., p. 354.

Carvoeiro, then following the Rio Branco to the town of Boa Vista, before heading to Boa Esperança along the Rio Uraricoera. From here the expedition continued to the confluence of the Rio Aracasa and the Rio Parima, following the Uraricoera to its Serra Parima source'.¹¹³ Despite conditions that made exploration physically and psychologically gruelling, such expeditions were common in the early decades of the twentieth century.¹¹⁴ Ex-president Theodore Roosevelt had participated in a scientific expedition to the region in 1913-14, and enthusiastically reported: 'This country and the adjacent regions, forming the high interior of Western Brazil will surely someday support a large industrial population and will be a healthy home for a considerable agricultural and pastoral population.'¹¹⁵ In an age of increased Pan-Americanism, North American scientists, geographers and explorers were motivated by a desire to document and map uncharted terrain in South America, not to mention the possibility of commercial exploitation and economic expansion.¹¹⁶

As a result of its veneer of objectivity and perceived indexicality, the camera was invariably used on such expeditions as an observational and recording tool, to document not only the terrain but also the indigenous peoples and plant specimens encountered. A clear example can be seen in a topographical photograph included in *National Geographic* (Fig. 2.1) that was entitled 'The fliers discover the camp of an

¹¹³ Ibid., p. 354.

¹¹⁴ Two well-known examples of North Americans who travelled to Brazil during this period are the ex-president Theodore Roosevelt, who accompanied Brazilian Colonel Candido Rondon to the 1,000 metre-long 'River of Doubt' (later renamed River Roosevelt) in a remote region of the Amazon basin from 1913-14, and the American industrialist Henry Ford, who sought a reliable source of cultivated rubber for the manufacturing processes of his Ford Motor Company in the Amazon. Ford's capitalist ventures culminated in the ill-fated industrial city of Fordlandia, located in the northern Amazon city of Santarém, which was established in 1928 and sold at a loss of \$20 million in 1945. Theodore Roosevelt, *Through the Brazilian Wilderness* (New York: Scribner, 1914); Greg Grandin, *Fordlandia: The Rise and Fall of Henry Ford's Forgotten Jungle City* (New York: Henry Holt & Company, 2010).

¹¹⁵ Theodore Roosevelt, *Through the Brazilian Wilderness* (New York: Scribner, 1914), p. 217.

¹¹⁶ Smith, *The United States and Brazil*, p. 56.

unknown Indian tribe, skillfully concealed from all except the airmen'.¹¹⁷ This provided a visual reinforcement of dominance through its panoptic and privileged aerial perspective, which captured a huge swath of river amongst a blanket of rainforest, broken up by a small clearing to the top-left of the frame. The caption informed the viewer that the hydroplane, itself an exemplary symbol of Western engineering, had enabled *National Geographic* to 'discover' the previously hidden habitation of this unknown indigenous group.¹¹⁸ Since the introduction of the use of aerial photography for military purposes, notably during World War One, this form of photographic mapping has been equated with an ideological impulse to master and conquer an unpeopled landscape.¹¹⁹ Pratt has conflated this singular, summarising birds-eye view, elevated above other documentary modes of representation, with power and termed it 'the monarch-of-all-I-survey' trope, whereby 'the esthetic qualities of the landscape constitute the social and material value of the discovery to the explorer's home culture, at the same time as its esthetic deficiencies suggest a need for social and material intervention by the home culture'.¹²⁰ This uneven balance of power between the *seer* and the *seen* was reinforced within the text of the *National Geographic* article through continued reference to the hydroplane as 'the eyes of the expedition', along with 'we were privileged to view the jungle from the air' and 'where the untrodden jungle presented a matted and almost impenetrable wall to men on foot, it surrendered its secrets readily to men in the sky'.¹²¹ The use of the camera, and its

¹¹⁷ Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', p. 370.

¹¹⁸ Ibid.

¹¹⁹ For further information on aerial photography taken from the hydroplane refer to Stevens, 'The Hydroplane of the Hamilton Rice Expedition, 1924-25,' *The Geographical Journal*, 68.1 (1926), 27-43.

¹²⁰ Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, p. 201.

Michel Foucault and Allan Sekula have both associated this unifying and totalising gaze with the authoritarian eye of the state and the individual voyeur. Michel Foucault, *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1977); Allan Sekula, 'The Traffic in Photographs', *Art Journal*, 41.1 (1981), 15-25.

¹²¹ Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', p. 353.

associations with scientific rationality, demonstrated competing impulses in *National Geographic*: to discover and learn, but also to master and order.

Snapshot 1: The Maku Woman's 'Old Piece of Cloth'

In tandem with the scientific reordering of the Amazonian landscape from above, photographs taken on the ground rendered Brazilian subjects equally transparent to *National Geographic's* quasi-anthropological gaze. The first snapshot that this thesis discusses was printed on the right-hand side of a double-page view of the magazine (Fig 2.2). Two full-length monochrome studies published on the same page, it captured an anonymous man and woman of the Maku population in a natural forest setting next to a river.¹²² In the photograph on the right, the man stands tall and still with his shoulders pulled back, his arms hanging at his sides and his left leg placed at an angle in front of his right leg. There is an awkwardness in the way that the toes on his left foot seem to curl inwards into the ground, which could be expressive of resentment at being scrutinised, or simply a reflection of his inexperience before the camera. He gazes directly into the lens with a neutral, even serious expression. He has bobbed dark hair and wears a cotton loincloth passed between the legs and around the waist. In the photograph on the left, a pregnant woman stands with her shoulders held back, arms by her side and legs apart. She is placed at an angle, somewhere between a full frontal and profile view, and gazes intently outside of the frame towards the river. This gives the impression that her priorities lie beyond the photographic frame that encases her. She also has bobbed dark hair and wears a

¹²² Ibid., pp. 396-97.

That this snapshot is in black and white reflects the norm in the early twentieth century, when colour photography was still in its infancy. Any colour photographs reproduced in *National Geographic* during this period were hand-painted Autochrome images.

patterned cotton apron tied around her hips, worn with a cape made from a flimsy material draped over her shoulders. Organised as a pair, each with the subject positioned separately in the frame, isolated in a bright and shallow space, these photographs were typical of the well-established nineteenth-century ethnographic practice of photographing 'types' based upon their geographical location and physical appearance. The title, 'A Maku Squaw and Her Husband: Parima River', anchored such a reductive reading and attempted to fix the individuals within the correct ethnic identification of the specific types that they were supposed to represent.¹²³ This was reinforced within the body of the article, through Stevens' detailed account of the appearance and characteristics of the Maku, which conflated cleanliness with order and rationality:

In facial contour they resembled Mongolian types, and their straight black hair was cut in a 'soup-bowl' bob [...] Each individual was scrupulously clean, and we observed that they bathed regularly. We found them to be keen mentally, sturdy, contented, helpful and kindly to each other, but each man thoroughly independent and self-sufficing. This was the first time, apparently, that they had had any contact with civilization.¹²⁴

The two photographs printed on the left-hand side of the double-page view mirrored this typological template. In the centre of the frame, they captured the head and partial torso of an anonymous young boy and man of the Mayongong population (Fig. 2.3).¹²⁵ On the right, the man was photographed squarely in front of the camera and placed against a light backdrop. He gazes slightly upwards, with his brow furrowed as he squints into the bright sunlight that casts a shadow over his face, and highlights the creases around his eyes. To his left, a young boy is also placed against a backdrop

¹²³ Ibid., p. 397.

¹²⁴ Ibid., p.400.

¹²⁵ Elizabeth Edwards has outlined these key characteristics in her examination of the scientific application of photography in the nineteenth century in 'Ordering Others: Photography, Anthropologies and Taxonomies' in *In Visible Light: Photography and Classification in Art, Science and the Everyday*, ed. by Chrissy Illes and Russell Roberts (Oxford: Museum of Modern Art, 1997), pp. 54-68.

devoid of any distracting features, and photographed at an angle within the frame. He neither smiles nor frowns, but gazes to his right, rather like the indigenous woman on the opposite page, at something beyond the photographic frame. These images drew a parallel with the use of the camera in science and criminology in their exposure of the subjects' faces to close viewing. With their blank backdrops, the subjects became displaced from time and space, encouraging the viewer to inspect them as separate racial entities. This was editorially reinforced by the classificatory white grid, consistent with the grid lines marked on the map of the expedition (Fig. 2.0), which framed all four photographs on the double-page magazine spread, and encouraged them to be understood by the *National Geographic* viewer in terms of their implicit or explicit relation to one another. Compositional effort on the part of the photographer is reduced, and variability in the resulting photograph rests on the particularities and peculiarities of the subject and her immediate environment.

However, a certain amount of tactility was required to view this magazine spread, which placed these complex images beyond, and in contradiction to, the photographic gaze that ostensibly scrutinised them. The *National Geographic* viewer was required to rotate the magazine ninety degrees clockwise, and gently pull it apart at its seams in order to view the four photographs in their correct and entire portrait dimensions (Figs. 2.4 and 2.5). This tactile gesture brought the viewer into closer contact with the represented subjects, through the interconnections prompted by simultaneously touching *and* looking. Di Bello has articulated that 'for the touching subject, the object touched reciprocates the touching', encouraging a more embodied and sensual encounter with the photographic object and 'blurring the border between

self and other'.¹²⁶ In April 1926, *National Geographic* was not the thin, glossy magazine recognisable today, but far heavier and thicker with textured, matte pages. It had certain similarities to a scientific journal setting out to present a distanced and detached ethnographic record of the Maku. Yet it also had many affinities with the family photograph album, as outlined in the introduction to this thesis, since the proximity of view arguably encouraged an intimacy with the subjects, stirring memories in the viewer and prompting a more personal response. Dress enabled this dynamic to be extended to the physical sensation of wearing, so that touch likewise triggered associations in the viewer, and responded to their own heightened awareness of how clothing *felt* and *moved* on their own bodies. The visual connections to be made between the haptic and the visual encouraged *National Geographic* viewers, not simply to *see* represented dressed subjects as scientific specimens, but to '*feel*' and fully comprehend them as living, breathing, digesting, cannibalising and self-fashioning human beings.

The tactile sensations evoked by the magazine constructed a more complete and singular experience of Brazilian subjects in *National Geographic*, and provide an opportunity to re-read the first snapshot in more intimate terms through the framework of anthropophagy. Although visually the snapshot (Fig. 2.2) depicted the *anthropometric* body, the caption that accompanied it emphasised the *anthropophagic* subject, since it highlighted the singularity of the subject's reception and assimilation of outside sartorial influences indicated through the process of self-presentation. It read: 'There is little in their costume to distinguish the men from the women in this tribe; they even affect the same style of hair "bob". *The woman has decorated her shoulders with an old piece of cloth for the occasion of having her*

¹²⁶ di Bello, 'Vision and Touch', p. 9.

photograph taken.' [my italics]¹²⁷ Despite its initial naïve assertion that there are few distinguishing features between male and female dress, the caption proceeded to contradict itself by drawing attention to the female subject's deliberate and self-conscious fashioning of herself 'with an old piece of cloth' for the photographer. This act suggested not simply an awareness of being on display, but a knowing and consensual performance that undermined a deterministic reading of the image. It presented a shift of the hegemonic gaze to the indigenous subject, the habitual object of anthropology, who ceases to represent a fixed and unchanging essence, but now demonstrates her ability to *digest* foreign cultural references from the leftover materials that she has to hand.

The caption intentionally directed the viewer's attention towards dress as a means to contextualise and produce narrative meaning within the image, employing what Roland Barthes termed 'anchorage' – using text to direct the intended meaning of an image and define the primary point of reference for understanding a photograph.¹²⁸ The subject's low-tech, 'make-do' clothing solution highlighted the inventiveness and resourcefulness of the Maku, who are neither fragile nor static in the face of the *National Geographic* gaze, but able to consume outside influences and re-fashion them to their own ends. It is in this sense that the photograph can be seen to encapsulate the symbolic and cultural meaning of the Portuguese word *gambiarra*, which can be understood as one manifestation of anthropophagy. *Gambiarra* has no English translation but is used colloquially throughout Brazil to refer to a makeshift

¹²⁷ Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', p. 397.

¹²⁸ Roland Barthes, *Image-Music-Text* (London: Fontana, 1977), p. 38.

contraption or improvised solution.¹²⁹ This is exemplified by the woman's ingestion and recycling of an 'old piece of cloth' to assemble an outfit deemed suitable for the photographer's gaze.¹³⁰ This fragmentary, readymade creation has been modified to fulfil a different use, and demonstrates the sustainability of the subject's practical and creative endeavour.

The woman's clothing rendered her as *active* rather than *passive* and in turn encouraged the *National Geographic* viewer to understand the ethnographic-style photograph in terms of a self-aware and individually styled portrait. Within the body of the article, Stevens acknowledged: 'It was not difficult to get the natives to pose. Our problem was rather to get them to unpose. Once they struck an attitude which the photographer desired, they held it indefinitely. No Hollywood director ever had more patient subjects.'¹³¹ Even though Stevens admitted that he had directed each photographic subject, we can see evidence that the subject also contributed her own preferences to the making of the photograph, since even just holding the pose indefinitely could be read as a challenge or form of resistance to the repressive measures of ethnographic photography. Tamar Garb has delineated this parallel between the tradition of portraiture and racialised ethnography: 'Where the ethnographic deals in types, groups and collective characteristics, portraiture purports to portray the unique and distinctive features of named subjects whose social identities provide a backdrop for individual agency and assertion.'¹³² Garb highlighted the noticeable parallel between the characteristics that indicate the authoritarian

¹²⁹ Ricardo Rosas, 'The Gambiarra: Considerations on a Recombinatory Technology' in *Digital Media and Democracy: Tactics in Hard Times*, ed. by Megan Boler (Cambridge: The MIT Press, 2008), pp. 343-54 (pp. 343-44).

¹³⁰ Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', p. 397.

¹³¹ *Ibid.*, p. 412.

¹³² Tamar Garb, *Figures and Fictions: Contemporary South African Photography* (London: V & A Publishing, 2011), p. 12.

measures of ethnography, such as full frontal exposure, visual uniformity, and the minimisation of light and shadow, with the individualising tendencies of portraiture. In *National Geographic*, this photograph can be viewed as a collaborative portrait that reflected the choices of the individual, who was clearly a willing participant in the image-making process, choosing her own props, pose, expression and style of presentation. This willing and collaborative aspect, highlighted through the subject's self-fashioning, displaced the institutionally imposed objectivity characteristic of ethnographic images of others, and complicated a straightforward reading of the image. As a result, the photograph stressed a heterogeneous resistance to the homogeneity imposed by *National Geographic's* disembodied imperialist gaze, exemplified by the landscape photographs taken by the hydroplane (Fig. 2.1), and instead drew attention to the fluctuating nature of anthropological photographs. Dress mobilised a more complex visual play on how the ethnographic photograph could simultaneously present both visual spectacle *and* individual lived experience.

A point of comparison can be made with a rather different image of the Maku that was presented one year earlier in an article written by A. H. Bruno, entitled 'Airplanes Aid Explorers in Brazil', which documented the same trip that Alexander Hamilton Rice directed to the Amazon. Published on a single-page spread in *Popular Mechanics* in November 1925 (Fig. 2.6), the caption read: 'Dr. Rice measuring a five foot two inch Maku Indian'.¹³³ It accompanied a photograph of Dr Hamilton Rice with a measuring device as he sized up an anonymous Maku man, who stands in profile with his arms folded across his chest and a bored expression on his face. Christopher Pinney has referred to the measuring stick as the 'anthropometrist's talisman'; ostensibly

¹³³ H. A. Bruno, 'Airplanes Aid Explorers in Brazil', *Popular Mechanics*, November 1925, pp. 786-90 (p. 788).

used to measure height, it is frequently employed as a 'mere studio prop'.¹³⁴ In contrast to the indigenous man's lack of Western-style clothing, Hamilton Rice is fully covered in khaki trousers and a buttoned-up shirt, reinforcing a dynamic rhetoric of difference between fully clothed 'civilised' American males and partially clothed 'uncivilised' Brazilian men. An earlier typescript (Fig. 2.7) read by Hamilton Rice at a meeting of the Royal Geographic Society on 21 February 1921, in which he described his 1919 expedition to the Amazon, demonstrated that he equated the adoption of Western-style dress with an evolutionary and linear narrative of progress from a state of primitivism to one of so-called civilisation. He forcibly propounded this dominant viewpoint when he described the imposition of Western-style dress on the indigenous population of Sao Gabriel (a municipality located on the northern shore of the Rio Negro River, in Amazonas state) as part of a civilising mission set up in 1916 by Christian missionaries: 'Sao Gabriel today with its clean, nicely dressed, courteous schoolchildren, neatly fenced gardens, cleared spaces and atmosphere of order and industry is in striking contrast to the squalid village of naked little savages and unkempt hoydens, neglected purlieus, and lack of municipal control and mission influence that prevailed up to three years ago.'¹³⁵ Whilst no attempt at enforced sartorial appropriation was made in this particular snapshot from *National Geographic*, in *Popular Mechanics* there was an unmistakable power dynamic between the dressed figure of Alexander Hamilton Rice, armed with a measuring stick, and the 'naked' photograph of the indigenous Maku man, which was crudely censored so that only the very top of the man's loincloth could be seen. Contrary to *Popular Mechanics*, *National Geographic* pointed out the Brazilian subjects' creative and symbolic appropriation of

¹³⁴ Christopher Pinney, *Camera Indica: The Social Life of Indian Photographs* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1997), p. 50.

¹³⁵ London, Royal Geographical Society, Hamilton Rice Expedition 1919-1920 Papers, Alexander Hamilton Rice, 21 February 1921.

selected aspects of Western-style dress through the use of the caption, which disrupted the representational stability of the photograph and nudged the viewer's attention towards a more personal narrative.

Despite the ways in which dress sculpted a subjective gaze onto Brazil in April 1926, it is clear that *National Geographic* still sought to present a Brazilian subject sufficiently distanced from its North American readership. This readership can be inferred from the advertisements that appeared within the magazine. One example can be seen in an advertisement for the American motor company Cadillac published in the same edition of *National Geographic* (Fig. 2.8).¹³⁶ A fair-haired slim white woman, not so dissimilar, perhaps, from the female *National Geographic* viewer, wears a cloche hat and a dress made of a flowing light-coloured fabric with a dropped waist and frilled cuffs. With her Art Deco-style scarf draped over her left shoulder, she symbolises the 'transcendent luxury' of the Cadillac, as described in the text at the bottom of the advertisement. Had *National Geographic* wanted to present a similarly fashionably dressed Brazilian subject to its female viewers, it could have easily found one, as an anonymous photograph taken in Rio de Janeiro (Fig. 2.9) in 1926 attests. During this period, urban reforms saw Rio de Janeiro remodelled on European architectural ideas and the increasing adoption of Euro-American fashions by wealthy Brazilian women. In this photograph, two smart and modern Brazilian women with carefully constructed and coordinated ensembles are framed before a palm tree in a leafy environment that might be a landscaped European garden. They wear neat cloche hats, contemporary tailored fashions with dropped waists, stockings and high heels, and have a collection of accessories, which include a clutch bag and an umbrella. Photographed side-by-side in the centre of the frame, these women face the camera

¹³⁶ Anon., *National Geographic*, April 1926, p. 3.

directly and appear ready for its gaze. The woman on the left is of indigenous descent, wears an ornately embroidered dress and smiles confidently. The woman on the right has more European features, wears a brooch on her right lapel, and enacts a more controlled, fashionable pout. Like the indigenous female subject in *National Geographic*, both of these women perform a 'look', but it is one that may have been more easily recognisable as fashionable by the *National Geographic* viewer. That *National Geographic* chose not to document this choice of subject reinforces that it either believed, or wanted to disseminate the idea that, Brazil was geographically and temporally located outside the sphere of Western modernisation.

Rather than utilise the *conspicuousness* of the European fashions presented in this anonymous photograph, *National Geographic* chose to present a more mystifying and *inconspicuous* example of sartorial anthropophagy performed by the indigenous female subject, which required the viewer to unfold independently the supplementary layers of ambiguity woven into the image. With no contextual information or explanatory comment within the body of the article about the process of self-fashioning enacted by the woman, the meaning of this *National Geographic* snapshot, although breaking out of a tendency for distanced and detached viewing, nonetheless remained as precarious and uncertain as Andrade's MA. That ambiguity was not so pervasive in the second snapshot that this chapter discusses, which drew more of a comparison with this anonymous photograph. It presented a form of anthropophagy that *National Geographic* viewers would have been more easily able to identify with, although the ambivalent meanings of dress can still be seen to have fluctuated between distance and identification: clothing as a barrier *and* as a mediator.

A Documentary Gaze on Brazil during World War Two

The second snapshot was published in *National Geographic* in October 1942, in an article entitled 'Air Cruising through New Brazil: A *National Geographic* reporter spots vast resources which the Republic's war declaration adds to strength of United Nations'.¹³⁷ The article was published two months after Brazil had broken off diplomatic relations with the Axis powers and officially declared war on Germany and Italy on 22 August 1942. Brazil was of particular importance to the United States in 1942 on two accounts: her rich deposits of natural resources, which included rubber, manganese, uranium, nickel and iron ore, and the military and strategic significance of her protruding northeastern coastline, which was considered vulnerable to Nazi military attack.¹³⁸ *National Geographic* documented an airborne trip taken by the author, Henry Albert Phillips, to produce a geographical survey of the country's 'struggle to improve its cities and create a New Brazil'.¹³⁹ The relationship between the two countries had shifted from an early-twentieth-century North American perception of Brazil as a tropical site ripe for exploitation and expansion, to a wartime intensification of Roosevelt's Good Neighbor policy, which perceived the country to be a necessary ally and vital to the protection of the Western hemisphere.¹⁴⁰ One example of the conciliatory attitude taken towards Brazil can be seen in the U.S. propaganda film, *Brazil at War*, produced by the Office of Inter-American Affairs in

¹³⁷ Phillips, 'Air Cruising Through New Brazil'.

¹³⁸ Smith, *The United States and Brazil*, pp. 114-15.

¹³⁹ Phillips, 'Air Cruising Through New Brazil', p. 503.

For further information on the history of diplomatic relations between the United States and Brazil, with particular attention paid to the Second World War, refer to: Robert W. Fontaine, *Brazil and the United States: Towards a Maturing Relationship* (Washington D C: American Enterprise Institute for Public Policy Research, 1974); Monica Hirst, *The United States and Brazil: A Long Road of Unmet Expectations* (New York: Routledge, 2005); Riordan Roett, *The New Brazil* (Washington DC: Brookings Institution Press, 2011); Smith, *Brazil and the United States*; Tota, *The Seduction of Brazil*.

¹⁴⁰ Mutual respect and understanding formed the ideological core of the cooperative war-time relationship between Brazil and the United States, both of which used popular media as a foreign policy tool to engender goodwill and aid diplomacy.

1943. It celebrated Brazil as ‘a powerful new friend’ and drew a comparison with the United States in terms of size, population, industry and resources: ‘Brazil brings much to the Allied Cause, not only the weight of her resources and manpower, but the militant spirit of her people and the reaffirmation of her friendship for the people of the United States.’¹⁴¹ Correspondingly, there was a shift in *National Geographic* which, rather than placing a quasi-ethnographic gaze on the Amazon region as it had done previously, began to utilise more familiar documentary modes of exposure, and focus on industrialised urban centres such as Rio de Janeiro and Sao Paulo.

A clear example can be seen in the thirty-two photographs selected to accompany Phillips’ article, which were reproduced entirely in black and white, and made dramatic use of light and shade, form and void, near and far to animate the static scenes of urban Brazil with a modernist, optimistic vision of transformation and progress. The crispness and clarity of the reportage panned a range of industrial, architectural and ecological sites, rendered on a monumental scale and in minute detail, which included the twenty-six-storey Marinelli building in Sao Paulo (see, for example, Fig. 2.10), the Lacerda elevator in Salvador, the grand opera house in Manaus, and Copacabana seafront. These were occasionally interspersed with images of the Brazilian population, in which the *mise-en-scène* visually supported a narrative that implied the social fabric of Brazil was comprised entirely of self-motivated and determined individuals. In a letter to *National Geographic* editor, J. R. Hildebrand, dated 18 June 1942, Phillips explained his revisionist intent in compiling the article (Fig. 2.11):

¹⁴¹ *Brazil at War* (Office of the Coordinator of Inter-American Affairs, United States Office of War Information, 1943).

I am glad we shall avoid the sappy Good Neighbor vein. Likewise we shall sidestep all touchy political inferences. No SA republic could have been better chosen for a complete turn-over as Brazil. Perhaps we should call the piece 'NOVO BRASIL' and follow the general lines of innovations, which of course will cover the greater part of the great country. In this respect, Vargas is the outstanding figure in the whole of the continent.¹⁴²

Phillips wanted to move away from an overtly sentimentalised representation of the Good Neighbor, personified in 1942 by the creation of the Walt Disney character Jose 'Ze' Carioca, an anthropomorphised parrot from Rio de Janeiro who appeared beside Donald Duck in the cartoon *Saludos Amigos*.¹⁴³ Instead, he emphasised the crucial role Brazilian President Getulio Vargas (in office from 1930 to 1945 and again from 1951 to 1954) had played in the modernisation and industrialisation of Brazil. He praised Vargas' popularity, which resulted from the fact that 'the people recognized him as one of themselves – a democratic, fearless Gaucho', and presented him as the charismatic and paternalistic leader of the 'New Brazil'.¹⁴⁴ In accordance with Phillips' intent to 'sidestep all touchy political inferences', that Vargas' authoritarian Estado Novo (New State) dictatorship (1937-45) had many commonalities with fascism, and that his allegiance with the Allied Forces in October 1942 had taken many by surprise, went completely undocumented by *National Geographic*.

Instead *National Geographic* was attentive to Vargas' outstanding and Westernised qualities, as a carefully orchestrated group photograph, taken at North American entrepreneur Henry Ford's rubber plantation in Santarem, attested. Published on a single-page spread, it captured Vargas directly in the frame, surrounded by members of his cabinet, all of whom appear to be of white European descent (Figs.

¹⁴² Washington DC, National Geographic Society Archives, Microfiche File No. 510-1-999.116948, Henry Albert Phillips to J. R. Hildebrand, 18 June 1942.

¹⁴³ *Saludos Amigos*, dir. by Wilfred Jackson (Walt Disney, 1942).

¹⁴⁴ Phillips, 'Air Cruising Through New Brazil', p. 536

2.12 and 2.13). The photograph is shot against a blank backdrop, which illuminates Vargas, who is dressed in a double-breasted white suit, shirt, striped tie and two-tone leather brogues. He stands in a confident pose, with his arms by his sides, directly facing the camera and yet averting his gaze from it. His adoption of white tropical wear is matched by three of his companions. Their suits are all made from a lightweight linen fabric appropriate for the Brazilian climate and, except for a few crumples, retain their Western-style tailoring in the heat. Whiteness is an important trope used in *National Geographic* as the visual manifestation of the complete erasure of impurities. It referenced the rigorous cleanliness central to contemporary North American ideology, in which mass-produced white products were perceived as smooth and sterile, rational and ordered.¹⁴⁵ A clear example can be seen in an advertisement for the denture-cleaning product Polident, published in *National Geographic* in May 1941 (Fig. 2.14).¹⁴⁶ It featured the fixed bright, white smile of a pale-skinned, blonde-haired woman, who gazed directly at the viewer, the pure white of her eyes matching that of her teeth. The insistent rhetoric of the text questioned: 'Are you letting dingy teeth destroy your smile ... perhaps your whole charm?' The answer to this problem could be quickly solved by using 'Polident – a product that magically dissolves all tarnish [...] *purifies* your plate – leaves it odorless, *clean* – attractive – as natural looking as the day you got it'.¹⁴⁷ The advert highlighted the virtues of whiteness as an attainable ideal and its pared-down organisation, like the simple lines of Vargas' white suit, visually alluded to Mary Douglas' assertion that the human desire for cleanliness must be understood as a process of environmental organisation, and the establishment of a social order

¹⁴⁵ Suellen Hoy, *Chasing Dirt: The American Pursuit of Cleanliness* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995).

¹⁴⁶ Anon., *National Geographic*, May 1941, p. 16.

¹⁴⁷ Ibid.

through the systematic process of bodily purification.¹⁴⁸ Rather than capture the complex, hybrid social reality of contemporary Brazil, composed of multiple ethnic, racial and indigenous groups, the magazine chose to stage a vision of Brazilianness that smoothed over and erased any evidence of ethnicity or indigeneity that deviated from a 'civilised' white norm. *National Geographic* sought to collapse the differences between white skin and white cloth, smoothing over 'touchy political inferences', and portraying the New Brazil as a re-born white nation that *National Geographic* viewers would be able to recognise straightforwardly as part of their own world.¹⁴⁹

Yet this image also provided a revealing opportunity to see how race functioned visually within Brazil at this particular moment, and how this connected to the preoccupations of the Vargas regime in fashioning a unified national identity through the trope of whiteness.¹⁵⁰ Vargas' adoption of white European imperialist dress demonstrated that he saw himself as part of the white European elite, and was self-consciously aware of his own appearance as a literal and figurative reinforcement of nationalist discourse. The pith helmet that he holds in his right hand, albeit partially obscured by the small boy who stands in front of him, was the quintessential symbol of Western imperialism and an intrinsic part of the uniform of Western overseas military campaigns. Here it is adopted by Vargas, not simply as a form of protection from the

¹⁴⁸ This was premised upon the assumption that, as Douglas explained, 'Dirt offends against order. Eliminating is not a negative movement, but a positive effort to organize the environment.' Mary Douglas, *Purity and Danger: An Analysis of the Concepts of Pollution and Taboo* (London: Routledge, 2004), p. 2.

¹⁴⁹ National Geographic Society Archives, Microfiche File No. 510-1-999.116948, Henry Albert Phillips to J. R. Hildebrand, 18 June 1942.

Luciana Martins makes this latter point in her discussion of American photographer Genevieve Naylor's photographic exhibition *Faces and Places in Brazil* (1943). She commented: 'The fifty photographs making up the exhibition seem to have been carefully selected to provide a picture of the country that would enable the American public to recognize Brazil, a country they knew very little about beyond being a "Great Coffee Nation", as part of their world'. Martins, 'Epilogue' in *Photography and Documentary Film in the Making of Modern Brazil*, pp. 209-16 (p. 212).

¹⁵⁰ Priscilla Peña Ovalle, *Dance and the Hollywood Latina: Race, Sex, and Stardom* (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 2011), p. 56.

sun, but in order for him to affiliate himself with the West through the recognisable figure of the white European traveller dressed in white European travel wear. It demonstrated his desire for the rest of the world to perceive of Brazil as a white, European nation undergoing the necessary processes of modernisation and industrialisation. Whilst the Vargas Government did not deny the existence of indigenous and African peoples within Brazil's complex multiracial society, official discourse smoothed over these diverse identities and fashioned an image of the country that was unequivocally white, or in the process of becoming white.¹⁵¹ This is framed within the *mise-en-scène* of this image, as Vargas smiles and gazes down at a small boy, dressed in a uniform of khaki shorts and jacket, who salutes and waves the Brazilian flag with its positivist motto of 'Order and Progress'. Vargas' gaze directly links himself to the boy, who is silhouetted against his white suit; the implication, it seems, is that the order and progress of Brazil rest upon its young, white, European-descended male populace. Rather than merely a self-conscious attempt to align himself with the United States as the amicable Good Neighbor, Vargas' white clothing encapsulated how the Brazilian elite prized European fashions. This image must also be read then as a pervasive reinforcement of the Estado Novo's racist ideology, which reflected complex power relations in operation within Brazil that sought to visually consume, and thereby marginalise, ethnicities that deviated from a white European norm.

¹⁵¹ Racial and cultural '*branqueamento*', 'whitening', had constituted a necessary process in the modernisation of Brazil following the abolition of slavery in 1888. The eugenics-influenced policy of various Brazilian governments since the late nineteenth century encouraged white European immigration from 'desirable' countries in the hope that it would ultimately 'whiten' the face of Brazil and its culture. Jeffrey Lesser, *Negotiating National Identity: Immigrants, Minorities and the Struggle for Ethnicity in Brazil* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1999), p. 4.

Snapshot 2: *Paulista Women's White Sportswear*

The cross-cultural tensions and layers of meaning evoked by white clothing can also be seen in the snapshot which is central to this section, printed on the right-hand side of a double-page view as part of Phillips' article (see Fig. 2.15).¹⁵² A full-page black and white photograph, it captured a group of athletic young white women, who appear to be of European descent, as they stand to attention before the camera. The upward-looking gaze of the camera elevates and projects the women against an open, unobstructed sky. Tall and erect, their feet placed together, arms straight by their sides, shoulders back, and stomachs tucked in, they gaze, for the most part, straight ahead. They are organised into pairs with military precision, and form a uniform line that stretches seemingly without limit into the distance. Their supple limbs and pale skin are illuminated by a natural sunlight that radiates from the right-hand side of the frame and stretches across the image. The construction of Brazilian femininity based upon glowing white ideals was not unknown in the North American press, as a photograph (Fig. 2.16) published in *American Vogue* in July 1941 attested.¹⁵³ Entitled 'South American Visitors: Five Beautiful Neighbors from Brazil, Peru and the Argentine ... recent visitors to the U.S.', it featured Vargas' daughter, Senhora Alzira Vargas do Amaral Peixoto, captured side-on, the flash of Horst P. Horst's camera illuminating her pale skin and white cotton dress. Richard Dyer has examined how camera lighting and film technology are specifically calibrated to assume and privilege white skin. He has conflated the representation of white bodies with the photographic quality of 'lightness', in which bodies are 'literally but also figuratively enlightened', reinforcing

¹⁵² Phillips, 'Air Cruising Through New Brazil', pp. 518-19.

Despite the fact that by the outbreak of World War Two colour film was in increasingly wide usage, *National Geographic* still shot many of its subjects in time-honoured black and white. This may have been an attempt to demonstrate the seriousness of the magazine's reportage.

¹⁵³ Anon., 'South American Visitors: Five Beautiful Neighbors from Brazil, Peru and the Argentine ... recent visitors to the U.S.', *American Vogue*, July 1941, p. 22.

an irreconcilable polarity between the colours, black and white, and the bodies, non-white and white.¹⁵⁴ Looking ahead and contemplating the prospect of a brighter and by extension *whiter* future, the women in *National Geographic* appear healthy and positive, reflecting the dynamism of a nation ready for war, a message of national unity, despite their individual facial features and body shapes, conveyed through group activity. The light illuminates their identical clean and simple white sportswear: white socks, white plimsolls, white laced-up polo shirts and white belts, all of which appear relief-like, staged against their dark shorts and the dark flat background. The uniformity of their clothing and poses serves to transcend Brazil's diverse and multiracial population, and the representation of multiple disciplined glowing white bodies, fused into a single powerful entity, can be understood as a metaphor for the unified global body: a powerful and cohesive Western hemisphere comprised of reliable and self-motivated individuals, all working together in co-operation.

The caption that accompanied this photograph read: 'Freed from the traditional chaperon of Latin America is the maid of Modern Brazil. Where formerly she sat at home with needlework, she now goes in for sports in a big way. Thousands of such sports-clad girls drilled at the inauguration of Sao Paulo's stadium in 1940.'¹⁵⁵ The caption described Brazil as a modernised country liberated from Latin America, symbolised by young Brazilian women and their adoption of a simple and practical outdoors sportswear aesthetic. *National Geographic* drew attention to the processes of sartorial anthropophagy through which a well-established North American sportswear aesthetic had been adopted and re-presented in a Brazilian context to serve as a potent symbol of a modern, white Brazil. Just as Vargas used white colonial

¹⁵⁴ Richard Dyer, *White* (New York: Routledge, 1997), p. 101.

¹⁵⁵ Phillips, 'Air Cruising Through New Brazil', p. 519.

dress to reinforce his political message in the previous image, here, white sportswear presented a literal and figurative endorsement of the political and ideological agenda of the Estado Novo regime. The popularity of North American sportswear, appropriate for both athletes and spectators, had risen steeply by 1942, liberating American fashion design from a dependence on traditional Parisian couture.¹⁵⁶ An example of American sportswear, which embodied an active, modern and streamlined new role for women engaged in a variety of active pursuits or taking on a broader range of work tasks, can be seen in an advertisement for Best and Co.'s line of 'Americana' clothing (Fig. 2.17), published in *American Vogue* in February 1941.¹⁵⁷ In *National Geographic*, North American sportswear no longer denoted Americanness but became a potent symbol of Brazilianness, centred on the efforts of Vargas' Estado Novo regime to formalise and institutionalise racial difference whilst creating rigid boundaries between masculine and feminine gender roles. The caption in *National Geographic* sidestepped any overt political references, but it did acknowledge that this photograph had originally been taken at the official inauguration of Sao Paulo's Municipal Sports Stadium on 27 August 1940. This event had been attended by Vargas and was, as Christina Peixoto-Mehrtens has pointed out, 'an explosive political symbol of modernity and a metaphor to the ways urban works and politics were to fuse in civic events' under his authoritarian regime.¹⁵⁸ Another photograph from the same event had appeared in the Brazilian newspaper *O Estado de Sao Paulo* on 28 April 1940 (Figs. 2.18 and 2.19), accompanied with a caption that read: 'Participating in the parade that inaugurates the Municipal Stadium, are numerous athletes from nearly all the Sao

¹⁵⁶ Rebecca Arnold, *The American Look: fashion, sportswear and the image of women in 1930s and 1940s New York* (London: I.B. Tauris, 2009).

¹⁵⁷ *American Vogue*, February 1941, p. 3.

¹⁵⁸ Christina Peixoto-Mehrtens, *Urban Space and National Identity in Early Twentieth Century São Paulo, Brazil: Crafting Modernity* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), p. 159.

Paulo associations. One sees here, the contingent of the School of Physical Education.¹⁵⁹ This photograph captured the female subjects in motion, a blur of black and white marching in tandem, the differences between the individual women blurred into a unified whole. In *National Geographic*, the women's consumption and re-presentation of American sportswear simultaneously re-asserted Brazilianness, and reassured *National Geographic* viewers, during a wartime period characterised by fragmentation and anxiety, that the superficial similarities in *white* sportswear and *white* skin could smooth over larger differences between Brazil and the United States. Dress promoted identification between *National Geographic* viewers and Brazilian subjects; it provided evidence of shared ideals and values, and reiterated the importance of Brazil as an important ally to the United States, whilst avoiding, as Phillips commented, the 'sappy Good Neighbor vein'.¹⁶⁰

However, despite this identification promoted through the narrative of dress, there remained an unmistakable power dynamic in *National Geographic*. This was centred on the fact that, in order to view the photograph in its correct landscape dimension (Figs. 2.20 and 2.21), the *National Geographic* viewer had to turn the page ninety degrees clockwise. Whereas in the first snapshot discussed, this material engagement with the image as object encouraged a more intimate gaze from the viewer, here it reinforced a distanced and disinterested gaze onto the women. This is because this tactile action brought the image into direct dialogue with a photograph printed on the left-hand side of the double-page view (Fig. 2.22), which presented vast quantities of Brazilian beef lined up outside in rows at the Wilson and Co. Inc. packing

¹⁵⁹ Anon., 'A Visita do Sr. Presidente Getulio Vargas a Sao Paulo', *O Estado de Sao Paulo*, 28 April 1940, p. 7.

¹⁶⁰ National Geographic Society Archives, Microfiche File No. 510-1-999.116948, Henry Albert Phillips to J. R. Hildebrand, 18 June 1942.

plant near Sao Paulo, hung up to dry like garments on a washing line. The titles of the two images encouraged the viewer to perceive the women as objects of a powerful gaze, and posited 'You can pick your own "Queen Coffee" from this line-up of athletic beauties at Sao Paulo' against 'Sun-dried Brazilian beef lures the American dollar into a venerable Brazilian industry'.¹⁶¹ Direct and overt, the captions highlighted the North American consumption of Brazilian goods such as beef and coffee. They advertised the female Brazilian subjects as mass-produced commodities displayed on a grocery store shelf, or at its most crude, as a harvest ripe to be gathered, encouraging the *National Geographic* viewer to select her preferred 'Queen Coffee': a distilled essence of Brazilianness neatly packaged for American consumption. Although *National Geographic* ostensibly appeared to document an image of Brazil that was visually akin to the United States, this was tempered by the editorial decision to place the women on the magazine page opposite an image of meat. It reinforced that, although this snapshot presented an ostensibly more intimate and familiar gaze on the women, demonstrated through their adoption of North American white sportswear, *National Geographic* was still engaged in portraying a more insidious form of dominance over Brazil. The final snapshot discussed in this chapter presents a third manifestation of the complex interactions between Brazil and the United States in relation to the concept of anthropophagy, and another shift in the fabric of *National Geographic's* representation of Brazil.

¹⁶¹ Phillips, 'Air Cruising Through New Brazil', pp. 518-19.

An Ethnographic Gaze on Brazil during the Military Dictatorship

The final snapshot was published almost thirty years later in the September 1971 edition of *National Geographic*, within an article entitled 'Brazil Protects her Cinta Larga'.¹⁶² This article presented a stark contrast to the modern, industrialised vision of Brazil and its thriving infrastructure that was impressed upon *National Geographic* viewers during the Second World War. Here Brazil reverted to an underdeveloped nation of vast resources, which drew a parallel with the image of Brazil presented in the first snapshot. This is perhaps not surprising given that this article was published during the Brazilian military dictatorship (1964-85), which had begun when a coup d'état supported by U.S. Cold War politics culminated in the overthrow of left-leaning Brazilian President, Joao Goulart, by the Brazilian Armed Forces.¹⁶³ During the early years of the dictatorship, the U.S. government frequently overlooked the systematic torture of Brazilian political dissidents. Correspondingly, *National Geographic's* shifting gaze during this period turned away from urban centres and politics, and towards Brazil's indigenous populations.

The article was written and photographed by W. Jesco von Puttkamer, 'semiofficial photographer and diarist', and documented the attempts by the Fundação Nacional do Índio (the National Indian Foundation, or FUNAI) to 'pacify' the Cinta Largas population, in one of the 'longest hardest, most dangerous jobs ever undertaken by my native Brazil's National Foundation for the Indian'.¹⁶⁴ In 1971 the Cinta Largas inhabited a territory in the southwest of the Amazon rainforest, covering, as can be seen on the map in Fig. 2.23, the Brazilian states of Rondonia and Mato

¹⁶² Puttkamer, 'Brazil Protects her Cinta Larga', pp. 420-44.

¹⁶³ The dictatorship continued until 1985, during which time 191 political murders and 243 disappearances took place. James Green, *We Cannot Remain Silent: Opposition to the Brazilian Military Dictatorship in the United States* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2010).

¹⁶⁴ Puttkamer, 'Brazil Protects Her Cinta Larga', p. 420.

Grosso. Within the article, an exoticised image of the Cinta Largas was fashioned within an imposed and timeless ethnographic present. Puttkamer described them as 'tense wild tribesmen' who 'for 400 years had escaped the encroachment of civilization'.¹⁶⁵ Puttkamer categorised and classified the Cinta Larga according to the wide sashes made from black tree bark that male members of the group wear around their waists, explaining: 'For the time being we are calling these Indians "Cinta Largas," from the Portuguese words for the broad belts often worn by men and boys of the region.'¹⁶⁶ There is a homogenisation and simplification inherent in this typological gesture, which drew a veil over the individual interactions that male and female indigenous subjects had with dress, and subjected them to a level of scrutiny based entirely upon their external appearance. This was reinforced when Puttkamer outlined the goals of FUNAI, which appeared more proprietorial than altruistic, and nurtured an idea of the Cinta Largas as a clearly differentiated Other, in need of paternal protection:

FUNAI's mission is a dual one. First, it pacifies hostile Indians so that Brazil, an underdeveloped nation, may extract the riches of its vast wilderness area as efficiently and painlessly as possible. Secondly, it protects the Indians it pacifies against the harmful aspects of our civilization with which they cannot cope [...] There is one thing that even the selfless, dedicated people of FUNAI cannot prevent. *That is the erosion of a simple culture by a strong, complex one [...]* and that is why each FUNAI *sertanista*, or Indian expert, carries in his *heart saudade, a nostalgic sadness*. [my italics]¹⁶⁷

Puttkamer's comment is rooted in a discourse of salvage ethnography, a recurring anthropological trope concerned with capturing the essence of a presence before its anticipated absence. He produced an idealised image of a mythical Brazilian past and

¹⁶⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶⁶ Ibid.

'Cinta Largas: Material Culture', in *Povos Indigenas no Brasil*, <<http://pib.socioambiental.org/en/povo/cinta-larga/427>> [accessed 3 June 2015]

¹⁶⁷ Ibid., p. 421.

reduced the Cinta Largas to an ineffable nostalgia, '*saudade*' (a Brazilian word for a nostalgic longing, which has no direct English translation), reinforcing the idea of the disappearance of their 'authentic' culture. Puttkamer was concerned with simultaneously documenting the 'lost' indigenous practices of the Cinta Largas while carefully inserting them into mainstream 'civilised' Brazilian society. He explained that FUNAI workers 'lived in daily peril of their lives. At any time, a *civilizado* might inadvertently do some small thing that could be misconstrued by the primitive mind and trigger a massacre.'¹⁶⁸ Such juxtapositions were abundant throughout the article and clearly demarcated the 'civilised' from the 'savage', justifying FUNAI's neocolonial activities through an understanding of its cultural and moral superiority.

Yet the twenty-three full-colour photographs of the Cinta Largas published within the article dissolved, to an extent, this division between the 'civilised' and the 'savage'. The photographs were distinct from the distanced and non-participatory scientific eye of the hydroplane that was seen in the first snapshot, which employed ostensibly more measured and preconceived strategies to document organised typologies of difference. Rather, these images had a relaxed quality and corresponding immediacy, which gave the impression that the subjects had forgotten the presence of Puttkamer's camera (see, for example, Fig. 2.24). This was a mark of the photographer's more intimate connection to the Cinta Largas, as someone who had gained knowledge otherwise inaccessible to outsiders, and was consequently able to photograph them from a presumably informed, albeit still outsider's, perspective. The unselfconscious, day-to-day nature of the photographs seemed to confirm the idea that the viewer was looking at a spontaneous moment in the life of the subjects; they functioned under the quasi-ethnographic pretence of the author as participant-

¹⁶⁸ Ibid.

observer, to emphasise that these are real people and real-life situations that Puttkamer was documenting. The images were printed close-up as full-page bleeds (Fig. 2.25), as opposed to being contained within a white border as they were in the first and second snapshots examined; this technique collapsed difference and invited a more direct response from the *National Geographic* viewer. Furthermore, as opposed to the matte, textured paper of the previous two snapshots, this one was printed in a slimmer edition of *National Geographic*, which had a combination of glossy and matte paper. The photographs were more self-reflexive about the encounter between members of FUNAI and indigenous subjects, and presented them close together, even hugging, suggesting that FUNAI were directly involved in the social life of the Cinta Largas and had formed relationships with them. This shift was a result of advances in camera technology which enabled photographers to document moving subjects, but it was also a reflection of the turn towards *National Geographic's* different methods of quasi-ethnographic research, from a distanced view to a more involved participation.

It is important not to exaggerate the singular novelty of this more intimate, self-reflexive gaze that *National Geographic* placed onto Cinta Largas subjects in September 1971. Ethnographic and photographic practices in Brazil since the early 1940s had already shifted to encompass more subjective approaches to documenting indigenous people, exemplified by the photographs and film stills produced by the SPI (the Indian Protection service, the state agency set up in 1910 that was responsible for the protection of indigenous groups, which in 1965 became FUNAI) within the expansive three edited volumes *Índios do Brasil* [*Indians of Brazil*], published between 1946 and 1953.¹⁶⁹ The 1,515 images collated by the Brazilian military engineer and

¹⁶⁹ C. M. Rondon, *Índios do Brasil, Vol I: Índios do centro, do noroeste e do sul de Mato Grosso* (Rio de Janeiro: Conselho Nacional de Proteção aos Índios, 1946); Rondon, *Índios do Brasil, Vol II: Cabeceiras do*

explorer, Cândido Mariano da Silva Rondon (1865-1958), the first director of the SPI, constituted a state project to modernise and industrialise the more remote regions of interior Brazil.¹⁷⁰ Yet rather than treat indigenous subjects as generic specimens of ethnographic ‘difference’, an obstruction getting in the way of progress, the vast majority of these official images presented, as Stephen Nugent has pointed out, ‘human subjects rather than material culture objects [...] a partial yet compelling portrait’ of a culturally-diverse, contemporary Brazilian society.¹⁷¹

Many of the photographs reproduced in Rondon’s three volumes have a more relaxed and immediate quality, which became a significant and established genre in the illustrated magazine *O Cruzeiro* (launched in 1928) throughout the 1940s and 1950s, and were markedly different from the images hitherto published in the mainstream Brazilian press.¹⁷² In order to fuel an increased demand for visual documentation of a Brazilian society in the process of transformation, in 1943 *O Cruzeiro* overhauled its previous editorial values and began to accompany ethnographic expeditions, such as those conducted by the Villas Boas brothers, to document to a widespread audience for the first time contact with the different indigenous subjects that they encountered. The empathetic portraits of Brazilian photojournalist Jose Medeiros (see for example Fig. 2.26, which captures an anonymous Xavante man, indigenous to the eastern state of Mato Grosso, close-up in the frame in 1949) and the candid shots of French-Brazilian photographer Henri Ballot

Rio Xingu, Rios Araguaia e Oiapoque (Rio de Janeiro: Conselho Nacional de ProteSao aos Indios, 1953); Rondon, *Indios do Brasil, Vol III: Norte do Rio Amazonas* (Rio de Janeiro: Conselho Nacional de ProteSao aos Indios, 1953).

¹⁷⁰ Stephen Nugent, *Scoping the Amazon: Image, Icon, Ethnography* (Walnut Creek, CA.: Left Coast Press, 2007), p. 92.

For a comprehensive introduction to trends within Brazilian ethnographic practice, and how this differs from developments in ‘Western’ anthropology conducted in Brazil, see Alcida Rita Ramos, ‘Ethnology Brazilian Style’, *Cultural Anthropology* 5:4 (1990), pp. 452-472.

¹⁷¹ Ibid., pp. 92-3.

¹⁷² Maria Luiza Melo Carvalho, *Contemporary Brazilian Photography* (New York: Verso, 1996), p. 14.

(see for example Fig. 2.27, which documents an anonymous group of Txukarramaes women, located along the Xingu River on the border between the states of Para and Mato Grosso, who appear unperturbed by the photographer's presence in 1953) encapsulated this new aesthetic of an intimate and subjective 'realism'. Andre Seguin des Hons has described how the magazine used the innovations of documentary photography to construct a humanised image of indigenous subjects, who were placed in the process of becoming integrated into Brazilian society:

Aesthetically, *O Cruzeiro* adopted the innumerable formal means used in modern photography: oblique horizons, unusual angles, the use of reflections causing spatial confusion, lenses which deform the image, tight close-ups, geometrical compositions, back-lighting and photomontage. Within the pages of the magazine, these methods had considerable impact. They created an aura of drama and grandeur about their subjects.¹⁷³

Images were no longer purely illustrative, but presented a subjective narrative, in which any notion of objectivity or distance was obliterated by the photographers' close-up and intimate engagement with their subjects. This photographic genre was eclipsed not simply by the advent of film and television, but most abruptly by the start of the military regime in 1964, which heavily censored the mainstream press and closed numerous magazines and newspapers. In doing so, it opened up a space for *National Geographic* to take over these new aesthetic values, as this chapter moves on to examine in closer detail.

¹⁷³ Andre Seguin des Hons quoted in Carvalho, *Contemporary Brazilian Photography*, p. 16.

Snapshot 3: The Cinta Larga Women's Black Body Paint

The particular snapshot that this chapter focuses on was published as a full-page bleed and occupied the right-hand side of a double-page view in *National Geographic* (Figs. 2.28 and 2.29).¹⁷⁴ It caught the viewer's attention since it was the only photograph that captured Cinta Larga women. Placed opposite a blank page of text, three female subjects stand side-on in a forest clearing, next to the remains of a smouldering fire. They do not look at the photographer but appear to be posing for another photograph, which is being taken by someone to the left of the photograph frame. They have short dark bobbed hair, wear necklaces of dyed *tucum* nuts and red string, and have painted geometric lines on their faces in *jenipap* dye.¹⁷⁵ The subject in the centre and her companion on the right have used black and red body paint to divide up and deconstruct their bodies, fragmenting them into separate parts. This sophisticated process isolates arms, chest, hips, legs, and ankle, and departs from the more prescriptive methods by which Western-style clothing tends to perceive the clothed body as a unified whole. For these women, painted and unpainted body parts become interdependent and have equal significance: both the positive shapes formed by the paint, and the negative spaces in between those shapes. This process of decontextualising one's own body parts, and perceiving each as an object in and of itself, demonstrates a self-reflexive gaze by which these women address their own bodies with a comparable level of scrutiny to that placed on them by the photographic gaze.

¹⁷⁴ Ibid., pp. 440-41.

This snapshot reflects the widespread use of colour photography in *National Geographic* and broader visual media by the 1970s.

¹⁷⁵ 'Cinta Largas: Material Culture', in *Povos Indigenas no Brasil*, <<http://pib.socioambiental.org/en/povo/cinta-larga/427>> [accessed 3 June 2015]

The women display a creativity and ingenuity in adopting new dress codes whilst retaining techniques customary to their own culture. In doing so, they develop their own version of 'Western' clothing, which re-invents it through their use of body paint.¹⁷⁶ Their resulting ensembles create shifting points of reference as the women represent the clothes *they* see, just as Puttkamer is documenting what *he* sees. The creative act of the women is comparable to an observation made by Claude Lévi-Strauss in *Tristes Tropiques* (1995). Lévi-Strauss described how the sophisticated Spanish American Caduveo Indians (also called the Mbaya) appropriated aspects of the uniform worn by Spanish sailors in the mid-nineteenth century through their customary practice of body painting:

After the Indians saw a European warship for the first time, when the *Maracanha* sailed up the Paraguay in 1857, the sailors noticed the next day that their bodies were covered with anchor-shaped motifs; one Indian even had an officer's uniform painted in great detail all over his torso – with buttons and stripes, and the sword-belt over the coat-tails.¹⁷⁷

Lévi-Strauss acknowledged the Mbaya's appropriation and re-presentation of the Spanish sailors' uniforms, which retained their visual motifs and design details but transformed them through the use of body paint. This process enabled the Mbaya to negotiate new sartorial meanings relevant to the sociopolitical organisation of their own culture. In *National Geographic*, the women's painted clothing may have been a comparably fluid demonstration of the subjects' creative self-invention, which refutes claims made within the text that the Cinta Largas have a static and 'simple culture'

¹⁷⁶ It is interesting to note that the women's dress has more in common with Eastern dress, such as that produced by the Japanese designer Issey Miyake in the 1970s. Miyake was interested in the space that existed *between* cloth and the body, and re-fashioned the principle tenets of Western dress, whose form is conventionally modelled closely to the body of the wearer, like a shell. While Miyake was concerned with the space between clothing and the body, these women are interested in the shapes between their different items of painted clothing on the surface of their skin, and likewise re-negotiate Western understandings of dress and the body and, in doing so, turn the performance of dress into an art form.

¹⁷⁷ Lévi-Strauss, Claude, *Tristes Tropiques* (London: Penguin, 2011), p. 189.

about to be eroded by a 'strong, complex one'.¹⁷⁸ The subjects' dressed bodies become a site of heterogeneous potentiality, which, rather than reinforcing the disintegration of Cinta Largas culture, suggests its ongoing creative renewal through dress that is receptive to contact with other cultures.

In *National Geographic*, the caption acknowledged that the women's body paint was a form of clothing rather than mere surface decoration, and read: '*Stylishly clad in painted "clothing"*, a feminine contingent arrives. Expedition members felt the women's presence marked a new level of confidence. Impressed by their poise, the author named them the "Three Graces".¹⁷⁹ Although this experimental form of sartorial anthropophagy was not explicitly pointed out, the caption acknowledged that the women had digested an existing discourse of Western-style clothing, and reapplied it using elements of indigenous material culture. The caption prompted the viewer to pick out the Western-style shapes of T-shirts, shorts, vests and body suits that could be seen within the photograph, which demonstrated the women's quick grasp of and adaptability to Western culture, thereby subverting the claims in the text that they are 'Stone Age Indians'.¹⁸⁰ The performative aspect of this mode of dress was enhanced by the poses that the women adopted, suggesting an awareness of the conventions of posing in Western-style photography. There is an evident attempt at self-presentation, but also a self-conscious exhibitionism, performed before the camera. The subject in the centre places one hand on her hip, tilts her face towards the camera or gaze located towards the left of the photograph frame, and places her weight on her left leg. The other two subjects are mid-way towards a pose. Barthes critically recognised that posing was a self-conscious act of making oneself into an image for the

¹⁷⁸ Puttkamer, 'Brazil Protects Her Cinta Larga', p. 421.

¹⁷⁹ Ibid., p. 440.

¹⁸⁰ Ibid., p. 421.

photographer's gaze: 'I pose, I know I am posing, I want you to know that I am posing.'¹⁸¹ The presence of all three women is undeniably felt as they participate in the construction of their own poses and appearances before the two camera gazes which provide an ambivalent complexity to the image. The viewer's awareness of these two gazes that have been placed onto the female subjects encourages her to imaginatively re-construct the women in three-dimensional terms. Puttkamer's position within the body of the article is one of nostalgic mourning for the loss of Cinta Larga culture, yet this particular snapshot, which appeared at the end of the *National Geographic* article, offered a glimmer of hope, since it demonstrated the Cinta Largas' creative and sustainable survival through dress. The association with the Three Graces, the mythological daughters of Zeus, said to represent beauty, charm and joy, who are frequently visually depicted in smooth, white artistic representations such as Antonio Canova's neoclassical marble sculpture (1814-17), implied both backwardness and evolution, since classical culture constituted the starting point for Western civilisation, but also the standard by which it was measured.¹⁸²

A point of comparison can be drawn with a rather different view of Brazilian women that was published in *Life* magazine on 12 November 1971 (Figs. 2.30 and 2.31), in an article written and photographed by John Dominis and entitled 'Taming the Green Hell: Brazil Rams a Highway Through The Wild Amazon.'¹⁸³ The article concerned the Brazilian Government's building of the Trans-Amazonian highway, a 4,000km road conceived of to unify Northern Brazil, which opened in September 1972 and ran through the Brazilian states of Paraiba, Ceara, Piaui, Maranhao, Tocantins,

¹⁸¹ Roland Barthes, *Camera Lucida: Reflections on Photography* (New York: Noonday Press, 1981), p. 12.

¹⁸² Christine M. Guth makes this point in her discussion of how European travellers encoded Japanese culture within Eurocentric frameworks that drew on Ancient Greece and Medieval Europe. Guth, *Longfellow's Tattoos: Tourism, Collecting and Japan* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2004), p. 31.

¹⁸³ John Dominis, 'Taming the Green Hell', *Life*, 12 November 1971, pp. 30-31.

Para and Amazonas. In the top-left-hand corner of the article, an image captured five Brazilian women straightforwardly in the frame, against a dull background of clouded sky, a wooden fence disappearing into the distance, and the green-and-white façade of a building. The caption that accompanied it read: 'Towns along the road are booming with such by-products of civilization as electricity and bar girls. On Saturday, hundreds of workers come into Altamira, above. Girls entertain the men for about \$3 each.'¹⁸⁴ A closer examination of the photograph demonstrated how simplified this description was in anchoring the meaning of the photograph, since it understood the women solely in terms of their availability as objects of consumption and a male gaze, and refused to acknowledge the layers of meaning embedded within their fashionable ensembles.

Each subject meets the photographer's gaze directly, and enacts a variety of poses, from straightforwardly presenting the body to the gaze that scrutinises them, to more stylised and performative fashion stances that reveal an uncovered thigh and high-heeled sandal. Their clothing is a combination of white nylon knee-high socks worn with white shoes, white and pink ankle-length dresses with thigh-high slits, and hot pants and overcoats in psychedelic printed fabrics, all of which stand out against the general degradation of their arid surroundings. The clashing colours and swirling patterns that adorn three of the women's outfits demonstrate the influence of contemporary hippie fashions, popular both inside and outside of Brazil during the period, with their penchant for exposing the body, vibrant hues and mismatched prints and styles. The women's clothing and poses were not only fashionable in Western Europe and the United States, but also circulated in mainstream Brazilian magazines, newspapers and soap operas. The women thus display a common awareness of

¹⁸⁴ Dominis, 'Taming the Green Hell', p. 30.

fashion that links them to the outside world, despite their remote geographical location, and encapsulates the global nature of fashion, as individuals negotiate different subject positions in the context of complex, transnational dynamics. To take these sartorial references into account which, unlike *National Geographic*, *Life* failed to do, enables the image to be read against the grain, and the women to be understood as no longer merely passive objects of a presumed male gaze but active fashion consumers in the context of a global economy who have negotiated and navigated the construction of their own identities through dress.

The reception and interpretation of the *National Geographic* snapshot, as exemplified by letters written to the magazine, demonstrated that it remained ambiguous and provocative in the minds of viewers, rather as the '*Manifesto Antropófago*' had been in 1928. One reader wrote to the secretary of *National Geographic* on 3 September 1971 (Fig. 2.32) acknowledging the educational value that she attached to the magazine, but criticising it for displaying nudity:

We have subscribed to your magazine for several years. The September 1971 issue has prompted this note to you – 22 pictures or pages of near-nude men and nude women! I have noticed an increasing trend in your magazine – and I am aware that this is the actual living pattern of these native tribes – of nudity. My teenage daughter refers to your magazine and has received invaluable assistance in her studies. Her friends also enjoy the magazine which occupies a prominent place on my coffee table – but this September issue will be put away. I'm sure that in the Brazilian jungle W. Jesco and von Puttkamer [sic] must have been able to find other interesting things – and been able to photograph these Indians more discreetly. Simply because these Indians wear no clothes at all should have prompted limited exposure of their bodies. I do not consider 22 pages of naked men suitable viewing for my teenage daughter.¹⁸⁵

¹⁸⁵ National Geographic Society Archives, Microfiche File No. 21.121397, Joan G. Wallis to The Secretary NGS, 29 August 1971.

This reader did not perceive the three Cinta Largas women as dressed and described them as 'nude', disregarding their complex use of body paint as a form of clothing. In response, although not actually outlining that body paint was a form of dress, *National Geographic* expressed the view that it was not necessarily a mark of civilisation to be clothed, and that it would be wrong to attempt to acculturate these peoples by forcing them to adopt clothing (Fig. 2.33):

If we are going to portray the Cintas Larga of Brazil, or the Stone Age tribesmen of new Guinea, or many of the newly independent peoples of Africa, we must accept that a large number of them go around wearing very little indeed – as do also many a 'civilized' American, Englishman or Russian today. To ignore this would, in our opinion, create just as false a picture of the world as if we did the opposite, and unnecessarily emphasized this aspect. Honesty, it seems to us, is key to this whole question. This is a very different thing from the deliberately pornographic (and essentially dishonest) publications so readily available these days in most drugstores.¹⁸⁶

National Geographic's acknowledgement that 'we must accept that a large number of them go around wearing very little indeed' still suggested an inability on the magazine's part to critically recognise the significance of the Cinta Largas' different modes of dress. Furthermore, the magazine's insistence on 'honesty' may be considered as an attempt to smooth over the ambiguity inherent in ethnographic and documentary modes of photography, which always reflect a particular gaze and are inextricably tied to the attitudes of the maker, who has chosen not only the subject but also the composition, lighting and framework within which that subject is captured.

¹⁸⁶ National Geographic Society Archives, Microfiche File No. 21.121397, John Scofield to Joan G. Wallis, 20 September 1971.

There were also letters that appeared to express an opposite viewpoint.

Another viewer wrote to *National Geographic* criticising the magazine for censoring its subjects (Fig. 2.34):

I wish to issue a complaint regarding the poor taste involved [...] You will note when looking at the pictures, you have censored the sex organs of the males in every case bringing attention to the fact. I presume this is based on some puritan concept that we are not supposed to see such things. If so, you are way behind the times. We are not a swinging family, in fact, we are considered rather square, but when the kids say 'tell it like it is', you should sit up and take notice. If your readers are incapable of handling such visual information, then don't put it in the magazine at all, but please do not degrade your magazine and degrade the readers' intelligence in the manner that you have.¹⁸⁷

National Geographic had not in fact censored the pictures; the viewer was inadvertently referring to the Cinta Largas' technique of keeping their scrotums pulled up and secured with palm-leaf ribbons, as can be seen in Fig. 2.24. In response, *National Geographic* gave the viewer a detailed explanation of the procedure (Fig. 2.35):

Cinta Larga males repair that part of the anatomy which you question in a way which obscures it from view. That part which is normally extrinsic is made intrinsic, or to put it bluntly, tucked back in. Our best information is this aids fertility which you must consider in terms of a relatively nomadic tribe which engages in hunting in the jungle for its livelihood. The small reed is attached by inserting a piece of loose flesh into a conical pocket resulting from an angular overlap at the end of the reed.¹⁸⁸

The different viewpoints offered by these two viewers provide an indication of the inconsistent or contradictory messages that the representation of dress provoked in the magazine, demonstrating that neither subject nor photographer – nor editor for

¹⁸⁷ National Geographic Society Archives, Microfiche File No. 21.121397, John T. Goss to Melville B. Grosvenor, 5 October 1971.

¹⁸⁸ National Geographic Society Archives, Microfiche File No. 21.121397, Jon Schneeberger to John T. Goss, 2 November 1971.

that matter – ever has complete control over the making of meaning within a photograph.

This chapter has used Andrade's self-aware metaphor of anthropophagy, whereby Brazilian subjects have swallowed foreign elements, selected aspects to consume, and incorporated them into their own organisms, to examine three snapshots that featured Brazil and were published in the first hundred years of *National Geographic*. The contradictory and ambiguous nature of anthropophagy made it a constructive critical tool to re-think these three very different, historically and geographically distanced, but particularly *charged*, cross-cultural interactions within the United States-Brazil contact zone. I return to Andrade's assertion that 'what clashed with the truth was clothing, that raincoat placed between the inner and outer world'.¹⁸⁹ In all three snapshots there has been a curiosity linked to *National Geographic's* observation of Brazilian dress.¹⁹⁰ Yet this chapter has also demonstrated that dress has provided a means for Brazilian subjects to negotiate and re-negotiate with creativity their individual identities. My analysis has attempted to assess the aesthetic singularities and creative innovations of Brazilian subjects' engagements with cross-cultural dress. A revisionist re-reading of these three snapshots through the lens of dress has articulated new frames of reference, potentialities and subjectivities, which have interrupted more dominant narratives embedded within the text of these *National Geographic* articles. Dress has enabled us to re-read these images against the

¹⁸⁹ Andrade, 'Cannibalist Manifesto', p. 38.

¹⁹⁰ It is interesting to note that dress study itself is grounded in an encyclopaedic interest in documenting diverse types of dress, exemplified by Italian scholar Cesare Vecellio's expansive two volumes, *Habiti Antichi, Moderni di tutto il mondo* [Old and Modern Habits of Dress in All Parts of the World], which catalogued dress in different parts of the world as early as 1598. Cesare Vecellio, *Habiti Antichi, Moderni di tutto il mondo* (Venice: Appresso i Sessa, 1598).

grain and challenge some of the straightforward assumptions that have been associated with the magazine. It has provided a counter-narrative, to challenge the prevailing scientific ideology of *National Geographic* to pursue 'the increase and diffusion of geographic knowledge'.¹⁹¹ It must be acknowledged that it was Brazilian women who were more openly scrutinised by male *National Geographic* correspondents, which raises issues of gendered authority, but nevertheless it was Brazilian women's dress that exhibited more potential to challenge a hegemonic gaze. This may be a result of the fact that women were understood as less important during the timeframe under examination, which meant they had a more fluid subjectivity to construct their identities in more idiosyncratic ways than men.

It must also be acknowledged that there were limitations to Andrade's methodology, since the interpretation of these three snapshots were often dependent, to varying degrees, upon their captions, which 'anchored' their meanings in a Barthesian sense. Yet, rather than fully accepting Barthes' argument that this process fixed the meaning of images, I would argue that, in *National Geographic*, the captions further complicated the images, providing additional layers of meaning to unfold. I turn here to Gerardo Mosqueira, who has aptly characterised anthropophagy as being 'not so fluid as it seems, since it is not carried on in neutral territory but rather [...] is subdued, with a praxis that tacitly assumes the contradictions of a dependence. In the end, who eats whom?'¹⁹² Mosqueira's criticism of anthropophagy reveals a paradox: although we cannot refuse, deny or disavow the creative appropriations that have materialised through it, the process can only take place within asymmetrical relations of power. During this period sartorial anthropophagy took place both

¹⁹¹ Anon., 'Announcement', *National Geographic*, October 1988, p.1.

¹⁹² Gerardo Mosqueira, 'Global Islands' in *Creolite and Creolization: Documenta 11 Platform 3* (Ostfildern-Ruit, Germany: Hatje Cantz, 2003), p. 31.

inconspicuously and conspicuously, simultaneously forming a mediator and a barrier between *National Geographic* and Brazilian subjects. *National Geographic* fulfilled a U.S.-driven cultural imperialism in each of these three snapshots to the extent that the magazine's agenda was clearly connected to broader political interests advanced by the United States during this period, rather than solely to the interests of Brazil. Despite being able to see instances in which Brazilian subjects negotiated and re-negotiated their own identities through dress, it was still *National Geographic* who ate, or fashioned, Brazil, as opposed to the other way around. *National Geographic's* images were distinguished from the broader global mediascape in the sense that they were far more complex and ambiguous than those produced by, for example, *Popular Mechanics*, *American Vogue* and *Life*. This unequal power dynamic shifted in the post-1988 period when *National Geographic* celebrated its centennial, and sartorial expressions by Brazilian subjects took on a new form as, to cite a term employed by North American scholar of Brazilian film, Robert Stam, an 'aesthetics of garbage'.¹⁹³ This coincided with a shift at *National Geographic*, as it moved from an understanding of its photographs as purely illustrative to the text, towards a more tactile understanding of imagery as key to the interpretation of its articles.

¹⁹³ Stam, 'Hybridity and the Aesthetics of Garbage', n.p.

Chapter 2.

Aesthetics of Garbage: Globalisation and the Representation of Brazilian Dress in *National Geographic* since 1988

- **Snapshot 4: Djauí's Red T-shirt and Adidas Shorts, December 1988**
- **Snapshot 5: The Afro-Brazilian Girl's Lycra Top and Denim Jeans, August 2002**

Whilst Andrade used the metaphor of anthropophagy in 1928 to conceptualise Brazilian *Modernismo* as an aesthetics of bricolage and discontinuity with the country's historical past, in 1998 Robert Stam drew a connection with postmodernism and described Brazilian film since the late 1980s as an 'aesthetics of garbage', articulated through the creative and hybrid act of pastiche.¹⁹⁴ Stam's metaphor is comparable to anthropophagy in the sense that it provides a means to invert cross-cultural expressions that have previously been seen as negative, and revalorise them as an anti-colonial trope, turning a premeditated disadvantage into a tactical strength. However, whereas anthropophagy was dependent upon the strong binary oppositions between oppressors and oppressed, the United States and Brazil, *National Geographic* and Brazilian subjects, an 'aesthetics of garbage' encapsulated the more nuanced subtleties and complexities that have been woven into the fabric of contemporary encounters within the *global* contact zone. Certainly, Andrade's ambiguous metaphor was innovative in its attempts to dissolve the irreconcilable dualities of cross-cultural interactions and, when used as an analytical tool, it revealed three particularly charged examples of exchange and dialogue, which illuminated Brazilian subjects' skills in self-fashioning and self-presentation before *National Geographic's* gaze. Yet there were limitations to his argument, which could not account for the increasingly interdependent and fluid nature of a globally restructured and continually changing world, which has influenced the various ways that dress, but also its representation in

¹⁹⁴ Stam, 'Hybridity and the Aesthetics of Garbage', n.p.

mass media, has been manufactured, distributed, sold, purchased, worn, discarded and recycled. The metaphor of an aesthetics of garbage provides a broader critical approach for a global era, which expresses additional degrees of uniqueness and, as Stam articulated, how ‘a discourse of “media imperialism”’ had given way to ‘reciprocity and “indigenization”’.¹⁹⁵ It enables globalisation not *merely* to be reduced to an objective economic process, but *also* to narrate the different stories, personal and collective, local and global, visual and material, which define and describe it.

Stam used garbage as a metaphor to recount the subversive potential and dynamic individualism of contemporary Brazilian culture, which negotiated and re-negotiated discarded aesthetic codes and conventions within the expanded, accelerated, and intensified global contact zone:

Another way that Brazilian culture is figured as a mixed site is through the motif of garbage. Garbage, in this sense, stands at the point of convergence of our three themes of hybridity, chronotopic multiplicity, and the redemption of detritus. *Garbage is hybrid, first of all, as the diasporized, heterotopic site of the promiscuous mingling of rich and poor, center and periphery, the industrial and the artisanal, the domestic and the public, the durable and the transient, the organic and the inorganic, the national and the international, the local and the global.* The ideal postmodern and postcolonial metaphor, garbage is mixed, syncretic, a radically decentered social text. [my italics]¹⁹⁶

Stam outlined the three strands woven into his conceptualisation of an aesthetics of garbage: hybridity, chronotopic multiplicity, and the redemption of refuse. Primarily, he emphasised that hybridity is not a neutral term, but has recurrently been adopted by Latin American governments to articulate national identity within integrationist

¹⁹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁹⁶ Ibid.

discourses that dismiss the existence of cultural, racial and social discrimination.¹⁹⁷

Stam acknowledged an important critique of hybridity – that, as an anti-essentialist discourse, it can often camouflage essentialisms, centred upon its ostensible failure to discriminate between diverse modalities, and instead stress oversimplified notions of blending, assimilation, mimicry, co-option, imposition, exploitation, and subversion.¹⁹⁸ He used Brazilian film as a case study to analyse this new hybrid form of multitemporal and intertextual aesthetics. The multifarious nature of dress equally enables the complex articulations and re-articulations of cross-cultural exchange to be unravelled so that hybridity, which unquestionably unfolds in power-laden contexts, is able to draw distinctions as opposed to blur them, and crucially, is not reduced to a nebulous and ‘descriptive, catch-all term’.¹⁹⁹

In addition, Stam used the term ‘chronotopic multiplicity’, derived from Russian literary theorist Mikhail Bakhtin, to describe the multiple and intertextual strands of world-time and world-space that are interlaced and overlaid in Brazilian film.²⁰⁰ Bakhtin drew upon the temporally palimpsestic nature of literary expressions and their inseparable layering of spatio-temporalities. In his 1981 collection of four essays, *The Dialogic Imagination*, he coined the term ‘chronotope’ to refer in a figurative, as opposed to mathematical or physical, sense to ‘the intrinsic connectedness of

¹⁹⁷ Latin America is often perceived as the hybrid region *par excellence* based upon the various encounters, clashes, contact, interaction, miscegenation and exchange between indigenous populations, Europeans, and Africans brought to the continent as a result of the European slave trade.

One of the first scholars to critically acknowledge hybridity was Brazilian sociologist Gilberto Freyre who in 1933 defined Brazilian identity in terms of mixing, namely of European and African cultures. Gilberto Freyre, *The Masters and The Slaves: A Study in the Development of Brazilian Civilization* (New York: Knopf, 1956).

¹⁹⁸ An outspoken critic of hybridity is Jonathan Friedman, who has argued that the theory reproduces the notion of cultural purity that it intends to transcend. Jonathan Friedman, ‘Global Crises, the Struggle for Cultural Identity and Intellectual Pork-Barrelling: Cosmopolitans versus Locals, Ethnic and Nationals in an Era of De-Hegemonisation’ in *Debating Cultural Hybridity: Multi-Cultural Identities and the Politics of Anti-Racism*, ed. by Pnina Werbner and Tariq Modood (London: Zed Books, 1997), pp. 70-89.

¹⁹⁹ Stam, ‘Hybridity and the Aesthetics of Garbage’, n.p.

²⁰⁰ Ibid.

temporal and spatial relationships that are artistically expressed in literature'.²⁰¹ A parallel can be drawn here with dress, which is interconnected and intertextual; it is the product of a multiplicity of historical periods, continually harking back to a fleeting past that it refabricates in the present. Lynda Nead has used the dress metaphor of a 'crumpled handkerchief' to articulate a topological concept of time and space as folded, whereby distant points can become close in proximity, or superimposed over one another.²⁰² This experience of time as crumpled, rather than flat and linear, weaves together past, present and future in continual and unexpected conversation. While time and space constitute abstract concepts and contexts, dress enables us to pinpoint and decipher particular examples of when individuals have expressed a sense of *who* they are in relation to *when* and *where* they are.²⁰³

Nead used the metaphor of the crumpled handkerchief, suggestive of old and greying qualities, as opposed to a clean, crisp and freshly ironed one. This is significant, and draws a correlation with the final strand that Stam wove into an aesthetics of garbage: the strategic redemption or recycling of marginal or second-hand aesthetics. A connection can be made here with the concept of *gambiarra*, which was touched upon in the first snapshot in chapter one and exemplified by the female subject's inventive recycling of an 'old piece of cloth', in order to self-present before the photographer's ethnographic gaze. Stam located these recycled aesthetics within the archive of *Udigrudi* (underground) Brazilian cinema of the late 1960s, heralded by Brazilian filmmaker Rogério Sganzerla, who developed techniques that appropriated international cinema and re-presented it in an irreverent, overtly affected but

²⁰¹ Mikhail Bakhtin, *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*, trans. by Michael Holquist (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981).

²⁰² Lynda Nead quoted in Caroline Evans, *Fashion At The Edge: Spectacle, Modernity and Deathliness* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003), p. 22.

²⁰³ Susan B. Kaiser makes this point in her introduction to *Fashion and Cultural Studies* (London: Berg, 2012), p. 1.

innovative manner.²⁰⁴ Though underground Brazilian cinema, which used second-hand aesthetics to parody borrowed ideas from Europe and the United States, was grounded in the counterculture of the 1960s, Stam located a new form of these techniques in Brazilian film from the late 1980s and 1990s.²⁰⁵ Brazilians, he asserted, were required to sift through the remnants of a global capitalist culture and incorporate and re-present leftover or salvaged elements 'like the heterogeneous scraps making up a quilt'.²⁰⁶ In doing so, he gave a positive identification and revalorisation to the transformative process of mending, altering and recycling diverse swatches of the West's unwanted products, and using them to construct a new, cross-cultural textile that mediated between the local and the global. Stam's use of a simile that draws on dress has an increased significance in relation to the timeframe under examination; since the late 1980s, increased consumerism and declining clothing prices have resulted in a vast surplus of second-hand garments no longer required in North America and Western Europe. These used items of dress have been donated to charitable organisations, sorted and baled, and subsequently exported to Latin America, Africa and Asia.²⁰⁷ It is through their re-use and transformation in diverse geographical locations that their cross-cultural meanings, as Karen Tranberg Hansen has remarked, 'shift in ways that help redefine used clothing into "new" garments'.²⁰⁸

This chapter will weave together the three strands that comprise an aesthetics of

²⁰⁴ Stam drew on one particular example: *The Red Light Bandit*, dir. by Rogério Sganzerla (Urano Filmes, 1968).

²⁰⁵ He drew upon three examples: *Isla das Flores*, dir. by Jorge Furtado (Casa de Cinema de Porto Alegre, 1989), *Boca de Lixo*, dir. by Eduardo Coutinho (Centro de Criacao de Imagem Popular, 1992) and *O Fio da Memoria*, dir. by Eduardo Coutinho (Cinefilmes, 1991), each of which engaged figuratively and literally with the trope of garbage.

²⁰⁶ Stam, 'Hybridity and the Aesthetics of Garbage', n.p.

²⁰⁷ Alexander Palmer and Hazel Clark, *Old Clothes, New Looks: Second Hand Fashion* (New York: Berg, 2005).

²⁰⁸ Karen Tranberg Hansen, 'Youth, Gender and Secondhand Clothing in Lusaka, Zambia: Local and Global Styles', in *The Fabric of Cultures: Fashion, Identity and Globalization*, ed. by Eugenia Paulicelli and Hazel Clark (London: Routledge, 2009), pp. 112-27 (p. 116).

garbage (hybridity, chronotopic multiplicity and the strategic redemption of detritus) to unpick a number of threads from the diverse and multisensory stories of contemporary globalisation that have been fabricated through the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic* since 1988.

This chapter begins with an examination of the article 'Within the Yellow Border', written by the then editor of *National Geographic*, Wilbur E. Garrett (1980-90), which was published in the magazine to celebrate its centennial in September 1988.²⁰⁹ This article encapsulated a shift that departed from an objective, scientific approach to the documentation of peoples and places in the world, and moved towards a heightened multisensory and subjective engagement with dressed subjects. It will be used to outline the changes that have taken place at *National Geographic* since 1988, which have been driven by, but increasingly have also driven, the forces of globalisation. I move on to analyse the layers of meaning woven into the two key snapshots or case studies of Brazilian dress that this chapter examines, which were published in the magazine in December 1988 and August 2002.²¹⁰ The first article was written by the American author and photojournalist, Loren McIntyre, and accompanied with photographs taken by the Brazilian photographer and documentary filmmaker, W. Jesco von Puttkamer, whose work was examined in the previous chapter.²¹¹ The second was written by African-American journalist, Charles E. Cobb Jr., and accompanied with photographs by American photographer, David Alan Harvey.²¹² This chapter draws conclusions to the following questions: what visual and textual strategies have been used by *National Geographic* to *fashion* an idea of Brazilian dress

²⁰⁹ Wilbur E. Garrett, 'Within the Yellow Border ...', *National Geographic*, September 1988, pp. 270-86.

²¹⁰ Loren McIntyre, "'Last Days of Eden': Rondonia's Urueu-Wau-Wau Indians', *National Geographic*, December 1988, pp. 800-87; Charles E. Cobb Jr., 'Where Brazil was Born: Bahia', *National Geographic*, August 2002, pp. 62-81.

²¹¹ Loren McIntyre, 'Last Days of Eden'.

²¹² Cobb Jr., 'Where Brazil was Born: Bahia'.

since 1988? And to what extent have Brazilian subjects self-fashioned through the trope of garbage, demonstrated by their ability to engage in sartorial accommodations, appropriations and negotiations of second-hand aesthetics of global culture?

The Representation of Brazil in *National Geographic* since 1988

It is useful here to include a brief comment on the representation of Brazil in *National Geographic* since the magazine celebrated its centennial in September 1988. To date, seventeen articles on Brazil have been published during this period.²¹³ Although they have appeared to follow no regular pattern, three key themes have emerged but, unlike the development tracked in Chapter One, these themes do not run chronologically. The predominant theme has been indigenous peoples and places in the Amazon or ecological sites in Brazil, reflected in the titles of articles such as 'Last Days of Eden: Rondonia's Urueu-Wau-Wau' (December 1988), 'The Amazon: South America's River Road' (February 1995), 'Into the Amazon' (August, 2003), 'The Rainforest in Rio's Backyard' (March, 2004), 'The Wild Wet' (August 2005), 'Last of the Amazon' (January 2007), 'Dazzling Brazilian Junes' (July 2010) and 'Kayapo Courage: the rich and powerful Brazilian tribe is battling a dam project that will not die' (January 2014).²¹⁴ The second theme has been Rio de Janeiro and Sao Paulo, reflected in the titles of articles such as 'Brazil: Flight to the Cities' (December 1988), 'Cities: Sao Paulo'

²¹³ Refer to Appendix 2: The representation of Brazil in *National Geographic* (1988 - December 2014).

²¹⁴ McIntyre, 'Last Days of Eden'; Scott Wallace, 'The Amazon: South America's River Road', *National Geographic*, February 1995, pp. 2-39; Scott Wallace, 'Into the Amazon', *National Geographic*, August 2003, pp. 2-27; Virginia Morrell, 'The Rain Forest in Rio's Backyard', *National Geographic*, March 2004, pp. 2-27; Susan McGrath, 'The Wild Wet', *National Geographic*, August 2005, pp. 46-71; Scott Wallace, 'Last of the Amazon', *National Geographic*, January 2007, pp. 41-71; Ronaldo Ribeiro, 'Dazzling Brazilian Dunes', *National Geographic*, July 2010, pp. 108-17; Chip Brown, 'Kayapo Courage: the rich and powerful Brazilian tribe is battling a dam project that will not die', *National Geographic*, January 2014, pp. 30-55.

(November 2002), 'Visions of the Earth: Rio de Janeiro' (April 2006), 'Visions of the Earth: Brazil' (January 2007), and 'A New Face for Rio' (October 2012).²¹⁵ The third theme, also the least represented in the period covered by the previous chapter, was Afro-Brazilians, reflected in the titles of two articles, 'Where Brazil was Born: Bahia' (August 2002) and, most recently, 'Where Slaves Ruled' (April 2012).²¹⁶ This chapter draws on two of these themes – indigenous peoples in the Amazon and Afro-Brazilians – whilst chapter three delves into the remaining theme, Rio de Janeiro and Sao Paulo.

Beyond the Yellow Border: A Heightened Phenomenology of Contact

To commemorate the 100th anniversary of *National Geographic*, a foldout article written by Wilbur E. Garrett, entitled 'Within the Yellow Border ...' (Figs. 3.0-3.4), was published in the September 1988 edition of the magazine.²¹⁷ This was the first of three centennial editions published consecutively and distributed to the magazine's 10.5 million members worldwide, eighty per cent of whom lived in the United States, and twelve per cent in the English-speaking countries of Canada, Great Britain, Australia and New Zealand.²¹⁸ Spread over eight interconnected pages that folded out of the magazine, to the left *and* right, back *and* front, the article reproduced three hundred and sixty *National Geographic* covers: every single cover published since September 1959, and each different cover design since October 1888. This

²¹⁵ Paul R. Ehrlich and Anne H. Ehrlich, 'Brazil: Flight to the Cities', *National Geographic*, December 1988, pp. 934-37; Erla Zwingle, 'Cities: Sao Paulo', *National Geographic*, November 2002, pp. 70-99; Izan Petterle, 'Visions of the Earth: Rio de Janeiro', *National Geographic*, April 2006, p. 14; Jorge Saenz, 'Visions of the Earth: Brazil', *National Geographic*, August 2007, p. 18; Antonio Regalado, 'A New Face for Rio', *National Geographic*, October 2012, pp. 72-91.

²¹⁶ Cobb Jr., 'Where Brazil was Born: Bahia'; Charles C. Mann and Susanna Hecht, 'Where Slaves Ruled', *National Geographic*, April 2012, pp. 122-39.

²¹⁷ Wilbur E. Garrett, 'Within the Yellow Border ...'.

²¹⁸ C. D. Bryan, *The National Geographic Society: 100 Years of Adventure and Discovery* (New York: Abrams, 1987).

foldout section was accompanied with a page of text, framed in the bold yellow rectangle that has characterised *National Geographic's* gaze on the world since February 1910.²¹⁹ Viewed with contemporary hindsight of the unprecedented and accelerated geographical and political change that the end of the Cold War would engender, the title 'Within the Yellow Border ...', which attempted to limit and confine the *National Geographic* viewer's gaze onto the world, appeared eerily portentous. Constraint and fixity were encouraged by the formulaic and systematic placement of the covers, which were reproduced in an identical size and format, and ordered with precision in a linear chronology. *National Geographic* presented a visual typology of itself on its 100th anniversary, with a neutral and objectifying gaze comparable to that placed upon it by Cyprian Gaillard in his pop-up artwork 'L'Origami du Monde' for *O32c* on the magazine's 125th anniversary.²²⁰

Yet the foldout section of 'Within the Yellow Border ...', corresponding with the format of Gaillard's artwork, required a tactile, three-dimensional engagement with the magazine as a material object, which surpassed a solely empirical, two-dimensional detached and objective gaze. The tangible qualities of the article operated in opposition to the title's rhetoric of containment and constraint, and urged viewers

²¹⁹ In 2004, Connie Phelps, senior editor and design director for *National Geographic*, explained the evolution and symbolism of the yellow bordered cover, which has graced the magazine since February 1910: 'A border of oak leaves and acorns, emerging from the bottom center and rising up on either side, represents the origins and sturdy growth of the Society. At the top, it meets a garland of laurel leaves and berries, a traditional symbol of achievement and honor in the arts of civilization. Inset at the cardinal points are the earth's four hemispheres, representing the all-embracing nature of the society's work and suggesting that the contents are bound only by "the world and all that is in it". A frame bordered in a buff colour resembles a kind of window on the world.' Connie Phelps quoted in William E. Ryan and Theodore E. Conover, *Graphics Communications Today* (Clifton Park, NY: Thomson/Delmar Learning, 2004), p. 504.

I would add to this that the colour yellow has been associated with wisdom and knowledge, thereby reinforcing the idea that *National Geographic* is an authoritative source of information about the world, but it is also representative of the sun, the life source of the earth, thus resonating with *National Geographic's* motto to care about the planet. It is certain that yellow, which has become increasingly vibrant over the years and at the time of writing, has visually distinguished *National Geographic* from other North American print media.

²²⁰ Cyprien Gaillard, 'L'Origami du Monde', *O32c*, Autumn/Winter 2013, pp. 160-67.

to venture on a multisensory excursion *beyond* the rectangular yellow border – something that may have been hinted at with the insertion of an ellipsis into the title, suggestive of an unfinished thought. The article unfolded as far as the arms could stretch and played with the affective capacities of the viewer. To scrutinise the covers in their entirety, the viewer was required to hold the magazine in her hands and realign her body in relation to it: to press her chest forwards, to move her face closer to inspect the small printed details, to achieve a sensory relation with the textured surface and smell of the recently printed, thin glossy pages. ‘Within the Yellow Border ...’ was designed not just to be read, but to be held and to be *felt*. Art critic Andy Grundberg, writing in the *New York Times* on 18 September 1988, recalled his memory of *National Geographic* on its centennial: ‘From the perspective of small-town U.S.A., the wild animals, tribal cultures and mountain vistas pictured on its pages seemed utterly foreign and completely foreign. *They were far off but, with the magazine nestled in my lap, they were also tantalizingly near.*’ [my italics]²²¹ Indeed, the centennial edition of *National Geographic* ventured one step further than Grundberg’s observation, and attempted to fold the viewer *into* the magazine, akin to Merleau-Ponty’s observation that perception is a fold into the flesh of the world, and establish a visual excitation that was inextricably linked to touch but also to the body of the subject flattened in reproduction.²²² Film historian Laura U. Marks has eloquently written of how ‘vision itself can be tactile, as though one were touching a film with one’s eyes’.²²³ She has acknowledged the importance of surface texture in evoking a range of experimental bodily responses, which stretch beyond cool, rational

²²¹ Andy Grundberg, ‘A Quintessentially American View of the World’, *New York Times*, 18 September 1988, pp. 11-12.

²²² Merleau-Ponty, *Phenomenology of Perception*, p. 368.

²²³ Laura U. Marks, *The Skin of the Film: Intercultural Cinema, Embodiment and the Senses* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2007), p. vi.

observation, and towards a more dynamic subjectivity and bodily interconnection between viewer and image. With its smooth, glossy pages, 'Within the Yellow Border ...' consciously prompted a multisensory response from its viewers, who had the potential to re-construct critically and singlehandedly the magazine's linear history.

The article had similar conventions to a folded paper map in the sense that, although the folding and unfolding gestures that it required of the viewer had a predetermined (in the sense of being pre-folded) structure, they were destined to generate inconsistencies, and potentially cause confusion, through the distinctive manner that individuals engaged with it. 'Within the Yellow Border ...' became an imaginative and ambiguous space, in which no single historical viewpoint was privileged, but rather a fragmented network of possible and overlapping histories. These re-constructed versions of the past were entirely dependent upon the *National Geographic* viewer, who unfolded and re-folded, arranged and re-presented, the article in accordance with their individually specific desires and whims, whether intentional or accidental. The viewer had the authority to deconstruct *National Geographic's* very precise historiography of its documentation of 'the world and all that is in it', exemplified by the neatly presented covers in a grid formation, and re-imagine it through a series of folding gestures, which enabled disjointed time periods and diverse geographical locations to connect intimately with one another, and thereby provide a patchwork quilt made up of scraps and fragments from possible pasts. The result was an innovative and fictional re-staging of the magazine's one-hundred-year history, which directly implicated the *active* viewer in the process of simultaneously looking *and* touching, folding and unfolding, fashioning and re-fashioning. 'Within the Yellow Border ...' reinforced the *impossibility* of a single

definitive history and resonated with Garrett's telling comment, printed in the textual accompaniment to the article, that in this centennial edition 'we look not just at what's old, but also at what's *new* about our past'. [my italics]²²⁴

'Within the Yellow Border ...' fashioned a slipperiness between objectivity and subjectivity, factual and imaginary, past and present, which was reinforced by the ambiguous text written by Garrett that accompanied it. He commented: 'Though I can't relate to all of them, these covers mark a century of holding up to the world our *uniquely objective publishing mirror*' [my italics].²²⁵ Garrett privileged *National Geographic's* definitive viewpoint, which had set out to disseminate an unmediated and faithful reflection of the world, acting as detached witness to the peoples and places observed for one hundred years. Yet 'mirror' is an interesting choice of word; an *ideal* mirror would duplicate exactly what is seen in its visual essence, but a *real* mirror can only ever be an approximation of that ideal, since it is 'necessarily reduced to two dimensions' and, as Wolfgang Coy has recognised, 'more or less distorted in accordance with the laws of optics'.²²⁶ When we view our own image in a mirror, we are often aware, even if not at an entirely conscious level, that it is a mutable and distorted representation, which has blurred the boundary between reality and fiction. Interestingly, Garrett appeared to self-reflexively acknowledge this contradiction, when he proceeded to assert a point of departure from the magazine's previous

²²⁴ Wilbur E. Garrett, 'Within the Yellow Border ...', p. 270.

²²⁵ Ibid.

Garrett indirectly engaged here with an article written by previous editor Gilbert H. Grosvenor (1899-1954) in March 1915, when the National Geographic Society boasted a membership of 337,000 subscribers, in which he laid out the 'Guiding Principles' of the magazine: 'The First principle is absolute accuracy. Nothing must be printed which is not strictly according to fact. The Magazine can point to many years in which not a single article has appeared which was not absolutely accurate.' Gilbert H. Grosvenor, 'Report of the Director and Editor of the National Geographic Society for the Year 1914', *National Geographic*, March 1915, p. 319.

²²⁶ Wolfgang Coy, 'In Photographic Memory', in *Photography After Photography: Memory and Representation in the Digital Age*, ed. by Hubertus v. Amelunxen, Stefan Iglhaut and Florian Rotzer (Amsterdam: G & B Arts, 1996), p. 66.

editorial objectives, and urgently called for ‘a once-in-a-century bit of *introspection* – *holding up the mirror to ourselves for a change* ... we’re looking ahead to the next 100 years’ [my italics].²²⁷ Garrett deconstructed the notion of a singular, objective geographical or historical ‘truth’, and acknowledged that it cannot exist beyond the author’s subjective point of view, nor the viewer’s interpretative understanding. He announced a re-construction of the magazine’s mode of reportage in which, from this point forth, *National Geographic*’s own subjectivity, its mirror image, would be discernible within the magazine.²²⁸ Garrett self-consciously laid bare the artifice prevalent in any form of representation that seeks to marginalise the other so-called proximate senses – in particular, touch – as a means to foreground an objectified and essentialised vision of the world informed by science and technology.²²⁹ In doing so, he highlighted the representational instability of *National Geographic*, which has not simply mirrored, but actively fashioned its subjects, manufacturing the objects of its gaze, in so far as it has registered them.

The performative and self-reflexive nature of ‘Within the Yellow Border ...’ had an inherent awareness of the plurality of self-narratives woven into the magazine, which were fractured, overlapping and multi-layered. Coupled with its focus on creatively re-presenting its own reportage history, with the assistance of the active *National Geographic* viewer, it encapsulated a paradigm shift, whereby the magazine no longer viewed itself as an exemplar of objective science, but as a creative site where the direct documentation *and* dramatisation of different individual and collective subjects intertwined. This was reinforced by Jane Livingston’s acknowledgement, within the same issue of the magazine, that today ‘we are viewing

²²⁷ Wilbur E. Garrett, ‘Within the Yellow Border ...’, p. 270.

²²⁸ Ibid.

²²⁹ Ibid.

National Geographic photography in a special way: holding it up by itself, full-frame, out of context, and away from words'.²³⁰ She celebrated the intrinsic and self-expressive value of *National Geographic* photography, which had been liberated from a prior understanding of it as directly illustrative of the accompanying text, to be praised for its own artistic imperative.²³¹ Considering Livingston's comment in conjunction with Garrett's article, the centennial edition of *National Geographic*, although a U.S. cultural expression rather than a Brazilian one, also encapsulated aspects comparable to an aesthetics of garbage, in the sense that it was a hybrid, which dissolved the border between text and photography, image and object, two dimensions and three dimensions, fact and fiction, past and present, objectivity and subjectivity, touch and vision. It created new and imaginative constellations from an old historical trajectory, in which world-space and world-time were intrinsically interconnected and intricately layered over the top of one another to form new palimpsestic, chronotopic multiplicities. It recycled old *National Geographic* covers to produce an innovative gaze, which was 'looking ahead to the next 100 years', and foretold a story that concerned a world on the brink of massive geographical, political and economic change.²³² When viewed with the luxury of contemporary hindsight, 'Within the Yellow Border ...' was unnervingly prescient of the intensification and expansion of images that would be produced by the global mediascape, and with which *National Geographic* would be required to contend.²³³ The article drew many

²³⁰ Jane Livingston, 'The Art of Photography at National Geographic', *National Geographic*, September 1988, p. 324.

²³¹ Jane Livingston, 'The Best Photos from National Geographic' in *Odyssey: The Best Photos from National Geographic* (Washington DC: Corcoran Gallery of Art, 1988), pp. 19-38.

²³² Wilbur E. Garrett, 'Within the Yellow Border ...', p. 270.

²³³ An article by Gilbert M. Grosvenor, full-time editor of *National Geographic* (1980-90), demonstrated that the magazine was clearly looking ahead to the digital changes of the future in 1988. In March 1988, within an article published in *The Geographical Journal*, Grosvenor questioned: 'What will it be like, I wonder, by the end of the National Geographic Society's second century? [...] will the index to all the volumes of our magazine – the entire compendium of our past – be contained in a microchip the size of

connections to 'L'Origami du Monde', discussed in the introduction to this thesis,²³⁴ but whereas Gaillard was looking back over the magazine's complex history on its 125th anniversary, and suggesting how it might be re-considered through imaginative storytelling and narrative reconstruction, Garrett looked forward, and provided the analytical tools that would enable the magazine to metamorphose to incorporate, and compete with, these unprecedented and accelerated global changes. *National Geographic's* increased focus on the importance of tactile imagery over detached text encouraged viewers to engage with images of peoples and places throughout the world in an increasingly multisensory way, and in doing so, to venture *beyond* the rectangular yellow border.

An Ethnographic Gaze on the Urueu-Wau-Wau in 1988

This paradigm shift towards a more multisensory and subjective engagement with Brazilian subjects will be examined in closer detail in the first case study that this chapter discusses, which was published in the third centennial edition of the magazine in December 1988, and entitled 'Last Days of Eden': Rondonia's Urueu-Wau-Wau Indians'.²³⁵ The article documented 'the predicament of one tribe' as they fought to protect their 7,000 square miles of land from encroachment by Brazilian pioneers in the form of loggers, rubber tappers, miners, cattlemen, and their families, of whom 166,000 had settled in 1986 alone.²³⁶ Only three hundred and fifty members of the Urueu-Wau-Wau (which is spelled in a number of ways, including Uru-Eu-Wau-Wau)

my fingernail? Will we be disseminating geographic knowledge by laser beams through machines not yet invented, instead of printing magazines, books and maps?' Grosvenor, 'A Hundred Years of the National Geographic Society', *The Geographical Journal* 154.1 (1988): 87-92 (p. 92).

²³⁴ Cyprien Gaillard, 'L'Origami du Monde', *O32c*.

²³⁵ McIntyre, 'Last Days of Eden'.

²³⁶ Loren McIntyre, *Exploring South America* (New York: C. N. Potter, 1990), p. 138.

remained in 1988.²³⁷ As hunter-gatherers who speak Tupi-Kawahib (prior to official contact in 1981 by FUNAI, the federal agency responsible for the preparation of indigenous groups in Brazil for increased contact with the rest of world), the Urueu-Wau-Wau were known as the 'Black Mouths'; this was due to the group's technique of using black *genipap* dye to tattoo their faces and the skin around their mouths.²³⁸ As a *National Geographic* memorandum written by the senior associate editor, Joseph R. Judge, on 12 August 1987 articulated (Fig. 3.5), the magazine was particularly keen to document 'the Indian tribes, who are sequestered now on a large island of forest paid for by World Bank Funds as conscience money for having paved an infamous road that opened the region to loggers and truckers'.²³⁹ Judge referred to the newly built BR-364, which had been completed in 1984 with a loan from the World Bank to cover one third of the costs and paved a main road through the entire state of Rondonia, from Porto Velho in the north to Cuiaba, 400 km to the south east. The road had resulted in vast deforestation of a once remote part of the Amazon rainforest, and mass settlement on previously Urueu-Wau-Wau territory.²⁴⁰

Judge was concerned with the 'salvage' of the Urueu-Wau-Wau and in the same memorandum cautioned against 'the headlong development of tropical forested regions and the consequences for indigenous peoples and irreplaceable flora and fauna'.²⁴¹ This prepared the stage for *National Geographic*, who appeared to operate

²³⁷ John Hemming, *Die if You Must: Brazilian Indians in the Twentieth Century* (London: MacMillan, 2003), pp. 296-97.

²³⁸ 'Uru-Eu-Wau-Wau: Material Culture', in *Povos Indigenas no Brasil*, <<http://pib.socioambiental.org/en/povo/uru-eu-wau-wau/1131>> [accessed 3 June 2015]

²³⁹ National Geographic Society Archives, Microfiche File No. 510-1-999.115517, Joseph R. Judge to John McPhee, 12 August 1987.

²⁴⁰ Robert H. Wade, 'Boulevard of Broken Dreams: The Inside Story of The World Bank's Polonoroeste Road Project in Brazil's Amazon', Working Paper No. 55 for Grantham Research Institute on Climate Change and the Environment (2011), <http://www.lse.ac.uk/GranthamInstitute/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/WP55_world-bank-road-project-brazil.pdf> [accessed 3 June 2015]

²⁴¹ National Geographic Society Archives, Microfiche File No. 510-1-999.115517, Joseph R. Judge to John McPhee, 12 August 1987.

on behalf of a broader anthropological concern to rescue a fragile and disappearing culture, and rendered the Urueu-Wau-Wau in a preserved, even memorialised, state for public scrutiny by the magazine's concerned readership. The 'salvage paradigm', to reference a term used by James Clifford and discussed in the first chapter of this thesis, finds a parallel in Pratt's observation that colonial travel narratives frequently severed 'contemporary non-European peoples off from their pre-colonial, and even colonial, pasts'.²⁴² Pratt characterised this as a form of archaeology, in which actual living people were recognised not as part of the present, but of a separate pre-European era. The implication of Judge's memorandum was that Urueu-Wau-Wau culture represented an authentic primitiveness in need of being salvaged from extinction. However, *National Geographic* had also made its own archaeological find and rescued, from this 'near-extinct-specimen-due-to-disappear', an important sample of *tike-uba*, an anticoagulant that is extracted from tree bark in Urueu-Wau-Wau territory and contains an important compound that can inhibit the growth of enzymes that cause blood-clotting.²⁴³ This was clearly detailed in a memorandum containing a sample collected by the photographer, exchanged between Jon Schneeberger, the Illustrations editor at *National Geographic*, and Jeffrey Lawson, a biochemist at the University of Vermont, on 22 June 1989 (Fig. 3.6).²⁴⁴ This great pharmaceutical find was later commercialised by the U.S. pharmaceutical company Merck, who appropriated the knowledge of the Urueu-Wau-Wau without any obligation to

²⁴² Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, p. 132.

²⁴³ Clóvis de Vasconcelos Cavalcanti, *The Environment, Sustainable Development and Public Policies: Building Sustainability in Brazil* (Cheltenham and Northampton: Edward Elgar, 2000), p. 193.

²⁴⁴ National Geographic Society Archives, Microfiche File No. 510-1-999.115517, Jon Schneeberger to Jeffrey Lawson, 22 June 1989.

compensate them, during a period of insecurity and uncertainty for the group, when compensation would have proved significantly beneficial.²⁴⁵

It is clear from this contextual analysis that *National Geographic* had its own set of concerns in documenting the Urueu-Wau-Wau; it was aware of the problems that they faced as a result of large-scale developments in Brazil, yet it also wanted to extract and capitalise upon their sophisticated scientific knowledge, as well as to document them before their anticipated demise. Despite this hierarchical power-based relationship between *National Geographic* and the Urueu-Wau-Wau that prompted the commissioning of the article, the fifteen glossy photographs that accompanied it actually worked to resist that hierarchy, since they highlighted the Urueu-Wau-Wau's sophisticated ability to negotiate and navigate their own subjective positions in a globalising world as fluid and changeable, as opposed to static and fixed. The photographs were a combination of candid reportage and posed portraits, taking precedence over text as they were printed in large-scale, glossy colour with minimal captions, and accompanied by only two short pages of text published at the very end of the article.

An interesting example of how viewers were encouraged through dress to literally *feel* the image of the subject, in terms of the physical senses, but also to emotionally *feel*, can be seen in a photograph that documented a young Urueu-Wau-Wau girl (Figs. 3.7 and 3.8). She is crouched in the foreground, transfixed by her reflection in the smooth, shiny surface of a green and silver balloon that she holds in her right hand, whilst tracing the contours of her face with her left hand. She uses her physical and intellectual senses of touch and vision to evaluate and *feel* herself within

²⁴⁵ Vasconcelos Cavalcanti, *The Environment, Sustainable Development and Public Policies*, p. 193.

the world. Her clothing cannot be seen apart from a red, yellow and blue beaded bracelet wrapped around her shin. Her reflection in the balloon also produces a fuzzy-edged patterned 'aura' around her reflected head, a literal but also symbolic reference that might allude to the subject's illumination as she sees herself as image, potentially for the first time. Behind her a young girl, who wears an oversized brown vest as a dress, presumably an item of second-hand adult clothing, with necklaces of teeth, bone and a whistle, an appropriated item that did not originate in Urueu-Wau-Wau culture, observes her own reflection in the side of the balloon with intrigue.²⁴⁶ Both of these subjects appear oblivious to Puttkamer's gaze, yet a woman wearing blue sports shorts and holding a child, both softly rendered in the blurred background of the image, smiles broadly in the direction of the camera. The photograph is framed in white and printed in the centre of a pale orange background, on the left-hand side of a double-page view. These conventions draw on portraiture, and encourage the viewer to observe everything that lies within the frame, highlighting the act of looking being performed by all three of the subjects, whether at their own reflections in the surface of the balloon, or directly returning the gaze of the photographer, like the woman in the background, and by extension, that of the *National Geographic* viewer.

Eugenie Shinkle has acknowledged that images that address the body bring into sharp focus the viewer's own experience of embodiedness since 'so-called "mirror neurons" in the brain fire not only when we perform a particular action ourselves, but when we witness someone else performing it'.²⁴⁷ When we view a representation of another body performing postures and gestures, we are unable to observe in a passive

²⁴⁶ McIntyre, 'Last Days of Eden'.

²⁴⁷ Eugenie Shinkle, 'The Line Between the Wall and the Floor: Reality and Affect in Contemporary Fashion Photography', in *Fashion as Photograph: Viewing and Reviewing Images of Fashion*, ed. by E. Shinkle (London: I. B. Tauris, 2008), pp. 214-26 (p. 220).

and detached manner, but involuntarily 'map these postures and gestures onto our body, feeling them in our skin and bones, muscles and viscera'.²⁴⁸ The little girl demonstrates an awareness of herself as a dressed subject to *be* seen, and an ability to see her dressed self *as* image. This self-reflexive dynamic is extendable to the dressed viewer, who is encouraged to perceive and experience the image through her own active experience of dressing, which encompasses an understanding of the self as active in the formation of meaning. A feeling of affective identification and uncanny proximity is exchanged between the *National Geographic* viewer and Urueu-Wau-Wau subjects, despite the disparities in geographical location and temporal separation, marked here by the spatial distance that the image has travelled, but also the disparity between the instant in which Puttkamer captured this photograph and the moment in which it was perceived by the viewer. Gesture and dress invite empathy with the subjects on a bodily level, as the sensations of looking are extended to being, thinking, wearing and feeling, and synchronised with those experienced by the viewer. These affective dimensions of the gaze are amplified by the range of surface textures available in the photograph, which encompass the roughness of the wooden structure against which the subjects in the foreground lean, their smooth skin and glossy dark hair, the shiny reflective surface of the balloon, the ribbed cotton of the subject's oversize vest, and the muddy and stony hard ground on which they stand. This plenitude of different tactile surfaces was not so abundantly visible in the previous three snapshots examined, but here they evoke a figurative sense of texture that prompts a fuller, more multisensory response from the *National Geographic* viewer, enhanced still further by the glossy sheen of the magazine page. The viewer has an intimate awareness of how it feels to be dressed and the distinct sensations that fabric

²⁴⁸ Shinkle, 'The Line Between the Wall and the Floor', p. 222.

evokes when it touches the skin, whether softness, roughness, smoothness or even scratchiness, in addition to its ability to restrict, or enhance, ease of movement. It is in this regard that world-space and world-time are collapsed through the everyday embodied experience of dress, and through the intersecting and multisensory positions that clothing mobilises between the *National Geographic* viewer and the Brazilian subject. The caption underneath this photograph merely reiterated what could already be deduced by holding the magazine, touching its pages, and looking at and feeling the image. It simply read: 'Captivated by her own image, an Urueu-Wau-Wau girl studies a plaything from another world at an outpost of FUNAI, Brazil's National Foundation for the Indian.'²⁴⁹

Snapshot 4: Djai's Red T-shirt and Adidas Shorts

The multisensory dimensions of dress had an increased significance in the particular snapshot this chapter focuses on, which documented an even more multilayered form of Urueu-Wau-Wau dress. Published on a double-page spread in *National Geographic*, it featured the chief of the Urueu-Wau-Wau, Djai, photographed next to another member of the Urueu-Wau-Wau, Caninde, underneath an orange heading that declaimed: 'The End of Innocence' (Figs. 3.9 and 3.10).²⁵⁰ It is important to acknowledge that the title still built upon the canonical trope of the vanishing 'primitive', and fashioned its Brazilian subjects within an evolutionary narrative that categorised and typologised the Urueu-Wau-Wau as a childlike society living in a state of barbarism, unwillingly being elevated into one of industrial civilization. A comparable glorification and memorialisation of the Urueu-Wau-Wau

²⁴⁹ McIntyre, 'Last Days of Eden', p. 804.

²⁵⁰ Ibid., pp. 812-13.

emerged in McIntyre's recollection, printed at the very end of the article, which stated: 'Jesco [von Puttkamer] mourned the passing of the Indians' natural nudity, saying "Oh Loren, they're not perfect any more."²⁵¹ Puttkamer's disappointment at the Urueu-Wau-Wau's increased adoption of Western-style clothing, as a replacement to their customary sparse dress, which supposedly rendered them 'not perfect any more', suggested a romanticised expectation that such a peaceful, quiet and supposedly authentic lifestyle, with a strong sense of community, would be immune to the superficial attractions of Western sportswear brands and mass consumption. It appeared to reinforce a belief that the Western world is characterised by fluidity, in the words of Zygmunt Bauman, 'forever "becoming", avoiding completion, staying under defined', as opposed to the non-Western world, typified here by Brazil's Urueu-Wau-Wau, which is stable, pure, and *fixed* within a timeless ethnographic present.²⁵²

Yet the actual image offered a point of departure for a deeper understanding of the layers of cross-cultural meaning that were woven into the snapshot, which were communicated to the viewer through the tactile qualities of dress. The image was given precedence over the text of the article, and reproduced very close-up on the double-page spread, framed on three sides in orange. This editorial decision isolated and elevated the subjects, using much the same conventions as a framed studio portrait. The photographer's close viewpoint, from directly beside his subjects, so much so that he cannot capture the full length of their bodies within the frame, engenders a closeness and intensity, one that is capable of collapsing the geographical and temporal distance between the Urueu-Wau-Wau and the *National Geographic* viewer. There is nothing casual or unengaged about this photograph, which seems to

²⁵¹ Ibid., p. 813.

²⁵² Zygmunt Bauman, *Liquid Modernity* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2000), p. viii.

stem from the photographer's deep knowledge of the subjects, who allow him to observe them unrestricted as they carry out commonplace activities in their daily lives. There is a sense of mobility and fluidity, and the photograph appears less constructed and less filtered by Puttkamer's lens. The two subjects are contemplative, which consequently slows down the viewer too, and encourages a more measured response. It also prompts the viewer to take in the tactile qualities of the image and the range of textures that can be discerned on its surface, from the softness of Djauí's red cotton T-shirt, the roughness of his faded blue-and-white striped Adidas shorts, the coarseness of the blue tarpaulin against which the subjects are framed, to the smoothness of his companion Caninde's reed girdle. These textures add a depth to the image, which the dressed viewer is encouraged to mimetically experience through this visceral intimacy with the subjects, which is enhanced by the smooth gloss of the magazine page, whose shine enhances the colours of the different fabrics and responds to the viewer's tactile sensibilities. The layout of this image on the double-page spread draws the viewer's attention towards Djauí, who is placed in bright sunlight on the left-hand side of the double-page spread and can be observed in full view, as opposed to Caninde, who is placed on the right-hand side, shaded by the blue tarpaulin and partially obscured by the central crease of the open magazine. Caninde is dressed in a broad girdle constructed from rattan and brown nuts, a necklace made of peccary teeth, and black *genipap* body paint. Both of the men's faces are tattooed with black *genipap*, but Caninde adopts no items of Western-style dress and has also decorated the skin around his mouth in black. Djauí, on the other hand, is illuminated, to highlight his lighter skin colour, incipient baldness and greying hair, all characteristics that inform the viewer that he is of mixed Indian and Caucasian ancestry. Djauí's hybrid identity is clearly reflected in his dress, which suggests an ambivalence towards globalisation on

the part of the Urueu-Wau-Wau, and demonstrates their ability to pick and choose preferred elements of global culture, thereby subverting the notion of their cultural dependency upon the West.

Djaii's outfit is exemplary of an aesthetics of garbage, since these unwanted and ubiquitous Western-style clothes – red T-shirt and Adidas shorts – have been appropriated and transformed to serve a new function, where they are accompanied with a necklace adorned with jaguar teeth and the facial tattoos customary to the Urueu-Wau-Wau. Simultaneously indigenous and Western, mass-produced and irreproducible, new and old, mainstream and alternative, local and global, Djaii's outfit embodies the paradoxes of hybridity. His clothing challenges the prescriptive textual constructions of Urueu-Wau-Wau identity within the title that accompanied this double-page spread, which placed the so-called remnants of a disappearing Urueu-Wau-Wau within a written salvage narrative. This is because Djaii's clothing confirmed not 'The *End* of Innocence' for a previously uncontacted society, but rather the *continuation* of a sustained relationship between the Urueu-Wau-Wau and the outside world, which had already enabled Djaii to pick and choose preferred elements of cast-aside Western-style clothing, and use them to articulate his own contemporary identity, which was not fixed, but constructed and re-constructed in accordance with the fluid demands of everyday life. He demonstrates discretion from within the specific options that are available to the Urueu-Wau-Wau. Djaii's clothing blurred the spatial and temporal disjuncture often presumed to exist between the developed West and the purportedly underdeveloped non-West, because it used something *old* from one geographical place to create something *new* in a very different geographical space, and thereby encapsulated the chronotopic multiplicities described by Stam. As opposed to

a homogenisation of the world through the exportation of global consumer goods, *National Geographic* presented instead a local appropriation of the West's unwanted clothing, which resonated with Appadurai's assertion that localised taste challenges the popular notion of the United States as the all-powerful controller of objects, commodities and values.²⁵³ Here dress provided a counter-tendency to a simplistic equivalence of globalisation with Americanisation or, even, McDonaldisation, a term coined by sociologist George Ritzer to describe the process by which 'the principles of the fast-food restaurant are coming to dominate more and more sectors of American society as well as of the rest of the world'.²⁵⁴ This latter view was forcibly propounded by a dazzling advert (Fig. 3.11) printed on the back of the very same edition of *National Geographic*, which unnervingly repeated the mantra 'None of us is as good as all of us' underneath a holographic image of the familiar golden arches imprinted with the sign 'over 10,000 opened'.²⁵⁵ It presented a generic and homogenised image of the American restaurant and a car, which could plausibly have denoted any time or space throughout the latter half of the twentieth century, and so reinforced an idea of the standardised and imposed spread of U.S. popular culture, which Ritzer deemed ready to eclipse individual worldwide creativity.

Rather than being a reflection of the overwhelming force of American norms and lifestyles suggesting 'sameness', the re-negotiation of items of Western-style clothing that were documented in this snapshot demonstrated a local response to the homogenising forces of globalisation. These items of dress did not originate in the sartorial culture of the Urueu-Wau-Wau, and were no doubt an exchange item from

²⁵³ Arjun Appadurai, *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1996).

²⁵⁴ George Ritzer, *The McDonaldisation of Society* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Pine Forge, 1992), p. 1.

²⁵⁵ *National Geographic*, December 1988, back cover.

FUNAI; yet what was initially an alien article has since been adapted and re-interpreted as a versatile vehicle for contemporary Urueu-Wau-Wau identity construction. As Professor Paulo César Aguiar de Mendonça, senior researcher at the Jesco von Puttkamer collection in Goiana, has explained:

Just as when white people travel, they adopt elements of other dress selectively. They [i.e. the Urueu-Wau-Wau] do it for diplomatic reasons, to negotiate, because white people won't accept them without. When they return, they go back to wearing no clothes.²⁵⁶

Although de Mendonça acknowledged that there is an asymmetry of power prevalent in the relationship between the Urueu-Wau-Wau and white people, he highlighted how the group integrates a sophisticated understanding of Western sartorial expectations, and appropriates and transforms these unwanted Western clothes to construct their varied and fluid identities in different cultural contexts. This process is not disingenuous since it enables second-hand Western dress to be adapted to serve a new function, which works on behalf of Urueu-Wau-Wau needs too.

An interesting point of comparison can be drawn with an image taken by Belgian film director Jean-Pierre Dutilleux, which appeared in *American Vogue* in June 1988 and documented the British musician Sting on his 'South American tour across Brazil, up the Amazon, visiting Indian tribes who want nothing from the 20th century' (Fig. 3.12).²⁵⁷ The article featured the Kayapo, a Gê-speaking people who live in a number of communities alongside the Xingu River and its tributaries the Iriri, Bacajá and Fresco Rivers. Occupying a very large territory in central Brazil, they are renowned for having had extensive but ambivalent interactions with non-Indians and

²⁵⁶ Paulo César Aguiar de Mendonça, Personal Communication with Author (Jesco von Puttkamer collection, Pontifícia Universidade Católica de Goiás, Instituto Goiano de Pre-História e Antropologia, Goiana, 10 April 2014). Refer to Appendix 5: Interviews.

²⁵⁷ Sting, 'Primal Sting', *Vogue*, June 1988, pp. 244-307.

environmentalists.²⁵⁸ Though this is not mentioned in the article, the Kayapo were filmed for a Granada television documentary in 1987 and, in return for their cooperation, demanded filming equipment for their own use, a notion that disrupted the quaint Western perception that the Kayapo enjoyed a romantic and authentic lifestyle divorced from 'civilisation'.²⁵⁹ This ignorant view was explicitly stated by the subheading: 'For three days, Sting was one of them, then they sent him back to "civilization" with a new look and an urgent message.'²⁶⁰ It accompanied a photograph of Sting with the leader of the Kayapo, Raoni Metuktire, already something of a celebrity in Europe, having appeared in Dutilleux's film, *Raoni: The Fight for the Amazon* (1978).²⁶¹ Both of the subjects face the camera wearing the customary body paint of the Kayapo, although Raoni also wears beaded red and blue jewellery and a lip plate. The notion that Sting can adopt a 'new look' by appropriating non-permanent elements of Kayapo dress, as and when he feels like it, reinforces his powerful position as a white man with the money and leisure time to travel. Whereas *American Vogue* fashioned the Kayapo as inferior and existing in a primitive, backward and underdeveloped past, a source of exotic inspiration to the civilised Western traveller, the visual representation of a different indigenous group's dress in *National Geographic* embodied an aesthetics of garbage that demonstrated the vitality of the Urueu-Wau-Wau, and their ability to re-use items of dress that have originated in the West to challenge and resist such reductive colonial and postcolonial narratives. This distinction may have been due in part to the different contexts in which *National Geographic* and *Vogue* circulate, the former having a more educational remit whereas

²⁵⁸ 'Kayapo: Introduction', in *Povos Indigenas no Brasil*, <<http://pib.socioambiental.org/en/povo/kayapo>> [accessed 11 February 2015]

²⁵⁹ Stam, *Tropical Multiculturalism*, p. 7.

²⁶⁰ Sting, 'Primal Sting', p. 244.

²⁶¹ *Raoni: The Fight for the Amazon*, dir. by Jean-Pierre Dutilleux (SND, Paris: 1978).

the latter is concerned with commerce and, in this example, with celebrities, but it was also due to the tactile sensations offered by the snapshot in *National Geographic*, which ventured beyond sight and encompassed the affective responses that it prompted in the viewer. In *Vogue*, the photograph was a very flat image that employed ethnographic conventions and had no depth in terms of light and shadow. This is particularly odd given that *Vogue* is a magazine accustomed to selling clothes and products through a focus on their tactile qualities, which are enhanced through photographic light; that the magazine chose not to emphasise the tactile sensations in this example reinforces the suggestion that it considered Kayapo dress to be distinctly outside the realms of 'Western' fashion. In *National Geographic*, the snapshot confirmed a *literal* aesthetics of garbage through the Urueu-Wau-Wau's distinctive utilisation of second-hand clothing. Once again, no caption was supplied, but equally no caption was required in order to understand its meaning. The second snapshot that this chapter discusses, as the following analysis reveals, embodied a more *conceptual* aesthetics of garbage, demonstrated by the appropriation of cast-aside sartorial ideas as opposed to actual items of dress that had originated in the West.

An African-American Gaze on Afro-Brazilians in 2002

This snapshot (in the wider sense) was published in *National Geographic* in August 2002 and entitled 'Where Brazil was Born: Bahia'.²⁶² The title rendered the fourth most populous state in Brazil as a cradle of Brazilian tradition and reinforced, as Anadelia A. Romo has acknowledged, the popular trope of 'Bahia as a museum, as a

²⁶² Cobb, 'Where Brazil was Born: Bahia'.

site of living tradition'.²⁶³ It is important to understand Bahia's history in order to appreciate Romo's comment fully. Salvador da Bahia was established as the Portuguese colonial capital in 1549, when the area was one of the largest sugar producers in the world. From the sixteenth century to the abolition of the slave trade in 1888, an estimated two million enslaved Africans, of the overall four million transported to Brazil, settled in Bahia. By the late nineteenth century Bahia was considered a provincial backwater and today it is one of the poorest Brazilian states, with one of the highest national rates of unemployment and income disparity.²⁶⁴ Despite this, a report revealed that by 2002 the development of Bahia's tourism industry had surpassed that of any other region.²⁶⁵ This was mainly due to the efforts of *Bahiatursa*, the Bahian tourism organisation, which emphasised Bahia's strong Afro-Brazilian presence and advertised the state as the 'birthplace of Brazil'.²⁶⁶ Paulo Guadenzi, the President of *Bahiatursa*, has affirmed that the uniqueness of Afro-Brazilian culture is a powerful tool to market Salvador as having a strong and 'authentic' allegiance to African tradition, as distinct from other tourist destinations throughout Brazil.²⁶⁷ In seeking to examine the continued force of African heritage in Salvador through its substantial population of 'descendants of the first slaves brought to the New World', *National Geographic* correspondent Charles Cobb clearly set out on a well-trodden path.²⁶⁸

²⁶³ Anadelia A. Romo, *Brazil's Living Museum: Race, Reform and Tradition in Bahia* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2010), p. 10.

²⁶⁴ Rachel Harding, *A Refuge in Thunder: Candomblé and Alternative Spaces of Blackness* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2000).

²⁶⁵ Lucia Aquino de Queiroz, *Turismo na Bahia: Estratégias para o Desenvolvimento* (Salvador: Secretaria da Cultura e Turismo, 2002), n.p.

²⁶⁶ Patricia de Santana Pinho, 'African American Roots Tourism in Brazil', *Latin American Perspectives*, 35.3 (2008), 70-86 (p. 85).

²⁶⁷ Queiroz, *Turismo na Bahia*, n.p.

²⁶⁸ Cobb, 'Where Brazil was Born: Bahia', p. 63.

It was a considered choice of *National Geographic* editor, William L. Allard (1995-2005), to appoint Cobb as correspondent; the latter later acknowledged that his appearance and African-American identity had enabled him to blend in and bond with his predominantly black subjects in a fashion that would have been inconceivable had he been white. As he described on the *National Geographic* website, in a section entitled 'On Assignment: Bahia. Field Notes from author Charles E. Cobb, Jr': 'I could meet whomever I wanted to meet and go wherever I wanted to go.'²⁶⁹ In ethnographic parlance, field notes are generally aligned with a particular type of participant-observation fieldwork, which evades a detached and distanced mode of viewing in favour of, as Robert M. Emerson has articulated, 'accounts *describing* experiences and observations the researcher has made whilst participating in an *intense* and *involved* manner' [my italics].²⁷⁰ It is widely accepted that field notes are subject to the conscious, but also unconscious, bias of the author who acts as participant-observer and potentially invests her own narrative and memories into her description of the events that took place. That *National Geographic* chose to include this type of information on its website can be understood as an attempt to highlight the paradigm shift at the magazine since its centennial, away from an understanding of itself as an exemplar of objective scientific record, and towards a more subjective simultaneous dramatisation *and* documentation of non-Western subjects as an involved participant. This connected to the fact that Cobb described his ancestry as the primary motivation for his trip to Salvador, which evaded any notion of objectivity. Cobb selected Bahia for

²⁶⁹ Cobb, 'On Assignment: Bahia. Field Notes from author Charles E. Cobb, Jr', <<http://ngm.nationalgeographic.com/ngm/0208/feature5/assignment1.html>> [accessed 11 February 2015]

²⁷⁰ Robert M. Emerson in *Writing Ethnographic Fieldnotes*, ed. by Emerson et al (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995), pp. 4-5.

its supposed preservation and careful maintenance of traditional African culture, wherein he might hope to reignite a 'lost' affiliation with his homeland, Africa:

As an African-American, I had come to see what had sprouted in this place where Africa's seeds were first planted centuries ago. I found a culture steeped in traditional religions brought by coloured peoples from West Africa, a place that remains key to the identity of this sprawling state.²⁷¹

This comment suggests that Cobb is able to provide an 'authentic' connection with, and therefore documentation of, Bahia, yet it is problematic since the author's desire to exchange what he conceives of as his own, U.S.-centric, conception of black 'African-American' modernity for the static preserve of the 'traditional religions brought by coloured peoples from West Africa', manifest in the lived experience of the local black Bahian communities with whom he interacted, exemplified the asymmetrical dimensions of power operating within the global contact zone. A disparity is highlighted between Cobb, a black man located in the North of the American continent, with a job that provides him with the opportunity and expenses to travel, and the Bahian communities situated in the South, who have far less access to global currents of power than Cobb. Cobb's travels to Bahia were not an isolated example, and within the article he observed that Bahian tourism had recently 'been boosted by increasing numbers of African-American visitors', who were attracted by the promise of 'a New World African culture that many find truer to its origins than their own'.²⁷² His observation corresponded with Patricia de Santana Pinho's examination of what she has termed 'African-American Roots Tourism', which has witnessed the movement of large numbers of African-American tourists to Bahia in pursuit of 'what they believe to be their roots but [...] in contrast to other tourists, who

²⁷¹ Cobb, 'Where Brazil was Born: Bahia', p. 63.

²⁷² Ibid., p. 77.

are usually interested in the exoticism of the “other,” they crisscross the Atlantic hoping to find the “same” represented by their “black brothers and sisters”.”²⁷³ Pinho has pointed out that this is part of a complex identity process whereby African-Americans cultivate a heightened sense of Africanness deemed essential for the perpetuation of their own contemporary diasporic black identities in the United States. Whilst ‘roots tourism’ has the potential to challenge the ‘traditional North-South flows of cultural exchange’, ultimately it often ‘confirms the existing hierarchy within the black Atlantic’, since it reinforces the semi-peripheral position of African and Latin American black communities in relation to blacks who are part of a dominant centre of blackness ‘in terms of cultural and academic production’, such as the United States.²⁷⁴

Although photography dominated this article, as it did in the previous case study, it is important in this case to comment on the Africanised image of Bahia that Cobb fashioned within the text. He made frequent reference to the black bodies of the *baianas*, the archetypal mature women who dress in voluminous white lace dresses and adorn themselves with colourful sacred beaded necklaces and bracelets. An example of a *baiana* dress can be seen in Figs 3.13-3.17, for sale on *white* mannequins at the Mercado do Madureira in Rio de Janeiro. This choice of mannequin is significant since *baianas* are associated with the Afro-Brazilian religion of Candomble, the generic name that is given to a number of syncretic religions that were created in Brazil in the nineteenth century, centred upon Catholicism and facets of African religious traditions. The *National Geographic* reader was invited to imagine a seaside scene that Cobb recalled from his trip:

Wearing the traditional white of Candomble, some carry offerings to Yemanja, the much beloved deity of the sea. Bearing their hopes for the future, they

²⁷³ Pinho, ‘African American Roots Tourism in Brazil’, p. 84.

²⁷⁴ Ibid.

move freely toward the ocean that carried their forebears to these shores in chains.²⁷⁵

Cobb described the rhythmic movements of the *baiana* priestesses, and the ease and grace with which they walked, moved and danced towards the shoreline, bedecked in their magnificent white attire, during an expressive form of worship used to summon the sea goddess *Yemanjá*, one of the Candomble deities named *orixas* to whom each worshipper is dedicated, and to incorporate divine energy into the human body. White clothing is adopted by the *baianas* because it is the colour of the Candomble spirit *Oxalá* and represents goodness and purity, but from an outsider's perspective, it also serves to ideologically emphasise the blackness of the wearer's skin.²⁷⁶ Cobb used the contact zone here as a literary strategy to build a historical disjuncture within the text between the autonomy of the *baianas* in contemporary Salvador, who are merged as one and used to form an indivisible, homogenising notion of black 'Bahianness', and their enslaved ancestors who were brought to Bahia 'in chains'. He refrained from acknowledging that the mode of dress worn by the *baiana* is a hybrid fusion of sartorial elements that originate from both Europe and Africa; whereas the *saia*, the flowing full-length gathered skirt worn with petticoat and crinoline, and the lace-trimmed blouse called the *camizu*, stemmed from nineteenth-century European dress, the intricately wound head-wrap called the *oja*, and the *contas* or *ilekes*, beaded necklaces, have West African antecedents.²⁷⁷ Cobb described a frenetic image in *National Geographic* of the *baianas* involved in worship:

In the embrace of their gods, followers of Candomble are *possessed* by African deities called *orixas* at a ceremony in Salvador. The multi-faceted god Omolu

²⁷⁵ Cobb, 'Where Brazil was Born: Bahia', pp. 80-81.

²⁷⁶ Mattijs Van de Port, 'Bahian White: The Dispersion of Candomblé Imagery in the Public Sphere of Bahia', *Material Religion: The Journal of Objects, Art and Belief*, 3.2 (2007), 242-72 (p. 245).

²⁷⁷ Cheryl Sterling, *African Roots, Brazilian Rites: cultural and national identity in Brazil*, (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), p. 69.

moves in grass-shrouded mystery, his legendary power to induce or cure illness greatly respected. Punctuated by *chanting* and the *pounding* of drums, the ritual resembled those I've seen in West Africa [...]where worshippers are *seized* by the holy spirit. [my italics]²⁷⁸

He described the noisy gathering of *baianas* using powerful language that gave an overriding impression of a black and mysterious Bahia, a folkloric spectacle rife with primitive rituals, popular devotion, mysterious forces and African spirits. Cobb ignored the contemporary appropriation of this mode of Afro-Brazilian dress by Bahian women employed strategically by the state government of Bahia as a source of revenue to 'sell' merchandise and culinary delicacies to foreign tourists, who have an appetite for 'exotic culture' and deduce the ensemble to be distinctively African and traditional.²⁷⁹

A clear example can be seen on the Bahian State Tourism Instagram page (Fig. 3.18); the *baiana's* abundance of colourful jewellery, voluminous white dress, vibrant eye-shadow, and blue *oja* vie for the viewer's attention, and render her the embodiment of exotic difference, distinct from the more austere dressed tourist she converses with.

Snapshot 5: The Afro-Brazilian Girl's Lycra Top and Denim Jeans

Although Cobb cemented Bahia textually as a static cultural preserve, useful only in constructing his own contemporary black U.S. identity in contrast to the notion of a Bahian Other, the accompanying fourteen photographs captured by North American David Alan Harvey demonstrated that Afro-Brazilians were distinctly contemporary in their style, and employed global sartorial references. This was communicated to the viewer through the distinctively tactile qualities of these images.

²⁷⁸ Cobb, 'Where Brazil was Born: Bahia', p. 74.

²⁷⁹ Erica Williams, 'Sex Work and Exclusion in the Tourist Districts of Salvador, Bahia', *Gender, Place and Culture: A Journal of Feminist Geography* (2013), n.p.
6<<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/0966369X.2013.786685#.VNtKlcZNM4>> [accessed 11 June 2015]

A pertinent example can be seen in a half-page photograph – the second snapshot this chapter focuses on – that captured a slender young anonymous Afro-Brazilian woman, who smiles broadly and dances to music in a crowded setting (Figs. 3.19 and 3.20). She is positioned centrally in the frame and photographed from a low camera level that lends her greater stature. Caught in the background of the image are abstract out-of-focus shapes that delineate individuals seated in white plastic chairs at white plastic tables littered with drink cans and bottles. We are informed by the text that the location is the *Noite da Beleza Negra* (the Night of the Black Beauty), an event sponsored by the Afro-Brazilian musical group, *Ilê Aiyê* (House of Life). *Ilê Aiyê* originated in Bahia in the early 1970s as an aesthetic movement to promote pride and consciousness in the local black community.²⁸⁰ The woman has a confident expression, which suggests to the viewer that she is comfortable with her appearance and perhaps, pleased to be observed. The blank white space above the photograph as it is positioned on the page is filled with the words: ‘Everywhere I went, I heard the sound of samba, the high-spirited indigenous music of Brazil whose rhythms are African through and through.’²⁸¹ Although the heading reiterates the deep African cultural roots of the event, the woman’s clothing aligns her with cosmopolitan modernity and contemporary global fashion trends. She wears large silver hoop earrings, a silver watch and a collection of white string bracelets on her left hand, and a silver ring on the fourth finger of her right hand; this is possibly an engagement ring, which in Brazil is traditionally worn on the right hand until the day of the wedding, when it is exchanged to the fourth finger of the left hand. Her long dark hair is pushed back with a wide elasticised purple hair-band and neatly braided, swinging as she moves to the

²⁸⁰ Deborah Valoma, ‘Cloth and African Identity in Bahia, Brazil’, in *Berg Fashion Library* <<http://dx.doi.org/10.2752/BEWDF/EDch2063>> [accessed 3 June 2015]

²⁸¹ Cobb, ‘Where Brazil was Born: Bahia’, p. 79.

music. She wears a pair of close-fitting, low-slung denim jeans with a sparkly blue halter-neck top made from a clingy Lycra-blended material, whose tactile qualities are emphasised by the photographer's use of a bright flash. This highlights the sparkling sequins that adorn her top, emphasised further still by the glossy veneer of the magazine page, but also renders her slightly cut-out from the background, a technique that is often used in fashion photography. It is significant that Harvey made these photographs using a Fuji Velvia 50, a very fine-grained, high-colour saturation photographic film that is often used by fashion photographers, because it enhances the aestheticisation of the subject through high picture quality and vibrant colour reproduction.²⁸² These technical choices draw our attention towards the subject's self-fashioning and encourage us to interpret the image within the protocols of a fashion shoot, rather than an ethnographic study, thus blurring the line between the two and encouraging the viewer to understand the subject as a self-fashioning individual as opposed to an anthropological object.

The clothing worn by the subject embodies a conceptual aesthetics of garbage through the leitmotif of the strategic redemption or recycling of second-hand aesthetics. It presents an interesting localised use of Lycra that emerged in Brazil in 1996 in Madureira, a poor suburb in the North Zone of Rio de Janeiro, and that by 2000 could be seen throughout Brazil, in the less affluent suburbs of Sao Paulo, Belo Horizonte, Belem do Para and Salvador. Lycra manufacture in Brazil had been centred since 1975 at a DuPont production facility in Paulinia, a municipality in the state of Sao Paulo, but in 1999 a \$100 million state-of-the-art renovation introduced developed processing techniques and automation, which doubled the output of Lycra in order to

²⁸² David Alan Harvey, 'On Assignment: Bahia. Field Notes from photographer David Alan Harvey', <<http://ngm.nationalgeographic.com/ngm/0208/feature5/assignment2.html>> [accessed 4 June 2015]

meet intensified popular demand throughout Latin America.²⁸³ Lycra-blended fabrics were used by low-end anonymous Brazilian fashion designers to create tight spandex trousers, tops, shorts and body suits, in a variety of colours, shapes, structures and sizes, with different patterns, holes, transparencies and mesh details.²⁸⁴ The designers were heavily influenced by the tightly-draped, figure-hugging aesthetic of the Tunisian-born, Paris-based designer Azzedine Alaia and other international designers, such as Giorgio Armani, Donna Karen and Karl Lagerfeld, whose designs they had observed in second-hand European fashion magazines, such as *Vogue* and *Elle*, from the 1980s.²⁸⁵ With limited materials and economic means, the anonymous designers re-interpreted ideas derived from Alaia's designs, which had little in the way of decorative detail or fuss, with sophistication to cater to the tastes of contemporary Brazilian consumers. Rather than an unsuccessful imitation of Alaia's design, the clothes stood as testimony to the designers' adaptation and transformation of ideas that were initially alien to them, using the materials and accessories available to them. Alaia always chose a clean and simple line, and preferred dark or muted colours, such as black, brown, beige, navy and soft pastels, but the Brazilian designers exploited the endless possibilities of colour, whether an acid hue of green, a flash of silver woven into turquoise, as seen in *National Geographic*, or lurid zebra print. The designers added elements such as chains, flesh-exposing zippers, cut-out sections and plastic elements to show off certain areas of the body, which then became a part of the decoration of the clothing. Whereas Alaia used Lycra to skim the body like a second skin, making it look as smooth and streamlined as possible through the use of discreet corsetry, the Brazilian

²⁸³ 'Dupont 1962, Lycra. Paulinia, Brazil',

<http://www2.dupont.com/Phoenix_Heritage/en_US/1962_b_detail.html> [accessed 11 February 2015]; Anon., 'Dupont Plans Brazil Lycra Plant', *WWD*, 19 October 1999, p. 17.

²⁸⁴ Mari Stockler, *Meninas Do Brasil* (Sao Paulo: Cosac & Naify, 2001), n.p.

²⁸⁵ Mari Stockler, Personal Communication with Author (27 - 31 October 2014). Refer to Appendix 6: Email Correspondence.

designers emphasised the sexual appeal and voluptuousness of the wearer's body, irrespective of size or shape.

As the Brazilian artist Mari Stockler, the first to document this trend, explained: 'Brazilians are very sexy and this is independent of the size of their bodies. Fashion standards of beauty interfere little in the real life of the majority of Brazilians.'²⁸⁶ The distinctive 'Brazilian sexuality' that Stockler referred to is conveyed most clearly in the situations in which the Lycra-blended fashions were worn, since the freedom of movement permitted by the outfits enabled Brazilian women to move in an unrestricted way. A clear example can be seen in an image from Stockler's photobook (Fig. 3.21), entitled *Meninas do Brasil* [*Girls of Brazil*] (2001), which extensively documented the aesthetics of this hybrid fashion trend from its inception in 1996. The photograph captures an Afro-Brazilian girl in a Lycra-blended white strap top with a built-in bra and adorned with metal chains. She wears blue denim jeans and silver jewellery, and dances with her arms and hands spread, an action that draws attention to her torso. The flash of Stockler's camera reflects from the bright white of her elasticated top, giving a tactile sense of the sensual appeal of the clothing. This image is comparable to the *National Geographic* photograph in the representation of how dress is animated through dance, expression and gesture. Whilst *National Geographic* attempted through the text to fashion Afro-Brazilians as cemented within a generalised conception of Africa, the visual representation of dress showed how the techniques and methods of international fashion design had been recycled and modified by anonymous Brazilian designers to enable the Afro-Brazilian subject to self-fashion her own identity.

²⁸⁶ Ibid.

A revealing point of comparison can be drawn with a photograph taken in Salvador da Bahia, which was published in *American Vogue* in March 2006 (Fig. 3.22) within an article entitled 'White Heat'.²⁸⁷ Photographed on location in Salvador by the American fashion photographer Arthur Elgort, it featured the Ethiopian model Liya Kebede, dressed in a cream Rochas column dress embroidered with tiny flower dots, photographed next to an anonymous *baiana* who is seated at a piano and wears an unnamed white laced crinoline dress. *Vogue* omits to provide any information about the symbolic value of the *baiana*'s white dress, the colour that is worn by adherents of Candomble to dispel adversity and evil, and reflect the purity and virtue of the spirit Oxalá.²⁸⁸ Instead the *baiana* is used as a symbol of indigeneity to didactically lead the eye towards Kebede, who is almost two foot taller and stands poised with one hand on her hip, the other elegantly draped across the top of the piano. The cream of her dress, which the caption informs the viewer is available at Barneys for \$29,380, is a subtle yet distinguishable contrast to the *baiana*'s starched white, the latter so spotless it is associated with an unremitting struggle against dirt and sweat in the warm climate through constant washing and bleaching. Whereas *National Geographic* had visually presented Bahian women four years earlier as young and fashionably dressed in a creative re-interpretation of European styles, *Vogue* provided the photographic counterpart to the romanticised and mythical narrative that Cobb described in the text, and instead delineated a recognisable dichotomy between purportedly static 'ethnic' dress, and continuously shifting European fashion.

²⁸⁷ Anon., 'White Heat', *American Vogue*, March 2006, pp. 518-31.

²⁸⁸ Sterling, *African Roots, Brazilian Rites*, p. 81.

This chapter began with an examination of 'Within the Yellow Border ...', published within the centennial edition of *National Geographic*, which encapsulated a shift from a detached scientific mode of viewing the magazine, towards a more intimate, tactile and subjective engagement with it. Drawing upon this paradigm shift that took place at the magazine, it used Stam's metaphor of an aesthetics of garbage, manifest literally and conceptually, to examine two snapshots of Brazilian dress, published in December 1988 and August 2002 respectively. Stam's theory enabled linear descriptions of time and space to give way to an understanding of globalisation in which shreds and patches of the local and global interact and are interwoven into the patchwork quilt that constitutes the contemporary interconnected and fluid world. The effects of globalisation have been documented by *National Geographic*, which has demonstrated the multidirectional flows and ideas of dress that have travelled far and wide across the world and enabled a multifarious Brazilian population to negotiate and re-negotiate their local and global identities in response to cross-cultural contact. This has been communicated in a phenomenological sense to *National Geographic* viewers through an increasingly tactile focus on imagery over text, incorporating a self-reflexive awareness of the ways that dress both touches the body and faces outwards in the direction of outside gazes onto the body. Rather than a one-directional flow of global goods, Brazilian dress has travelled in numerous directions and emerged as a complex, heterogeneous process that incorporates mixing, borrowing, creating and differentiating local and global contexts through an aesthetics of garbage.

Stam's garbage metaphor has provided a means to understand contact as a series of cultural exchanges and sartorial resistances demonstrated by the self-fashioning and self-presentation of Brazilian subjects in *National Geographic*. In the

first example, the garbage metaphor worked on a more literal basis and enabled Djauí to adopt chosen aspects of global culture, and use it to self-fashion in the face of a more dominant context that attempted to fashion the Urueu-Wau-Wau within a fixed ethnographic present. In the second example, the garbage principle worked in more abstract terms and was evidenced by the adoption of Lycra-blended clothing by the Afro-Brazilian subject, whose sartorial choices were informed by, yet reinterpreted, international fashion designers, such as Azzedine Alaïa and Giorgio Armani. Rather than emphasising binary dualisms, garbage has provided a more nuanced understanding of exchanges and subtle differentiations within the United States-Brazilian contact zone as documented in *National Geographic*, even as they have unfolded within asymmetrical relations of power. Applied to dress, Stam's metaphor has enabled the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic* to be reconsidered in a way that is not oppositional, linear or essentialist. Nevertheless, a new theoretical and methodological framework is required for an analysis of (Brazilian) fashion as presented in two revealing examples since 2001. The following two snapshots in chapter three are the exception that prove the rule, applicable since 1988, that *National Geographic* moved from distanced and detached viewing towards an increasingly tactile and multisensory engagement with images in the magazine as material objects.

Chapter 3.

The Space In-Between: Brazilian Fashion in *National Geographic* since 2001

- **Snapshot 6: The Yanomami Boy's Gaze at the *National Geographic* Photographer's Clothing, September 2001**
- **Snapshot 7: Bianca Marque's Bikinis and Victor Denzk's Dresses, September 2011**

The snapshot analysed in the previous chapter, which was taken in Salvador da Bahia and published in *National Geographic* in August 2002, appropriated stylistic techniques commonplace in fashion photography in order to highlight the female Afro-Brazilian subject's performance of contemporary global fashion trends, in a creative practice that fused Brazilian street-style with elements of European designer fashion. The subject's innovative Lycra top had an additional 'value' that affiliated it with the seasonally shifting styles of fashion, as opposed to the more gradual changes that are associated with dress, an important distinction to which I will return. Although *National Geographic* did not explicitly refer to the subject's ensemble as fashion, the magazine commandeered photographic techniques frequently employed within a fashion context. These techniques, of bright flash, vibrant colour, and high-resolution reproduction, subconsciously prompted the viewer to interpret the snapshot within the parameters of fashion, and potentially to perceive the subject as an active and self-fashioning individual, as opposed to an ethnographic object.

This tension at *National Geographic* between the discourses of fashion and ethnography, and their associated significations, can be traced to a large coffee-table tome, titled *National Geographic Fashion*, which was published almost one year earlier, in September 2001.²⁸⁹ This was the first occasion on which the magazine had self-consciously used a *fashionable* gaze to re-present its published and unpublished

²⁸⁹ *National Geographic Fashion*, ed. by Cathy Newman (Washington DC: National Geographic Society, 2001).

editorial history.²⁹⁰ It marked an exception in the magazine's historiography of the 'world and all that is in it' since 1988, when the magazine had moved from cool, detached viewing, and towards an increasingly intimate, multisensory engagement with the magazine as a tactile, material object.²⁹¹ This was followed up in September 2011, with the publication of the article 'Machisma: How A Mix Of Female Empowerment And Steamy Soap Operas Helped Bring Down Brazil's Fertility Rate and Stoke Its Vibrant Economy', which was written by Cynthia Gorney and accompanied with photographs by John Stanmeyer.²⁹² This article did not approach Brazilian fashion directly, but used it indirectly as a tool to construct meaning within its visual and textual narrative. Fashion, as a multifaceted and multidimensional process, which thrives on contradiction and ambivalence, provides an opportune and fitting medium for this chapter to retrospectively consider *how* and *where National Geographic* encouraged its viewers to position themselves in relation to represented Brazilian subjects.

This chapter marks a noticeable exception from the preceding and following two chapters, immediately evident from its title, in that it consciously employs the term 'fashion', as opposed to 'dress', as the primary medium for its examination of *National Geographic's* representational strategies. In the introduction to this thesis, I defined dress broadly using Eicher and Roach-Higgins' important and oft-cited

²⁹⁰ *National Geographic* had never explicitly focused on fashion before the publication of *National Geographic Fashion*, with the exception of one article, which was written by Nina Hyde and accompanied with photographs taken by William Albert Allard. Entitled 'The Business of Chic', and published in the magazine in July 1989, the article focused on high-end designers Saint Laurent, Chanel, Lacroix and Dior, who were described as 'synonymous with style. These French designers have collectively spun the fabric of haute couture, marking Paris the centre of the fashion world.' *National Geographic* presented fashion as an elite couture design system centered exclusively in Paris, amongst a small group of creative individuals, which disregarded the possibility that fashion might emerge elsewhere in non-Western and non-capitalist cultures. Nina Hyde, 'The Business of Chic', *National Geographic*, July 1989, pp. 146-157 (p. 148).

²⁹¹ Wilbur E. Garrett, 'Within the Yellow Border ...', p. 270.

²⁹² Cynthia Gorney, 'Machisma', *National Geographic*, September 2011, pp. 96-121.

definition: 'an assemblage of bodily modifications and/or supplements displayed by a person in communicating with other human beings'.²⁹³ This interdisciplinary characterisation emphasised the importance of appreciating and analysing the material qualities, but also the expressive capabilities, of clothing, body covering, adornment, accessories, tattoos, piercings, makeup, hairstyles and scarification within a cross-cultural, fluid framework.²⁹⁴ Although Eicher and Roach-Higgins' overarching definition includes fashion, which they understand to be a demonstration of change within any dress practices, in my understanding, this characterisation does not adequately encapsulate the heightened ambiguity of *fashion*. Whilst remaining an elusive and much debated concept, fashion cannot *merely* be the subtleties of change in dress, but is surely also an additional and alluring value that is attached to different forms of clothing, whether rarefied and elite, fast or throwaway, local or global, and often also to its visual representation, to entice consumers.

A deeper understanding of the different concepts of fashion is relevant to this chapter, and helps to recognise the potential of this thesis to add to current scholarship surrounding 'non-Western' dress and fashion. The interdisciplinary and cross-cultural examinations of Jennifer Craik, Margaret Maynard and Susan Kaiser have all challenged the perennial distinctions made between 'Western' fashion and supposedly 'non-Western' dress, and highlighted the vibrant and dynamic fashion systems, both everyday and elite, that exist throughout the world.²⁹⁵ These scholars

²⁹³ Eicher and Roach-Higgins, 'Dress and Identity', p. 7.

²⁹⁴ A crucial component of Eicher and Roach-Higgins' definition, which is to be commended for its ability to re-think the distinction between 'fashion', misleadingly assumed to be the dominant form of dress in 'civilised' Western societies, and 'other clothing and/or body adornment', often narrowly perceived by the West to be more 'primitive', is that dress is *not* static and fixed, but continually in flux.

²⁹⁵ Craik, *The Face of Fashion*; Maynard, *Dress and Globalisation*; Kaiser, *Fashion and Cultural Studies*.

The influential writings of Georg Simmel and John Flugel are just two examples of scholarly fashion writing in the early twentieth century that have contributed to a still widespread understanding of fashion as a product only of 'civilised' Western, capitalist and industrialised, societies. See G. Simmel,

have emphasised the need for a more globally inclusive re-evaluation of the definition of fashion, which can surpass European- and North American-centred stereotypes of the rest of the world. Craik has highlighted the constantly shifting and interdependent relationship between Western and non-Western fashion systems, and technologies of the body, within which 'there is considerable leakage between competing systems offering a choice of dress techniques to consumers everywhere'.²⁹⁶ Maynard has extended the discussion initiated by Craik but, less concerned with the duality of different fashion systems and dress practices, emphasised instead the tactical cross-cultural engagements that are encapsulated in the processes of mixing, fragmentation, syncretism, multiplication, creolisation and hybridity. She has demonstrated that the meanings of dress shift as it moves across borders, acquiring new values in individual and complex ways, which challenge the presumed hegemony of Western fashion to produce global uniformity in dress. Most recently, Kaiser has gone beyond the arguments of Craik and Maynard, and proposed a new definition of fashion as 'an ongoing challenge of negotiating and navigating through multiple ambiguities and contradictions', that is intrinsically connected to being an individual subject in a global economy, who simultaneously embodies multiple subject positions, whether of race, gender, age, sexuality, ethnicity, class or nationality.²⁹⁷ Craik, Maynard and Kaiser have all constituted a crucial stage in the discussion concerning the production and consumption of dress and fashion within a globally inclusive framework. However, they are yet to account fully for the visual dimension of fashion, and the key role that images of dress have played in constructing and disseminating a cross-cultural idea of what fashion constitutes throughout the world.

'Fashion', *International Quarterly*, 10 (1906): 130-55; J C. Flugel, *The Psychology of Clothes* (London: Hogarth, 1930).

²⁹⁶ Craik, p. 39.

²⁹⁷ Kaiser, p. 7.

Such discussions have been moved into the field of fashion photography by Sarah Cheang, who has contributed important debates concerning how racial and ethnic stereotypes might be challenged from *within* fashion imagery published in *British Vogue*.²⁹⁸ This thesis adds to current scholarship by situating these debates in the context of non-fashion photography published in *National Geographic*, albeit with a focus on images that utilise stylistic techniques often employed within fashion photography. By looking at how images of non-Western dress, placed within a Western fashion context, might complicate a dominant European and North American-centred understanding of what fashion is, I hope to bridge a gap between existing scholarship on *National Geographic*, and academic debates concerning non-Western fashion and dress. I aim to demonstrate that a globally inclusive definition of fashion must encompass *dress* but, and of equal importance, *images of dress*, so as to recognise critically that fashion is not *simply* an economic force, whether on a micro or macro level, but an interconnected form of visual and material culture that sculpts our own ability to self-present, as well as awareness of others' ability to do the same. A crucial part of the Western understanding of what fashion constitutes is encapsulated by *National Geographic*, and so this chapter uses images of dress published within the magazine as a productive tool to re-think definitions of fashion within a cross-cultural and interdisciplinary framework, one that is intricately connected to the visual.²⁹⁹

This chapter departs from simplistic and one-sided Eurocentric definitions of fashion that privilege it as a Western construct, in favour of more expansive, interdisciplinary and transcultural methodologies. It is in this vein that I introduce

²⁹⁸ Cheang, 'To The Ends of the Earth': Fashion and Ethnicity in the *Vogue* Fashion Shoot'.

²⁹⁹ I have already touched upon the lack of appropriate terminology to conceptualise the 'Western' and the so-called 'non-Western', and hope that readers will understand the value in using a term that is problematic, in order to problematise it directly from within through pertinent examples.

Brazilian novelist and poststructuralist theorist, Silviano Santiago, whose collection of essays, *The Space In-Between: Essays on Latin American Culture*, was first published as an English translation in the United States in 2001. Santiago's concept of the space in-between will be used as an analytical tool to enable the cross-cultural strands of global fashion to be separated and considered in more attentive and isolated detail.³⁰⁰

Santiago initially developed the self-conscious concept of the 'space in-between' in 1978, amidst pessimistic theoretical discussions in Brazil, which questioned how Brazilian subjects could negotiate and re-negotiate their neocolonial entrapment and cultural dependency upon an alien and dominant Western culture. Santiago drew upon Andrade's metaphor of anthropophagy, used as a critical tool in the first chapter of this thesis, to describe how the Latin American writer devours Western literary works, consumes the original text, and regurgitates a second text within the same space. He used anthropophagy in a more developed way than did Andrade, attributable to the fact that he was writing during the latter years of the military dictatorship. This period coincided with the academic re-evaluation of Brazilian literary modernism, in an effort to express the peculiarity and transformative potential of contemporary Brazilian cultural production, which was understood as a hybrid

³⁰⁰ Silviano Santiago, *The Space In-Between*.

Anamelia Fontana Valentim and Alessandra Brandao are the first and only scholars to have used Santiago's concept to analyse Brazilian fashion. In a paper given at the Fourth Global Fashion Conference, held at Mansfield College, Oxford University (16-19 September 2012), they argued that a better understanding of Brazilian fashion was required, which would venture beyond simplistic assertions that claim it is little more than an inferior copy of European and North American fashion. Rather, Brazilian fashion is a complex mixture of foreign and local sources, and, although Santiago's theory emerged as a critical analysis of Brazilian literature, it provides a fertile starting point to give a positive and postmodern quality to the copy in Brazilian fashion. Valentim and Brandao's paper drew my attention to Santiago's theory and, whilst their twenty-minute paper was unable to fully exhaust the analytical properties of the space in-between in relation to Brazilian fashion, this chapter seeks to provide a number of additional examples. Anamelia Fontana Valentim and Alessandra Brandao, 'The Position of Brazilian Fashion in a Borderless Place', <<http://www.inter-disciplinary.net/critical-issues/wp-content/uploads/2012/08/fontanafashpaper.pdf>> [accessed 13 June 2015]

construction that has mixed and synthesised aspects of Western and non-Western cultures.³⁰¹

The gaze of the Latin American writer, Santiago contended, is characterised by this hybrid or liminal position of in-betweenness, which he poetically articulated as:

Between sacrifice and play, between prison and transgression, between submission and aggression to the code, between obedience and rebellion, between assimilation and expression – there, in this seemingly empty place, its temple and its site of clandestinity, the anthropophagus ritual of Latin America is performed [...] To speak, to write, means to speak against, to write against.³⁰²

Within this ‘seemingly empty’ and de-territorialised space, characterised by perpetually shifting movement between binary oppositions, elements of North American and Western European cultural practices have been strategically assimilated by Brazilian subjects, and re-presented with reference to their specific social, cultural, political and individual identities.³⁰³ This self-conscious strategy of subversion has copied the language of the dominant culture in order to deconstruct it from within, emphasised by Santiago’s claim that ‘to speak, to write, means to speak against, to write against’.³⁰⁴ ‘Writing back’ is a literary term coined by Santiago, which was first presented in the introduction to this thesis. It is a form of auto-ethnographic expression whereby Western literary practices are modified, re-presented or even resisted in part, in order to provide space for different creative non-Western modes of expression that are constructed in response. Santiago defended the need to understand the critical potential of Latin American literature and artistic production, which is not simply an inferior imitation of Western literature and artistic production,

³⁰¹ Idelbar Avelar, *The Untimely Present: Postdictatorial Latin American Fiction and the Task of Mourning* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1999), p. 138.

³⁰² Silviano Santiago, *The Space In-Between*, p. 31.

³⁰³ Ibid.

³⁰⁴ Ibid.

but an infinitely richer re-presentation of it since it '*contains within itself a representation of the dominant text and a response to that representation within its very fabrication*'.³⁰⁵ Santiago's use of the noun 'fabrication' is a reminder that 'writing back' is intentionally constructed, and includes elements of invention, storytelling and dramatisation which complicate the boundaries between reality and artifice. Fashion is often linked to the creative construction of an individual's actual identity, and therefore provides a fitting medium to draw out some of the cross-cultural narratives woven into the representation of Brazilian Fashion in *National Geographic* since 2001.

Santiago directly referred to fashion, albeit in the broadest sense of prevailing trends, which is applicable to dress, when he wrote:

The major contribution of Latin America to Western culture is to be found in its systematic destruction of the concepts of *unity* and *purity*: these two concepts lose the precise contours of their meaning, they lose their crushing weight, their sign of cultural superiority [...] Latin American artists' creative production [is no longer reduced to] a work whose life is limited and precarious since it is enclosed in the radiance and prestige of the original, of the trendsetter.³⁰⁶

Santiago used the postmodernist thought of Derrida and Foucault as an ideological tool to deconstruct the assumed binary opposition between original and copy, superior and inferior, Western and non-Western, which has characteristically framed debates regarding cross-cultural transactions within the global contact zone. He questioned the notion that fashion is a Western construct, rendering everything produced in Latin America an inferior copy of a Western original. Rather, Latin American cultural production, Santiago argued, held the potential to dislocate and rupture the very ideological foundations of source and influence that Western modernity has been constructed upon. In the introduction to the English-language

³⁰⁵ Ibid., p. 63.

³⁰⁶ Ibid., pp. 31-3.

translation of *The Space In-Between*, Ana Lucia Gazzola and Wander Melo Miranda built upon Santiago's fashion metaphor, and provided an eloquent summary of his concept: 'The ideological fallacy in which notions like source and influence are often clothed is dismantled, and the value of the (peripheral) copy with respect to the (hegemonic) model is recovered.'³⁰⁷ This chapter uses Santiago's metaphor of the space in-between as a point of departure to recover the value of Brazilian self-consciously fashionable representations that were clothed within more dominant representations of Brazilian fashion by *National Geographic*. Santiago's text is not a huge advance on Stam's; both provide a positive theorisation and identification with non-dominant Brazilian discourse, text, artifacts and cultural expressions previously seen as deficient. Nevertheless Santiago's concept, although first used in a critical analysis of Brazilian literature, is more abstract than Stam's metaphor of an aesthetics of garbage, which was grounded in specific examples that engaged Brazilian film as texts, and thus embodies the nuances, contradictions and ambiguous nature of fashion.

The two snapshots examined in this chapter have therefore been selected because they exemplify a fashionable gaze that *National Geographic* placed upon Brazil in two particular and isolated exceptions over the course of a decade. The first section seeks to unravel some of the interconnections and complexities between the visual, textual and tactile strategies that were used in the photobook *National Geographic Fashion* to construct a fashionable gaze onto the magazine's own editorial history in 2001. This gaze oscillated precariously in-between critical recognition of represented subjects as self-fashioning individuals, in correspondence with

³⁰⁷ Ana Lucia Gazzola and Wander Melo Miranda, 'Introduction: Silviano Santiago, a Voice In-Between', in *The Space In-Between: Essays on Latin American Culture*, pp. 1-8 (p. 3).

contemporary academic critique, and fashioning them as an exotic spectacle; to cite Maynard's acerbic observation, 'worthy of [aesthetic] appropriation, but beyond fashionable change'.³⁰⁸ I use Santiago's metaphor of the space in-between to examine a particular snapshot of Brazil, one of three re-presented in *National Geographic Fashion*, and unpick how the magazine's *fashionable* gaze may have been counteracted through the *in-between* gaze of self-fashioning Brazilian subjects.

The second section examines the implicitly fashionable gaze that *National Geographic* placed on Brazilian women in the article, 'Machisma' in September 2011.³⁰⁹ I use the term 'implicit' to acknowledge that, although fashion was not the focus of the article, it played a crucial role in fabricating a narrative of Brazil to *National Geographic* viewers. I untangle the visual, textual and tactile strategies employed by *National Geographic* to fashion an idea of Brazil in the magazine but also, taking into account the enlarged digital networks that *National Geographic* expanded to incorporate since 1995, on the website (accessible at www.nationalgeographic.com).³¹⁰ I use Santiago's metaphor to examine two particular snapshots from this article, and analyse to what extent Brazilian subjects can be seen to have responded directly to *National Geographic's* fashionable gaze by presenting new subjectivities through their own self-fashioning. This chapter critically addresses three different media (photobook, magazine and website) to build upon the phenomenological mode of analysis introduced and developed in the previous two chapters. It considers how these different media may have prompted the viewer to interpret Brazilian subjects in a particular fashion. I draw conclusions in response to

³⁰⁸ Maynard, *Dress and Globalisation*, p. 69.

³⁰⁹ Cynthia Gorney, 'Machisma', pp. 96-121.

³¹⁰ Gorney, 'Machisma' <<http://ngm.nationalgeographic.com/2011/09/girl-power/gorney-text>> [last accessed September 2014]

This snapshot examines the predominant theme, as noted in the second chapter of this thesis, of Rio de Janeiro and Sao Paulo in *National Geographic's* representation of Brazil since September 1988.

the following questions: how has *National Geographic* fabricated a fashionable gaze onto Brazil since 2001? And to what extent does Santiago's metaphor enable us to see how Brazilian subjects have self-fashioned, demonstrated by their ability to sartorially 'write back', through gaze, pose or dress, in response to their dominant representation by *National Geographic*?

National Geographic Fashion: In-Between Exotic Spectacle and Critical Recognition

The official launch of the large coffee-table book, *National Geographic Fashion* (Figs. 4.0 – 4.6) on 6 September 2001, was held at the American department store Saks Fifth Avenue, New York. It coincided with events coordinated by the Council of Fashion Designers of America (CFDA) in celebration of New York Fashion Week Spring/Summer 2002. This marketing decision placed the luxurious large-scale (31cm x 28cm x 2.5cm) photobook, albeit reasonably priced at \$50 for mass-market appeal, firmly within a high fashion as opposed to an academic context; arguably, the latter would have been more conspicuously achieved had the official launch been held at American book retailer, Barnes and Noble.³¹¹ This fashionable gaze, which leaned towards the exotic spectacle of representing *National Geographic* subjects for the benefit of a Western high-fashion audience rather than inciting critical recognition of them as self-fashioning individuals, was reinforced by fashion editor Lamont Jones' multisensory description of the launch event for the *Pittsburgh Post-Gazette* on 8 September 2001:

More than 700 guests, wearing Burberry tops, Armani suits and Ferragamo scarves, revelled on the Second Floor of Saks Fifth Avenue in Manhattan. They

³¹¹ *National Geographic Fashion* was sold exclusively at Saks for \$50 throughout September 2001 until it reached stores throughout the United States in October. It coincided with the opening of the exhibit 'Where Fashion Comes From', which displayed enlarged photographs from *National Geographic Fashion* in a tent at Bryant Park, Manhattan, as part of a series of events organised by the CFDA to coincide with New York Fashion Week.

drank cosmopolitans and nibbled Chinese dumplings, filet mignon and marinated rice rolled in grape leaves as the soul-stirring rhythms of a seven-member African drum and dance ensemble reverberated from a newly renovated area fronted by the Donna Karan salon. There were no remarks or speeches from Saks or National Geographic officials, just music, food and drink. Some guests even tossed their designer handbags to one side and danced across the floor.³¹²

National Geographic Fashion did not feature any Burberry, Armani, Ferragamo or DKNY, but instead re-framed and re-contextualised one hundred and forty-five *National Geographic* photographs, of diverse and anonymous subjects, from various geographical spaces and places throughout the twentieth and twenty-first centuries. The subjects selected for inclusion were comparable only by their striking and symmetrical model-like faces and, generally speaking, symmetrical figures, whether slender, ample, or muscular, which had unequivocally been selected by an eye attuned to Western fashion and beauty conventions. In the West, balanced and symmetrical bodies and faces have tended to be perceived as more attractive than asymmetrical ones.³¹³ The implication in *National Geographic Fashion* may have been that it was permissible to be different, assuming that within that notion of difference there was a recognisable balance, symmetry and corresponding Western ideal of beauty.³¹⁴ This fashionable Western gaze belonged to *National Geographic* photo editor, Annie Griffiths Belt, who explained that, in choosing the images for inclusion she looked ‘for commonality and diversity. Mostly, I looked for self-expression.’³¹⁵ A mixture of full colour, monochrome and hand-painted Autochrome prints reproduced on high quality

³¹² Lamont Jones, ‘Fashionable Influence: National Geographic Celebrates Book That Documents Fashion History’, *Pittsburgh Post-Gazette*, 8 September 2001, p. 20.

³¹³ It is for this reason that Rei Kawakubo’s bold experiments with asymmetrical fashion designs throughout the 1980s and 1990s were so shocking and thought-provoking to a Western fashion audience, since they re-defined and re-wrote the basic tenets of Western fashion and beauty conventions. Lars Svendsen, *Fashion: A Philosophy*, trans. by John Irons (London: Reaktion Books Ltd, 2006), p. 89.

³¹⁴ Sander L. Gilman makes a similar point in his discussion of European, post-enlightenment aesthetics in *Making the Body Beautiful: a cultural history of aesthetic surgery* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1999), p. 150.

³¹⁵ Annie Griffiths Belt, Personal Communication with Author (6 - 15 September 2014). Refer to Appendix 6: Email Correspondence.

satin-finish paper, the photographs were re-presented as highly aestheticised full-page bleeds, double-page enlargements, and single-page images framed in white.

The substantial weight of *National Geographic Fashion* required a desk or table in order for it to be viewed in its entirety, which clearly distinguished it from the slim, glossy magazine, which could be held in the hands and easily transported, whether rolled up in the palm or slipped inside a bag. Whilst *National Geographic* magazine clearly cannot be denoted as ephemeral, since viewers frequently held on to and collected issues, *National Geographic Fashion* had a distinctly more seductive and tactile quality, which tempted the viewer to pick it up, to leaf through it, and potentially, to take it home and display it prominently on a coffee table or bookshelf as the latest exotic fashion accessory. The photobook included introductory essays by cultural anthropologist Joanne Eicher, a point to which this analysis will return, and fashion historian Valerie Mendes, in addition to three chapters provided by *National Geographic* writer and editor Cathy Newman, who consulted a range of dress-historical resources and conducted interviews with a number of fashion specialists.³¹⁶ Nevertheless, the photographs, which Belt organised in collaboration with designer Ben Pham over a period of three months to create 'pairings and spreads', remained the primary focus of the publication, constructing as opposed to illustrating the narrative; this was reinforced by the editorial decision to reference the images with only a short caption in minute print, which provided the bare contextual essentials: photographer, location and date.³¹⁷ Beyond superficial formal similarities, the photographs bore no relation to one another, which resonated with Newman's recollection that the layout of the book was 'an aesthetic decision related to pacing,

³¹⁶ Refer to Appendix 7 for a list of people interviewed and books consulted by Cathy Newman in preparation for *National Geographic Fashion*.

³¹⁷ Belt, Personal Communication with Author.

and [had] nothing to do with scholarship'.³¹⁸ An example is a double-page view (Fig. 4.2) which juxtaposed a small Sri Lankan girl framed by palm fronds in 1907 with a photograph of a young Hawaiian subject wearing a feathered headdress as she competed in the Miss Universe Pageant in 1998. The photographs were periodically interspersed with unreferenced quotations, which lacked historicisation and contextualisation. A case in point is a double-page spread (Fig. 4.3) depicting a Dutch farming family on the island of Marken, dressed in clogs and handmade clothing, and photographed in 1914. It was accompanied by a quote from Italian fashion designer Elsa Schiaparelli, which read: 'In difficult times fashion is always outrageous.' Taken from a completely different time period and context, the quote bore an ambivalent, verging on meaningless, connection to the image, beyond ruminating on one facet of the abstract and intangible nature of 'fashion'.³¹⁹

Whilst *National Geographic Fashion* was clearly marketed to a predominantly fashion-orientated audience, that it was published within a period when dress and fashion academic scholarship was beginning to employ increasingly interdisciplinary and transcultural methodologies, which critically recognised different modes of dressing fashionably throughout the world, cannot be ignored.³²⁰ *National Geographic* was well aware of this scholarship, since it boldly included an introduction by Eicher, who set the critical tone for the photobook and cast doubt upon simplistic dichotomies

³¹⁸ Cathy Newman, Personal Communication with Author (National Geographic Society Archives, 22 June 2013). Refer to Appendix 5: Interviews

³¹⁹ *National Geographic Fashion*, pp. 118-9.

³²⁰ Since the 1990s the historiography and methodological focus of dress and fashion studies have been broadened by new theoretical approaches influenced by anthropology, cultural and media studies, design history and material culture. In 1993 Jennifer Craik acknowledged the numerous non-capitalist and indigenous systems of fashion that co-exist and compete with Western high fashion, which encompassed everyday as well as more exclusive and specialised practices of dressing fashionably in Craik, *The Face of Fashion*. In 1995 Joanne Eicher undertook work on various facets of dress within a global framework in *Dress and Ethnicity: Change Across Space and Time* (Oxford: Berg, 1995). In 1997 the academic journal *Fashion Theory: The Journal of Dress, Body and Culture* provided a forum for the academic study of fashion as the intersection of dress, body and culture, which analysed a range of phenomena that included foot binding and fashion photography.

that presumed the dominance of so-called Western ‘fashion’ above allegedly non-Western ‘dress’.³²¹ She urged the *National Geographic Fashion* viewer to rid herself of an ‘ethnocentrism that encourages the belief that we who live in technologically sophisticated cultures are the only ones capable of, or interested in, change’ and instructed her to consider two themes as she held and thumbed through the photobook: ‘First, the subtleties of fashion as change in dress, and, second, how we interpret change in dress as fashionable.’³²² Eicher later recalled: ‘I was allowed to write whatever I wanted. I wrote what I saw as my philosophy about fashion and dress.’³²³ Eicher’s philosophy was most evident in her insistence that *National Geographic Fashion* had the potential to redefine and broaden our understanding of fashion, as a fluid and continual amendment and re-thinking of dress that characterises everyday life across the globe.

Yet when questioned why the photobook was titled *National Geographic Fashion*, as opposed to dress, for example, rather than invoke this philosophy, Newman and Eicher answered respectively that the decision was ‘driven by marketing [... since] fashion is a more interesting word than dress or clothing, both of which seem rather dull by comparison’ and ‘fashion made the title appealing, more so than dress, and publishers do make books to sell’.³²⁴ This disjuncture between academia and commerce was implicitly reiterated in the flyleaf to the photobook, which celebrated fashion in very broad terms:

Fashion is dramatic, demure, colourful, quiet ... it’s timeless, it’s transient, shocking or soothing, surprising, exciting. It’s an instinct as old as Adam and

³²¹ *National Geographic Fashion*, p. 26.

³²² Ibid.

³²³ Joanne Eicher, Personal Communication with Author (29 August – 3 September 2014). Refer to Appendix 6: Email Correspondence.

³²⁴ Newman, Personal Communication with Author; Eicher, Personal Communication with Author.

Eve, and all over the world it's wherever you look. Fashion is culture. Fashion is art. Fashion is us.³²⁵

On the one hand, this expansive definition encompassed fashionable modes of dress in their various manifestations across world-time and world-space, but on the other, it reduced fashion to a meaningless, undifferentiated and universal layer through which to gaze upon the world at large, and re-frame *National Geographic's* editorial history for commercial gain.³²⁶ The photographs that were re-presented, which focused narrowly on 'ethnic' dress, as opposed to high fashion or street style, encapsulated a palpable tension, between a critical recognition of diverse dress practices across the globe as 'fashion', in line with contemporary academic debate, and a loss of analytical awareness due to the emphasis on the exotic, multisensory spectacle of dress, which drew more noticeably on popular ethnography, a constant source of inspiration to the Western fashion world.³²⁷

Viewed in its entirety, *National Geographic Fashion* was a complicated demonstration of a fashionable gaze, which fused a diverse catalogue of expressions, gestures, poses, clothing and accessories into a synaesthetic spectacle of sights, sounds, smells, tastes and tactile sensations. The photographs encouraged the viewer to look at dress, but also subconsciously to make cross-linkages between the senses, and to imagine how clothing might feel, smell, or sound as it moved, and to re-construct a three-dimensional and multisensory image of fashionably dressed *National*

³²⁵ *National Geographic Fashion*, flyleaf.

³²⁶ In the late 1990s *National Geographic* expanded to become part of a profit-seeking corporation called *National Geographic Ventures*, which included television, website, books such as *National Geographic Fashion* and collected issues of the magazine reproduced on a CD-ROM. These were separate from the non-profit organisation that included the magazine. Constance L. Hays, 'Seeing Green in a Yellow Border', *The New York Times*, 3 August 1997, pp. 12-13.

³²⁷ To clarify my use of the term, Maynard defines ethnic dress as: 'attire characteristic of a specific language, religious and ethnographic social group and may be worn by diasporic peoples who retain allegiance to their culture heritage. The term "ethnic" is preferred to traditional, which implies a form of unchanging attire.' Maynard, *Dress and Globalisation*, p. 12.

Geographic subjects. However, whilst the tactile nature of the two snapshots discussed in the previous chapter encouraged a more intimate engagement with Brazilian subjects, which departed from cold, distanced and rational scientific viewing, in *National Geographic Fashion* there was an overriding sensation that the magazine had shifted one step too far, and produced a dizzying hyper-synaesthetic overload, which threatened to overshadow the viewer's critical faculties. David Howes has used the term 'hyperesthesia' to describe the commodification of multi-sensory values in late capitalist culture, which focuses on 'seducing the senses of the consumer in the interests of valorizing capital'.³²⁸ A similar form of 'multisensory marketing' can be seen in *National Geographic Fashion*, which attempted to seduce the viewer/consumer by engaging as many of her senses as possible.³²⁹ In doing so, as Howes has articulated, *National Geographic* may have sought 'to create a state of *hyperesthesia* in the shopper', who became distracted by the pleasurable, tactile qualities of the photographic representation of dress, and less concerned by its deeper significance for individual wearers.³³⁰

One might argue that there was an intrinsic critique embedded within this haphazard and eclectic arrangement of colourful, tactile imagery, which jostled and competed for the viewer's attention. A similar line of reasoning was employed in the introduction to this thesis, which acknowledged that the diverse arrangement of *National Geographic*, exemplified by the 125th centennial edition, could be

³²⁸ David Howes, 'HYPERESTHESIA, or, The Sensual Logic of Late Capitalism', in *Empire of the Senses: the sensual culture reader*, ed. by Howes, (New York: Berg, 2005), pp. 281-303 (pp. 287-8).

Howes drew on Virginia Postrel's understanding, in *The Substance of Style: how the rise of aesthetic value is remaking commerce, culture and consciousness* (New York: Harper Collins, 2003), of how the tactile qualities of fashion items affect a consumer's feeling and evaluation of them. Postrel wrote: 'People pet Armani clothes because the fabrics feel so good. These clothes attract us as visual, tactile creature, not because they are "rich in meaning" but because they are rich in pleasure.' Postrel quoted in Howes, 'HYPERESTHESIA', p. 287.

³²⁹ Ibid., p. 286.

³³⁰ Ibid.

conceptualised as a contact zone. In *National Geographic Fashion*, however, there was more evidently a standardisation, flattening and levelling of individuals, which was prompted by the exotic spectacle of diversely dressed non-Western subjects, all of whom were aestheticised in accordance with Western beauty conventions, but nonetheless rendered unequivocally *peculiar* through the gaze of fashion. Ultimately, the mismatch process by which different photographs were arranged and re-presented in *National Geographic Fashion* was more likely to tantalise and excite the curiosity, than engage the critical faculties, of the geographically removed viewer. The photobook therefore resonated more closely with Santiago's dismissal of the exotic representation of the Other as 'an image of a smiling carnival and fiesta-filled holiday haven for cultural tourism' than with the cautionary tone set by Eicher in her introduction, which urged viewers not to accept straightforwardly the representation of non-Western dress and fashion as an everyday contemporary reality, since 'it may not even be an example of what most people wore at the time' and 'photographers may have a specific purpose for documenting a certain type of dress'.³³¹

Santiago's critique was abundantly clear in the commentary provided by one viewer, who described the comfort she found in *National Geographic Fashion* when she received it by Federal Express, 'approximately five minutes before tower one of the World Trade Center was hit'.³³² As she explained, 'in the post WTC American experience', the photobook provided 'a powerful visual and contextual tool for understanding the value of clothes and adornment. Filled with timeless images of people from across the globe, it [offered] a compelling reminder to those both in and outside the realm of fashion to consider the rest of the world's joys and sorrows as we

³³¹ Santiago, *The Space In-Between*, p. 38; *Ibid.*, p. 20.

³³² Tobin Levy, 'Tobin Levy's Fashion Book Reviews: National Geographic Fashion', <<http://www.lookonline.com/newbookreview-4.html>> [21 May 2013] (para. 1 of 5)

reflect upon our own.³³³ Viewers located within the West, and directly afflicted by the fragmentation and anxiety caused by 9/11, were invited to seek comfort in the stability provided by non-Western subjects, who were placed within a timeless ethnographic present. This viewpoint encapsulated the contradictions of *National Geographic Fashion*, which equated itself with contemporary scholarship that sought to define fashion within an expansive and cross-cultural framework, but also had an undeniable commercial remit, which suggested that academic debate had not quite filtered through into popular parlance, still captivated as it was by the exotic flair of a presumed Other. The photobook self-consciously fashioned itself as an open sourcebook of popular ethnography that re-presented and re-framed non-Western subjects through a fashionable gaze that enabled the Western viewer to distinguish herself and the United States from a presumed stable opposite. Rather than engage with actual fashion systems, past or present, Western or non-Western, nor with high-end or everyday fashion, *National Geographic Fashion* focused on stereotypes of the exotic that reiterated distinctions between the Self and the Other. It failed to report on the multidimensional nature of fashion, as it has negotiated and navigated various different subject positions, whether of race, gender, sexuality, ethnicity, class, age, or national identity, within the context of contemporary globalisation.

This narrow viewpoint was not confined to *National Geographic*, but widespread across the U.S. media, exemplified by an article published in *Women's Wear Daily* on 24 July 2001, entitled 'Fashion's Second Circuit: Plagued by fashion ennui and trying to find something unique to capture consumer's attention, buyers are combing all corners of the earth for new, interesting resources. Here are reports from

³³³ Levy, 'Tobin Levy's Fashion Book Reviews' (para. 2 of 5)

recent fashion weeks in Brazil and Australia.’ (Fig. 4.7)³³⁴ The title acknowledged that Brazil and Australia constituted a *second* fashion circuit, and by implication, *secondary* to Paris, New York, London and Milan. It also unashamedly pointed out the intent to plunder exotic looks from these countries in order to re-invigorate Western fashion. The overriding impression provided was that, rather than numerous different fashion systems in existence throughout the world, there was still only one, Western-dominated fashion system, which was distinguished from the non-West, and contained the power to incorporate a range of new and different ethnicities and exotic delights into its own frame of reference, *as* and *when* it pleased. This asymmetrical balance of power rife in *WWD* resonated with Jones’ uncritical recognition, in the closing remarks to his article in the *Pittsburgh Post-Gazette*, that *National Geographic Fashion* provided ‘a great holiday book for that fashionista on your list’.³³⁵

Nevertheless, the concept of the space in-between can be used to analyse, and potentially deconstruct, individual images of Brazil that were re-framed and re-contextualised in *National Geographic Fashion*. Rather than reduce Brazil to an ineffable nostalgic and historical past, Santiago opens up a site of potential to re-interpret *National Geographic’s* fashionable gaze onto Brazil, by understanding contact from the perspective of self-fashioning Brazilian subjects. Brazil appeared three times in *National Geographic Fashion*: on the left-hand side of a double-page view (Fig. 4.4), and on both sides of a double-page view (Fig. 4.5). In each instance, *National Geographic* focused on indigenous peoples, drawing a parallel with the third snapshot examined in the first chapter of this thesis. However, as opposed to focusing on

³³⁴ Michael Kemp, ‘Global: Fashion’s Second Circuit, Brazil’s Big Draw’, *Women’s Wear Daily*, 24 July 2001, pp. 16-17.

³³⁵ Michael Marko quoted in LaMont Jones, ‘Fashionable Influence: National Geographic celebrates book that documents fashion history’, *Pittsburgh Post-Gazette*, 8 September 2001, p. 20.

Brazilian women, who provided an interesting example of the appropriation and re-presentation of Western dress practices in the magazine prior to 1988, *National Geographic Fashion* in these instances solely documented men.

The first image (Fig. 4.8) was taken by American photojournalist Loren McIntyre in 1972, and captured a Waura wrestler (indigenous to the Xingu National Park in the Western state of Mato Grosso) covered in large red and black designs painted on his chest and legs.³³⁶ It was originally published on the left-hand side of a double-page view, opposite a blank wall of text, in the October 1972 issue of the magazine (Fig. 4.9), within an article entitled 'Amazon –The River Sea'.³³⁷ Re-presented in the photobook, on the right-hand side of a double-page view, it was cropped, enlarged and stretched to fit the 30cm-squared pages of *National Geographic Fashion*. The image was lightened, which rendered the subject's skin paler, so that the light bounced off his muscular physique, but it also softened and subdued his red and black body paint. This aestheticisation made the subject appear less fierce, and possibly more palatable to Western tastes. Yet rather than gazing into a blank wall of text, which constrained and confined him to the magazine page, his pensive gaze now extends beyond the photobook, situating the subject as the performer of his own actions. His self-possessed gaze is matched by that of the Brazilian subject in the second photograph, which was captured by Robert W. Madden in 1976 and published on the left-hand side of a double-page view in *National Geographic Fashion* (Fig. 4.10).³³⁸ The Yanomamo subject (indigenous to the Amazon rainforest on the border between Venezuela and Brazil) gazes directly at the viewer with wide-open eyes, requesting a close-up response from her. There is an intimate and quiet theatricality to

³³⁶ *National Geographic Fashion*, p. 178.

³³⁷ Loren McIntyre, 'Amazon – The River Sea', *National Geographic*, October 1972, pp. 456-99.

³³⁸ Ibid.

this photograph, an intensity of moment between the viewer and subject rendered through the immediacy and simultaneous stillness of the representation.³³⁹ Although this particular photograph was previously unpublished, a comparable photograph of the same subject appeared in the August 1976 edition of the magazine, in an article entitled 'Yanomamo: The True People' (Fig. 4.11).³⁴⁰ Both of the subjects have a presence and assertiveness, reinforced by their singular and central positioning within the frame, which demonstrates their ability to assert individual subjectivities from within the confines of *National Geographic's* fashionable gaze.

Snapshot 6: The Yanomami Boy's Gaze at the *National Geographic* Photographer's Clothing

The final image of Brazil re-presented in *National Geographic Fashion*, and the snapshot this chapter focuses on, mobilised a more dynamic form of resistance to *National Geographic's* fashionable gaze. Published on a single-page spread (Fig. 4.12), it re-presented and re-framed a photograph of a Yanomamo man posed with his young son, originally documented by Michael Nichols in 1990, and previously archived in a grid formation on the online photographic archive, National Geographic Creative (Fig. 4.13).³⁴¹ Re-contextualised within *National Geographic Fashion*, the photograph was stretched and cropped along the bottom edge; this may have been an intentional censoring of the young boy's exposed private parts, but it also increased the focus onto the two subjects, and framed them in the more intimate protocols of portraiture, as opposed to ethnography. The portrait was intensified in colour, so that a more

³³⁹ *National Geographic Fashion*, p. 12.

³⁴⁰ Napoleon A. Chagnon, 'Yanomamo: The True People', *National Geographic*, August 1976, pp. 211-23 (p. 211).

³⁴¹ *National Geographic Fashion*, p. 13; 'A painted Yanomamo poses with his son', in *National Geographic Creative*, <<http://www.natgeocreative.com/ngs/photography/search/comp-view/index.jsf>> [accessed 13 June 2015]

dynamic dialectic was mobilised between the two figures, who are dressed in red body paint and red loincloth, and the fertile, leafy green surroundings that frame them. This editorial decision drew attention to the red of the dress and their painted, tanned skin, which stands out clearly in the foreground, contrasting with the recessive green of the background.

Both subjects are captured straightforwardly in the frame; the man stares confidently and directly into the camera lens, whilst the young boy addresses the photographer with an arresting and inquisitive gaze. The man's confident and composed gaze denotes complicity between the subject and the photographer, subverting the one-directional power relations frequently attributed to the relationship between observers and observed. It is useful here to draw on Merleau-Ponty's observation that, in viewing a face that gazes directly at the viewer, we are not simply aware that it is a face, but we take into account the position of the face; not only do we *face* that face, but this relationship is reciprocal, since we are also *faced*.³⁴² The man has a dignity and stands as an active agent of his own appearance, rather than as a forlorn and passive object of a distanced voyeuristic gaze. His right arm envelops his young son, whose presence is also undeniably felt within the image as a knowing agent. The young boy is a site of potentiality, an in-between figure, who obscures the divisions between self and other, present and past, young and old, observer and observed. He appears to be as captivated by the curious sight of the clothed photographer, and perhaps his different mode of dress, as the photographer is by him. This self-reflexive dynamic can be extended to the viewer, who is equally aware of the young boy's gaze, which stares out beyond the confines of the photobook

³⁴² Merleau-Ponty, *Phenomenology of Perception*, p. 294.

onto their own dressed body and evokes a self-consciousness in the viewer's gaze onto the young boy and his father as subjects-to-be-looked-at.

This particular snapshot is an indeterminate and ambivalent image, which mobilises a complex interplay between the dominant gaze that has been placed upon the Yanomamo man and his son, centred upon the physical appearance of their dressed bodies, and a defiance of that exotic tourist gaze, which is counteracted by the inquisitiveness of the young boy's gaze. Although his clothing bears no obvious trace of cross-cultural contact and exchange, his self-possessed gaze suggests an instance of reflexivity, which characterises Santiago's notion of writing back, whereby the actions of the dominant culture, here *looking* and *observing*, are mimicked. Homi Bhabha has observed that mimicry is 'the sign of a double articulation; a complex strategy of reform, regulation and discipline, which appropriates the Other as it visualizes power'.³⁴³ The little boy's gaze hints at an alternative and critical re-reading of this image, which opens up a site of potential for *National Geographic Fashion* to be understood in its entirety not merely as a fashionable gaze that blurred peoples and places from across world-time and world-space but as a productive space for new subjective possibilities and realities to be created and contested. It is a potent reminder that just as the Yanomamo man and his son provide an exotic spectacle to the *National Geographic* photographer, this dynamic works in playful irony, since the photographer is an equally exotic specimen to the Yanomami subjects.

However, this critical recognition was entirely dependent upon the *National Geographic Fashion* viewer, to slow down and contemplate the images re-framed within the lavish photobook. This may have been encouraged by the large size of the

³⁴³ Homi Bhabha, 'Of Mimicry and Man: The Ambivalence of Colonial Discourse' in *The Location of Culture* (London: Routledge, 1990), pp. 85-92 (p. 85).

photobook, which required a desk to be viewed, as opposed to the magazine, which was an intimate object that could be carried around. Considered in the context of the fragmentation and chaos generated by 9/11, it is perhaps less likely that feelings of identification and intimacy were mobilised between viewer and subject, and more likely that *National Geographic Fashion* fuelled a desire for cultural superiority on the part of the U.S. viewer, to reinforce North American dominance by asserting the exotic difference of the rest of the world.³⁴⁴ It was not until ten years later that *National Geographic* documented Brazil again through a fashionable gaze, only on this occasion, rather than focusing on ethnic dress worn by indigenous Brazilian men, it concentrated on Western-style high fashion adopted by Brazilian women living in Rio de Janeiro.

A Fashionable Gaze on Brazilian Women in 2011

National Geographic Fashion constituted an exception in historiography of the magazine's documentation of the world in 2001, oscillating precariously between exotic spectacle, particularly when the luxurious large-scale photobook was viewed as

³⁴⁴ This would provide an explanation as to why *National Geographic* chose to leave out particular images from the photobook, such as one taken by Robert W. Moore and published in the magazine in May 1939, which documented a group of men and women of European descent dressed in elegant European-style fashions as they queue for a taxi outside the luxury English department store, *Mappin'*, in Sao Paulo. *Mappin'* opened in Sao Paulo in 1913 and enabled the aspiring middle classes of a newly industrialised and capitalist Sao Paulo to consume luxury goods such as clothing, accessories, furniture, fabrics and household appliances which denoted 'Englishness'. It disseminated fashionable forecasts to the Brazilian elite and, its popularity in the 1940s, reflected a boom in Sao Paulo's commercial and industrial infrastructure. This choice of omission demonstrated that *National Geographic Fashion* had an agenda (just as *National Geographic* had an agenda during World War Two, when it chose to document white European-descended, rather than indigenous, Brazilians) since the fashionable gaze it placed on the world was here palpably informed by an ethnographic desire to codify difference, rather than to present viewers with a more easily recognisable image of fashion as a global economic force that permeates social and cultural life. Moore, 'As Sao Paulo Grows', p. 659.

For more information on *Mappin'* see Rita Andrade, 'Mappin Stores: Adding an English Touch to the São Paulo Fashion Scene', in *The Latin American Fashion Reader*, ed. by Regina Root (New York: Berg, 2005), pp. 176-187.

a whole, and critical recognition, potentially encouraged when individual images of Brazil were viewed in contemplative isolation. Ultimately, it probably served to establish, rather than to erode, alterity. This dialectic can be examined in more detail in an article published in *National Geographic* in September 2011, entitled ‘Machisma: How A Mix Of Female Empowerment And Steamy Soap Operas Helped Bring Down Brazil’s Fertility Rate and Stoke Its Vibrant Economy’, which marked another exception in historiography of *National Geographic*’s documentation of Brazil.

Unlike the snapshots discussed in the previous chapter, where imagery took precedence over text, and encouraged identification with Brazilian subjects, this article gave equal precedence to text and image, just as did the pre-1988 snapshots examined in the first chapter. The title of the article made use of the neologism ‘Machisma’, which *National Geographic* researcher Heidi Schultz explained was a fabrication by the author, American journalist Cynthia Gorney:

It is a play on the word Machismo used in Brazil and many other Latin American countries. Machismo has been linked to violence and physical assaults on women. This was an inversion of that definition. We were showing empowered women who were fighting back, by taking their fertility into their own hands.³⁴⁵

Gorney explained that the article was written as ‘part of a year-long series called 7 Billion’, which addressed the ‘world’s population reaching that number’.³⁴⁶ As a result of its ‘vast landmass, with enormous regional differences in geography, race and culture’, Brazil was selected as an exemplary case study ‘to illustrate the drop in fertility that had been noted in many developing countries’, including Russia, India,

³⁴⁵ Heidi Schultz, Personal Communication with Author (National Geographic Society Archives, 22 June 2013). Refer to Appendix 5: Interviews.

³⁴⁶ Cynthia Gorney, Personal Communication with Author (18-19 July 2013). Refer to Appendix 6: Email Correspondence.

China and South Africa.³⁴⁷ Within the article, she compared Brazil's fall in fertility with that of the United States:

[The] new Brazilian fertility rate is below the level at which a population replaces itself. It is lower than the two-children-per-woman fertility rate in the United States. It is the largest nation in Latin America – a 191-million-person country where the Roman Catholic Church dominates, abortion is illegal (except in rare cases), and no official government policy has ever promoted birth control – family size has dropped so sharply and so insistently over the past five decades that the fertility rate graph looks like a playground slide.³⁴⁸

Gorney acknowledged that this trend did not apply only to 'wealthy and professional women' but to all levels of society, including 'schoolteachers, trash sorters, architects, newspaper reporters, shop clerks, cleaning ladies, professional athletes, high school girls, and women who had spent their adolescence homeless'.³⁴⁹ The article put this trend down to rapid industrialisation following the end of the military regime in 1984, which required women to work longer hours rather than stay at home with children; the ability to obtain means of birth control over the pharmacy counter without prescription; the introduction of a national pension, reducing dependency in old age on a larger family; the rise in caesarean sections as a result of financial incentives for doctors; the increase in women's equality rights that stemmed from the Brazilian Women's Movement of the 1970s and 1980s; and, finally, the widespread influence of Brazilian *telenovelas*, Portuguese-language evening soap operas, and their propagandistic dissemination of 'a singular, vivid, aspirational image of the modern Brazilian family: affluent, light skinned, and small'.³⁵⁰ Gorney's final comment was not flippant, but referred to the contemporary reality that, whilst Brazil is culturally and

³⁴⁷ Gorney, 'Machisma', p. 102.

³⁴⁸ Ibid., p. 101.

³⁴⁹ Ibid.

³⁵⁰ Ibid., p. 108.

racially diverse, this has not, until very recently, been reflected in national media, where Afro-Brazilians have frequently been relegated to invisible or secondary roles.³⁵¹

Gorney described the consequences of this drop in fertility: ‘multi-class consumerism’ and an explosion in consumer credit, ‘reaching middle- and working-class families that two decades ago had no access to these kinds of discretionary purchases paid off over time’.³⁵² Whilst she acknowledged that it was ‘a gross simplification’ to deduce that Brazilian women are choosing to have fewer children in order to spend more money, she explained that ‘questions about material acquisition – how much everything now costs, and how much everyone now desires – both interested and troubled nearly every Brazilian woman I met’.³⁵³ Gorney cautioned that economic growth and a drop in fertility did not straightforwardly ensure nationwide family wellbeing unless affluence was carefully managed and invested, the implication being, perhaps, that Brazilian women might have a tendency to be rather frivolous with their newfound wealth. So-called frivolity was not characteristic, however, of all of the women that Gorney met. Her article concluded with a description of having coffee with a group of professional women in Sao Paulo, where they studied ‘eight different glossy parenting magazines’:

We studied the fashion photographs of beautiful toddlers in knits and aviator sunglasses and fake furs. ‘Look at these kids,’ said Milene Chaves, a 33-year-old journalist, her voice hovering between admiration and despair. She turned the page. ‘And it seems you have to have a decorated room too. I don’t need a decorated room like this.’ [...] The half dozen friends around her agreed, the magazines still open on the table before us: attractive objects, they said, but so excessive, so disturbingly too much.³⁵⁴

³⁵¹ Samantha Nogueira Joyce, *Brazilian Telenovelas and the Myth of Racial Democracy* (Lanham: Lexington Books, 2012).

³⁵² Gorney, ‘Machisma’, p. 116.

³⁵³ Ibid., p. 118.

³⁵⁴ Ibid., p. 119.

Whilst the Brazilian women quoted appeared critical of their peers' materialistic desire for (in this particular instance, children's) fashion items, such as 'knits, aviator sunglasses, and fake furs', which were often paid for on credit, the back cover of the same edition of *National Geographic* featured Leonardo DiCaprio (Fig. 4.14), dressed in an open-collared dark grey shirt and black jacket, in the latest Tag Heuer watch advertisement; this luxury fashion item tempted the *National Geographic* viewer, if not to purchase outright, then surely to buy on credit.³⁵⁵ DiCaprio modelled a man's watch from the mid-range Carrera series; the implication deduced by the *National Geographic* viewer would surely have been that it was permissible for U.S. men to participate in fashion as active consumers, but not for Brazilian women, even if it was in aid of their children rather than a lavish purchase for themselves, reinforcing a power imbalance between the two groups.

It is important to point out that whilst the article did not focus on fashion, it played a key role in constructing the new identity of the 'empowered' Brazilian women represented by *National Geographic*. Gorney's opinion of fashion in Brazil, which she cleverly worked into her report so that it appeared *actually* to be the opinion of the Brazilian women she had interviewed, was retrogressive, and connected to the view of fashion propounded by the Women's Liberation Movement (WLM) in the United States during the late 1960s and 1970s. The WLM understood fashion to be trivial, since the movement deemed it more liberating for women to break out of preconceived ideas of controlled femininity which constructed false ideals of women.³⁵⁶ Yet by putting forward this point of view via the Brazilian subjects that she interviewed, Gorney conveyed the overriding impression that it was glossy Brazilian

³⁵⁵ *National Geographic*, September 2011, back cover.

³⁵⁶ Caroline Evans and Minna Thornton, *Women and Fashion: A New Look* (London: Quartet, 1989), p. 3.

magazines, rather than, in fact, *National Geographic*, which perpetuated an out-of-date and artificial ideology of Brazilian femininity through its representation of contemporary Brazilian fashion, with its attempts to tell Brazilian women how they *should*, or rather *could*, live their lives. Rather than depicting Brazilian fashion as a highly profitable industry, which would have directly linked it to Brazil's vibrant economy (to which by 2011 it was contributing 3.5 per cent), as referred to in the title of the article, *National Geographic* presented fashion as a mechanism used in a purportedly sexist male-dominated Brazilian society to control women and keep them in their place.³⁵⁷ The implication was that, although Brazil may have had a lower fertility rate in 2011 than the United States, it was far behind in terms of attitudes to gender equality, despite *National Geographic's* apparently commendable attempts to unearth evidence of its own invention, 'Machisma'.

Despite this, the photographs of Brazilian fashion that accompanied the article, which were far more complex and intermedial images, communicated a slightly different narrative to the viewer. It is important to point out that the twenty full-colour photographs selected by Stanmeyer to accompany the article as a whole were predominantly a combination of portrait photography and documentary images. An example of the former can be seen in Fig. 4.15, a double-page view that contrasted two family portraits: on the left, the darker-skinned, seven-child family of Maria do Livramento Braz, who is seated in the middle, and used as an exemplary case to reflect 'Brazil's once high fertility rate', and on the right, the lighter-skinned two-child family of Maria Corrêa de Oliveira, also seated, who is a reflection of how 'the number of kids

³⁵⁷ Anon., 'In Brazil, Booming Economy Boosts Apparel Business', in *Apparel* <<http://apparel.edgl.com/news/in-brazil-booming-economy-boosts-apparel-business75616>> [accessed 13 June 2015]

per woman has plummeted since the 1960s'.³⁵⁸ An example of the documentary image is exemplified by Fig. 4.16, a double-page spread that captured Liliane Mineira da Silva with her children, Beatriz and Vitoria, as she produces crochet for the Coopa-Roca arts cooperative, situated in Rio's largest favela, Rocinha.³⁵⁹ Yet intervening within this overriding visual narrative were two ambiguous images, which had the potential to dissolve binary divisions and sculpt out a space *in-between* the conventions of documentation and dramatisation.

Snapshot 7a: Bianca Marque's Bikinis in the Magazine

The second snapshot this chapter examines was published on a double-page spread at the very end of the article as printed in the magazine (Figs. 4.17 and 4.18). It captured fashionably dressed women talking, eating and laughing within the plush interior of Brazilian fashion designer Bianca Marques' boutique. The caption informed the viewer that this was 'an upscale Ipanema boutique', in the affluent South Zone of Rio de Janeiro.³⁶⁰ The heightened surface appearance of the image immediately associated it with fashion: the glint of glass chandeliers, the shine of the silver material of the bikini displayed, the lustrous dark hair of the central female subject, the polished glass windows, the smooth mirror to the right of the image and, last but not least, the silky sheen of the magazine page. This endorsed the disdainful implication propounded within Gorney's text, that fashion magazines are superficial, 'so excessive,

³⁵⁸ Gorney, 'Machisma', pp. 98-99.

³⁵⁹ Coopa-Roca stands for Rochina Seamstress and Craftwork Cooperative Ltd, and was set up in the early 1980s to '[train], manage and coordinate the work of female residents of Rochina, who produce artisanal pieces for fashion and design markets'. 'About Us', < http://www.coopa-roca.org.br/quem_somosl.asp > [accessed 13 June 2015]

³⁶⁰ Gorney, 'Machisma', p. 119.

so disturbingly too much'.³⁶¹ It had the appearance of social reportage; it could have been a society page since it documented, rather than fashion explicitly, more an anthropology of social life, and the antics of wealthy women in Brazil, which could be interpreted as rather vulgar, and on first glance might be read as providing entertainment for the *National Geographic* viewer. Indeed, to consider the photograph as a whole, the female subjects are presented as passive, unaware of the active, observing gaze of Stanmeyer and his camera as they chat, eat and laugh amongst themselves.

Nevertheless, within the image we can discern aspects of Santiago's space in-between. The gaze of the woman to the left of centre in the image, who is also reflected in the mirror on the right-hand side of the page, does not suggest passivity, but a specifically feminine gaze that matches Stanmeyer's masculine gaze onto the women. It is a gaze comparable to that of the small boy examined in the previous snapshot, but, rather than curious, it is confident and self-assured. The Brazilian subject is no longer the object of a gaze, but the instigator of a gaze; she inhabits a space in-between the photographer and his female subjects, where she matches *National Geographic's* dominant visual gaze and places it back onto the photographer and, through the magazine's dissemination, also onto the *National Geographic* viewer. That there is a camera placed on the sofa next to her, directly pointing at the viewer, reinforces her position as an active self-fashioning subject, but also her own awareness of herself as a fashion image. The female protagonist encapsulates what Merleau-Ponty termed the 'split gaze', whereby 'external perception and the perception of one's own body vary in conjunction because they are the two facets of one and the

³⁶¹ Ibid.

same act'.³⁶² The woman's active gaze operates as a powerful inversion of *National Geographic's* fashionable gaze onto the women, which renders their private sphere of a shopping boutique public within the pages of the magazine. She turns that gaze back onto the viewer, looking back with a steely stare, which encourages a heightened sense of looking, seeing, being, feeling and wearing within the viewer and invites, perhaps, critical self-reflection and contemplation, as the viewer becomes aware of her own position as a voyeur. This self-reflexive dynamic is reinforced by the editorial decision to split the image in two by the use of a mirror, which reflects the image back onto itself. The crease of the magazine double-page spread emphasises this mirroring, but also obscures the subject's reflection, drawing attention to the fact that mirrors do not simply reflect, but actively construct, resonating with Garrett's implicit acknowledgement of this in the centennial edition of *National Geographic*, within the article 'Within the Yellow Border ...', examined in the second chapter. The woman's gaze indicates that she is confident with her appearance, which she has subjectively constructed through her adoption of fashionable items of clothing. Her fashioned body does not render her a passive object but is actively produced as a site for the articulation of her own feminine and social identity. Fashion gives her the confidence to define herself *against* an objectifying *National Geographic* gaze, by mimicking that gaze in a process that resists and re-fashions it.

An interesting point of comparison can be drawn with a swimwear shoot documented in the *New York Times Style Magazine* (Fig. 4.19) five months earlier in April 2011, entitled 'The Full Brazilian: frolicking on her native beaches in resort's flirty new silhouette of rompers and shorts is that national treasure, the gorgeous Raquel

³⁶² Merleau-Ponty, *Phenomenology of Perception*, p. 237.

Zimmermann'.³⁶³ Just as in *National Geographic*, the fashion shoot celebrated a desirable white Brazilian femininity, but here it captured the globally successful fashion model Zimmerman on a trip to Fernando de Noronha, an archipelago in the Atlantic Ocean, 354km offshore from the northeast coast of Brazil. There is a relative lack of exoticism and playing up of a sensual Brazilian femininity that might be expected from a swimwear shoot on location in Brazil, not least with a Brazilian model. In one of the photographs a palpable awkwardness permeates Zimmerman's pose. Somewhat dwarfed by her environment, she is placed just to the right of centre in the frame and gazes directly at the camera. She models a Missoni bikini and Diane von Furstenberg sunglasses – one example of the American fashion press' refusal to acknowledge Brazilian fashion designers properly as equal competitors on the global fashion stage. Yet it is Zimmermann's body language that stands out in this image: she sticks out her stomach, pulls back her shoulders, allows her arms to hang stiffly by her sides, and turns her feet slightly inwards, with one foot curling awkwardly into the sand on which she stands. She has the appearance of an awkward, passive child rather than a globally successful, active supermodel. Zimmerman has a far less dynamic gaze than the central subject documented in *National Geographic*. Her eyes are covered with sunglasses, so that even though the viewer watches her, she remains inaccessible; this might denote resistance to the photographer's gaze but, due to her childlike stance that renders her body readily available to the viewer, seems to suggest more a passive complicity to her documentation.

In addition to Zimmermann's unorthodox pose, what is particularly revealing about this fashion shoot in the *New York Times Style Magazine* is that, rather than

³⁶³ Kevin Raub, 'The Full Brazilian', *New York Times T Style Holiday Magazine*, 4 December 2011, pp. 160-69.

present an exoticised Brazilian beach scene, it is taken in a reasonably homogenous environment, which could be any number of isolated nature spots throughout the world. It therefore has a lack of exoticism, and less of a focus on surface, glitz and glamour, which might be expected from a tropical fashion shoot set in Brazil for a U.S. readership.³⁶⁴ It is in this respect that the *National Geographic* snapshot, despite Stanmeyer's insistence that it was an example of straightforward and objective reportage, was ambiguous, since the emphasis on superficial surface, and the multisensory experience the viewer was encouraged to have with the image, may have undermined her critical re-reading of it through the subject's dress, gesture, gaze and pose.³⁶⁵ The surface qualities of the image situated the subject within a fashion as opposed to documentary context, but there was an ambivalent sense in which, even though the subject's return gaze situated her as active, and complicated the photographer's straightforward control over her, the photograph appeared directed and cultivated by Stanmeyer's discriminating eye. The tactile qualities of the image, from the glistening chandeliers, glittering bikini, soft velvet sofa, to the shiny glass window and mirror, threatened to seduce the senses of the viewer and potentially, encourage a state of hyperesthesia in her, which enhanced the likelihood that her critical awareness of the subject's self-fashioning would become overshadowed.

³⁶⁴ One example of a U.S. fashion shoot that capitalised on a stereotypical tropical Brazilian identity of samba, sun and carnival is 'Viva Brazil!! Staring Gisele and New Girls (And Boys!) From Ipanema', written by A. A. Gill, and accompanied with photographs by Mario Testino, which appeared in *Vanity Fair* in September 2007. It included Brazilian models, artists, actors and musicians, including Gisele Bundchen, Adriana Lima and Bebel Gilberto, but only ever wearing Western fashion labels, as opposed to those of successful Brazilian designers, which reinforced an idea of Brazil as a source of exoticism to invigorate the Western fashion system, but not critically acknowledged as a potential competitor to it. A. A. Gill, 'Viva Brazil!! Staring Gisele and New Girls (And Boys!) From Ipanema', *Vanity Fair*, September 2007, pp. 316-334.

³⁶⁵ John Stanmeyer, Personal Communication with Author (27-30 March 2014). Refer to Appendix 6: Email Correspondence.

If *National Geographic* had truly wanted to document Brazilian fashion it might have pointed out, within the text of the article or in the caption to this snapshot, the success of the Brazilian swimwear industry, which has been linked to the originality of the product, representative of both the Brazilian lifestyle and the Brazilian climate that has necessitated its production.³⁶⁶ It may have mentioned that Brazilian swimwear is distinct from other segments of the Brazilian fashion industry because it has moved beyond, as Silvano Mendes and Nick Rees-Roberts have articulated, ‘the traditional imitation of European and North American labels’, formerly widespread amongst Brazilian fashion design up until the late 1990s, ‘to a position of stylistic influence’, which can be charted through the collections of western fashion brands such as Gucci and Louis Vuitton.³⁶⁷ *National Geographic* failed to acknowledge these crucial cross-cultural aspects of Brazilian swimwear, that have positioned it on the cusp of Brazil and the West, in creative dialogue with the West but also culturally and stylistically distinct from the West. By factoring these important issues into the construction of the article, *National Geographic* would have directly linked the documentation of Brazilian fashion to the Brazilian economy, and highlighted the particularly strategic nature of the Brazilian swimwear industry, which negotiates local and global sensibilities for commercial gain. Instead, the magazine presented a very narrow view of Brazilian fashion as the elite domain of wealthy, white, European-descended women, oscillating precariously between acknowledging the self-fashioning of Brazilian subjects, and over-emphasising the tactile stimulations that its representation provided, which contributed to an idea of fashion as a superficial, feminine preoccupation. The second

³⁶⁶ Malcolm Newbery, ‘The Brazilian Swimwear Industry’, in *Global Market Review of Swimwear and Beachwear – Forecasts to 2013* (Bromsgrove, UK: Aroq, 2007), pp. 71-80.

³⁶⁷ Silvano Mendes and Nick Rees-Roberts, ‘Branding Brazilian Fashion: Global Visibility and Intercultural Perspectives’, in *Fashion Cultures Revisited: Theories, Explorations and Analysis*, ed. by Stella Bruzzi and Pamela Church Gibson (London: Routledge, 2013), pp. 31-42 (p. 31).

part of this snapshot extends these arguments to consider how a similar fashion-focused, and equally ambiguous, image from the same article was re-framed and re-contextualised online for the digital edition of *National Geographic*, and how this may have encouraged viewers to re-interpret self-fashioning Brazilian subjects.

Snapshot 7b Victor Dzenk's Dresses on the Website

The layout of images on the *National Geographic* website required the viewer to adopt a more active and decisive role than previously encouraged by the magazine. This is because images re-framed on the website were presented as a series of cropped, close-up thumbnail photographs, which needed to be selected by the viewer, using the mouse or touch-pad, in order to view the full-scale images in enlarged isolation (Figs. 4.20 and 4.21). The enlarged images were always presented on a plain white background, divorced from the text, with the exception of a caption, and from the remaining photographs of the accompanying article. This editorial decision constructed each image as a finished composition in and of itself, fixed in motion like a film still, but it also gave the viewer a choice as to which images to view, and in which order to view them. It is possible that the perceptive viewer was encouraged to fill in the narrative in-between images re-framed on the digital screen, and to construct their own storyline that was less dictated by *National Geographic*, as the linear nature of reading the magazine may have encouraged, and more subject to their own, individual whims.³⁶⁸

³⁶⁸ This corresponded with *National Geographic*'s acknowledgement in a 2013 press release that with its expansion into digital media the magazine is continuing to expand 'the scope of its visual storytelling, experimenting with digital experiences to find new ways of documenting the world and of allowing

Lucas D. Introna and Fernando M. Ilharco's have acknowledged that digital screens

present an already screened world to us which is already consistent with our ongoing involvement in that world. Hence, foremost and primarily what screens show is not the content that appears on the screen, but simultaneously, and perhaps more fundamentally, *a way of being in that world*. As screens we look *at* them but also simultaneously, immediately, and more fundamentally, we look *through* them to encounter our way of being in the world.³⁶⁹

Introna and Ilharco attribute a heightened sense of embodiment to the viewer's experience of the screen, which mobilises a dynamic interplay between viewer and subject, and can be extended to the level of self-projection on the part of the *National Geographic* viewer that the smooth, reflective surface of the digital screen engendered. In her discussion of self-reflexivity and fashion blogs, Agnes Rocamora has pointed out that the digital screen, comparable to a mirror, 'allow[s] one to look at oneself', as well as to look at what is presented on the screen.³⁷⁰ My own analysis of this particular image, as it was re-framed on the website, was conducted on a MacBook pro, whose flat screen thinly bordered in silver and placed perpendicular to the keyboard, has the appearance of a dressing table mirror, particularly when placed on my desk, not least when I catch sight of my own reflection projected onto the screen, which becomes a palimpsest placed over the top of the represented subjects.³⁷¹ This simultaneous sensation of looking, but also being looked back at, counteracts claims that all photographs viewed on screens, whether on computers,

readers to interact with content'. Anon., 'National Geographic Magazine', <<http://press.nationalgeographic.com/files/2014/05/NGM-overview-5-14.pdf>> [accessed 15 April 2013]

³⁶⁹ Lucas D. Introna and Fernando M. Ilharco, 'On the Meaning of Screens: Towards a Phenomenological Account of Screenness', *Human Studies*, 29 (2006), 57-76 (p. 66).

³⁷⁰ Agnes Rocamora, 'Personal Fashion Blogs: Screens and Mirrors in Digital Self-Portraits' in *Fashion Cultures Revisited*, ed. by Stella Bruzzi and Pamela Church Gibson (London: Routledge, 2013), pp. 112-127 (p. 119).

³⁷¹ Rocamora makes a similar point but she asserts that her reflection can be seen only when the screen is turned off. I would extend this to suggest that the screen acts as a reflective mirror when turned on as well. Rocamora, 'Personal Fashion Blogs', p. 121.

mobile phones or iPads, have disembodied the viewer and rendered her effectively immobile whilst the screen moves.³⁷² Once selected, a photograph on the *National Geographic* website could not be zoomed in and out of via the mouse or touchpad; for the viewer to observe the image in closer detail, she had to physically move her body in towards the screen. The screen thus had the potential to prompt an intensely charged encounter between the *National Geographic* viewer and Brazilian subjects, capable of eroding the physical and, by extension, emotional distance between the observer and the image. This encounter was given a heightened importance in the final image this chapter analyses, as a result of the complex gazes acted out by the three subjects represented on the screen.

The image (Fig. 4.20) was photographed in Brazilian fashion designer Victor Dzenk's boutique in Rio de Janeiro. A pair of high-heeled shoes can be seen on the feet of the central female subject in Stanmeyer's photograph, as she sashays down a corridor adorned with mirrors, inside, as the caption generically informed the viewer, 'a fashion boutique in Ipanema'.³⁷³ In the image, Stanmeyer captured the central subject's whole body within the centre of the frame, which encouraged the viewer's gaze to move upwards, or downwards, taking in her nude-coloured high heels, her slim, tanned legs, turquoise mini-dress with a sheer cut-out section and puff sleeves, gold necklace, made-up face and blow-dried hair. Although this masculine gaze subjected the female subject to scrutiny from the *National Geographic* viewer, there are a number of feminine gazes within the image which counteract the visual mastery

³⁷² These claims have been made by Lev Manovich and Joanna Sassoon. Refer to Manovich, 'The Paradoxes of Digital Photography', in *Photography After Photography: Memory and Representation in the Digital Age*, pp. 57-66; Joanna Sassoon, 'Photographic Materiality in the Age of Digital Reproduction', in *Photographs, Objects, Histories: On the Materiality of Images*, ed. by Elizabeth Edwards (London: Routledge, 2004), pp. 186-202.

³⁷³ Gorney, 'Machisma', <<http://ngm.nationalgeographic.com/2011/09/girl-power/stanmeyer-photography#/08-fashion-boutique-670.jpg>> [accessed 15 April 2013]

of Stanmeyer's gaze, and instead direct the viewer's eye to move constantly around the frame in a triangular shape and grasp its charged narrative, rather than be centred on the fetishisation of this one subject. Each of the women's identities is constructed through this in-between movement, which contributes to an idea of them as actors in a *telenovela*, albeit one in which there is an unmistakable imbalance of feminine power dramatised. Through these gazes, there is a sense that Brazilian identity is an interconnected process of fluid 'becoming', rather than a fixed 'being'. The first gaze belongs to the central light-skinned subject, who glances at a woman with long dark hair, who is captured to her left but to the right of the photograph frame. The second gaze belongs to this light-skinned subject, who wears a white lace dress and glances to her right, leading the viewer's eye to a darker-skinned shop assistant. Pushed into the left-hand corner of the photograph against a clothes rail laden with colourful dresses, and framed against a heavily patterned psychedelic background, the third gaze belongs to this subject, who appears to be of indigenous descent and is dressed in a plain black uniform. She clutches a collection of wooden coat hangers that support brightly coloured and patterned dresses, which contrast dramatically with her austere ensemble. Her downcast gaze as she focuses upon the task in hand is matched by that of the mother working from home for Coopa Roca, who was documented by Stanmeyer and seen in Fig. 4.16. There is an unmistakeable visual conflict, not only within this image, but also within the photographs published elsewhere in the article, between women who are employees of the Brazilian fashion industry and placed in correspondingly *static* roles and the wealthier women whom they serve and who consume fashion, who are presented in equivalent *active* roles. The distinction between *passivity* and *activity* is emphasised here through the contrasting skin tones of the darker-skinned, uniformed employee and the lighter-skinned, dressed-up

consumers. The caption guided the viewer's attention to focus on this imbalance of power in the ability for feminine self-fashioning: 'Consumer Culture: Despite the booming economy, not every Brazilian can indulge in expensive fashions like these.'³⁷⁴ This is overtly conveyed to the viewer through the pose, gesture, dress and gaze of the white-skinned Brazilian women, who 'write back' at a voyeuristic male gaze by taking their representation into their own hands. The implication was that fashion in Brazil enabled wealthy light-skinned women to construct their own subjective identities in-between Brazil and the West as active consumers, and thereby participate in their visual representation by *National Geographic*, but that it did not so enable less wealthy dark-skinned women, who are condemned to play the part of passive operators within the Brazilian fashion industry.

This image, rather like the previous one, is not a fashion photograph but rather a dramatised anthropology of Brazilian social life. It uses fashionable details, such as the emphasis on tactile sensations, from the soft carpet, crisp cotton lace of the white dress, shiny glass mirror, to the women's glittering jewellery, not least the smooth, tactile surface of the digital screen, now often the first point of contact for experiencing high-end fashion culture in the West, to draw the *National Geographic* viewer in, so as to narrate the presumed reality of race relations within Brazil, through the ways in which fashion is produced and consumed by European-descended white Brazilian women. Yet the emphasis on surface texture and tactility may have resulted in a diminished critical awareness on the part of the viewer, whose intellectual interpretation of the photograph was undermined by its dependence upon the sensory haptic and optic experiences produced by fashion, which operated as a substitute for touch but also, potentially, for depth.

³⁷⁴ Ibid.

The two images examined in this snapshot were ambiguous and oscillated between *fashioning* Brazilian women as a passive spectacle, emphasised by the aestheticised sensory overload of tactile surface textures within the photograph to excite and tantalise the viewer, and critically acknowledging their individual practices of *self-fashioning*, highlighted through the various dynamic gazes they perform. This visual ambiguity resonated with Stanmeyer's own, contradictory descriptions of his photographic practice, which eroded the clear division between objective documentation and subjective dramatisation. On the one hand, he asserted: 'I do not direct the subjects in my photographs or collaborate in any way. This is reportage photography. It is naturally happening – no poses or styling done.'³⁷⁵ Yet he also acknowledged: 'I simply see what has a feeling, purpose or emotion to the story. Not every photograph works. Other[s] do. It's like working a pottery wheel, constantly molding the clay until the narrative takes shape and form.'³⁷⁶ If these photographs are understood as an equal collaboration between subjects and photographer, then narrative construction could be a tool used to communicate individual subjects' self-fashioning and self-presentation through a heightened sense of drama, emotion and suspense. In this scenario, Stanmeyer's role would be to simply document their performance, allowing the subjects to perform their own fashionable identities. Indeed, there is an overriding sense that, even when the images were re-presented online and viewers were given a more active critical interpretative role, that Stanmeyer understood his position as an orchestrator, in which he is the creative artisan shaping and giving form to the narrative, choreographing his actors like a director.

³⁷⁵ Stanmeyer, Personal Communication with Author.

³⁷⁶ Ibid.

This chapter has identified two instances in the history of *National Geographic's* representation of Brazil since 2001 when the magazine has engaged with fashion. In the first snapshot, *National Geographic* clearly stated this and fashion was represented within a very broad ethnographic framework, informed by contemporary scholarship but with an explicit commercial imperative, which presented Brazilian fashion as ethnic, indigenous and masculine. Fashion provided a generic lens through which to view the world at large, and diverse subjects were rendered unequivocally peculiar when viewed through it. In the second snapshot, fashion was a subtext within an article that concerned Brazilian women, and it was used to demonstrate how wealthy, white-skinned women consume and construct their identities through Brazilian fashion. Fashion was presented within an anthropological framework, but dismissed as superficial and distinctively feminine. Over the course of ten years, *National Geographic* departed from a masculine, ethnic understanding of Brazilian fashion, which asserted that difference was permissible assuming that within that notion of difference there was a recognisable Western ideal of beauty, and moved towards presenting an overtly white, Westernised image of Brazilian fashion. In both of these snapshots, *National Geographic* ignored the multidimensional nature of Brazilian fashion, and presented two very narrow ideas of what fashion in Brazil constituted, neither of which encapsulated the experience of fashion as a site of articulation and identity formation within the context of a global economy.

In both 2001 and 2011, the gazes of self-fashioning Brazilian subjects have characterised an in-betweenness that has constituted a resistance to *National Geographic's* fashionable gaze. It is interesting to note that 'writing back' has not been communicated through dress, so much as via the active gazes that subjects have

displayed in response to *National Geographic*. In the first snapshot, the little boy's curious gaze at the photographer was an intrigued reaction to the presence of the camera, but also to the photographer's peculiar mode of dress. In the second snapshot, the Brazilian woman's active and self-possessed gaze, in the form of a sustained look at the camera and the photographer, seemed to affirm a shared recognition of herself as fashionable image, drawing attention to the fact that the photograph was just that – a representation. In the final image analysed, the women's gazes at one another within the boutique counteracted the visual mastery of Stanmeyer's gaze, and highlighted the complexity of the snapshot, and the hierarchies that exist in Brazil amongst different social, ethnic and racial groups.

Whilst these return gazes have complicated *National Geographic's* straightforward control over its subjects, the magazine's fashionable attention to the haptic visual qualities of the images has threatened to override the interactive nature of the exchange between viewer and subject. In the first snapshot, this was a result of the luxurious qualities of the photobook as a material object, its haphazard arrangement of images, and the tactile sheen of its pages. In the second snapshot, this was less to do with the material object of the magazine or digital screen, beyond its glossy sheen, so much as the range of surface textures within the image, which encouraged the viewer's gaze to rest on the exterior of the photograph, rather than to explore its depth and meaning. The synaesthetic overload of these two snapshots, which has been evident in all three media examined by this chapter – book, magazine, and screen – demonstrates *National Geographic's* commodification of these tactile sensations, which increasingly came to overshadow viewers' critical awareness of self-fashioning Brazilian subjects. It is possible that this was a result of *National*

Geographic's reluctance to engage in a sustained way with fashion on an intellectual level, since it understood itself to be an educational and scientific journal, and did not include fashion within that definition. These two snapshots prove the exception to the hypothesis that, since 1988, *National Geographic* has encouraged readers to have an increasingly multisensory and more intimate engagement with Brazilian subjects.

Part Two: Holding up a Mirror to *National Geographic*

The first part of this thesis examined the representation of Brazilian dress and fashion in *National Geographic* since 1906, when the magazine first made contact with Brazil. It understood contact as an embodied, emotional and multisensory experience, which extended beyond distanced, disembodied viewing, and was intricately connected to the dressed bodies of both the Brazilian subject and the *National Geographic* viewer. In all seven snapshots examined, the photographic representation of dress and fashion drew variously on the conventions of ethnography, portraiture, documentary, fashion and cinematography, which mobilised an ambivalent friction between viewer and subject that oscillated between identification and difference. In the period prior to 1988, this dynamic tended towards encouraging the *difference* of Brazilian subjects, even though dress complicated a straightforward reading of images published within the magazine. In the period subsequent to 1988, dress encouraged *identification* with Brazilian subjects, through the haptic visual qualities of the images, which took precedence over the textual narrative of articles. The representation of Brazilian fashion provided the exception to this paradigm shift since 1988; it shifted one step too far, and encouraged viewers to appreciate the haptic visual qualities of images to the extent that superficial surface took precedence over analytical depth, distracting viewers' critical faculties in a hyper-synaesthetic overload. As opposed to encouraging the critical recognition of self-fashioning Brazilian subjects, the medium of fashion prompted viewers to treat them as exotic or fetishised feminine specimens.

The second part of this thesis provides a crucial counterpoint to the first part, and examines the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic Brasil*.³⁷⁷ It covers a shorter time period than the first three chapters, but examines how the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic Brasil* holds up a mirror to, and thereby casts a light upon, the representation of Brazil in *National Geographic*. This thesis is structured as a contact zone, since it brings *National Geographic* into direct dialogue and critique with *National Geographic Brasil*. That the first part is larger and comprised of three chapters, whereas the second part is smaller and encompasses only two chapters, is an intentional tool deployed to highlight structurally the asymmetrical relations of power prevalent within the United States-Brazil contact zone. *National Geographic Brasil* needs to be theorised as an exemplary form of auto-ethnographic expression, a phenomenon that was examined in the previous three chapters through the concepts of anthropophagy, an aesthetics of garbage and the space in-between. To recapitulate, whereas Pratt defined ethnographic texts as ‘those in which European metropolitan subjects represent to themselves their others’, auto-ethnographic expressions are ‘representations that so-defined others construct *in response to* or in dialogue with those texts’.³⁷⁸ She used the term to describe how subordinate subjects, a position embodied here by *National Geographic Brasil*, undertake to re-present their own culture in ways that *engage* with their representation by a dominant culture, exemplified in this instance by *National Geographic*. *National Geographic Brasil* arrived in Brazil in May 2000, when Brazilian

³⁷⁷ *National Geographic Brasil* was the tenth edition of *National Geographic* reproduced in a local language, following the Japanese edition (April 1995), European Spanish edition (October 1997), Latin American Spanish edition (November 1997), Italian edition (February 1998), Hebrew edition (June 1998), Greek edition (October 1998), Polish edition (October 1999), German edition (October 1999) and French edition (October 1999).

³⁷⁸ Pratt, ‘Arts of the Contact Zone’ in *Ways of Reading: An Anthology for Writers*, 5th edn, ed. by David Bartholomae and Anthony Petrofsky (New York: Bedford/St Martins, 1999), pp. 582-96 (p. 589).

media conglomerate, *Editora Abril*, the largest publishing and printing company in Latin America, distributed 20,000 copies of the Portuguese-language edition to newsstands nationwide. This was accompanied with the launch of the *National Geographic Brasil* website (www.ngbrasil.com.br), which advertised subscription services to the magazine.³⁷⁹ Permission was only granted to *Editora Abril* to reproduce *National Geographic Brasil* for profit after William L. Allen, the then editor-in-chief of *National Geographic* (1999-2005), had satisfied himself that the magazine's high-quality printing and publishing techniques could be maintained in Brazil, demonstrating the importance to Allen of the materiality of the global outreach of the magazine.³⁸⁰ The second part of this thesis takes this materiality into equal account as the first part, considering how the Brazilian viewer was encouraged to engage with four snapshots of Brazilian dress re-presented in the magazine. These snapshots are organised chronologically to highlight the development of *National Geographic Brasil* from May 2000 to 2015.

³⁷⁹ Founded in 1950, *Editora Abril* was the first publisher of Walt Disney comics in Brazil. It has since grown exponentially and now publishes books, videos, travel guides, textbooks, music, maps, and magazines. Through a range of titles, which include Brazilian weekly news magazine *Veja*, *Playboy* (Brazilian edition), *Men's Health* (Brazilian edition), *Nova* (Brazilian edition of *Cosmopolitan*), *Estilo de Vida* (Brazilian edition of *In Style*) and *Runner's World* (Brazilian edition), *Editora Abril* has sought to capitalise from potential readers from a diverse range of ages and social classes.

³⁸⁰ *National Geographic Brasil*, as part of the for-profit media conglomerate *Editora Abril*, had an explicit commercial imperative, unlike *National Geographic*, which since its establishment has formed part of the tax-exempt not-for-profit National Geographic Society. The latter was complicated in 1994 with the establishment of the for-profit, tax-paying division of the National Geographic Society, National Geographic Ventures, which included the website, television programmes, books and complete digitalised editions of the magazine published on CD-ROM. Constance L. Hays, 'Seeing Green in a Yellow Border: Quests for Profits is Shaking a Quiet Realm', *New York Times*, 3 August 1997, pp. 12-13.

Chapter 4. Misplaced Ideas: Brazilian dress as reflected in the first ten years of *National Geographic Brasil*

- **Snapshot 8: The Mayongong Man's Rawhide Bag and Cotton Loincloth, July 2000**
- **Snapshot 9: Lourenço Loy's Red and White Bandana and Gold Medallion, February 2001**
- **Snapshot 10: The Japanese-Brazilian Women's Cotton *Yucata* and Wooden *Geta*, June 2008**

In his 1986 essay, 'Brazilian Culture: Nationalism by Elimination', Austrian-born Brazilian literary and cultural critic Roberto Schwarz examined the existential circumstances of being the subordinate and peripheral subject of the asymmetrical relations of power prevalent within the United States-Latin American contact zone:

We Brazilians and other Latin Americans constantly experience the artificial, inauthentic and imitative nature of our cultural life. An essential element in our critical thought since independence, it has been variously interpreted from romantic, naturalist, modernist, right-wing, left-wing, cosmopolitan and nationalist points of view, so we may suppose that the problem is enduring and deeply rooted. Before attempting another explanation, let us assume that this malaise is a fact. Its everyday manifestations range from the inoffensive to the horrifying. Examples of inappropriateness include Father Christmas sporting an Eskimo outfit in a tropical climate and, for traditionalists, the electric guitar in the land of samba.³⁸¹

Schwarz identified a perpetual problem faced by Brazilians, who have repeatedly appropriated intellectual paradigms, cultural forms and fashionable trends from the United States and Europe, regardless of their relevance to local circumstances and national needs. This tendency to import foreign ideologies and institutions has ultimately defined Brazil in terms of fragmentation and lack of fulfilment, reflected in the development and current state of Brazilian culture. These are the key themes of Schwarz's more pessimistic view, certainly in comparison with the positive stances of

³⁸¹ This essay was first published as 'Nacional por subtração' in the Brazilian newspaper *Folha de São Paulo*, 7 June 1986. The first English translation by Linda Briggs was published in *New Left Review*, 167 (1988), 77-90. I refer throughout this chapter to the English translation of Schwarz's collection of essays, *Misplaced Ideas: Essays on Brazilian Culture*, trans. by John Gledson (London: Verso, 1992).

the three scholars examined in the first part of this thesis, of Latin American dependency upon derivative intellectual thought and cultural forms from European and North American capitalist systems. Schwarz criticised the fact that ideas from the so-called centre have arrived in Brazil in quick succession, leaving little time for them to be refashioned and re-interpreted for a domestic audience, before the next innovation arrives. He understood this pacing to be a dynamic of power that has deprived Brazil of the chance to create forms of self-understanding related to its own reality and history; rather, ideas projected from the centre have arrived on the so-called periphery and demanded an imposed receptivity from a Brazilian audience. Schwarz traced the historical and cultural complexities of these inadequacies to post-independence in 1822, when Brazil remained a slave-holding society but employed the dominant liberal ideologies of freedom and modern individuality that were projected from Europe.³⁸² The adoption of modern democratic ideals of autonomy and personal agency, developed in response to an alien socio-cultural set of circumstances, could not be implemented authentically in Brazil, a country whose economic infrastructure was dependent upon slavery, but neither could they be refused. The sartorial example of a fur-trimmed Father Christmas suit worn in tropical Brazil is only a more recent and trivial example of the same phenomenon (see Fig. 5.0., a photograph posted on Facebook on 14 December 2014, by Brazilian Fashion Buyer Deborah Reis, dressed in shorts and sandals).³⁸³

In 2001 Francine Masiello provided a productive metaphor, and one which was appropriate given the increased global exportation since the early 1990s,

³⁸² Schwarz, *Misplaced Ideas*, p. 14.

³⁸³ An even more inappropriate example might be the adoption of fox and minx furs, influenced by Hollywood movies, by upper-class Brazilian women throughout the 1930s, who were required to pay a costly monthly fee to keep the garments refrigerated in the tropical climate. Valentim and Brandao, 'The Position of Brazilian Fashion in a Borderless Place', (para 3 of 5).

facilitated by economic liberalisation, of surplus, secondhand clothing from the Northern hemisphere to Latin America, Africa and Asia, to reassess the problematic development of ideas in Brazilian history that is manifested in Schwarz's 'misplaced ideas':

Despite the fact that Latin American intellectuals insist on the rule of the copy in relation to a European 'original,' the fit is always inadequate; like a set of borrowed clothing, the original is often several sizes too large.³⁸⁴

Masiello pessimistically overruled the subversive and positive qualities of the 'copy' that have been celebrated in much Latin American academic discourse. Instead, she conflated misplaced ideas with inappropriate and ill-fitting, cast-off clothing and ignored its potential to be transformed or customised on arrival in Latin America. In agreement with Schwarz, Masiello rejected the postmodern notion that the copy might constitute a positive means of creative re-presentation, which held the potential to undermine and uproot the supposed dominance of the European or North American original. From the perspective offered by Schwarz and Masiello, the importation of foreign thought and cultural products as misplaced ideas, or a set of ill-fitting borrowed clothing, is central to understanding the cultural, social, political, economic and sartorial history of Brazil.³⁸⁵

On first assessment, the arrival in Brazil in May 2000 of *National Geographic Brasil* might be misunderstood as a striking contemporary example of misplaced ideas, a demonstration of the process of cultural globalisation by which a popular magazine established and developed within the United States has been made appealing and accessible to new audiences in so-called peripheral countries such as Brazil. Unlike

³⁸⁴ Francine Masiello, *The Art of Transition: Latin American Culture and Neoliberal Crisis* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2001), p. 60; B. Lynne Milgram, 'Refashioning Commodities: Women and the Sourcing of Secondhand Clothing in the Philippines', *Anthropologica* 46.2 (2006), 189-202 (p. 193).

³⁸⁵ Schwarz, *Misplaced Ideas*, p. 30; Masiello, *The Art of Transition*, p. 60.

Andrade, Stam and Santiago, Schwarz outlined the painful existential conditions that a diffusionist conception of modernity, as a one-directional flow that travels from the centre to the periphery, or in the instance of *National Geographic*, from Washington DC to Sao Paulo, has created for Brazilians. This pessimistic stance ignored the fact that no culture is static, since ideas are always departing from one context, and being appropriated and applied differently, often in alternative and unpredictable directions, on their arrival in a new one. A closer look at *National Geographic Brasil* reveals that the magazine's wide-ranging and sophisticated production of local material has often complemented, and sometimes even challenged, ideas about Brazil produced by *National Geographic*.

A statement made by Matthew Shirts, the then editor-in-chief of *National Geographic Brasil* (May 2000 - May 2013), a US-born journalist who has lived and worked in Brazil for over thirty-five years, enables the development of the magazine to be understood not merely as a process of growing into a borrowed set of clothes cast off by *National Geographic*, but as a potential means of fashioning a new, distinctively Brazilian ensemble. Shirts articulated the negotiations and re-negotiations that took place with *National Geographic* during the new magazine's first thirteen years of publication:

Our relationship changed dramatically between 1999, when I was first 'trained' by NGM-USA [*National Geographic*] and 2013, when I left the position of Editor-in-chief of NGM-B [*National Geographic Brasil*]. In the beginning they tried to have as much control as possible of the editorial process. It was like night and day. By 2005 or so we were friends working together as a team. They changed dramatically, loosening up, *but by then we had absorbed their methods and gotten better than them at doing what National Geographic does (and on a Brazilian budget)* [my italics].³⁸⁶

³⁸⁶ Matthew Shirts, Personal Communication with Author (8 May – 2 June 2014). Refer to Appendix 6: Email Correspondence.

As Shirts outlined, prior to 2005 local material produced independently by *National Geographic Brasil* was rigorously checked before publication by Amy Kolczak, Head of International Material at *National Geographic*, in Washington DC.³⁸⁷ His description of this relationship as ‘like night and day’ can be understood as a metaphor for the contact zone, in which the opposite poles of the United States and Brazil are posited against one another, and battle it out in a dynamic characterised by asymmetrical relations of power.³⁸⁸ However, after five years of publication, this relationship progressed to become more collaborative, ‘friends working together as a team’.³⁸⁹ Shirts described the process by which *National Geographic Brasil* established itself during its first decade of publication as one in which *National Geographic’s* methods were absorbed and realised, through a variety of creative appropriations, to the extent that it emerged ‘better than them at doing what *National Geographic* does’.³⁹⁰ The implication here is that *National Geographic Brasil’s* lack of financial advantages forced it to be creative and to improvise, which animated local modes of re-presentation, and complicated one-dimensional understandings of the magazine as heavily indebted to *National Geographic*.

Shirts explained how *National Geographic Brasil* selectively adopted aspects of *National Geographic* that were of most interest to Brazilian viewers, transforming the magazine to meet local requirements:

The next step was the production of editorial material of our own: journalism in the style of NGM ... It’s always necessary to adapt a magazine to local taste. But this was harder for us than it was for the Americans. Firstly, they had taken a very universal theme to interpret geography as ‘the world and all there is in it’ [sic]. Secondly, because they are able to invest hundreds of thousands of dollars into the production of a single article ... *We decided we needed to bring*

³⁸⁷ Ibid.

³⁸⁸ Ibid.

³⁸⁹ Ibid.

³⁹⁰ Ibid.

NGB closer to its Brazilian readers, essentially provide the national to the 'national geographic'. Some of the reports from the American edition are of more interest to some readers, less interesting to other readers. We wanted to connect to the Brazilian reader [my italics].³⁹¹

Shirts' statement contained an acceptance that there are *different* world-views. It corresponded with Appadurai's assertion that the world is not a singularly dominated and homogenous structure controlled by the United States, but an intertwined and interactive global system fabricated from 'multiple worlds', each of which is 'constituted by historically situated imaginations of persons and groups spread around the globe'.³⁹² Whereas *National Geographic* was concerned with encapsulating 'the world and all that is in it', to quote Alexander Graham Bell's oft-repeated catchphrase, *National Geographic Brasil* sought to document what lay within, rather than beyond, national borders.³⁹³ This was openly acknowledged by *National Geographic Brasil* Editor (May 2000 -) Ronaldo Ribeiro, who explained the magazine's ethos: 'We are trying to keep the diversity of subjects that feature in NG American, by finding that diversity in Brazilian subjects that feature in NG Brasil'.³⁹⁴ This chapter uses the analysis developed in the previous three chapters to build upon Schwarz's useful metaphor, so that it can be used to encapsulate more adequately the shifting perceptions and increased significance of globalisation in the post-Cold War era, as it has unfolded across world-time and world-space, and established new hierarchies and inequalities.

Schwarz's argument will be re-fashioned in a more positive light, to demonstrate how foreign cultural ideas have been selectively reworked and

³⁹¹ Ibid.

³⁹² Appadurai, *Modernity at Large*, p. 33.

³⁹³ Alexander Graham Bell quoted in Pauly, 'The World and All That is In It', p. 523.

³⁹⁴ Ronaldo Ribeiro and Roberto Sakai, Personal Communication with Author (Abril Headquarters, Sao Paulo, Brazil, 8 May 2014). Refer to Appendix 5: Interviews.

refashioned in a transformative process that is sensitive to the particularities and peculiarities of Brazilian culture. This enables the intricacies and nuances of the processes of cultural exchange that have existed between the United States and Brazil, and Brazil and different cultures that rest within its borders, to be unpicked and analysed. It is useful here to draw on Cuban anthropologist Fernando Ortiz's understanding that foreign cultural ideas are not automatically and inevitably misplaced on arrival in Latin America, but must serve some purpose if they can circulate within a given environment, however different.³⁹⁵ Ortiz engaged with the issue of the peripheral nature of Brazilian culture by drawing attention to the particular and complex processes of cultural transference by which subordinated groups selected and invented from materials imposed upon them by a dominant culture. Rather than revert to binary and essentialist views of 'centres' and 'peripheries', Ortiz coined the neologism 'transculturation' to refer to the highly varied phenomena that he witnessed in many aspects of Latin American life, economic, institutional, artistic, ethical and religious, which had emerged as a result of intricate cultural transmutations throughout the history of Latin America.³⁹⁶ He selected 'transculturation' to replace such terms as 'acculturation' and 'deculturation', which replicated the logic of colonialism since they explained cultural contact from the perspective of the North American and European centre, and he defined it as that which

better expresses the different phases of the transition from one culture to another because this does not consist merely in acquiring another culture [...] but the process also necessarily involves the loss or uprooting of a previous

³⁹⁵ Fernando Ortiz, *Cuban Counterpoint: Tobacco and Sugar* (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1995), pp. 102-03.

³⁹⁶ Ibid.

culture [...] in addition it carries the idea of the consequent creation of new cultural phenomena.³⁹⁷

Ortiz used the term to denominate the transformative processes undergone by a society in the acquisition of foreign cultural material. This entailed both the diminishing of a society's native culture due to the imposition of foreign material, and the synthesis of the indigenous and the foreign to create a new, original cultural product. Reformulated through the lens of Ortiz, foreign cultural products have the potential to be defined not solely in terms of loss, as *misplaced* ideas, but also in terms of movement and relocation, as *displaced* ideas, ripe with the potential to supersede or override those ideas that existed previously. My use of the term *displaced* ideas revises Schwarz's original concept and redefines foreign ideas in terms of their movement throughout time and space, in which they are not stable and fixed homogenous entities, but historically changeable and relative at any given moment.

Before addressing the first snapshot this chapter examines, it is useful to outline who came into contact with *National Geographic Brasil*. Whereas *National Geographic* had a very broad readership, *National Geographic Brasil* had a far narrower circulation. Although it is difficult to ascertain exact figures, since readers may have shared the magazine with family and friends, the average reader was presumed to be male, aged between twenty-four and thirty-four, and to live in the Southeast, the economic heartland of the country that encompasses Rio de Janeiro and Sao Paulo.³⁹⁸ They were classified as social class B, usually comprised of individuals who have completed higher education and are professionally qualified.³⁹⁹ The implicit norm of this audience is that they were European-descended and predominantly

³⁹⁷ Ibid.

³⁹⁸ Ribeiro and Sakai, Personal Communication with Author.

³⁹⁹ Ibid.

white-skinned. This was reinforced by the advertisements that featured within the magazine. An example can be seen in the July 2000 edition, which promoted the importation of Western European and North American lifestyles and goods to Brazil, through products such as cars (Fig. 5.1), Timberland boots (Fig. 5.2) and Nescafe coffee (Fig. 5.3).⁴⁰⁰ These advertisements tended to feature white-skinned male Brazilians, as opposed to those of predominantly indigenous or African descent. They provide a tangible reminder that, just as there was a considerable geographical distance between the *National Geographic* viewer and Brazilian subjects represented in the magazine, so there was also often a significant gulf between the *National Geographic Brasil* viewer and represented Brazilian subjects.

The Representation of Brazil in *National Geographic Brasil* Over A Decade

From May 2000 to April 2010, *National Geographic Brasil* published one hundred and twelve articles on Brazil, initiated and executed by a small team in Sao Paulo with the assistance of a select number of contracted freelance journalists, editors, designers, photographers and writers.⁴⁰¹ Of the one hundred and twelve articles, seven were shortened and paraphrased versions of material that had originally appeared in *National Geographic* during its first hundred years of publication, synthesised and re-presented in different configurations and sizes on the *National Geographic Brasil* page. Eight were direct translations of material that focused on Brazil and was published simultaneously in *National Geographic*. This chapter predominantly focuses on the ninety-seven articles produced independently

⁴⁰⁰ *National Geographic Brasil*, June 2000.

⁴⁰¹ Refer to Appendix 3: The representation of Brazil in *National Geographic Brasil* (May 2000 - April 2010).

by *National Geographic Brasil*, which commenced in December 2000 and continued (almost) every month until May 2010, when the magazine celebrated its tenth birthday. Viewed in their entirety, these articles emphasised the vast size of Brazil and its heterogeneous social, racial and ethnic composition, spanning a broad range of spaces and places throughout the country.⁴⁰²

This chapter extends Schwarz's concept of misplaced ideas to examine the intricacies of global cultural exchange, between both the United States and Brazil, and between Brazil and itself, which were visible in the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic Brasil* from May 2000 to April 2010. It examines three snapshots organised over a period of seven years, using them to draw points of comparison and distinction with *National Geographic*. The first snapshot was written by Brazilian journalist Marina Moraes and published in *National Geographic Brasil* in July 2000.⁴⁰³ It re-presented an article examined in the first chapter of this thesis, which was written and photographed by Albert W. Stevens and published in *National Geographic* in April 1926, and considers the new interpretative potential provided by its discursive re-framing seventy-six years later.⁴⁰⁴ The second snapshot concerned Angolan immigrants living in Rio de Janeiro and was written and photographed by Brazilian photojournalist Ricardo Beliel and published in *National Geographic Brasil* in February 2003.⁴⁰⁵ The

⁴⁰² Refer to Appendix 3 for a map detailing geographical locations of 112 articles that featured Brazil and were published in *National Geographic Brasil*, May 2000 - April 2010.

⁴⁰³ Marina Moraes, 'Grandes Reportagens: a terra é verde. Formigas gigantes, onças à espreita, piranhas, corredeiras, mosquitos, malária. As descobertas e os sustos de uma exoedição de hidroavião à Amazônica em 1924', *National Geographic Brasil*, July 2000, pp. 154-61.

⁴⁰⁴ Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, pp. 353-420.

⁴⁰⁵ Ricardo Beliel, 'Mais Brasil: Angolanos no Rio. Fugitivos da Guerra em seu país, imigrantes de Angola vivem hoje em cunidade no centro velho do Rio de Janeiro – onde, há um século, influências africanas germinaram o samba carioca', *National Geographic Brasil*, February 2003, pp. 114-23.

Beliel is Professor at the *Escola Superior de Propaganda e Marketing* in Sao Paulo, and a contributor to numerous Brazilian newspapers and magazines such as *O Globo*, *Jornal do Brasil*, *O Estado de Sao Paulo*, *Manchete*, *Placar* and *Veja*, in addition to the European and North American publications *Time*, *Christian Science Monitor*, *Bild Zeitung*, *Marie Claire* and *Discovery Magazine*.

third snapshot examined Japanese immigrants living in Sao Paulo and was written and photographed by Brazilian portrait photographer Marcio Scavone and published in June 2008.⁴⁰⁶ This chapter uses displaced ideas as a critical lens through which to examine how cultural ideas from *National Geographic* have been re-framed and re-contextualised in *National Geographic Brasil* since May 2000. It knits together a series of conclusions to the following questions: how has *National Geographic Brasil* used dress to fashion an idea of Brazil through the representation of Brazilian dress? Has the magazine submissively repeated ideas about Brazil that were originally disseminated by *National Geographic*, or has it adapted and re-presented these ideas to address local concerns? To what extent can Brazilian subjects be seen to have *self-fashioned*, and to what extent have they been *fashioned by National Geographic Brasil*? Has a dynamic reconfiguration of relations and consciousness between the United States and Brazil, and Brazil and itself, been mobilised by *National Geographic Brasil*?

A Brazilian Gaze on *National Geographic* in 2000

The first snapshot this chapter discusses was published in *National Geographic Brasil* in July 2000, within an eight-page article produced by Moraes, entitled 'Major Reports: the earth is green. Giant ants, lurking jaguars, piranhas, rapids, mosquitoes, malaria. The findings and scares of an expedition by hydroplane to the Amazon in 1924'.⁴⁰⁷ The article re-contextualised eleven black-and-white

⁴⁰⁶ Marcio Scavone, 'Oriente Próximo: No Bairro da Liberdade em São Paulo, reside o espírito dos 100 anos da imigração japonesa no Brasil' *National Geographic Brasil*, June 2008, pp. 32-47.

Scavone studied Professional Photography at Ealing College in London (1974-6) and is the author of a number of photobooks, which include *E entre a sombra e a luz* (Sao Paulo: DBA, 1997), a series of photographs taken in Sao Paulo, Rio de Janeiro, Paris, London and Lisbon, and *Luz Invisível* (Sao Paulo: DBA, 2002), a collection of photographs taken of Brazilian celebrities, including footballer Pele and architect Oscar Niemeyer, in addition to ordinary Brazilians.

⁴⁰⁷ Moraes, 'Grandes Reportagens: a terra é verde'.

photographs, carefully selected from the eight-six originals that had been taken by Albert W. Stevens and published in the sixty-eight-page initial version of the article, which appeared in *National Geographic* in April 1926. I examined this article to contextualise the first snapshot analysed in Chapter One of this thesis.⁴⁰⁸ An image that was initially published in *National Geographic* (Fig. 5.4), but subsequently re-used seventy-four years later by *National Geographic Brasil* (Fig. 5.5), enables Schwarz's pessimistic view of the relation between the copy and the original to be re-conceptualised as *displaced* rather than *misplaced* ideas.

Printed in *National Geographic* in April 1926, the image was originally published on the left-hand side of a single-page spread (Fig. 5.6). It documented a male member of the Mayongong population (indigenous to the state of Roraima in Northern Brazil, close to the Venezuelan border).⁴⁰⁹ The background is a grey and white blur that focuses the viewers' attention on the man's clothed body, which is placed as an object of curiosity. The subject has bobbed dark hair and wears a cotton genital covering arranged under the crotch and around the hips in the shape of a T. He carries a leather bag across his shoulder, and the tops of his arms are tied tightly with scraps of coloured material. Positioned just off-centre in the frame, and gazing directly to his right, engrossed in something or someone beyond the photographic frame, his arms are crossed defensively against his bare chest. This self-possessed gesture might be read as one of subtle subversion to the ethnographic gaze that surveys him. This image had to be turned clockwise by the viewer, in order to be perceived in its correct

⁴⁰⁸ Albert W. Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', *National Geographic*, April 1926, pp. 353-420.

⁴⁰⁹ James Stuart Olson, *The Indians of Central and South America: An Ethnohistorical Dictionary* (Westport, Greenwood, 1991), p. 236.

portrait dimension (Fig. 5.7).⁴¹⁰ This embodied action brought the photograph into uninterrupted dialogue with an image of a woman, printed in exactly the same portrait dimensions on the left-hand side of the page, and a full-page landscape photograph of a woman and child sleeping in a hammock that was published on the opposite page. It rendered the image an active as opposed to passive object, which gained meaning specifically when navigated by a physical movement of the viewer's hands, who had to simultaneously pull the textured, matte pages of the magazine apart at the seams in order to view the man in his entirety, and to read the accompanying caption.

The caption to the image read: 'YOUNG MEDICINE MAN OF THE MAYONGONG TRIBE: His rawhide bag contains pebbles, roots and *a miscellaneous collection of rubbish* with which he works his healing magic upon the credulous [my italics].'⁴¹¹ The contradictory caption was both a pervasive reinforcement of the subject's titillating objectification for the benefit of the distanced *National Geographic* viewer, which refused to understand the practices and lived experiences of the Mayongong population within the boundaries of Western civilisation, *and* a subversive illumination of the symbolic meaning of the Portuguese word *gambiarra*. This term carries a strong cultural and conceptual weight in Brazil, and was introduced in the analysis of the first snapshot (Fig. 5.8) this thesis examined. To recapitulate, whilst *gambiarra* has no English translation, as Ricardo Rosas has succinctly articulated, it is 'akin to the English term *makeshift*, referring to any improvisation of an expedient substitute when other means fail or are not available. In other words, "making do."⁴¹² Within the context of *National Geographic*, *gambiarra* was exemplified by the subject's makeshift adaptation and improvised recycling of 'a miscellaneous collection

⁴¹⁰ Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', pp. 398-99.

⁴¹¹ Ibid., p. 398.

⁴¹² Rosas, 'The Gambiarra', pp. 343-44.

of rubbish' in order to assemble a set of tools from whatever is at hand, which ultimately served a different purpose through their modification, and enabled him to work 'his healing magic upon the credulous'.⁴¹³ The caption both represented the subject as farcical and de-constructed his reductive objectification by highlighting the sustainability and inventiveness of his creative and practical endeavour. It is in this respect that *gambiarra* can be likened to Lévi-Strauss' concept of '*bricolage*', wherein the '*bricoleur*' performs his tasks with fragmentary, ready-made materials and tools that are close at hand, and despite the absence of a preconceived plan, through instrumental assemblage exceeds the boundaries imposed upon him, in this particular example, by *National Geographic's* ethnographic gaze.⁴¹⁴

Snapshot 8: The Mayongong Man's Rawhide Bag and Cotton Loincloth

The redemptive quality inherent in the re-framing of this image seventy-four years later by *National Geographic Brasil* in July 2000 must be understood in itself as an act of bricolage, which built upon, but also camouflaged, the characteristics of assemblage evident within the confines of the image. Brazil's historical past, previously buried in *National Geographic's* photographic archive and *National Geographic* viewers' personal magazine collections, was re-inscribed in the contemporary Brazilian present, where it was retrospectively invested with prospective new meanings. The image was enlarged, cropped along its left-hand side, and re-framed to place the subject in the centre of the image, surrounded by a thin black border and positioned in the centre of the white magazine page.⁴¹⁵ This re-presentation focused the attention

⁴¹³ Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', p. 398.

⁴¹⁴ Claude Lévi-Strauss, *The Savage Mind* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1962).

⁴¹⁵ Moraes, 'Grandes Reportagens: a terra é verde', p. 157.

of the viewer on the subject, and encouraged her to experience the image meditatively within the conventions of portraiture, which in capturing a likeness probes the inner essence of an individual, as opposed to ethnography. The softly layered textures and varying tones of light and dark within the image further encouraged the viewer to take into consideration the subject's point of view, his expressions, feelings, sensations and gestures being given a heightened importance that worked to strike an emotional chord. The colour tone of the image was adjusted to give it a sepia tint, which consciously invested romanticising overtones and gave the subject an air of wisdom. This editorial decision enhanced the archival qualities of the image as a reflection of a time that had passed; it also reiterated, to the astute viewer, that this was a colonial document discursively re-framed within the postcolonial present. There is an overriding sense that *National Geographic Brasil* sought to reclaim *National Geographic's* distanced, ethnographic gaze and replace it with a more intimate Brazilian gaze, which catalysed remembrance by re-claiming Brazilian history on its own terms and memorialised the subject as an idealised Noble Savage.

However, as the photograph was placed on the page in portrait dimensions, the *National Geographic Brasil* viewer did not *need* to turn the magazine page clockwise, but could straightforwardly observe the image as it was. The image as re-presented in the glossy pages of *National Geographic Brasil* therefore demanded a less bodily engaged mode of viewing than it had done in *National Geographic* and, potentially, encouraged a more distanced relation to the subject. Distance was reinforced by the caption that accompanied this image in *National Geographic Brasil* which, rather than emphasising and building upon the subject's creative demonstration of *gambiarra*, blindly questioned: 'Why does he tie his arms so tight?

Many questions remain unanswered. Researchers described the Indians as surprisingly clean, and carefree in differentiating men and women in dress or haircut.⁴¹⁶ The caption scrutinised the subject with a comparable curiosity to that of *National Geographic*'s visual ethnographic gaze, and highlighted the Brazilian viewer's estrangement from the subject's lived experience. Dress here became the focus of difference, which smoothed over the subtleties that distinguished male and female dress practices amongst the Mayongong. The caption camouflaged the complexities of Mayongong society and, rather than attempting to provide a richer understanding of their material culture using contemporary ethnographic research, emphasised instead what was still not known about them. In this respect, the textual accompaniment to the image corresponded with contemporary government policy, implemented in 1997 by Brazilian president Fernando Henrique Cardoso (1 January 1995 – 1 January 2003), which ignored indigenous concerns and enabled the private interests of land developers, miners and loggers to stake a claim to over fifty percent of all indigenous land in Brazil, frequently with destructive consequences for the ecology and livelihood of indigenous peoples.⁴¹⁷

Whilst *National Geographic Brasil* re-framed this image in ostensibly more intimate visual terms than *National Geographic*, its caption ignored a crucial aspect of the interpretation of the man's creative and practical practice of *gambiarra*, which is likely to have been recognisable to the Brazilian viewer. In doing so, it was exemplary of *displaced* as opposed to *misplaced* ideas, since it intentionally, as opposed to inevitably, as Schwarz may have pessimistically concluded, relinquished the image's

⁴¹⁶ Moraes, 'Grandes Reportagens: a terra é verde', p. 157; See Appendix 8 for a full English translation of this article.

⁴¹⁷ *Introduction to Politics of the Developing World*, ed. by Mark Kesselman (Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin, 2004), p. 247.

ostensibly distanced *visual* ethnographic significations, but used *text* to replace them. This action established a new asymmetrical dynamic of power, no longer between the United States and Brazil, but between Brazil and itself, which worked to camouflage the subject's performance of *gambiarra*, and accentuated instead the differences between the 'civilised' Brazilian viewer, and the good-natured but purportedly 'uncivilised' indigenous subject. The re-framed photograph became a sentimentalised and prosaic image of the Noble Savage, which reclaimed the indigenous subject in more familiar and sentimental terms than *National Geographic*, but also re-fashioned him textually as a passive as opposed to active construct, whose sartorial practices still remained an insignificant mystery to most urban male Brazilians.

A Documentary Gaze on Angolan Brazilians in 2003

The second snapshot this chapter discusses was published in *National Geographic Brasil* in February 2003, within an article entitled 'Little Africa: Living in a community in Rio de Janeiro, people from Angola recreate the environment where samba and carnival were born'.⁴¹⁸ Unlike the first snapshot examined, rather than being a re-presentation of material that had originally been published in *National Geographic*, it was produced independently by *National Geographic Brasil*, but was still checked prior to publication by *National Geographic*. The twenty-page article documented Angolan immigrants living in an area of Rio de Janeiro identified as 'Little Africa' because of its high concentration of Afro-Brazilians, who in the late nineteenth century had begun to inhabit the zone in Downtown Rio de Janeiro between the Port

⁴¹⁸ Beliel, 'Mais Brasil: Angolanos no Rio'.

and Praça Onze.⁴¹⁹ Beliel fabricated a palimpsestic connection between Little Africa's pan-African past, and its diverse Angolan present, and sought to examine how new cultural practices witnessed in the area were enriching and re-inscribing more established Afro-Brazilian cultural expressions. He explained his intentions for the article:

In the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century the area between the docks and the neighborhoods of Health, Santo Cristo, Gamboa, and New Town Plaza XI was inhabited by slaves and descendants of slaves and an African culture developed there with samba, capoeira, and candomblé. At that time the area was known as Little Africa. Many African immigrants living in this area today do not even know the historical coincidence that they are sharing the same geographic space that other Africans had inhabited a century past. I made the decision to give a direct approach, and make a cultural, historical, social and political comparison between nineteenth century Africa and the Angolans living there in the present.⁴²⁰

Beliel was clearly sensitive to the depth and complexities of lived experiences in Angola, which received independence from Portuguese colonial rule in 1975, over one hundred and fifty years subsequent to Brazilian independence in 1822, but descended into a turbulent Civil War that continued, interspersed with fragmented periods of peace, until 2002.⁴²¹ As he explained:

In the case of Angola I have known the country a long time. I went there the first time covering the war in 1996 and then returned, often reporting on cultural and social issues. In Rio, at the time I wrote this material for National

⁴¹⁹ The name 'Little Africa' is attributed to Brazilian composer and painter Heitor dos Prazeres (1898-1966), who lived near Praça Onze.

Bruno Carvalho provides an interesting analysis of the area during the first decades of the twentieth century, when 'Little Africa' constituted the uncivilised Other area of Rio de Janeiro, a point of contrast to the beautiful, modernising South Zone. See 'Beyond the Belle Epoque: On the Border of a "Divided City", *Porous City: A Cultural History of Rio de Janeiro* (Liverpool: University Press, 2013), pp. 74-103.

⁴²⁰ Ricardo Beliel, Personal Communication with Author (11 April – 12 May 2014). Refer to Appendix 6: Email Correspondence.

⁴²¹ Although the Angolan Civil War was fuelled by military rivalry between the Popular Movement for the Liberation of Angola (MPLA) and the National Union for the Total Independence of Angola (UNITA), two former liberation movements who were in conflict following the decolonisation of Angola, fighting was propelled by internal and external circumstances that stemmed from Cold War dynamics between the USA and USSR. Whilst the conditions of the Angolan Civil War are still subject to debate and reflection, a comprehensive introduction that addresses the complexities of Lusophone Africa within the postcolonial, global era can be found in Fernando Arena, *Lusophone Africa: Beyond Independence* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2011).

Geographic Brasil, I knew very well several Angolan immigrants or students living in Brazil. When I thought about doing this job it was because I had a lot of information and access to the environment of this community.⁴²²

Despite Beliel's awareness of the problems that had been encouraging Angolan refugees to emigrate to Brazil since 1975, a problematic interweaving of past and present permeated his article, through repeated allusions to a collective African past allegedly inscribed in the activities of present-day Angolans, and the environment in which they lived. He observed that Angolans 'have in their blood the heritage of a continent which they know only to be on the other side of the ocean'.⁴²³ Such ambiguous comments contributed to an imaginary idea of a singular and culturally monolithic entity termed Africa, to which Angolans are intimately connected by virtue of having been born in the same landmass, which oversimplified the continent's diverse peoples, cultures and histories. Beliel noted that 'preserving their culture is a law among immigrants' who 'recreate the environment where samba and carnival were born'.⁴²⁴ Similar observations woven into the fabric of the article placed Angolan subjects within a fixed and traditional past, concerned only with safeguarding stereotypical Afro-Brazilian cultural expressions, and disregarded their ability to exercise choice and discretion in incorporating new ideas from contemporary global culture.

Nevertheless, interlaced within this dominant textual narrative, was a revealing subtext (manifest in the text and imagery), which focused on young male Angolans, who re-elaborated and re-negotiated global hip-hop culture through clothing, style, body language and gesture. This subnarrative moved *beyond* the potentially

⁴²² Beliel, Personal Communication with Author.

⁴²³ Beliel, 'Mais Brasil: Angolanos no Rio', p. 116. Refer to Appendix 8: Translated Articles.

⁴²⁴ Ibid., p. 114.

objectifying and mystifying textual descriptions that conflated Angola with the African continent in its entirety and blurred distinctions between the colonial past and postcolonial present. Instead, Beliel used hip-hop to highlight the multidirectional flows of globalisation that have enabled young Angolan rappers to self-fashion their diasporic identities in-between the U.S., Brazil and Angola. He outlined the sartorial subtleties of Angolan identification with hip-hop in Brazil, which has adapted ubiquitous global clothing (sneakers) to local tastes (in terms of colour):

It is not hard to realise the Angolan presence among the crowd in Lapa neighbourhood. Style makes the difference. Ignoring all economic issues, the immigrants wear a combination of foreign labels with an African touch. For them to be well 'labeled', as they call it, they will spend 500RS in shining sneakers in Angolan colours – red and black.⁴²⁵

Beliel carefully explained the oppression that Angolans had encountered in Angola, but also the marginalisation and subordination they have been subject to since their arrival in Brazil, where the history of colonial repression reverberated in contemporary Afro-Brazilian experiences. He quoted an Angolan rapper named Big Mani, who left Angola to escape enforced military conscription, reintroduced by the Angolan government in 1993: "'Here there's a lot of prejudice towards Africans. They still think we are slaves and I've been asked if I came to Brazil while riding a horse'".⁴²⁶ This important contextual background enabled Angolan immigrants' engagements with hip-hop to be seen, not as derivative and trivial in relation to U.S. hip-hop, but as a means of individual self-expression to fashion and perform political views against the repressive measures of the Angolan government, but also against a racially intolerant Brazilian society. Rather than the adoption of hip-hop in Brazil being exemplary of misplaced ideas, its appropriation and re-definition by young Angolan men to address contemporary diasporic struggles was a tangible demonstration of *displaced* ideas.

⁴²⁵ Ibid., p. 122.

⁴²⁶ Ibid., p. 123. Refer to Appendix 8: Translated Articles

Snapshot 9: Lourenço Loy's Red and White Bandana and Gold Medallion

Of the nine brightly coloured photographs that accompanied the article, one particular snapshot stood out for its multilayered qualities and startling ability to provide a dynamic space of agency for the male subject to fashion his global hip-hop identity through dress and gesture. It was a portrait of an athletic and muscular young black rapper named Lourenço Loy (Fig. 5.9).⁴²⁷ He is captured posing on the right-hand side of a single-page spread, opposite a half-page block of text that rests above a candid half-page photograph of two older Angolan leaders, Muada Feliz and Maitre Boa, who lead a ceremony in a Kibanguista Church in Rio de Janeiro, native to the Bakongo community. There is an immediate visual distinction between the bright contrasts and colourful juxtapositions of red, yellow and green that frame Lourenço Loy outside in the photograph on the right, and the more sombre pale yellows and white that frame the two figures inside on the left. This distinction is reinforced through the clothing choices of represented subjects; unlike the photograph on the left, dress dominates the image of Lourenço Loy, who appears comfortable with the prospect of being seen.

The caption directed the viewer's attention towards dress as the central point of reference for an interpretation of the image: 'The clothing of Lourenço Loy, a rapper, shows the vanity of Angolan youth.'⁴²⁸ Whilst vanity is a derogatory choice of word, suggesting the subject has a narcissistic preoccupation with his own mirror image, it also pointed out that it is a conscious decision of the subject to dress like this, the subject having carefully chosen the terms on which he presents himself to the photographer's gaze. In highlighting that this 'vanity' is prevalent amongst Angolan

⁴²⁷ Ibid., p. 117.

⁴²⁸ Ibid.

youth, the caption also articulated an opposition to the older men on the left-hand side of the double-page view, who may have been associated with more conventional Angolan culture and captured seemingly unaware of their own actions, and foregrounds instead a sense of becoming through youth fashions and self-presentation. The subject wears oversized baggy grey trousers, a red and white printed bandana that pushes back his braided hair, a white Nike sweatband on his right wrist, shiny tinted sunglasses, silver rings, a diamante stud in his right ear, a large watch and a heavy gold chain. The chain occupies the centre of the frame and has a pendant hung on the end that reads 'Death Row Records'. The pendant has the emblem of the American record company 'Death Row Records' that was founded in 1991 and was famous for signing numerous West Coast hip-hop artists such as African-American rapper Tupac Shakur, who wore a solid gold, diamond-encrusted version.⁴²⁹ Lourenço Loy's clothing shows that he is influenced by the male bravado of U.S. hip-hop style, and he emulates the popular gestures. Crouched down low, the creases and folds of his baggy denim jeans are emphasised. His body language is confident and he glances askance, looking up and outside of the frame with a sense of self-possession. He wears no shirt and the upper parts of his arms are highlighted to exaggerate his muscular physique. Shot from a low angle, the subject conveys strength. His carefully positioned hand gestures, with the wrists bent slightly forward, render the hands larger and more expressive to the camera. They give a sense of the subject as an exhibitor of his own actions through dress and body language.

Whilst his dress and body language identify him with African-American popular culture, there are visual and textual cues within the image that reference local

⁴²⁹ Ronin Ro, *Have Gun Will Travel: The Spectacular Rise and Violent Fall of Death Row Records* (New York: Doubleday, 1998).

Brazilian and Angolan cultural markers, and suggest that his style is not simply an inferior and misplaced imitation of African-American hip-hop. Rather than being placed in a homogenous and unidentifiable environment, Lourenço Loy is photographed sitting on stone steps that lead up to the bright exterior façade of a yellow, green, black and red colonial-style house built by the Portuguese. The house is decorated in blocks of Pan-African colours that also make up the colours of the Angolan national flag and its Brazilian counterpart. These contextual details firmly situate his processes of self-fashioning within Brazilian and Angolan, as opposed to U.S., interests, and demonstrate how fashion has been adapted to local concerns. As Carol M. Rotley and Geraldine Rosa Henderson have pointed out, whilst many 'global hip-hop sub segments take cues from African-American hip-hop, they also imbue it with an inventiveness and creativity so that it becomes uniquely theirs, and represents their pains, struggles and political issues'.⁴³⁰

Yet the layout of this brightly coloured image on the double-page magazine spread complicated the political messages that were encoded within the subject's performance of hip-hop through dress and gesture. It risked placing the subject as a hyperbolic expression of black Otherness, advertised for aesthetic appropriation by a distanced, white-skinned *National Geographic Brasil* viewer. Presented straightforwardly on the page, as though on a stage or screen, Loy is the male protagonist of a drama being narrated, and viewers watch him perform his starring role, where he is given space for self-presentation and self-expression. The extreme

⁴³⁰ Carol M. Motley and Geraldine Rosa Henderson, 'The Global Hip-Hop Diaspora: Understanding the Culture', *Journal of Business Research*, 61 (2008), 243-53 (p. 246).

Although not referring explicitly to Angolan immigrants' identification with hip-hop, Derek Pardue provides an informative ethnographic study of Brazilian hip-hop, predominantly as it has emerged and developed on the periphery of Sao Paulo in recent years. He has pointed out how Brazilian hip-hoppers 'borrow and recast hip-hop signs they associated with the U.S.' through a process of cultural appropriation and negotiation. Derek Pardue, *Ideologies of Marginality in Brazilian Hip-Hop: Retelling Marginality through Music* (London: Palgrave MacMillan, 2008), p. 6.

close-up and dominant position of Lourenço Loy on the magazine page placed him too close for the viewer *not* to experience an intimate engagement with him, yet the terms of that involvement were contradictory and ambiguous. In her discussion of film, which is useful when analysing photography and its sequential layout in magazines, Jennifer M. Barker has written of how ‘this sense of fleshy, muscular, visceral contact seriously undermines the opposition between the viewer and the film, inviting us to think of them as intimately related but not identical, caught up in a relationship of intersubjectivity and co-constitution, rather than as subject and object posited on opposite sides of the screen.’⁴³¹ In this photographic example, however, the subject looks beyond the photograph frame, and refuses to engage with his audience, which engenders an uneasiness, and frustrates a physical or emotional intersubjectivity between viewer and subject through the pages of the magazine. There is an array of textures centred on dress and the body within the image, from rough denim jeans, smooth skin, gleaming plastic sunglasses, soft cotton bandana, to shiny gold medallion, all of which emphasise surface over depth. While the profoundly tactile quality of the image ostensibly brings the viewer closer to the subject, and encourages, as Barker has articulated, ‘a caressing touch rather than a penetrating gaze’, the bright blocks of saturated colour and the subject’s black skin add a rhythmic and emotional dimension that encourages a loud, synaesthetic response, and threatens to override the viewer’s deeper understanding of the sociopolitical purpose of hip-hop for Angolan immigrants living in Rio de Janeiro.⁴³² It is in this vein that the photograph is comparable to images of non-Western subjects re-framed in *National Geographic Fashion*, examined in the previous chapter, which demonstrated a tendency to focus on their exotic spectacle as

⁴³¹ Jennifer M. Barker, *The Tactile Eye: Touch and the Cinematic Experience* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2009), pp. 12-13.

⁴³² Barker, *The Tactile Eye*, p. 24.

opposed to acknowledging critically the individual processes of self-fashioning. Kobena Mercer has employed the term 'hyperblackness' to describe the paradoxical condition of black cultural expressions such as hip-hop which, as a highly visual form of global branding marked by rhetorical excess and exaggeration, often divorces black culture from its political aspirations, particularly when viewed by white-skinned viewers/consumers.⁴³³ Hyperblackness was apparent, not solely in this particular image, but in nearly all of the images reproduced within the *National Geographic Brasil* article, each of which had a lyrical quality and a rhythmic dimension, fabricated by the bright colours and tactile textures that framed the black male (and female) subjects. Whilst this dialectic between figure, form and colourful environment could be read as a celebration of blackness, the images' referential capacities were drastically undermined when viewed in comparison to the advertisements reproduced elsewhere within the same edition of the magazine, which presented only white Brazilians in aspirational scenarios.

Beliel has explained the photographic approach he adopted for this article:

Many of the photos are spontaneous situations that naturally happened, I've never created an artificial situation to photograph, what I do is journalism, but I can ask the person being photographed to remain in a place or a direction, in order to look to the value of the final image [...] A picture of someone always has the cooperation of the person being photographed. It is impossible to remain indifferent and be photographed. Everyone is somehow expressed through being photographed.⁴³⁴

His initial description of the process by which he documented his subjects rested firmly within the confines of reportage and connoted spontaneity, neutrality on the part of

⁴³³ Kobena Mercer, 'Diaspora Aesthetics and Visual Culture' in *Black Cultural Traffic: Crossroads in Global Performance and Popular Culture*, ed. by Harry J. Elam, Jr. and Kennell Jackson (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 2005), pp. 141-61 (p. 160).

⁴³⁴ Beliel, Personal Communication with Author.

the photographer, truthfulness and objectivity. Yet, in apparent opposition, Beliel then acknowledged that he might direct the subject 'to remain in a place or direction', and that every photograph is collaborative to some extent, since the subject is always responsive to the photographer's gaze, and thereby has a degree of agency in self-presentation before his camera. This description of his working methods highlighted a similar contradiction to Stanmeyer, who was quoted in the previous chapter. Stanmeyer's working methods oscillated between transparently objective, evident in his assertion that 'this is reportage photography. It is naturally happening – no poses or styling done', and openly fictitious, apparent in his acknowledgement that capturing a photograph was 'like working a pottery wheel, constantly molding the clay until the narrative takes shape and form'.⁴³⁵ Both Beliel and Stanmeyer defined their photojournalistic approaches in opposition to, or possibly even beyond, simplistic oppositions between fact and fiction. Their comments bear witness to the instability of reportage photography, and suggest a contemporary shift towards acknowledging its decidedly subjective status, even as its objectivity is simultaneously reasserted. T. J. Demos has pointed out that it has become 'common, even fashionable, to announce subjective biases, or to argue for the impossibility of documentary representation tout court, due to its historically discredited status'.⁴³⁶ Demos articulated a desire to suspend disbelief, to assert that reportage is objective, even as this proclamation is forcibly rejected by the widespread and cross-cultural inclination to highlight the creative fabrication of an image by the artistic mastery of the *photographer* (particularly in the case of Stanmeyer, who adopts a more authoritarian approach), but

⁴³⁵ Stanmeyer, Personal Communication with Author.

⁴³⁶ T. J. Demos, *The Migrant Image: The Art and Politics of Documentary during Global Crisis* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2013), p. 36.

often also in collaboration with his *subjects* (in the more cooperative example of Beliel).

Rather like Beliel's description of his working methods, the second snapshot this chapter examined was indeterminate. Whilst Angolan hip-hop fashions worn in Brazil were a displaced re-interpretation of United States mainstream hip-hop culture, adapted and localised to highlight the poverty and racial inequality experienced by Angolans living on the social margins of Rio de Janeiro, their representation by *National Geographic Brasil* presented a carnivalesque spectacle of black Otherness, which was advertised for aesthetic appropriation by a distanced white viewer. It hinted that the visual and tactile gaze of the *National Geographic Brasil* viewer in relation to the Angolan subject was imbued with uneven relations of power; whereas this dynamic had previously been between *National Geographic* and Brazilian subjects, power had been mobilised and exchanged, and was now in operation between *National Geographic Brasil* and Angolans living in Brazil. This snapshot encapsulated displaced ideas to the extent that it highlighted the additional hierarchies prevalent *within* the Portuguese colonies, and contributed to an overriding impression that a new contact zone had emerged, no longer between the United States and Brazil, but between Brazil and Angolan immigrants within its borders.

A Portraiture Gaze on Japanese Brazilians in 2008

The third snapshot this chapter examines was published in *National Geographic Brasil* in June 2008, within an article entitled 'Near East: In Liberdade in São Paulo, the

spirit of 100 years of Japanese immigration to Brazil resides.⁴³⁷ Like Beliel's article, it examined an area of Sao Paulo named 'Liberdade' ('Freedom') in 1920, which has been home to the largest Japanese expatriate community in the world since 1912. Scavone explained that the article was published 'to celebrate 100 years of Japanese presence in Brazil', since the first Japanese immigrants arrived in Santos, state of Sao Paulo, on the *Kasato Maru* ship in June 1908.⁴³⁸ The reductive title, 'Near East', drew upon North American and Western European ideas of an exotic Orient. It placed Liberdade as a synecdoche for Japan, which was extendable, through the deliberate and nebulous use of the geographically indistinct term 'the East', to the Orient in its entirety, substituting a part for a whole inasmuch as Beliel's article narrated a culturally distinct area of Rio de Janeiro as a synecdoche for Africa at large.

Scavone's text had a more meditative quality than Beliel's in the way that it lyrically interlaced past and present through affective descriptions, which recalled his own captivating and subjective memories of Liberdade on first visiting the area in the early 1970s, accompanied by his father, for whom 'the magic of the Japanese district had long ago captured his imagination as a writer'.⁴³⁹ Scavone re-presented Liberdade less as a geographically distinct zone as an idealised realm for imagination, desire and nostalgia, where both the Japanese expatriate and the Brazilian observer might hope to retrieve and reignite a memory of a past Japanese presence unavailable in the present. Scavone described how the architecture and urban environment of Liberdade have 'an amber colour that is loaded with nostalgia', which in autumnal light made it

⁴³⁷ Scavone, 'Near East'.

⁴³⁸ Marcio Scavone, Personal Communication with Author (22 November 2014 – 6 January 2015). Refer to Appendix 6: Email Correspondence.

⁴³⁹ Scavone, 'Near East', p. 45.

appear 'even more original, more real, and closer to its Eastern descent'.⁴⁴⁰ Such romanticised descriptions evoked an image of a faded old sepia-tinted photograph, rather like the visual trope used in *National Geographic Brasil* in the first snapshot examined, where time and space were intricately interwoven through the physical disintegration of the material object, which was made to symbolise a bygone era. Scavone described how in contemporary Liberdade 'everything seems to blur, waiting for a mysterious order to return to what it once was'.⁴⁴¹ Such nostalgic longings for a more 'authentic' but past Liberdade of the 1960s and 1970s permeated his writing, a period he deemed to be of 'strength and cultural autonomy', but was irretrievably lost in the present, since the area 'grew up and was swallowed by the metropolis ... dissolved in the ethnic melting pot of neighboring areas'.⁴⁴²

These sensual textual descriptions were reinforced by the accompanying images. The ten photographs published within the sixteen-page article employed a shallow depth of field, a technique often used in portraiture, which rendered many of the buildings, figures and faces documented slightly blurred (see for example Figs. 5.10 and 5.11). Whilst this photographic decision evoked a nostalgic mood that connected to the whimsical descriptions of the text, it also established a boundary, rather like a diaphanous veil, between the subject and the viewer, which obscured the viewer's direct entrance into the setting and characters of the scene, and frustrated an immediate identification, and emotional connection, with represented Japanese-Brazilian subjects.

⁴⁴⁰ Ibid.

⁴⁴¹ Ibid.

⁴⁴² Ibid. p. 46.

Snapshot 10: The Japanese-Brazilian Women's Cotton *Yukata* and Wooden *Geta*

A particular example can be seen in the final snapshot this chapter examines, which was reproduced on a double-page spread (Fig 5.12).⁴⁴³ Spread horizontally across the page, it captured thirteen women of Japanese-Brazilian descent in an interior setting, lined up in a row to face the gaze of Scavone's camera, and that of the *National Geographic Brasil* viewer. The women are photographed stationary and subject to a level of scrutiny as they stand up straight, dressed in the *yukata*, an informal and more comfortable unlined version of the *kimono*, which is constructed from a lightweight, printed cotton fabric. The creases and folds of their clothing are captured in crisp detail by Scavone's camera. Decorated with a boldly printed graphic pattern that stretches from dark blue around the bottom to pale purple at the top, the texture of the women's *yukata* contrasts with the blur of polished wooden floor in the foreground of the image. A bright red *obi*, silk sash, is worn high up and tied tight behind the subjects' waists. It is crisply photographed to highlight the delicately patterned polka dots imprinted upon the cloth. The women wear *geta*, Japanese footwear with a long cultural heritage, which are constructed from wood and a soft thonged piece of cloth or leather. An example of a *yukata* and *geta* can be seen in Figs. 5.13 and 5.14, taken in a shop on Rua Galvão Bueno, in Liberdade, Sao Paulo in 2014. When wearing *geta*, the foot sits lightly on the wooden base of the shoe, not pushed entirely into the fork of the thong, which requires a slight forward tilt from the wearer, particularly when walking. Even though the women are captured stationary, Scavone's

⁴⁴³ Ibid., pp. 44-45.

camera angle emphasises this forward tilt created by the *geta* in action, so that the women appear ready to topple forward towards the viewer.

The women's different facial features counteract the homogeneity of their dress, which assumes a superficial veneer of anonymity associated with any form of uniform. Not all of the subjects' faces can be seen, as a result of the harsh cropping and full-page bleed of the photograph, which came from a much larger print (Fig. 5.15). That we cannot see all of the individual faces discourages identification with the subjects on the part of the viewer, who surveys the women but is unable to get close to them, and is instead captivated by the range of tactile surface textures evoked by the blurred shallow depth of field and the contrast between smooth wood and crisp cotton. Those faces that are captured present a mixture of expressions, from forced smiles to apparent indifference. None of the subjects look at the camera, nor at one another, except for the subject on the far left who gazes warily in the direction of the photographer, possibly enacting a covert form of resistance to her documentation. That all of the women except for one clutch their hands across their bodies and in front of their crotches draws attention to the wide sleeves of their *yukata* but also accentuates their femininity; as Scavone later acknowledged, 'for me this photograph is all about the expressions of the girls being transferred to their hands and feet'.⁴⁴⁴

The photograph was taken during a beauty contest held during the *Tanabata Matsuri* festival that takes place in Japan and Sao Paulo in the first weekend of July. The caption that accompanied the photograph acknowledged this and read: 'MISS TANABATA CONTEST happens at the Association headquarters Miyagui Kenjinkail. In 2008 the 30th edition will be held. The candidates, who come from all over the state of

⁴⁴⁴ Scavone, Personal Communication with Author.

São Paulo, are wearing the yukata, a lighter costume kimono, which is compatible with the climate of Brazil. Clothing is a good symbol of the Japanese Brazilian neighborhoods.⁴⁴⁵ The caption staged an ambivalence; it both highlighted how a traditional mode of Japanese female dress has been reinvented and acclimatised for local wear in Brazil, but it also used clothing as a symbol of ethnic and cultural *difference*. On the one hand, the *yukata* is a form of dress that is exemplary of *displaced* ideas and has enabled Japanese-Brazilian subjects to self-fashion and self-present by affirming their cross-cultural identities in-between Japan and Brazil.⁴⁴⁶ The caption highlighted that this mode of ethnic dress was not static but had been fluidly refashioned for compatibility with its local context. It acknowledged that the photograph had been taken on a ceremonial occasion, which reiterated that it is unlikely to have been worn by these women on a daily basis, but has been used to revive and reignite a more traditional and feminine Japanese identity for a specific purpose. Yet simultaneously, the *yukata* provided a sartorial focus to mobilise the distance and difference of the female subjects in relation to the predominantly male *National Geographic Brasil* viewer. That the women are documented inside gives a sense of feminine domesticity, which contrasted with the tough masculinity evoked by the representation of Lourenço Loy in the previous snapshot examined. The caption encourages a quasi-ethnographic surveillance of the women, rather like the caption in the first snapshot examined, and asserted the distinctiveness of their dress whilst remarking that it was culturally specific to Japanese Brazilians, rather than a reflection

⁴⁴⁵ Scavone, 'Near East', pp. 44-45.

⁴⁴⁶ The following studies provide an informative introduction to how Japanese immigrants have simultaneously assimilated with Brazilian customs, but also expressed a sense of loyalty to Japanese cultural practices throughout the twentieth and twenty-first centuries: *Searching for Home Abroad: Japanese Brazilians and Transnationalism*, ed. by Jeffrey Lesser (Durham: Duke University Press, 2003); Jeffrey Lesser, *A Discontented Diaspora: Japanese Brazilians and the Meanings of Ethnic Militancy, 1960-1980* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2007); Takeyuki Tsuda, *Japanese Brazilian Return Migration in Transnational Perspective* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003).

of a sartorial performance re-enacted to mark a specific event. Such a touristic gaze was reinforced by the fact that almost all of the women shyly avert their gaze from the viewer, contributing to a feeling of their submission to the photographer's gaze.

Certainly, it was a conscious decision made by *National Geographic Brasil* to choose to publish this photograph of Japanese Brazilian woman, wearing a form of cross-cultural dress less easily recognisable to the viewer, than to include a far more dynamic and contemporary (both in dress and photographic technique) image that Scavone captured on the same trip to Liberdade (Fig. 5.16). This photograph documented a Japanese-Brazilian woman outside in bright sunlight in the urban city environment of Sao Paulo. Although the background is blurred, the central subject is crisply documented, distinct from the hazy images reproduced in *National Geographic Brasil*, to capture the knit of her grey sleeveless roll-neck top, the glossy sheen of her dark hair, and the sparkle of her diamante earrings. Even though the subject does not look directly at us she appears confident and self-possessed, and the up-close focus on her face, as she glances to her left, engenders a more intimate engagement between viewer and subject. Her mode of dress is more reflective of what most Japanese Brazilians might wear on a daily basis. The photograph could have been taken in Tokyo or Sao Paulo, and reflects more realistically the cross-cultural mix of cultures that interact and negotiate in Liberdade, which is not a romanticised location of quaint Japanese customs, as the image re-presented in *National Geographic Brasil* may have suggested, but one area of a thriving global city.

Scavone's summary of his photographic approach in this article provides an interesting point on which to conclude this chapter. As he explained:

I am absolutely taken by portrait photography, so much so that I use my approach to portraiture to explain and navigate in all other genres of photography that interest me[...] I decided that an essay about a city, a street or a district, like Liberdade, is a portrait, I call it an expanded portrait. *I let the people and the objects tell the story*[...] *My approach would never be objective, there was never an intention of journalism behind it* [my italics].⁴⁴⁷

Scavone clearly drew on the aesthetic qualities and communicative possibilities of portraiture, a mode of depiction that is rooted in subjectivity, reinforced by his assertion that 'My approach would never be objective'.⁴⁴⁸ He outlined the aesthetic qualities and communicative potentials of his practice, which override its referential function, as an unbiased means of accurately conveying detailed information. Yet his assertion, 'I let the people and the objects tell the story', actually suggested a more unmediated relation to his subjects than the previous photographers examined in this thesis, each of whom was quick to assert the reportage status of their practice.⁴⁴⁹ Scavone suggested, instead, that the lived experiences and practices of his subjects drove the creative fabrication of the images, rather than his own desire to impose a particular style or singular documentary 'truth'. His approach, even though the photographs selected for inclusion in the magazine tended to focus on more 'ethnic' forms of dress, was therefore a shift beyond that of the previous photographers examined in this thesis. This is because Scavone's comments suggested a critical re-thinking of documentary photography, which contained the potential for a more subjective re-working of the medium, a point that will be taken up in the work of the photographer examined in the final chapter of this thesis.

This chapter has examined the establishment and development of *National Geographic Brasil* over its first ten years in publication. In all three of the snapshots

⁴⁴⁷ Scavone, Personal Communication with Author.

⁴⁴⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁴⁹ Ibid.

examined there has been a concern with Brazil's history and cultural identity. The first snapshot re-framed and re-contextualised an image of an indigenous Brazilian subject that had originally been published in *National Geographic* in April 1926, and placed him in more romanticised and sentimental terms as a Noble Savage seventy-six years later. Yet *National Geographic Brasil* camouflaged an important aspect of the subject's creative performance of *gambiarra*, and rendered him a passive signifier of Brazil's indigenous history, divorced from contemporary Brazilian civilisation. There was an overriding sense in this snapshot that *National Geographic Brasil* had re-fashioned the Mayongong subject as objectified and racially monolithic, rather than the subject's own practices of self-fashioning constituting an act of individual defiance to his original ethnographic surveillance by *National Geographic*. Whilst *National Geographic Brasil* clearly visually deconstructed some of the asymmetrical relations of power previously in place between the indigenous Brazilian subject and the *National Geographic* viewer, it mobilised a new dynamic of control through text that essentialised and idealised Brazil's indigenous past, and paid little attention to the subjectivities and subtleties in differentiation in dress between Mayongong men and women. Overall, this snapshot was exemplary of *displaced* rather than *misplaced* ideas, because it intentionally, as opposed to accidentally or inevitably, used the indigenous subject as a tool to mobilise collective memory of an indigenous past for the benefit of contemporary Brazilian viewers, yet in doing so, refused to understand Brazil's numerous and culturally distinct indigenous societies as belonging to part of the present.

The second and third snapshots both examined culturally distinct immigrant communities of Angolans and Japanese living in zoned areas of large urban cities, Rio de Janeiro and Sao Paulo. Both of the articles that these snapshots were published

within struck an emotional chord with the viewer through their complex interweaving of past and present, and constant references to a traditional past apparently inscribed in the subject's present-day activities. Within Beliel's article, an interesting subtext, in text and images, concerning young Angolan males' identification with global hip-hop through dress and gesture, worked to undermine the problematic and dominant textual narrative. Hip-hop enabled the *National Geographic Brasil* viewer to see how Angolan subjects negotiated and re-negotiated global fashions and used them to express their socially, culturally and politically marginalised experiences in Brazil, but also Angola, which had prompted their emigration. Yet their brightly coloured visual representation in *National Geographic Brasil* risked masking their sociopolitical use of hip-hop to *self-fashion*. It risked instead *fashioning* Angolan subjects in a carnivalesque spectacle of black Otherness, and advertising them for aesthetic appropriation by a culturally distanced and predominantly white-skinned Brazilian viewer. Whereas Beliel established a masculine Other, Scavone's article was more concerned with a feminine Other. Both the textual narrative that accompanied his article, and his accompanying photographs, fashioned a whimsical and mythical construction of Liberdade, whilst the snapshot examined was an interesting demonstration of how Japanese-Brazilian women use dress to construct and perform their fluid, cross-cultural identities on particular ceremonial occasions. Yet the caption's focus on dress risked obscuring this exemplary expression of displaced ideas in favour of a romanticised depiction of dress as a symbol of passive, feminised Oriental *difference*.

In *National Geographic Brasil*, comparable to *National Geographic*, there has been a palpable tension between encouraging identification with Brazilian subjects and highlighting their exotic difference. Schwarz's argument has been re-fashioned

and defined in terms of movement and relocation, as *displaced* ideas, as opposed to solely in terms of loss, as *misplaced* ideas. This reworked theory has enabled us to see how ideas between *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil* have been in flux rather than static, but it has also demonstrated the new hierarchies and inequalities that have been established in the formation of a new contact zone, no longer between the United States and Brazilian subjects, but between Brazil and the various immigrant groups that have settled within its borders.

Chapter 5. Mundialization: Brazilian dress in *National Geographic Brasil*, August 2013

- **Snapshot 11: The Guarani-Kaiowa's Western-style dress and Feathered Headdresses, August 2013**

The preceding four chapters of this thesis used a snapshot methodology to analyse ten case studies from *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil*, which spanned the period 1926 to 2011. These chapters expanded upon the theoretical concepts of anthropophagy, an aesthetics of garbage, the space in-between and misplaced ideas, conceptualised respectively by Andrade, Stam, Santiago and Schwarz, to analyse the shifting dynamics and hierarchies of power woven into the representation and re-presentation of Brazilian dress and fashion. These four scholars were selected for their specific and interdisciplinary uses of dress and fashion metaphors, which were employed to make a positive identification with the cross-cultural complexities of Brazilian sartorial identities.

The methodological framework used in the final chapter of this thesis can be situated historically as the culmination of these four theoretical concepts. In the greatly accelerated phase of contemporary globalisation, Brazilian cultural critic and sociologist, Renato Ortiz, has pointed out the limitations of methodologies that *assume* Brazil's dependency on the West, even if they are used positively to revalorise the improvisational and interactive dimensions of cross-cultural encounter and exchange. Ortiz advanced the logic of crucial aspects of concepts employed by Andrade, Stam, Santiago and Schwarz, and considered Brazil, no longer as unique and peripheral in relation to the West, but one cultural manifestation competing against numerous others in a global system, within which it has become, 'somehow senseless

[...] to talk about a diffusing centrality of a clear opposition between external and internal, foreign and autochthonous'.⁴⁵⁰

Ortiz is particularly relevant to an examination of *National Geographic Brasil* in the transitional period following May 2010, when the magazine celebrated its tenth anniversary, and began to position itself more dynamically and pragmatically in relation to *National Geographic*.⁴⁵¹ As Matthew Shirts summarised:

In 2010, the cycle of globalization of *National Geographic* closed when one of the editors of the Brazilian edition, Ronaldo Ribeiro, wrote the text of the report on Lençóis Maranhenses for the mother magazine, published around the world and read by 40 million people [...] Global issues are increasingly coming to NGBrasil. It's true that many materials were very Americanized, but we had to take these in order to also produce the Brazilian content. Now, however, NGBrasil and NGUSA are increasingly *discussing the same topics, albeit from different perspectives* [my italics].⁴⁵²

Shirts cited the example of a July 2010 article written by Ronaldo Ribeiro, entitled 'Sea of Dunes: wind and rain have sculpted the landscape of Lençóis Maranhenses. But this Brazilian National Park faces problems', which was published simultaneously in *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil*.⁴⁵³ Whereas *National Geographic Brasil* had previously been dependent upon the 'mother magazine', in a coercive relationship that had forced the magazine to publish articles on issues more immediately relevant to a U.S. audience, in order to also produce local Brazilian content, Ribeiro's article symbolised a paradigm shift towards a more consensual rapport with Washington DC. Rather than *National Geographic* and *National*

⁴⁵⁰ Ortiz, 'Popular Culture, Modernity and Nation' in *Through the Kaleidoscope: the experience of modernity in Latin America*, ed. by Vivian Schelling (New York: Verso, 2000), p. 144.

⁴⁵¹ Refer to Appendix 4: the representation of Brazil in *National Geographic Brasil* (May 2010 - December 2014).

⁴⁵² Shirts, Personal Communication with Author.

⁴⁵³ Ronaldo Ribeiro, 'Dazzling Brazilian Dunes', *National Geographic*, July 2010, pp. 108-17; Ribeiro, 'Mar de Dunas: vento e chuvas esculpiram a paisagem dos Lençóis Maranhenses. Mas esse parque nacional brasileiro enfrenta problemas', *National Geographic Brasil*, July 2010, pp. 50-65.

Geographic Brasil co-existing within a hierarchical relation of power, they now entered in productive and dissonant tension, 'discussing the same topics, albeit from different perspectives'.⁴⁵⁴ Shirts acknowledged that there were multiple world-views and a parallel can be drawn here with Ortiz's understanding of mundialization.

Ortiz made a distinction between technological and economic globalisation, and the cultural dimensions of globalisation, which he conceptualised in 2006 using an English neologism, *mundialization*, derived from the French word, *mondialisation*:

There is no conceptual opposition between the common and the diverse; a mundialized culture promotes a cultural pattern without imposing the uniformity of all; it disseminates a *pattern* bound to the development of world modernity itself. Its width certainly involves other cultural manifestations, but it is important to emphasize that it is specific, founding a new way of 'being-in-the-world' and establishing new ideas and legitimizations. And that is the reason why there is not and there will not be a single global culture, identical in all places. A globalized world implies a plurality of world-views. What we do have is the consolidation of a civilization matrix, world modernity, that is actualized and diversified in every country, region, place, as a function of its particular history. And this means that globalization/mundialization is one and diverse at the same time.⁴⁵⁵

Ortiz argued that to refer to the technological and economic sphere is to designate processes that are reproduced throughout the world in the same fashion: whether a single and unified global economic structure (capitalism) or a singular technological system (comprised of the Internet, computers and satellites etc.). He contended that it is not possible to speak of a singular global culture or identity in the same sense that one can refer to a singular technological or economic structure, and asserted: 'there is

⁴⁵⁴ Renato Ortiz, 'Problematizing Global Knowledge – Genealogies of the Global/Globalizations', *Theory, Culture & Society*, 23 (2006), 401-03 (p. 402).

Ortiz first introduced the concept of mundialization, or mundialización, in Spanish in 1998, in one chapter, 'Sobre la Mundialización y la cuestión nacional', published as a collection of essays in *Otro Territorio: ensayos sobre el mundo contemporáneo* (Buenos Aires: Universidad de Quilmes, 1996). That Ortiz was writing a decade later than Santiago and Schwarz, when a more postnational understanding of the hierarchies between native and foreign influences was being developed in Brazil, is part of the reason that his argument advances beyond the space in-between and misplaced ideas.

⁴⁵⁵ Ortiz, 'Problematizing Global Knowledge', p. 402.

no global culture; only a process of cultural mundialization'.⁴⁵⁶ Ortiz used the example of the English language to demonstrate his point. Whilst the predominance of English throughout the world unequivocally demonstrates an imbalance of power within the global contact zone, it does not automatically indicate the disappearance of diverse languages or entail a singular mode of conversing in the face of its universal dominance. Mundialization must be understood then as a site of resistance, change and adaptation; it denotes a world vision that 'co-exists with other world visions, establishing hierarchies, conflicts and accommodations with them'.⁴⁵⁷ It is facilitated by the technological and economic processes of globalisation, but delineates a space for different conceptions of the world, whereby diverse, and sometimes conflicting, forms of understanding come into contact with one another, nevertheless preserving the diversities of their differences.

Ortiz argued that it was inappropriate to refer to an autonomous global culture, which is hierarchically superior to national, regional, local or individual cultural practices. He stressed that mundialization is an overall social phenomenon; whilst there exists a 'cultural *pattern*', a common background that we all share throughout the world, that this must not be *misunderstood* as a pervasive homogenisation or standardisation of ideas, behaviour or cultural products, 'imposing the uniformity of all'.⁴⁵⁸ His use of a dress metaphor is significant, and provides a useful tool to consider how the dynamics of global culture are localised and indigenised through fashion and dress practices, whether on a micro or macro level. In the global fashion industry, a pattern is a two-dimensional industrial template used to create any number of three-

⁴⁵⁶ Ortiz, 'Social Sciences and the English Language', *Revista Brasileira de Ciências Sociais*, 19.54 (2004), 5-22.

⁴⁵⁷ Ortiz, 'Problematizing Global Knowledge', p. 402.

⁴⁵⁸ *Ibid.*

dimensional garments. Yet the type of pattern can differ drastically, not to mention the endless possibilities prior and subsequent to cutting, focused predominantly on the surface of the garment and concerned with use of different fabrics, materials, colours and decoration, each of which is articulated and differentiated according to the particular discernments and desires of an individual, group, culture or country. A revealing example of mundialization, in operation on a micro level, has been provided by Mylene Mizrahi, who conducted an ethnographic study of the local appropriation of a specific Brazilian form of denim worn by women at *favela* Funk Balls in Rio de Janeiro.⁴⁵⁹ Whilst the jeans worn by dancers may have *appeared* to be a generic and homogenous form of a global style, they were produced from a stretchy fabric called *moletom*, which was not denim but simulated its appearance. This distinctive fabric was thicker than denim, enabling rhinestones, embroideries, lace and other fabrics to be attached to it, as well as rips, tears and perforations to be made into it, and clung to the moving body like a second skin. The result was a distinctively Brazilian re-presentation of global denim that drew many parallels with the Lycra fashions documented in the fifth snapshot this thesis discussed, which captured an Afro-Brazilian girl dancing in Bahia; both had a seductive power as body, clothing and dance worked together in motion, which prompted viewers to consider not only how the Lycra top and denim jeans looked, but also how they *felt*.

Just as Mizrahi observed the subjective and sensory experiences of Brazilian jeans for wearer *and* viewer, Ortiz referred to mundialization in phenomenological terms as a process that has provided individuals with ‘a new way of “being-in-the-world” and establish[ed] new ideas and legitimations’.⁴⁶⁰ Such a statement appeared

⁴⁵⁹ Mylene Mizrahi, “Brazilian Jeans”: materiality, body and seduction at Rio de Janeiro’s Funk Ball’ in *Global Denim*, ed. by Daniel Miller and Sophie Woodward (Oxford: Berg, 2011), pp. 103-26.

⁴⁶⁰ Ortiz, ‘Problematizing Global Knowledge’, p. 402.

to suggest that not only is there no singular global culture, but there is no universal *experience* of globalisation; rather, an individual's specific engagement with the processes of cultural mundialization are anchored in her subjective sensory *perceptions* and *experiences* of her surrounding environment. This mundialized sensorium may take discursive and narrativised forms, producing and fashioning *new* subjectivities and sensory spaces across world-time and world-space. Mundialization is not *simply* the hybrid mix of local and global, as diverse objects, elements and ideas interact and are re-fashioned, but *also* the new sensory modes of perception and experience opened up during the process. In accordance with Ortiz's assertion that 'a globalized world implies a plurality of world views', and building upon the analysis made in the previous four chapters, this chapter seeks to consider how the Brazilian subject, but also the *National Geographic Brasil* viewer, perceived, experienced, and articulated a relation to their surrounding environment through dress.

The final case study this chapter analyses expands my snapshot methodology to examine three snapshots within one article, which was published in *National Geographic Brasil* in August 2013. This article was the cross-cultural product of U.S. photojournalist Nadia Shira Cohen and her partner, Brazilian photojournalist Paulo Siqueira. It concerned the Guarani-Kaiowa indigenous group, who inhabit areas of the central-Western state of Mato Grosso do Sul in Brazil.⁴⁶¹ I begin by contextualising the article and introducing the more specific world-view that informs the geographical and sensory spaces that the Guarani-Kaiowa inhabit, which will be used to analyse their dress practices. I move on to analyse the first snapshot, which was published on the

⁴⁶¹ Nadia Shira Cohen, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, August 2013, pp. 116-31. Refer to Appendix 8: Translated Articles.

left-hand side of a double-page view within the magazine. This analysis is developed in the second snapshot, which examines the right-hand side of the same double-page view as it was re-framed and re-contextualised for the digital iPad or tablet edition of *National Geographic Brasil*. The final snapshot advances beyond the photographic analysis made in the previous four chapters of this thesis and examines a three-minute film that was produced exclusively for the digital edition of the article, to be viewed on an iPad or tablet screen. These three case studies, located within one snapshot, will be contextualised with contemporary examples from the broader global mediascape. This chapter concludes by knitting together a series of conclusions to the following questions: how has *National Geographic Brasil* fashioned an image of the Guarani-Kaiowa through the representation of their dress, and to what extent can indigenous subjects be seen to have *self-fashioned*? Has *National Geographic Brasil* highlighted the complex and shifting processes of mundialization through which the Guarani-Kaiowa have engaged and interacted with the technological and economic processes of globalisation? Or has it reduced these processes to a form of standardisation and homogenisation?

An Ethnographic Gaze on the Guarani-Kaiowa in 2013

The case studies this chapter examines were published within a sixteen-page article, written by Cohen and accompanied with photographs by Siqueira, entitled 'Guarani: red earth. They believe they have a spiritual connection to the place where their ancestors lived. In Mato Grosso do Sul, for decades this belief has bathed

indigenous territory in blood.⁴⁶² The title referenced the fertile, red earth of Mato Grosso do Sul, an agriculture-rich Brazilian state that borders Paraguay and Bolivia, but also the bloodshed that has taken place there as a result of an increasingly tense stalemate between European-descended farmers and indigenous groups. The region has a large proportion of high-value farmland, comprised of sugarcane and soya plantations and cattle ranches, which are vital to Brazil's increasing economic prosperity and supported by the developmental agenda of Brazilian President Dilma Rousseff (1 January 2011-).⁴⁶³ The region is also home to over 61,000 indigenous people, the majority of whom are Guarani-Kaiowa.⁴⁶⁴ The conflict stemmed from a 1988 constitution that promised indigenous peoples the right to inhabit their ancestral lands, though not the legal right to own them, a process of putting the law into practice that has been considerably drawn out and judicially challenged by the farm lobby.⁴⁶⁵ This constitution over the identification and demarcation of small areas of indigenous land was put in process in 2007, and is supported by FUNAI, federal prosecutors and international NGOs, but has been repeatedly blocked by legal challenges, and opposed by farmers, the state government and Farmasul, the industry body for farmers.⁴⁶⁶ Indigenous groups have staged a series of occupations of

⁴⁶² Nadia Shira Cohen, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha. Eles acreditam ter uma ligação espiritual com o lugar em que seus antepassados viveram. No Mato Grosso do Sul, essa crença há décadas banha de sangue o território indígena', *National Geographic Brasil*, August 2013, pp. 116-131. Refer to Appendix 8: Translated Articles.

⁴⁶³ In contrast to Luiz Inacio Lula da Silva who, although criticised by the indigenous movement during his time in office oversaw a number of demarcations that returned ancestral lands to indigenous peoples, Rousseff is increasingly seen as an economic pragmatist who is insensitive to indigenous rights. This is largely due to her role in disputes over the Belo Monte dam project, which was executed despite criticism from the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights. Anon., 'Brazil: Clashes with indigenous movement will rise', in *Oxford Analytica Daily Brief* <<https://www.oxan.com/>> [accessed 12 February 2015]

⁴⁶⁴ There are three subgroups of the Guarani living in Brazil: the Mbya, Nandeva and Kaiowa, each with subtle differences in religious orientation, social and political practices, linguistic forms and customs. 'Guarani Kaiowa: Introduction', in *Povos Indigenas no Brasil*, <<http://pib.socioambiental.org/en/povo/guarani-kaiowa>> [accessed 3 June 2015]

⁴⁶⁵ Anon., 'Brazil: Clashes with Indigenous Movement will Rise', n.p.

⁴⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, n.p.

farmland, which has resulted in violent expulsion by farm security guards and federal police. The tensions between landowners and indigenous peoples that have arisen in Mato Grosso do Sul are rooted in the territorial importance that the Guarani-Kaiowa attach to the geographical area their ancestors inhabited.

It is in this respect that I introduce the critical term that constitutes the world-view of the Guarani-Kaiowa. The Guarani-Kaiowa use the term *tekoha* to denote the physical places that they inhabit (whether land, field, forest, water, animals or plants), and in which the Guarani *teko* (way of being) is realised. The *tekoha* has been defined as 'a result and not as a determining factor, as a continuing process of situational adjustment ... defined by virtue of the effective characteristics – material and immaterial – of access to geographical space by the Guarani'.⁴⁶⁷ As a category that once connoted solely territorial space for the Guarani-Kaiowa, *tekoha* has since acquired great relevance and wide usage as a socio-political, cultural and multisensory space that encompasses behaviour, habitat and cultural expression, and influences their way of *being*: of thinking, feeling, acting, dressing and wearing. The *tekoha* is not fixed, but continuously re-evaluated in relation to their changing environment. A parallel can be drawn here with Pierre Bourdieu's delineation of the ever shifting 'habitus', which he defined as 'structured structures predisposed to function as structuring structures, that is, as principles which generate and organize practices and representations that can be objectively adapted to their outcomes'.⁴⁶⁸ The habitus encompasses the characteristic norms and tendencies that influence behaviour and thought in a given society or group and structures the way that embodied individuals live; like the *tekoha*, it entails a *situational adjustment* and adaptation to shifting

⁴⁶⁷ 'Guarani Kaiowa: Introduction', in *Povos Indigenas no Brasil*,
<<http://pib.socioambiental.org/en/povo/guarani-kaiowa>> [accessed 3 June 2015]

⁴⁶⁸ Pierre Bourdieu, *The Logic of Practice* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1990), p. 53.

surroundings and unexpected situations. The *tekoha* resonated with Ortiz's assertion that mundialization was 'a total social phenomenon, which pervades all cultural manifestations. The whole goes to the core of its parts, redefining them in their specificities.'⁴⁶⁹ The *tekoha* must be understood then in phenomenological terms, as a pervasive manifestation of the Guarani-Kaiowa's embodied experience and perception of 'being-in-the-world'.⁴⁷⁰

Case Study One: Magazine

The first snapshot this chapter examines (Figs. 6.0 and 6.1) was printed on the left-hand side of a double-page view in *National Geographic Brasil*. A set of four full-length photographs of anonymous members of the Guarani-Kaiowa, it was placed opposite a photograph of an indigenous man reproduced on the right-hand page.⁴⁷¹ The snapshot had a standardised, uniform quality, and stood out from the apparent artlessness that characterised the majority of images published within the article, which lay closer to what the *National Geographic Brasil* viewer may have recognised as a sensationalist, photojournalistic aesthetic. An example of the latter can be seen in Figure 6.2, a full-bleed double-page spread that captured a Guarani-Kaiowa named Osorio bleeding from a head wound following a confrontation with a local landowner.⁴⁷² It is a direct image, instantly recognisable as reportage as a result of its hard-hitting subject matter (according to Susan Sontag, 'war was and still is the most irresistible – and picturesque – news'), and the charged compositional tension that

⁴⁶⁹ Ortiz, 'Problematizing Global Knowledge', p. 402.

⁴⁷⁰ Ibid., p. 420.

⁴⁷¹ Cohen, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha', pp. 126-27.

⁴⁷² Ibid., pp. 120-21.

indiscriminately crops fragmented bodies out of the photograph frame.⁴⁷³ In contrast, the four carefully framed identically sized images that constitute this snapshot were published in a grid formation on an otherwise blank magazine page. The images shared the compositional format of a single figure posed in the centre of the frame: a style of representation discussed in the first snapshot of this thesis and situated within a long tradition of the essentialised and objectified ethnographic 'type', whereby the subject is presented within a shallow picture plane, in standardised, even light to enable a full, even mathematical, mapping of the indigenous body. Here, the photographer has maintained a standardised distance from his subjects, and used a large aperture to give a shallower depth of field, which lends a crispness and clarity to the isolated subjects, who are colourfully staged against a softly blurred, luscious green background. Ostensibly, this seductive full-colour ethnographic gaze, which is comparable in composition to Stevens' monochrome documentation of the Maku man and woman in 1926, encourages the viewer to study the isolated and exotic subjects anthropometrically, as objects rather than as interacting social agents, and to make a comparative study of their different modes of dress from within the uniformity of their depiction.

Yet the caption that accompanied this image read: 'The Guarani call these taken lands *tekohas*. In Pueblito in Iguatemi, another municipality, residents try to build a life in the area considered ancestral territory.'⁴⁷⁴ It highlighted the term *tekoha*, and drew the viewer's attention to the process of cultural mundialization by which the Guarani-Kaiowa attempt to build a new life, through a process of situational adjustment to their environment. Whilst the caption omitted to mention dress, it

⁴⁷³ Sontag, *Regarding the Pain of Others*, p. 49.

⁴⁷⁴ Cohen, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha', p. 126.

situated the subjects as interacting social agents rather than essentialised and racialised specimens, and encouraged a closer examination of the four subjects. Whereas ethnographic photographs were made to compare and contrast different races and ethnicities, these images depicted subjects from the same indigenous group; as a result, rather than suggesting their homogeneity as a whole, the snapshot served to identify individual differences. The only typicality is the serial approach of photographing the subjects, since the diverse characteristics of each subject is shown through dress, pose, setting and their placement within the photographic frame. Each subject displays calm and self-possessed expressions, gestures and poses, and demonstrates his or her agency in self-fashioning before the photographer's gaze, which becomes an imaginative space to stage fanciful versions of themselves.

There is a palpable shift in this snapshot in the representation of Guarani-Kaiowa identity, from something fixed, to something performative. The little boy stands with his feet together and arms and head poised upwards as he fires his plastic gun (Fig. 6.3); the little girl stands legs apart with her hands crossed in front of her, looking down to her right (Fig. 6.4); the woman in the top left portrait (Fig. 6.5) stands sideways on and looks down pensively, apparently absorbed in her own thought, with her hands gently clasping the handle of a gourd maraca; and the woman in the bottom left portrait (Fig. 6.6), her fingers splayed over the top of two ceremonial sticks pointed into the ground, commands the viewer's attention with her stern expression. As the only subject to directly address the camera (the others look up, down or outside of the picture frame), she forms the focal point of the snapshot, compelling the viewer to meet her gaze and positioning herself as an active participant of perception and expression. Alison Griffiths has highlighted the paradoxical quality that is attached to

what she terms the 'return gaze', whereby ethnographic subjects directly match the gaze of the photographer: 'While it signals the filmmaker's [or photographer's] agency as the gatherer of images – we collect images of *them* and not vice versa – at the same time it carries with it a subversive or defiant element, a look that *could* be transcribed as "I see you looking at me and don't like it".'⁴⁷⁵ In this example, however, the subject appears calm, composed and comfortable with her exposure, and the image can be read less as a straightforward act of defiance to a controlling photographic gaze. Her return gaze is comparable to that of the Brazilian woman documented in the fashion boutique by Stanmeyer in 2011, examined in the seventh snapshot this thesis discussed, and suggests that the nature of the interaction between photographer and subject is complicit and consensual, rather than controlling. There is no awkwardness in the resulting images, but rather a sense that the subjects had an increased awareness and consciousness of their bodies in phenomenological terms, as a subject to be looked at, and as an image before the camera. There is a stillness to these images, which encourages a more measured and contemplative response from the *National Geographic Brasil* viewer and is not unexpected, given that prototypes for these images were initially made using a large format camera, which slows down the image-making process and demands that the subjects remain still for a prolonged period of time.⁴⁷⁶

Siqueira commented on this snapshot:

With these images I was not trying to pretend that they are objective – they are posed portraits and it is obvious. I allowed the subjects to show themselves as

⁴⁷⁵ Alison Griffiths, *Wondrous Difference: Cinema, Anthropology and Turn-Of-The-Century Visual Culture* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2002), p. 200.

⁴⁷⁶ Cohen and Siqueira, Personal Communication with Author.

they wished. This is a more recent new direction that I have taken, away from more traditional, reportage photography.⁴⁷⁷

Rather like Scavone's description of his working methods in the previous chapter, he described his role within the image-making process as relatively passive and unmediated, but advanced one step beyond Scavone since, in these particular images, he 'allowed the subjects to show themselves as they wished'.⁴⁷⁸ He asserted that this innovative approach demonstrated a shift away from 'more traditional, reportage photography', in which subjects do not pose and the photographer, as hidden 'fly-on-the-wall' witness, decides on the composition and angle at which to capture them. Siqueira deemed this well-established photojournalistic practice to be a faithful transcription of reality.⁴⁷⁹ In contrast, within these 'posed portraits', rather than establish a distance from his subjects, Siqueira distanced himself from the image-making process, beyond setting up the camera equipment at a uniform distance from each subject, and taking the photograph. The implication here is that Siqueira did not perceive these images to rest within the confines of an objective, documentary mode, but rather saw them as a contingent dramatisation of identity, as subjects performing their own subjectivities.⁴⁸⁰ Whilst Siqueira posited a divide between objectivity, 'traditional reportage', and subjectivity, 'posed portraits', he also articulated a long recognised paradox concerning documentary photography, centred on an understanding that it is surely more realist to allow subjects to present themselves as they wish, and to display openly the photographic equipment used, rather than to catch them off-guard, and to construct their identities from a determined distance.⁴⁸¹

⁴⁷⁷ Ibid.

⁴⁷⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁷⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁸⁰ Ibid.

⁴⁸¹ Ibid.

Although not openly acknowledged by Siqueira, in my reading, these images were a tangible demonstration of a 'performative documentary', to use a term coined by T.J. Demos, wherein 'the dramatization and direct transmission of reality intertwine'.⁴⁸² Produced in the same year that Cyprien Gaillard created 'L'Origami du Monde' for *O32c*, this snapshot hinted at how a more objective truth might be reclaimed through narrative construction and imaginative storytelling, but operating on the part of the Guarani-Kaiowa subjects, rather than the *O32c* viewer, who dramatise their identities through dress.

Dress performed a crucial role within this snapshot in articulating the subjects' identities, and fracturing the distance between *National Geographic Brasil* viewer and Guarani-Kaiowa subject. There is an emphasis on the texture and materiality of the subjects' colourful clothing, which refuses to blend seamlessly into the lush green environment that frames them. The setting emphasises the richness and fertility of the environment, but also the importance the Guarani-Kaiowa attach to their *tekoha* as a source of cultivating food, and collecting raw materials for use as firewood, remedies, utensils, tools, building supplies and dress.⁴⁸³ Their clothing demonstrates the Guarani-Kaiowa's situational adjustment to their changing immediate environment, as they create outfits from the tools and materials that they have to hand in a process that draws on *gambiarra*, which was discussed in the first and eighth snapshots of this thesis. The images invite a tactile gaze from the viewer, whose eyes move across the glossy flat surface of the magazine page and perceive the different textures presented, from the soft cotton of Western-style T-shirts, the

⁴⁸² T. J. Demos, *Return to the Postcolony: Specters of Colonialism in Contemporary Art* (Berlin: Sternberg Press, 2013), p. 26.

⁴⁸³ 'Guarani Kaiowa: Introduction', in *Povos Indigenas no Brasil*, <<http://pib.socioambiental.org/en/povo/guarani-kaiowa>> [accessed 3 June 2015]

smooth feel of a patterned polyester skirt, to the rough patches of denim on a customised skirt. The tactility of the images invites the viewer to run their fingertips across the page, not to simply look, but also to *feel* the dress worn by the subjects, who display a combination of Western-style clothing and indigenous elements such as beaded necklaces, bracelets, headdresses and skirts fashioned from strips of cloth, wool and plastic.⁴⁸⁴ The little boy wears mud-stained pale blue and green shorts, a striped T-shirt, red face paint and necklaces made of fruit stones, gourds and found objects. The little girl wears a dark purple top, tie-dye shorts, red face paint and a skirt made from different coloured wool and plastic tassels. The woman in the top left portrait wears an oversized blue T-shirt, an orange beaded and feather headdress, necklaces made from fruit stones and found objects (bones, gourds, animal skin, wood and seeds), brown face paint, and a skirt made from denim, feathers, fruit stones and black T-shirt fabric. The woman in the bottom left portrait wears an elasticated heavily patterned skirt, a necklace made of fruit stones and feathers, a collection of plastic bracelets, and a red T-shirt that reads 'Feliz Natal' ('Merry Christmas' in Portuguese). The viewer is encouraged to identify with the subjects through their dress, to take into account its sensory and expressive meanings, and to experience vicariously the tactile fascination that informs the Guarani-Kaiowa's own relationship to their *tekoha*.

Although dress was not directly mentioned in the article, Siqueira and Cohen were clearly interested in the clothing choices of the Guarani-Kaiowa.⁴⁸⁵ A distinction can therefore be drawn from the Brazilian authors of the snapshots discussed in the previous four chapters, one of whom even confessed: 'I'm not an expert on clothing or

⁴⁸⁴ It is important to acknowledge that my use of the term 'Western-style clothing' is to point to the fact that the style, even if not its manufacture, originates in North America and Europe. Maynard, *Dress and Globalisation*, p. 12.

⁴⁸⁵ Cohen and Siqueira, Personal Communication with Author.

feminine behavior'.⁴⁸⁶ Siqueira and Cohen described how dress 'has shifted along with the Guarani-Kaiowa's adaptation to their land. Today they have incorporated the materials that they have to hand into their dress.'⁴⁸⁷ This comment acknowledged the Guarani-Kaiowa's critical assimilation of foreign elements found within their *tekoha*, which are re-fashioned to suit their own needs and tastes. An example can be seen in the outer skirt worn by the woman in the top left portrait, which is a contemporary adaptation of Guarani-Kaiowa ceremonial dress, created here from a pair of deconstructed and re-stitched denim jeans and a torn-up black T-shirt and decorated with a knotted belt of white stones and orange feathers. Siqueira and Cohen explained that the Guarani-Kaiowa 'used to use only feathers found on their land' as decoration for their dress, but now they also strategically appropriate items from mainstream culture and 'incorporate different things such as plastic bags, T-shirts, plastic beads'.⁴⁸⁸ An example of the creative utilisation of used materials can be seen in the portrait of the little girl, whose distinctive skirt has been made by knotting together recycled plastic bags and wool to create hanging tassels. Siqueira and Cohen commented that amongst the Guarani-Kaiowa 'dress is very different ... there are those who wear only traditional dress, those who utilize elements of traditional dress, and those who dress like normal Brazilian teenagers'.⁴⁸⁹ This remark acknowledged the Guarani-Kaiowa's ability to pick and choose *what*, *when* and *how* they interact with items of global dress. Cohen and Siqueira described how 'the Guarani-Kaiowa dress up for special occasions, for battle and for defense. They use dress to demonstrate their personal desires and individual choices'.⁴⁹⁰ This comment emphasised the flexibility and freedom that the

⁴⁸⁶ Beliel, Personal Communication with Author.

⁴⁸⁷ Cohen and Siqueira, Personal Communication with Author.

⁴⁸⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁸⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁹⁰ Ibid.

Guarani-Kaiowa have in taking elements of Western-style dress and using them to fashion their own indigenous identities. An example can be seen in the portrait of the woman wearing the red T-shirt that reads 'Feliz Natal'. The T-shirt is not being worn during the festive period and takes on a new meaning in its different context. The authors acknowledged: 'The longer that we stayed in the community, we began to see changes. Some of the Indians didn't wear traditional clothes all of the time, but others did, and others dropped traditional wear all together. The younger kids will not go to the village dressed as Indians because they are embarrassed, and they balk at their grandparents for dressing like this.'⁴⁹¹ There is the suggestion here that young members of the group are ashamed by their grandparents' inability to adapt and negotiate change through dress. As a whole, the authors' comments acknowledged that the only aspect that is Western about Guarani-Kaiowa clothing is its origin, since it has been selectively modified and re-fashioned, and demonstrates the process of mundialization as products transferred across the world as a result of economic globalisation are used strategically for the creation of personal and cultural indigenous Brazilian identities.

A revealing point of comparison can be drawn with a photograph of an anonymous Guarani-Kaiowa girl (Fig. 6.7), which was published on 9 October 2013 on the online blog accompaniment to the Brazilian newspaper, *O Estado de S. Paulo*, within an article entitled 'NGOs associate high rate of suicide among young Indians to land problems'.⁴⁹² The article examined increased suicide rates amongst the Guarani-Kaiowa and Guarani-Nandeva communities, which were much higher than the national

⁴⁹¹ Ibid.

⁴⁹² Roldao Arruda, 'ONG associa alta taxa de suicídio entre índios jovens a problemas fundiários', <<http://politica.estadao.com.br/blogs/roldao-arruda/ong-associa-alta-taxa-de-suicidio-entre-indios-jovens-a-problemas-fundiarios/>> [accessed 15 March 2015]

average and disproportionately affected adolescents and young people. This disproportionate trend was associated with their social dislocation at losing land owned by their ancestors. The article detailed the alcoholism and malnutrition widespread on Guarani-Kaiowa reservations throughout Mato Grosso do Sul, and was published to coincide with World Mental Health Day on 10 October 2013. It was accompanied by a photograph, captioned 'Guarani Child: for international NGOs the solution to the problems would be the magnification of indigenous lands'. A young girl stares directly into the camera lens at close range, her symmetrical body placed squarely in the foreground. She wears a dirty, oversized white patterned jumper, and her long dark hair, plaited at the front, hangs forward over her shoulders. She regards the camera with an innocent, wide-eyed gaze, her hands clasped awkwardly in front of her, nervously pulling at her jumper. Whereas in *National Geographic Brasil* there is a sense of the subjects as exhibitors of their own actions, here the subject enacts a dazed passivity, which is more likely to engender sympathy and pity in the viewer but refuses to acknowledge the subject as an interacting agent. The subject's soiled clothing is a clear demonstration of the problems faced by the Guarani, who live in overcrowded reservations and often have little or no access to clean drinking water, medicinal plants, fuel and food, whilst her yellowing hair is reflective of the severe malnutrition experienced by the community. A different type of identification between viewer and subject is evoked in this image; in *National Geographic Brasil* dress revealed the vitality of the community and contained an element of performativity, whereas here the purpose of the image is to evoke sympathy. In the second snapshot this chapter examines, however, which was also intended to be viewed on a digital screen as opposed to a magazine page, *National Geographic Brasil* risked glossing over the serious problems faced by the Guarani-Kaiowa.

Case Study Two: iPad

The double-page view that appeared in *National Geographic Brasil* was also adapted for an iPad edition of the magazine, which was launched in December 2012 and available to digital subscribers. In the first digital edition, the then editor-in-chief of *National Geographic Brasil* (May 2000 - May 2013), Matthew Shirts enthused:

The iPad edition of *National Geographic Brasil* has just been launched! This is our first edition in this format ... it seems that the tablet computer was made especially for our magazine. The photos are more stunning, if that is possible, and the maps and graphics are interactive, facilitating the organization of information. There are also videos that can lead you to a new dimension of journalism in magazines. The new digital format stimulates the quality of editing more than that printed on paper.⁴⁹³

The digital edition of the magazine was locked so that it could only be viewed in landscape mode (Fig. 6.8), an editorial decision that prompted the viewer to perceive and experience the images as a constructed narrative, comparable to the sequencing of a filmstrip, rather like Snapshot 7b examined in Chapter Three. Image and text were intentionally isolated; to view the images, which were presented on a black background, the viewer was required to make a horizontal swipe across the screen (Fig. 6.9), yet to read the text, which was presented on a white background, the viewer had to make a vertical swipe down the screen (Fig. 6.10). The high-resolution images were privileged over the monochrome pages of text, which reiterated Shirts' assertion that 'The photos are more stunning [...] The new digital format stimulates the quality of the editing more than that on printed paper'.⁴⁹⁴ Shirts' emphasis on the proficiency in editing that was required to produce the digital edition of the magazine is particularly relevant to an analysis of dress, since *National Geographic Brasil* would

⁴⁹³ Matthew Shirts, 'Do Editor', *National Geographic Brasil* [digital edition], December 2012, n.p.

⁴⁹⁴ Ibid.

necessarily have been required to consider how particular textures, materials, colours and decoration appeared when re-framed in high-resolution on the digital screen.⁴⁹⁵

In the August 2013 iPad edition, the same set of portraits examined in the previous snapshot was re-framed on a black background for the digital screen (Figs. 6.11 and 6.12).⁴⁹⁶ The male subject seated in an armchair dominated the background of the screen, and served as the point of departure from which the viewer could choose to select any of the other four portraits to view, which were now printed in close-up thumbnails running down the left-hand side of the screen (Fig. 6.13). The digital edition of *National Geographic Brasil* also included three new portraits not included in the magazine, which captured their subjects in a variety of modes: dwarfed by their surroundings (Fig. 6.14), at the very front of the photograph frame so that the entire body cannot be captured within it (Fig. 6.15), and a close-up showing only the head and torso in focus, against a blurred background of blue sky and green vegetation (Fig. 6.16). Touch was now a crucial part of the viewing experience, since the active viewer was given a choice as to which images to view, and in which order to view them, which were selected by pressing on individual thumbnails with a fingertip. This interactive element dispelled claims, as discussed in the third chapter, which argue that digital images have rendered the viewer passive and immobile. Furthermore, the shiny flat surface of the iPad now reflected the *National Geographic Brasil* viewer's face onto the screen, so that she is likely to have experienced the simultaneous sensation of looking but also, being looked back at. This reflected gaze highlighted the

⁴⁹⁵ In his discussion of digital fashion films, Gary Needham has noted that 'clothes are chosen for the screen because they *film* well rather than wear well and this also extends to the computer screen – where fashion images exist as electronic information, files and coding. They way clothes look, and how certain fabrics and colours will appear on the digital screen, are now taken into consideration at the level of design and production'. Gary Needham, 'The Digital Fashion Film', in *Fashion Cultures Revisited*, ed. by Stella Bruzzi and Pamela Church Gibson (London: Routledge, 2013), pp. 103-111 (p. 104).

⁴⁹⁶ Cohen, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha', *National Geographic Brasil* [digital edition], August 2013, n.p.

viewer's own process of identity construction – the viewer could not help but catch sight of her own reflection in the screen and perhaps, self-consciously adjusted her hair, or re-presented herself accordingly – and in doing so, drew a parallel with the Guarani-Kaiowa subjects' subjective processes of presenting themselves before a gaze. This return gaze was particularly emotive when the photograph of the woman in the red 'Feliz Natal' T-shirt was viewed on the iPad, since her returned gaze acted as a palimpsest over the viewer's gaze reflected on the screen, prompting an intimate connection between *National Geographic Brasil* viewer and Guarani-Kaiowa subject. Yet the viewer's reflected gaze on the digital screen was more problematic in the second case study this chapter examines, as the following analysis reveals, since the male subject refused to meet the gaze of the photographer and by extension, the viewer.

In this snapshot, the male subject is seated outside in a worn brown armchair, against a verdant backdrop of crops, green field and expansive blue sky. With his head lowered, and body inclined towards the viewer, he gazes down pensively and stares at the ground. His left palm leans on a wooden stick, whilst his right hand holds a gourd maraca. Although re-presented on the screen using portrait conventions, much as it had been in the magazine, there is a de-familiarisation with the established codes of portraiture, since the subject's face and body language refuse to communicate with the viewer. Whilst denying a straightforward identification between viewer and subject, the viewer is nevertheless seduced by the three-dimensional tactile textures that the image encompasses, from the rough fabric of the dirty dishevelled sofa, the ribbed cotton of the subject's mint-green shirt, the soft blue, red and green feathers that adorn his headdress, to the string of shiny beads and smooth shells that he wears

around his neck. These tactile fabrics had an increased clarity when re-produced on the higher resolution iPad screen, enabling the viewer to discern more of the range of different surface textures, and encouraging her to consider not only how they look, but also how they *feel*. These surfaces lead the viewer around the image and encourage a sensual gaze that delves beyond the two-dimensional shiny hard flat surface of the iPad screen, and encourages an intersubjective relationship with the dressed subject. The ensemble worn by the subject, whose name the caption informs us is Ava Tape Rendy'i, displays a discriminate appropriation and re-presentation of dress from two different cultural systems, both Western and indigenous. His combination of collared shirt and Cargo shorts, worn with decorative items from Guarani-Kaiowa material culture, is a palpable demonstration that globalisation does not engender the loss of local forms of dress, but rather is a mundialized process of simultaneous fragmentation and reinvention as local and global items of clothing interact.

Yet a phenomenological engagement with the subject, and an understanding of his phenomenological engagement with his own environment, was undermined by the accompanying caption to the image, which glossed over sartorial subtleties and positioned the subject within a Western art-historical framework. It read: 'The spiritual leader Ava Tape Rendy'i, of the Teykue indigenous land in Caarapó, poses in the cornfield of the Saint Helena farm.'⁴⁹⁷ Pose is an overloaded choice of word that points to the obviously staged nature of the highly aestheticised and theatrical composition. The subject's pose situated the image visually within the Western art-historical canon, surely recognisable to an educated Brazilian readership, in which the principal subject is crowned, seated on a throne, framed centrally within the image, gazing down and

⁴⁹⁷ Cohen, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha', *National Geographic Brasil* [digital edition].

holding symbolic objects in open palms.⁴⁹⁸ There is an overriding sense, particularly when comparing this image to the four photographs examined in the previous case study, wherein the subjects appeared to relish the opportunity to *self-fashion* before the camera, that the subject, who is perhaps less likely than Siqueira to have had an awareness of the continuum of similar Western art-historical images, has been *fashioned* by the photographer, and directed to remain in this dramatic pose for the duration of the shot. There is an awareness of Ava Tape Rendy'i's passive submission to the photographic gaze, as his head hangs limply forwards, and he is positioned within a fictive *mise-en-scène* of Siqueira's choosing. There is a contrast between the *National Geographic Brasil* viewer, who views this image on the digital screen, and sees her own identity reflected back, and the Guarani-Kaiowa subject's inability to assert his identity; with his head hanging forwards, he is placed as an object to be surveyed and controlled, rather than a subject to engage in dialogue with. This asymmetrical balance of power between the active viewer and passive subject was reversed in the final case study this chapter examines, which engaged with the medium of film presented on the digital screen, and provided a rare opportunity for the tactile and visceral qualities of Guarani-Kaiowa dress to be captured in three-dimensional motion, which previously could only be suggested in the photographs presented in the magazine, on the website, and on the iPad screen.

Case Study Three: Film

The final snapshot this chapter examines is the short film reproduced on the iPad edition of the magazine, which was entitled 'Sem Solução: o governo federal nem

⁴⁹⁸ This Western art historical canon included paintings such as, to cite but one example, the early fifteenth-century Ghent altarpiece, executed by Jan van Eyck in 1430-42.

indeniza os ruralistas nem regularize as terras indígenas' ['Hopeless: the government neither indemnifies the farmers nor regulates the indigenous lands']'.⁴⁹⁹ It was funded by Planeta Susteneval, and specially made by Cohen and Siqueira for the digital edition of *National Geographic Brasil*, serving as a record of their six-day trip during which time they photographed the Guarani-Kaiowa. The film opened with a post-Apocalyptic scene as billowing orange and grey smoke emerged from the silhouette of a tall forest, and polluted a cloudless sky barely visible in the background (Figs. 6.17 and 6.18). A carefully selected soundtrack of crackling fire was interwoven into the scene to produce a potent symbol of the destructive effects of colonisation on indigenous lands. As the sound of a decorated gourd instrument being meditatively played gradually displaces the sound of crackling fire, an emotive palimpsest is enacted, and the frame switches to the torso of Ava Tape Rendy'i, recognisable from the previous photograph, wearing beaded necklaces, body paint and a feathered headdress, singing as he performed (Fig. 6.19). It is the first time that we have seen indigenous dress in motion, and how it connects to performance, dance and song, and a feeling of co-presence is engendered between viewer and subject, through the sense of tactile closeness prompted by the zoomed in shot, which provides a compelling feeling of being in the midst of the action, of "being there" with the subject. There is a mesmerising quality as Ava Tape Rendy'i's dress moves in three-dimensional forms; the muscles of his right arm flex as he shakes the maraca, causing his red and black body paint to pulsate, the tassels that decorate the instrument move in time to the music, his beaded necklaces jingle and the feathers on his headdress flutter as he sways his head in time with the music. Despite the flat surface of the digital screen this

⁴⁹⁹ *Sem Solução: o governo federal nem indeniza os ruralistas nem regularize as terras indígenas*, dir. by Paulo Siqueira (Brazil: Planeta Susteneval, 2013). Refer to Appendix 8: Translated Articles for a translation of the film's dialogue.

range of tactile sensations and textures presented in motion give a simulated sense of touch. Whilst there is an element of theatricality to this performance, the camera does not linger on Ava Tape Rendy'i long enough for him to become an ethnographic spectacle, but rather switches to Siqueira and Cohen, who are surveyed with a comparable curiosity but captured in Western-style dress as they follow a group of Guarani-Kaiowa.

Siqueira is dressed in jeans and a T-shirt and carries a food sack on his shoulder (Fig. 6.20). Cohen follows, dressed in a strappy black vest top and rolled up denim jeans, carrying her pink and orange Nike trainers in one hand and her green Havaianas flip-flops in the other (Fig. 6.21). A voiceover by Siqueira explained that there are around 50,000 Guarani living in Brazil at the moment, and that he and Nadia had come to document the disputes over their lands. Throughout the two-minute fifty-eight seconds duration, viewers witness the Guarani-Kaiowa as they fulfil daily activities such as washing, cooking and farming the land. A memorable scene captures a Guarani-Kaiowa man in a combination of Western-style dress and indigenous jewellery standing before a group of men, also in a cross-cultural mix of sartorial elements, inside a hut. The voiceover captures him providing the presumed perspective of the farmers: 'The indigenous don't work, so what is their interest in the land, it is all crazy.'⁵⁰⁰ Throughout we are constantly presented with photographs of Cohen (who is also a photographer, although most of the photographs printed in the magazine were shot by Siqueira) documenting the Guarani-Kaiowa. She bends down and crouches low to get the best shot. She is reflected with her camera in the car windscreen. These shots are very self-reflexive and do not try to hide the presence of the photographer; they emphasise instead the subjectivity of both Cohen and Siqueira, which disrupts

⁵⁰⁰ *Sem Solução*, 0.58.

any notion of their role as an all-controlling, distanced ethnographic gaze.

Representation is instead presented as a fluid process, open to various different interpretations, and is reminiscent of a comment that Cohen makes in the text of the article, which encourages the viewer to think about how the Guarani-Kaiowa might also perceive the photographers:

Our society romanticizes the Indians. We tend to think that the Guarani want to return to their ancestral land, plant new trees for the wildlife to return and then live in huts, hunt all day and pray at night dressed in feathers. Not quite. 'You go around dressed as Pedro Alvares Cabral in 1500?' Tonico Benites asks the photographer Paulo Siqueira, who accompanies me. Benites is Guarani and teaches anthropology at the Federal University of Dourados. 'Does having a mobile and computer make me less Indian? We are evolving along with modern society, like any other ethnic group,' he says, as we take a coffee at my hotel in the city.⁵⁰¹

The film comprised aestheticised images that had appeared in the magazine, and footage of their trip and interactions with their subjects. It closed with a photograph of one of the farmers, named as Dacio Queiroz Silva, as he explains that if the government paid farmers considerable compensation then they would leave the area: 'There is no solution. If you say: "No, but, there is an amendment to the budget for the indemnification agreement of the land!" "So, give me, give me, then I will be leaving ..."'⁵⁰² Although none of the Guarani-Kaiowa are named, unlike Siqueira, Cohen and Silva, they are given an opportunity to represent themselves sartorially through the film, demonstrating how clothing moves on their bodies and fits into their surrounding environment, their *tekoha*. The haptic visual qualities of their dress in motion engenders a sense of touch, drawing the viewer in, and encouraging her to consider its form in closer detail, producing an intense awareness of an active self-fashioning Guarani-Kaiowa presence. Whereas *National Geographic Brasil* used film to produce an intimate relationship between the viewer and Guarani-Kaiowa dress presented on

⁵⁰¹ Cohen, 'Guaranis: terra vermelha', p. 130.

⁵⁰² *Sem Solução*, 2.28.

the screen, demonstrating its lived and subjective experience as a manifestation of individual tastes, a rather different representation of Guarani-Kaiowa dress is seen in the film *Birdwatchers*, produced by Italian-Chilean director Marco Bechis.⁵⁰³

Birdwatchers, a fictional film that was shot predominantly without the use of a script and used many untrained Guarani-Kaiowa as actors, nevertheless reduced the indigenous group's interactions with globalisation to a form of standardisation that led to a fragmentation of group identity. The opening scene captured a group of European birdwatchers sailing along a picturesque river in Mato Grosso do Sul (Fig. 6.22), where they come into contact with a group of Guarani-Kaiowa hiding in the verdant trees that line the riverbank (Fig. 6.23). The indigenous people are armed with bows and arrows and wear loincloths, beaded jewellery, feathered headdresses and body paint (Figs. 6.24-6.26). A few release token arrows from their bows for the benefit of the tourists. The scene alludes to what Deborah Root has argued is the insatiable 'appetite' of a European audience for the exotic 'other', as a source of 'violence, passion and spirituality'.⁵⁰⁴ This notion is amplified by the second scene, which watched the Guarani-Kaiowa change back into their usual Western-style clothes of jeans and T-shirts, and collect scant payment for their exotic display (Figs. 6.27 and Fig. 6.28) from the wealthy European-descended landowner Roberto, who profits considerably from the European tourists that he hosts on his lavish estate, not to mention his rich supplies of sugar, soy, wood, beef and biofuels. With aerial shots that juxtapose densely wooded forest and open fields of cattle and crops, the film confronts the devastating effects of European colonisation upon the region and the displacement suffered by the Guarani-Kaiowa, who are dehumanised, impoverished, living on small

⁵⁰³ *Birdwatchers*, dir. by Marco Bechis, (Brazil: Paris Filmes, 2009).

⁵⁰⁴ Deborah Root, *Cannibal Culture: Art, Appropriation and the Commodification of Difference* (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1996), backcover.

reserves and makeshift protest camps, and treated with patronising paternalism by mainstream Brazilian society. This is most evident through the young figure of Ireneu (Fig. 6.29), who uses his wages from harvesting sugarcane on the landowner's plantation to buy a brand new pair of sneakers from the shopping mall (Fig. 6.30). He is scolded by his alcoholic father Nadio, who remonstrates that he ought to have purchased additional supplies from the local shop to provide for the malnourished community. Ireneu is accused by Nadio of neglecting traditional Guarani-Kaiowa culture and, in a climactic scene towards the end of the film, he commits suicide. The make of Ireneu's sneakers is unknown since the camera intentionally never focuses long enough upon them, and so they serve as a homogenous expression of generic global culture, which literally wipes out an indigenous Guarani-Kaiowa life in the face of its dominance. *Birdwatchers* presents Guarani-Kaiowa subjects as fragile, with a lack of agency through dress. There is an increased awareness as the film progresses that Bechi sought to capture the indigenous group before their presumed demise, in a process that drew on salvage ethnography discussed in the first and third chapter of this thesis. In contrast, *National Geographic Brasil* presented the Guarani-Kaiowa as individuals performing their own subjectivities, rather than as objects of a controlling and dehumanising ethnographic gaze. Whereas Bechis fashioned the Guarani-Kaiowa as doomed, on the receiving end of the asymmetrical global relations of power, *National Geographic Brasil* highlighted their vitality through mundialization, and integrated a critique of Western documentary photography and ethnographic image-making into a representation of Guarani-Kaiowa dress.

This chapter has used Ortiz's concept of mundialization to examine three snapshots that were published within an article in *National Geographic Brasil* in August 2013. Mundialization can be understood as the culmination of the four theoretical concepts employed in the previous four chapters, and it has been used to consider how Brazilian cultural expressions are no longer fashioned in-between Brazil and the West, but are manifestations competing against many others in a global system. This methodological framework has been particularly useful for an examination of *National Geographic Brasil* in the post-2010 period, when the magazine began to position itself more pragmatically and dynamically in relation to *National Geographic*. I return to Ortiz's assertion that 'there is no global culture; only a process of cultural mundialization'.⁵⁰⁵ This fluid concept was used to highlight the improvisational nature of Guarani-Kaiowa dress, which was understood within the context of the *tekoha*, the framework that denotes the physical places that the Guarani-Kaiowa inhabit, but also their situational adjustment to their changing immediate environment.

The first case study was examined as it was published within the magazine and consisted of four posed portraits, each of which enabled the subjects to self-fashion and self-present before the photographer's gaze. The tactile qualities of dress encouraged the *National Geographic Brasil* viewer to vicariously experience the fascination that the Guarani-Kaiowa have with their *tekoha*, and there was a tangible sense that the magazine had taken a distance from subjects, providing a space for them to stage fanciful versions of themselves, rather than imposing a style of representation upon them. This photographic approach enabled the Guarani-Kaiowa to demonstrate their individual sartorial interactions with the technological and economic processes of globalisation, and revealed no overt standardisation or

⁵⁰⁵ Ortiz, 'Problematizing Global Knowledge', p. 402.

homogenisation to their representation, beyond the grid formation in which subjects were presented. Cohen and Siqueira clearly had an awareness of Guarani-Kaiowa dress practices as a form of mundialization, which was a shift beyond each of the photographers and authors interviewed in the previous chapters, none of whom professed to be particularly interested in dress. This worked to undermine the asymmetrical relations of power between *National Geographic Brasil* and Brazilian subjects.

The second and third case studies were examined as presented on the iPad edition of *National Geographic Brasil*. The range of tactile textures in the photographic portrait of Ava Tape Rendy'i, which was re-presented for the screen in high resolution, ostensibly brought the viewer closer to the subject, and encouraged an awareness of his ability to *self-fashion*. Yet there was a sense that the subject may have been posed, or *fashioned*, by Siqueira, in a dramatic *mise-en-scène* that drew on the Western art-historical canon. There was a standardisation inherent to this representational gesture, which drew a veil over the subject's discriminate negotiation and re-negotiation of dress from two different cultural systems, Western and indigenous. The final case study was a short film, produced exclusively for the digital edition of the magazine. The re-presentation of dress in motion, and the close-up and tactile qualities of film, provided a substitution for touch and encouraged the *National Geographic Brasil* viewer to perceive the subjects as self-fashioning individuals within a three-dimensional, multisensory framework. This mode of representation, not previously examined within this thesis, produced an intersubjective relationship between Guarani-Kaiowa subjects and the viewer, and drew her attention the individual, mundialized processes of the indigenous group's sartorial interactions with global

culture. Rather than an over-saturation and desensitisation of imagery presented on the digital screen, the final case study prompted a more intimate, nuanced response from the viewer, which provided an opportunity for the Guarani-Kaiowa to represent their own subjectivities through dress, gesture and performance.

Conclusion

- **Snapshot 1: The Maku Woman's 'Old Piece of Cloth', April 1926** (Fig. 7.0)
- **Snapshot 2: *Paulista* Women's White Sportswear, October 1942** (Fig. 7.1)
- **Snapshot 3: The Cinta Larga Women's Black Body Paint, September 1971** (Fig. 7.2)
- **Snapshot 4: Djauí's Red T-shirt and Adidas Shorts, December 1988** (Fig. 7.3)
- **Snapshot 5: The Afro-Brazilian Girl's Lycra Top and Denim Jeans, August 2002** (Fig. 7.4)
- **Snapshot 6: The Yanomami Boy's Gaze at the *National Geographic* Photographer's Clothing, September 2001** (Fig. 7.5)
- **Snapshot 7: Bianca Marque's Bikinis and Victor Denzk's Dresses, September 2011** (Fig. 7.6 and 7.7)
- **Snapshot 8: The Mayongong Man's Rawhide Bag and Cotton Loincloth, July 2000** (Fig. 7.8)
- **Snapshot 9: Lourenço Loy's Red and White Bandana and Gold Medallion, February 2001** (Fig. 7.9)
- **Snapshot 10: The Japanese-Brazilian Women's Cotton *Yucata* and Wooden *Geta*, June 2008** (Fig. 7.10)
- **Snapshot 11: The Guarani-Kaiowa's Western-style dress and Feathered Headdresses, August 2013** (Figs. 7.11, 7.12 and 7.13)

This thesis set out to examine the hypothesis that, since *National Geographic's* centenary edition in September 1988, the magazine has traced the beginnings of a different view of encounters within the United States-Brazil contact zone, driven by the forces of globalisation, which have resisted the processes of objectification, appropriation and stereotyping that previous scholarship has associated with the rectangular yellow border. It hypothesised that this was because photographs of Brazil published in *National Geographic* since 1988 have provided evidence of a fluid and various population, which has selected and experimented with preferred elements and ideas derived from North American and Western European dress, and used it to fashion their own, distinctly Brazilian identities. The temporal and geographical scope of this thesis, as well as its primary focus on dress and fashion, emerged from dissatisfaction that academic discourse to date has not considered how *National Geographic* may have *fashioned* Brazilian subjects within the context of contemporary

social life, which has unequivocally been transformed by global economic and cultural exchange. Equally, and to ensure that I did not privilege a Western perspective, it sought to consider how Brazilian subjects might have *self-fashioned*, and demonstrated a resilience, ingenuity and inventiveness in negotiating and modifying commodities and ideas that have materialised through cross-cultural encounter. I selected Brazil as a case study due to its long history of cultural and ethnic diversity, which is demonstrated in the multifaceted nature of Brazilian dress and fashion. Brazil embodies the slipperiness of the tensions between the 'Western' and the 'non-Western', and enjoys an influential position in Latin America and, increasingly, on the world stage, which casts doubt upon simplistic assertions of U.S. cultural and sartorial imperialism. These factors raise interesting questions about how a recognisable image of Brazil has been narrated to an increasingly global readership by means of *National Geographic* and, since its establishment in May 2000, *National Geographic Brasil*. This thesis has employed a multidisciplinary method of analysis that uses five Brazilian scholars who have deployed dress and fashion metaphors in their writings, which have encompassed poetry (Andrade), film studies (Stam), poststructuralist theory (Santiago), literary criticism (Schwarz) and anthropology (Ortiz). This has provided a crucial opportunity to understand contact between the United States and Brazil that was represented in *National Geographic*, not solely from the perspective of the magazine, but also taking into account the practices and lived experience of dress for self-fashioning Brazilian subjects.

This conclusion ties together the various threads woven throughout this thesis to deduce to what extent its hypothesis has proven accurate, and to highlight any areas in which it has been tested. In doing so, it considers the theoretical implications

of this thesis' findings in relation to the wider academic discourse on *National Geographic*, which has condemned the primitivising and exoticising gaze that the magazine has purportedly placed on non-Western subjects. This conclusion provides answers to the following five research questions that were posited in the introduction to this thesis: how has *National Geographic* fashioned and narrated an image of Brazil through its representation of Brazilian dress and fashion? How do these representational strategies relate to those of the broader global mediascape? How do the magazine's different gazes onto Brazilian dress and fashion reflect global, political, social, cultural and economic attitudes and agendas between the United States and Brazil? How might photographic snapshots of dress break out of these different gazes, whether ethnographic, documentary or fashionable, by enabling active Brazilian subjects to self-consciously fashion, through pose, performance, expression, gesture and the mobilisation of their own multiple gazes? How does the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic Brasil* cast a light upon *National Geographic's* representational strategies? It will highlight the new conclusions provided by a cross-cultural, dress-historical analysis of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic* since 1988, outline any limitations encountered and, briefly, consider potential avenues for future research.

How has *National Geographic* fashioned and narrated an image of Brazil through its representation of Brazilian dress and fashion?

The first part of this thesis, comprised of chapters one, two and three, has demonstrated that throughout the history of *National Geographic's* documentation of Brazil, clothing and/or bodily adornment has been used by the magazine as a crucial

indicator of Brazilian subjects' identities, whether indigenous (snapshots one, three, four and six), white European (snapshots two and seven), or Afro-Brazilian (snapshot five). From April 1926 to September 2011, dress and fashion have provided a primary visual symbol of cultural practices that are presumed to be at certain points different from, but at other times similar to, those of the *National Geographic* viewer. The seven snapshots discussed in the first part of this thesis demonstrated that not only did the magazine use dress as a tool to oppress Brazilian subjects and emphasise their exotic difference, as Lutz and Collins, Steet, and Rothenberg have pointed out, it also used clothing to present the complex cross-cultural tensions between homogeneity and heterogeneity, as Brazilian subjects negotiated and re-negotiated the forces of globalisation.

As this thesis has demonstrated, hybrid forms of dress were apparent in *National Geographic's* documentation of Brazil in the period prior to 1988, which confirmed that cross-cultural sartorial engagements and negotiations were already taking place before, as well as after, the unravelling of the fabric of a bipolar Cold War world. Photographs published in *National Geographic* during this period drew less visual attention to the subtleties of Brazilian dress, and were often reliant instead upon accompanying captions to explain that the clothing worn by subjects was a careful and considered choice. The captions articulated new sartorial frames of reference, which disrupted the asymmetrical power relations that previous scholarship has attributed to *National Geographic's* purportedly imperialist gaze. When considered in relation to the photographs that they accompanied, the captions, which highlighted the Maku woman's 'old piece of cloth' (snapshot one), 'sports-clad girls', and the Cinta Larga women's 'painted "clothing"' (snapshot three), drew attention to dress as an act

of selective self-presentation on the part of active female Brazilian subjects.

Nevertheless, when considered as a whole, the rhetoric of the articles within which these snapshots were published largely skirted over Brazilian dress practices, focusing instead on active, masculine pursuits in the Amazon; the industrialisation and modernisation of a Brazil that was ready for war; and, finally, an ethnographic concern to document Brazil's apparently disappearing indigenous groups. The overriding conclusion drawn is that in the period prior to 1988, the magazine deemed dress to be an unimportant, feminine preoccupation; on the one hand, this enabled female Brazilian subjects to articulate and construct their identities in idiosyncratic ways, but it also warranted little sustained interest from *National Geographic's* frequently shifting gaze.

In the period subsequent to September 1988, *National Geographic* became increasingly interested in male and female Brazilian dress practices. Rather than fashion an increasingly homogenous image of Brazil, as a result of the interconnectedness engendered by contemporary globalisation, which has enabled clothing commodities and fashionable ideas from the United States and Western Europe to move rapidly across geographical borders, *National Geographic* highlighted the subtleties of heterogeneous Brazilian dress forms, within which local and global elements have interacted. The photographic representation of Djauí's red T-shirt and Adidas shorts (snapshot four), as well as the Afro-Brazilian girl's Lycra top and jeans (snapshot five), demonstrated the accommodations and resistances inherent in Brazilian dress, which may have been a tactical and considered choice, as in the case of Djauí, or a distinctive and local re-presentation of European high fashion, as in the example of the Afro-Brazilian girl. The haptic-visual qualities of photographs published

in the magazine since 1988 encouraged viewers to consider not only how Brazilian clothing looked, but also how it *felt*, prompting identification between viewer and subject centred on the interconnected activities of looking, seeing, being, feeling and, crucially, wearing. This was a transitional moment in editorial policy at *National Geographic*, encapsulated by the September 1988 centenary edition, towards an emphasis on the intrinsic and self-expressive value of photography, as image *and* object, which was no longer deemed merely illustrative of the accompanying text. This thesis has shown that not only did *National Geographic* begin to document a more multifarious population since 1988, but it also prompted its readers to experience Brazilian subjects in an increasingly multisensory way. Despite this, the rhetoric of the articles within which these two snapshots were published largely ignored the varied styles of dress worn by Brazilian subjects, and either refused to comment on dress practices per se, as in Loren McIntyre's article 'Last Days of Eden', or instead focused on the folkloric spectacle provided by more traditional forms of Brazilian dress, such as that worn by the *baiana*, the archetypal mature black woman dressed in voluminous white lace who is associated with Salvador da Bahia, as in Charles Cobb Jr.'s article, 'Where Brazil was Born'.

2001 marked the first of two exceptions to the hypothesis of this thesis, as the magazine attempted to engage consciously with fashion for the first time, with the publication of the photobook *National Geographic Fashion*. Rather than highlight the nuances and inflections of fashionable style throughout the world, whether fast and throwaway or rarefied and elite, *National Geographic* focused very narrowly on ethnic, regional and national dress. The textual commentary that accompanied *National Geographic Fashion* was contradictory; it included a foreword by Eicher, who situated

the photobook within contemporary academic scholarship that cast doubt on simplistic dichotomies between Western 'fashion' and allegedly non-Western 'dress', but it also placed obscure quotations beside unrelated images, juxtaposing diverse geographical places and temporal periods with little concern for individual subjects. Photographs published within *National Geographic Fashion* had clearly been selected with an eye attuned to Western beauty conventions, which connected diverse subjects visually, by their model-like faces and symmetrical bodies. Viewed in its entirety, the photobook placed a homogenising veil over the different and diverse processes of self-fashioning and self-presentation that have emerged throughout the world, which transcend geographical, social, cultural, political and economic boundaries. The haphazard and eclectic juxtaposition of colourful, tactile imagery, rather than encouraging identification with Brazilian subjects, risked resulting in a synaesthetic overload that reinforced their fetishised status as a symbol of exotic Otherness. The representation of Brazil focused entirely on male indigenous subjects (snapshot six), who displayed no overt signs of cross-cultural self-fashioning through items of dress. 2011 marked *National Geographic's* second engagement with Brazilian fashion, and documented high-end designer clothes (snapshot seven), in the article written by Cynthia Gorney, 'Machisma'. It presented fashion within an anthropological framework, only this time its gaze had been turned upon white European-descended Brazilian women living in Rio de Janeiro, as opposed to indigenous male subjects. It documented the interior of two boutiques, in which Brazilian women experienced, performed, and consumed fashion, but the magazine narrated an idea of these activities as superficial and distinctly feminine, which was reinforced by the rhetoric of the article within which this snapshot was published. The magazine presented a very narrow view of Brazilian fashion, which ignored its multidimensional nature, rather as

National Geographic Fashion had done, and implied instead that it was the privileged domain of a select group of elite, white, wealthy Brazilian women. *National Geographic's* representation of Brazilian dress has thus been subject to various shifts since the magazine was established in 1888, which has tended towards a more intimate engagement with Brazilian subjects since 1988, but has occasionally still lapsed into older representational paradigms, as demonstrated in 2001 and 2011.

How do these representational strategies relate to those of the broader global mediascape?

The first part of this thesis contextualised *National Geographic's* representation of Brazil with examples from mainstream U.S. magazines such as *Popular Mechanics*, *Vogue*, *Life*, *The New York Times* and *Women's Wear Daily*, and drew points of comparison and distinction. *National Geographic's* representational strategies proved more multilayered than those of contemporary U.S. media; each of the seven snapshots examined revealed points of fracture and resistance to simplistic binaries between civilised and primitive, clothed and unclothed, dominant and dominated. These tensions were a result of *National Geographic's* intention to communicate with its viewers not solely in terms of semiological meaning, but also in the *affective* responses and feelings that images of dress evoked, however subconsciously or involuntarily these operated on behalf of the viewer. This editorial strategy prompted active *National Geographic* viewers to make a more complex reading of photographs and, whilst apparent in the magazine since it first made contact with Brazil in 1906, it was brought into much sharper focus as of September 1988. By playing with the affective capacities of the viewer, and functioning as image *and* object, the article

'Within the Yellow Border...', published in the centennial edition of the magazine, signalled a paradigmatic shift, as *National Geographic* worked to provide viewers with an increasingly multisensory and intimate engagement with dressed Brazilian subjects, encouraging them to see, but also to *feel* the photographs. This tactile and intimate, as opposed to disembodied and distant, gaze was not so apparent in contemporary U.S. media, but in *National Geographic*, it operated to erode geographical and temporal distance between the magazine's viewers and Brazilian subjects. This shift in editorial policy revealed a prescient awareness on the part of *National Geographic*, which recognised that it would be required to keep up-to-date with, but also to compete against, the proliferation of images produced by the global mediascape. Although *National Geographic*, unlike *Vogue*, *Women's Wear Daily* and *The New York Times*, has not focused explicitly on fashion until 2001, images of dress have played a crucial role in fashioning an idea of Brazil and Brazilian subjects. *National Geographic* has proven more fluid and unstable than previous scholarship has acknowledged; this has been a result of the contradictions in the nexus of meaning between the photographs, their placement on the printed page or webpage, the accompanying caption, the text of the article within which photographs were published, and the function of the magazine or computer as a material object.

How do the magazine's different gazes onto Brazilian dress and fashion reflect global, political, social, cultural and economic attitudes and agendas between the United States and Brazil?

National Geographic first made contact with Brazil in April 1906, the same year that the Pan-American conference, which was organised for co-operative trade within

the Western hemisphere, was held in Rio de Janeiro. This demonstrated that the magazine's initial interest in Brazil clearly reflected U.S. awareness of Brazil as an economic trading partner. Articles published between 1906 and 1933 placed an ethnographic gaze on the Amazon region, and emphasised its suitability for U.S. economic expansion and commercial exploitation. The second trend noted emerged between 1939 and 1945, a period of worldwide fragmentation and anxiety, and articles placed a documentary gaze on Brazil, to emphasise its similarities with the U.S. in terms of size, modernity and capitalism. *National Geographic's* documentation of Brazil during this period can be understood as a reflection of Roosevelt's Good Neighbor policy, which was intensified following the outbreak of war in Europe, and sought to present Brazil as a nation comparable to the U.S., which was ready and willing to participate in protecting the Western hemisphere from attack by the Axis powers. The third trend noted emerged from 1964 to 1984, during a period when Brazil was suppressed by a right-wing military dictatorship which was politically aligned to the interests of United States. *National Geographic's* ethnographic gaze focused on indigenous populations in the Amazon region. This heightened interest in indigenous subjects, which ignored any sensitive political inferences, can be attributed to U.S. anxieties concerning the brutal nature of the military regime. The three patterns noted in *National Geographic's* representation of Brazil prior to 1988 demonstrated that the magazine was clearly concerned to advance the broader political interests of the United States, rather than Brazil, and to this extent it represented a form of imperialism that is consistent with the findings of previous scholarship.

In the period subsequent to 1988, however, *National Geographic's* gaze did not reflect an overt economic or political agenda between the U.S. and Brazil, and it no

longer followed such a systematic, uniform, or easily definable pattern. Generalised themes, including the Amazon, urban centres such as Rio de Janeiro and Sao Paulo, and Afro-Brazilians, emerged only when the articles were viewed as a whole and from a distance. All of the articles were connected by their multifarious articulation of Brazil that, for the first time in the magazine's history, highlighted the global mix of Brazilian people. Whereas previously the magazine had always judged Brazil in relation to the United States, and in doing so, presented a world polarised on Cold War lines, since 1988 it began to consider Brazil in its own, unique terms. This shift in editorial policy at the magazine marked a transitional period for Brazil too, as it emerged from a brutal military dictatorship and moved towards a democratic constitution. With the stabilisation of the Brazilian economy in 1994, when the *real* replaced the *cruzeiro*, Brazil slowly strengthened its prominence as a regional power and gradually worked to gain a position of international influence. This was recognised in 2001, when it was named as one of the four fast-growing economies denoted by the acronym BRICs (Brazil, Russia, India and China). As the least politically problematic of the BRICs, and the most culturally, ethnically and racially diverse, *National Geographic's* gaze on Brazil might be attributed to the geopolitical forces of contemporary globalisation, which have pushed the magazine to recognise the country as symbolic, in microcosm, of the evolving structure of a new global order. Whilst *National Geographic* never overtly focused on the Brazilian economy or its political constitution, by documenting a more multifarious population through dress, it recognised the dynamism of a Brazil that could sartorially, but potentially also economically and politically, bridge the perceived gap between the Western and the non-Western. This thesis suggests the potential for further research into this area, covering a similar temporal period but a broader geographical scope, which could examine, firstly, how *National Geographic's*

representation of dress in emerging powers such as Russia, India, China and South Africa might fare in comparison to Brazil, and secondly, what this might tell us about their broader geopolitical relation to more established powers, such as the United States and European Union.

How might photographic snapshots of dress break out of these different gazes, whether ethnographic, documentary or fashionable, by enabling active Brazilian subjects to self-consciously fashion, through pose, performance, expression, gesture and the mobilisation of their own multiple gazes?

In order to consider contact between the United States and Brazil that was represented in *National Geographic*, this thesis drew on Pratt's term, 'auto-ethnographic expression', which she used to describe how ethnographic subjects creatively self-fashioned by appropriating elements from a dominant culture, and infiltrating it with local modes of dress. In the period prior to 1988, this thesis drew upon Andrade's self-aware metaphor of anthropophagy to examine how Brazilian subjects in *National Geographic* sartorially consumed select elements of Western culture, and used them to regurgitate a distinctly Brazilian ensemble. The first snapshot demonstrated that the Maku woman's appropriation of a piece of cloth exemplified her ability to digest foreign cultural elements obtained through cross-cultural contact, and refashion them to meet different ends. Dress enabled the subject to demonstrate her inventiveness and resourcefulness, which resisted *National Geographic's* ethnographic photographic gaze. In the second snapshot, the *Paulista* girls' white sportswear demonstrated how a well-established U.S. sportswear aesthetic had been appropriated and re-presented to serve a different means, which worked in

favour of Vargas' Estado Novo regime that laboured to present Brazil as a modern, white European nation. Dress enabled the Brazilian subjects to demonstrate their Brazilianness rather than their Americanness through white clothing, but the placement of the documentary photograph on the magazine double-page view, opposite a photograph of Brazilian beef, objectified the women and hindered their ability to self-fashion. The third snapshot of Cinta Larga women's body paint pointed to a self-reflexive gaze by which they mimicked the ethnographic gaze *National Geographic* placed on them, and posed to demonstrate their ingenuity in adopting and adapting Western dress codes and photographic conventions. In each of these three snapshots, dress articulated new potentialities and subjectivities for an interpretation of the images but, just as Andrade's theory revealed limitations since it assumed the contradictions of Brazilian dependency on the West, there was an overriding sense that *National Geographic* had eaten, or rather fashioned, Brazil, as opposed to Brazilian subjects self-fashioning through dress, pose and gesture. Whilst this conclusion is consistent with previous scholarship, since it has revealed the magazine's processes of objectifying and stereotyping Brazil in the period prior to 1988, it goes beyond the arguments of Lutz and Collins, Rothenberg, Steet and Hawkins, since it recognises that this was not a straightforward asymmetrical relation of power between Brazilian subjects and *National Geographic*, but rather involved various elements of accommodation and negotiation between two different cultures.

To analyse the period subsequent to 1988, this thesis used Stam's metaphor of an aesthetics of garbage to encapsulate the subtleties and complexities of Brazilian subjects' skill in self-fashioning within the context of an increasingly interconnected global era. In the fourth snapshot this thesis examined, the garbage metaphor worked

on a literal basis and enabled Djauí to appropriate second-hand items of Western clothing and use it to mix and match local and global elements. Dress broke out of the textual narrative that sought to place the Urueu-Wau-Wau within an imposed ethnographic present. The fifth snapshot this thesis examined operated on a more conceptual basis and enabled the Afro-Brazilian subject to re-interpret European high fashion through her strategic recycling of second-hand ideas and aesthetics. Dress broke out of *National Geographic's* gaze to the extent that it refused the textual narrative of the article that sought to present Salvador da Bahia as a static cultural preserve of Africanness. What is interesting about these two snapshots is that *National Geographic* actively drew attention to the subjects' self-fashioning through the haptic-visual properties of the images, which encouraged viewers to rethink Brazilian subjects in a way that was not essentialist. These findings support the hypothesis of this thesis that, since 1988, *National Geographic* has allowed subjects to demonstrate tactical decisions about their different modes of dress; there was a tangible sense that Brazil represented numerous different styles of clothing and/or bodily adornment that constitute the patchwork quilt of contemporary global life.

In the sixth and seventh snapshots this thesis examined, Brazilian subjects broke out of *National Geographic's* attempts to fashion them in 2001 and 2011 to the extent that their returned gazes, either back at the viewer, or at one another, encapsulated Santiago's notion of the space in-between, whereby distinctions between the U.S. and Brazil, photographer and photographed, became blurred. In the sixth snapshot, the little boy's inquisitive gaze at the photographer counteracted the visual mastery of *National Geographic's* fashionable gaze. In the seventh snapshot, the women's gazes at one another and at the photographer reinforced their positions as

interacting social agents, who were able to self-fashion. Nevertheless, during this period, *National Geographic's* focus on the haptic-visual qualities of the image as a material object threatened to override the subjects' abilities to self-fashion and provided the exception to the hypothesis of this thesis. In these two instances, the magazine presented a less complex picture of a global population, and defined subjects more narrowly as either indigenous or European-descended, reverting to representational strategies utilised in the period prior to 1988. Brazilian subjects represented in *National Geographic* have therefore demonstrated an ability to self-fashion since 1888, but this has become more pronounced since 1988, and directly communicated to the viewer through the haptic visual qualities of photographs, which have encouraged an intersubjective relationship between viewer and subject .

How does the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic Brasil* cast a light upon *National Geographic's* representational strategies?

The second part of this thesis, comprised of chapters four and five, provided a counterpoint to *National Geographic's* documentation of Brazil through dress, and examined the representation of Brazilian dress in *National Geographic Brasil* since May 2000, when the magazine was first established. Articles published in *National Geographic Brasil* drew a connection with *National Geographic's* representation of Brazil in the period subsequent to 1988, since they fashioned an idea of the country as hybrid and syncretic, which combined numerous culturally, ethnically and racially diverse subjects.

In the period prior to 2010, *National Geographic Brasil* demonstrated that, whilst it declared itself not to be interested in dress, rather as *National Geographic* had done until 2001, clothing was repeatedly used as a primary visual symbol emphasising the *difference* of represented Brazilian subjects. The first case study (snapshot eight) examined an image of an indigenous subject that had originally been published in *National Geographic* in April 1926, but had been re-contextualised seventy-six years later in *National Geographic Brasil*. The subject was placed in more romanticised and sentimental terms than he had been previously, but this act also camouflaged a crucial aspect of the subject's self-presentation, *gambiarra*, and placed him as a passive construct, rather than an interacting social agent. The subject's processes of self-fashioning, which were exemplified by his determined gaze, his defensively crossed arms, and his use of left-over items to create a set of tools to, as *National Geographic* acknowledged in 1926, 'work his healing magic upon the credulous', were largely ignored by *National Geographic Brasil*.⁵⁰⁶ The magazine drew a veil over the subject's tactical use of material items and expressive gestures, and instead highlighted his clothing as a crucial marker of his difference. This was pointed out in the caption, which blindly questioned: 'why does he tie his arms so tight? Many questions remain unanswered.'⁵⁰⁷ *National Geographic Brasil* mobilised a new dynamic of power, which replaced *National Geographic*'s pseudo-imperialist gaze with an ostensibly more intimate Brazilian gaze, but it was one that disguised an insidious form of dominance that sought to essentialise, objectify and memorialise an indigenous Brazilian past. This gesture might be attributed to Brazil's increased economic stability, and a desire to sever its connections with native indigenous populations, who did not easily fit within its globalising ambitions for the future. This particular example demonstrated

⁵⁰⁶ Stevens, 'Exploring the Valley of the Amazon in a Hydroplane', pp. 398-99.

⁵⁰⁷ Moraes, 'Grandes Reportagens: a terra é verde', p. 157.

displaced ideas, to employ a reformulated version of a term first used by Schwarz, since it exemplified the fluidity of ideas derived from *National Geographic*, which were re-presented in *National Geographic Brasil*, and thereby used to serve a different, neo-imperialist purpose that adhered to a Brazilian agenda.

The concept of displaced ideas was examined in greater sartorial detail in the second example analysed from *National Geographic Brasil* prior to 2010 (snapshot nine). A subtext within the article demonstrated how young Angolan men living in Rio de Janeiro appropriated elements of global hip-hop culture, and used them to negotiate and re-negotiate their own marginalised identities in-between Angola and Brazil. The textual narrative of the article within which this snapshot was published constantly referred to a 'traditional' Pan-African past that was allegedly inscribed in Angolans' present-day experiences in Brazil. It thereby drew many connections to the textual representation of Salvador da Bahia in *National Geographic* in August 2002 (snapshot five). Yet whilst the Afro-Brazilian girl's clothing resisted and provided a palpable counter-narrative to *National Geographic's* gaze, in *National Geographic Brasil* there was an overriding sense that the magazine had fashioned Angolan-Brazilian subjects in a carnivalesque spectacle of black Otherness. Whereas *National Geographic* had highlighted the haptic-visual qualities of dress through photographs to encourage identification, and an emotional interconnection, between *National Geographic* viewer and Brazilian subject, *National Geographic Brasil* used dress to highlight the exotic difference of Brazilian subjects. It is in this respect that *National Geographic Brasil* revealed many of the processes of objectification and stereotyping that were no longer evident in *National Geographic's* representational strategies in the post-1988 period. This might be attributed to the facts that *National Geographic Brasil*

was still struggling to assert its own identity as a magazine, that it was using older editions of *National Geographic* for inspiration on the types of articles it might commission, and that it was still being censored by *National Geographic*, which wanted to ensure that it was presenting a 'realistic' vision of Brazil to its own, English-speaking readership.

The final snapshot from *National Geographic Brasil* examined prior to the magazine's ten-year anniversary also displayed evidence of displaced ideas, exemplified by the use of 'traditional' Japanese clothing by Japanese Brazilians to perform their cross-cultural identities on particular ceremonial occasions (snapshot ten), such as on the centennial of the first Japanese immigration to Brazil. This case study was situated within a dominant textual narrative, which risked obscuring the *National Geographic Brasil* viewer's understanding that the adoption of the *yukata* and *geta* amongst these communities was a careful and considered decision made by Japanese-Brazilian subjects. Such cross-cultural sartorial references were obscured in favour of presenting the dress of Japanese-Brazilian subjects as a passive and feminine spectacle of Oriental Otherness. The haptic visual qualities of the snapshot drew a veil over the subtleties and nuances of the *yukata*, which had been adapted for wear in the tropical climate of Brazil, and placed it as a distinct symbol of ethnic and cultural difference.

The tensions between text and image that were prevalent in each of these *National Geographic Brasil* snapshots drew a connection to *National Geographic's* ambiguous representational strategies, and demonstrate how dress has assumed and accrued new meanings as it has travelled through different interpretative spheres. This was particularly interesting in *National Geographic Brasil* given that articles, unlike

those published in *National Geographic*, were frequently written and photographed by the same author. As *National Geographic Brasil* developed throughout its first decade of publication and gained more editorial freedom from *National Geographic*, there was an overriding awareness that it was beginning to establish new hierarchies and inequalities, which suggested the formulation of a new contact zone, no longer between the United States and Brazil, but between Brazil and the various immigrant groups that had settled within its borders. Although *National Geographic Brasil* documented a hybrid and multifarious population, new essentialisms began to emerge through dress from *within* those representations. Like *National Geographic*, although the magazine did not directly focus on dress and fashion, it played a crucial role in the construction of Brazilian identities, from the dominant perspective of *National Geographic Brasil*, but also from the viewpoint of self-fashioning Brazilian subjects. A future research point in my examination of *National Geographic Brasil* in the period from 2000 to 2010 would be to analyse contextualising examples, in order to draw points of contrast and comparison, and thereby, develop and test my conclusion.

In the period post 2010, when *National Geographic Brasil* celebrated its first decade in publication, the magazine began to position itself more pragmatically and dynamically in relation to *National Geographic*. This shift was comparable to the shift in *National Geographic's* representational strategies since 1988, and it was a result of the magazine's increased confidence, and the establishment of a more amicable rapport with Washington DC. This thesis used Ortiz's notion of mundialization to acknowledge that there was no longer only one world-vision, produced by *National Geographic* but rather, in an increasingly interconnected world, there existed multiple world-visions, of which *National Geographic Brasil* provided one, that competed with

numerous others, both within and beyond Brazilian borders. Three case studies were examined within one snapshot, and the concept of mundialization was used to draw attention to Guarani-Kaiowa subjects' ability to self-fashion and perform their individual identities using the versatile options provided by the movement of clothing across geographical and regional boundaries. A comparison was made with *National Geographic's* representational strategies in 2011, which crossed over into digital media, and the second case study examined how *National Geographic Brasil's* iPad edition of the magazine affected the viewer's interpretation of dressed Brazilian subjects. Rather like *National Geographic's* representational strategies, discussed in snapshot seven, which was re-framed on the *National Geographic* website, there was an overriding sense that *National Geographic Brasil* had fashioned its Brazilian subjects, in this case, glossing over sartorial subtleties and situating its subject within a Western art-historical framework. Nevertheless, the final case study examined moved beyond each of the representational strategies employed in the previous ten snapshots published in *National Geographic* and *National Geographic Brasil*. The use of the medium of film, which was produced specifically for the iPad edition of the magazine, provided an opportunity for Guarani-Kaiowa subjects to represent and perform their subjective identities through dress, movement, gesture, expression and gaze. The close-up and tactile qualities of film, and the moving forms of dress that it facilitated, provided a substitution for touch and encouraged an intimate haptic-visual relation to clothed Guarani-Kaiowa subjects. *National Geographic Brasil's* representational strategies illuminated potentials for *National Geographic* to venture into new modes of digital representation, which are capable of *continuing* to resist the processes of objectification, stereotyping and appropriation that have been associated with the magazine in scholarship to date, and which could make use of the digital

technologies available in a global context. Scholars are yet to examine editions of *National Geographic* that have been produced in different locations throughout the world; this would provide an important avenue for future research, to examine the cross-cultural processes of negotiation that have taken place within the U.S. edition, and to consider how the meanings of dress, but also its representation, never speak to a single audience, but are decoded and recoded as clothing travels through diverse sites and locations. Like *National Geographic*, as *National Geographic Brasil* has developed as a magazine, it has demonstrated more of a concern with issues of materiality that are central to the representation of dress as image *and* object, and its diversion into film encapsulated its ability to promote identification with dressed Brazilian subjects.

This thesis, which set out to examine the hypothesis that since 1988 *National Geographic* has documented a more multifarious Brazilian population, engaging with elements of North American and Western European dress in individual and selective ways, has contributed a dress-historical and cross-cultural analysis to the body of knowledge already produced on the magazine. It has highlighted how dress has provided a three-dimensional, multisensory medium through which to revise previous views that have stressed *National Geographic's* one-dimensional participation in an imperialist representation regime, and it has demonstrated that the magazine has by no means fixed subjects within a timeless ethnographic present. The ambiguities and fluidities of Brazilian dress have enabled it to operate in unexpected and frequently strategic ways, often against the overriding textual narratives that have framed it. This thesis has demonstrated how *National Geographic* has enabled *National Geographic*

viewers, but also Brazilian subjects, to engage selectively with aspects of global dress, as image, object, text and idea intertwined, and in doing so, to fashion their interconnected identities in a process that is continually becoming, and never static.